## *LE GOÛT D'ORVAL*: CONSTRUCTING THE TASTE OF ORVAL BEER THROUGH NARRATIVES

© Ema Noëlla Kibirkstis

A dissertation submitted to the School of Graduate Studies in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

**Doctor of Philosophy** 

**Department of Folklore** Memorial University of Newfoundland

**February 2023** St. John's, Newfoundland & Labrador



Figure 0.1. Orval beer bottle and glass. Image by Em Saunter. *Source:* "Beers I'm Glad Exist – Orval," by Em Saunter, accessed August 23, 2021, <u>www.pintsandpanels.com/beers-im-glad-exist-orval-1</u>.

#### Abstract

This study explores the construction of taste through narratives, using Orval beer as a case study. Often found on lists of the best or most unique beers in the world, Orval is a bottle conditioned, dry-hopped strong Belgian ale with Brettanomyces yeast, creating an orange-hue beer topped with a large volume of white foam. It is both easy to drink and complex in flavour. Made in southeastern Belgium within the walls of a Trappist Abbey, Orval is closely associated with the country of Belgium, a pilgrimage site for beer lovers because of its unique and diverse beer culture. In 2016 "Beer Culture in Belgium" was inscribed on UNESCO's Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. Orval beer also carries the Authentic Trappist Product label, ensuring that this product is brewed under the supervision of Trappist monks or nuns, within the Abbey walls, and is non-profit. Additionally, the beer has a unique, distinctive taste. This dissertation explores narratives that tell of all these aspects. The first section, Narrating Belgium, examines how social and economic histories build Belgium as a beer nation, and how conversion narratives of Belgian beer enthusiasts support this theory. The Narrating Trappist section examines how the Legend of Orval and the history of Orval Abbey create a sense of place for Orval beer and how the Authentic Trappist Product label helps construct its terroir. The last section, Narrating Taste, focuses on narratives of taste as shared in online reviews of Orval beer. I first conduct lexical and network analysis of reviews on Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate before focusing specifically on themes found in BeerAdvocate reviews. Through ethnographic and textual research, this dissertation introduces a folkloristic approach to taste and argues that both contextual and sensory elements are essential in building taste through narratives.

#### Acknowledgements

If it takes a village to raise a child, it must take a continent to write a dissertation. This research would not have been possible were it not for the generosity and support from those surrounding me. First and foremost, I would like to thank Frère Xavier and Orval Abbey for their generosity in welcoming my curiosity and allowing me to conduct my research on this place and their beer. Without their hospitality, none of this would have been possible. Second, I would like to thank all my informants who took the time out of their busy schedule to speak with me: Jean-Marie Rock, André Odwa, Dr. Marc Heyde, Vital Streignart, Dimitri van Roy, Charles "Chuck" Cook, Stu Stuart, and Tom Peters. It is thanks to these conversations that I was able to think critically about this topic.

Shout out to Dr. Diane Tye for being my supervisor and mentor on this project. Thank you for being patient with me and reeling me back in when I got overexcited and digressed into another tangent. I feel extremely fortunate to have been one of your last students before your retirement, it truly is an honour to have someone I look up to be by my side. I would also like to thank other members of the faculty, such as Dr. Holly Everett for jumping in as co-supervisor, and my committee members Dr. Kelley Totten and Dr. Cory Thorne for our stimulating conversations and thoughtful feedback. And, of course, big thank you to Memorial's Department of Folklore administrative staff, Ms. Ann Marie Gushue and Mrs. Margie Chafe for being extremely efficient and kind, especially during my times of highest anxiety. Additionally, I would like to quickly thank Dr. Timothy Tangherlini from the University of California, Berkeley, who after I attended his keynote address at the 2021 Folklore Studies Association of Canada conference, generously answered my emails and provided me initial guidance with navigating computational folkloristics. I would also like to thank my peers at Memorial that made graduate life slightly more bearable: Dan Neill, Ruzhica Samokovlija Baruh, Noah Morritt, Sarah Shultz, and Marissa Farahbod.

Outside of academics, I am very fortunate to have surrounded myself with some of the most enthusiastic friends and family. First things first, thank you to my dog, Chef, for being my best friend and forcing me to go outside. I know you don't know how to read (yet), but just know that when even your father and I adopted you during my comprehensive examinations, I never knew how much joy it would be to come home every day to a happy, wiggly puppy. You are the greatest writing and cooking assistant a human could ask for. Huge thanks to my husband and biggest cheerleader, Christopher Nash, for supporting me emotionally (and often financially) – I am extremely lucky to have you in my life and I love you. I would also like to thank my family: Regina Kibirkstis, Algis Kibirkstis, Kristina Kibirkstis, Noëlla Kibirkstis, Vytis Kibirkstis, and Ieva Cederström for supporting me, even though you have still have no idea what I am doing. My friends who helped distract me and find joy in my darkest periods: Karyne Tétrault, William Lacoste, Mel Hoskins, Riley Yesno, Lily Walsh, Jonathan Tang Sik Fon, Victoria De Jesus, Maricar Kristine Montes, Michael Mosher, Megan McDonald, Ellie Rideout, and oh so many more. I could probably write a thesis-long list of all the people who supported me along the way, so I am sorry to everyone I missed... next beer's on me.

## **Table of Contents**

| Abstract        |  | iii |
|-----------------|--|-----|
| Acknowledgments |  | iv  |
| List of Tables  |  | vii |
| List of Figures |  | х   |
| Prologue        |  | xi  |
| Section I       | Introduction   | 1   |
| Chapter One     | Introduction: Approaches to a Folkloristic Study of the Taste of<br>Orval Beer                   | 3   |
| Section II      | Narrating Belgian  | 51  |
| Chapter Two     | Brewed Belgium: A Social and Economic History of Beer in Belgium                                 | 53  |
| Chapter Three   | The Belgian Beer Experience: Belgian Beer Tourism and Conversion Narratives                      | 89  |
| Section III     | Narrating Trappist   | 119 |
| Chapter Four    | <i>Aureavallis</i> : The Legend of Orval and History of the Abbaye Notre-Dame d'Orval            | 121 |
| Chapter Five    | Trappist Terroir: Savouring Trappist Life through Orval Beer                                     | 160 |
| Section IV      | Narrating Taste  | 184 |
| Chapter Six     | "This truly is a blessed beer.": Lexical and Network Analysis of<br>Online Reviews of Orval Beer | 185 |
| Chapter Seven   | Narratives of Taste: A Folkloristic Approach to Taste  | 217 |
| Section V       | Conclusion   | 245 |
| Chapter Eight   | Conclusions: Narrating Taste as Folklore Practice  | 247 |
| References      |  | 251 |
| Appendix        |  | 291 |

# List of Figures

| 0.1  | Orval beer bottle and glass  | ii  |
|------|--|-----|
| 2.1  | Panoramic view of the Orval brewery and illustrated guide on how Orval beer is made  | 40  |
| 2.2  | "The Low Countries with the border of 1648. After 1648: top: The Dutch<br>Republic (Republic of the Seven United Provinces); bottom: The Spanish<br>Netherlands" | 58  |
| 2.3  | "Present-day borders between Belgium and the Netherlands"  | 58  |
| 2.4  | Top destination countries worldwide by percentage of exported Belgian beer in the year 2019  | 60  |
| 2.5  | Production of beer in millions of hectolitres (hl) in 2019 in the European Union   | 61  |
| 2.6  | Exportation of beer outside country of production in millions of hectolitres (hl) in 2019 in the European Union  | 61  |
| 2.7  | Consumption of beer in litres (L) per capita in the year 2019  | 62  |
| 2.8  | Beer label of Dutch brewery Hertog Jan, in the likeness of Jan Primus or John I,<br>Duke of Brabant (1251-1295)  | 68  |
| 2.9  | Beer label of the Czech brewery Gambrinus  | 68  |
| 2.10 | Beer label of the Belgian brewery Cantillon's Rosé de Gambrinus  | 68  |
| 2.11 | Statue of King Gambrinus in the "Best Place" at the historical Pabst Brewing Company in Milwaukee, Wisconsin   | 68  |
| 2.12 | Gambrivius Künig in Brabant/Flandern (Gampar, king of Brabant and<br>Flanders)   | 72  |
| 2.13 | Beer label of the American brewery Saint Arnold's Comeback   | 79  |
| 2.14 | Beer label of the Belgian Abbey brewery Steenbrugge's brown ale  | 79  |
| 4.1  | Countess Matilde of Tuscany with the Orval trout at her feet" by Jean Huet   | 122 |
| 4.2  | Tableau of Matilda of Tuscany and the fish returning her ring from a comic book, detailing Orval's history   | 122 |
| 4.3  | Mathilde Fountain located on the old monastic grounds of Orval Abbey with a mural by Jean-Claude Servais   | 122 |

| 4.4  | Orval beer bottle label, featuring the Orval trout with a golden ring in its mouth  | 123 |
|------|---|-----|
| 4.5  | Orval Abbey circa 1232  | 140 |
| 4.6  | Comic book drawing of Orval Abbey under construction during the 18 <sup>th</sup> century, prior to the destruction during the French Revolution           | 143 |
| 4.7  | Comic book drawing of troops destroying Orval Abbey on June 23rd, 1793  | 143 |
| 4.8  | " a cathedral!" Comic book drawing of the reconstructed Orval Abbey in its full glory, sometime in the mid-twentieth century                              | 145 |
| 4.9  | General plan of the construction of Orval Abbey by the Architect Henry Vaes   | 149 |
| 4.10 | Orval Abbey today   | 150 |
| 4.11 | View from the courtyard   | 150 |
| 4.12 | Map printed on a pamphlet provided at Orval Abbey giftshop, numbering stops<br>along the way to guide you through the museums and ruins                   | 151 |
| 4.13 | Picture taken within Orval Abbey's giftshop   | 153 |
| 4.14 | Showing off a kilogram block of Orval cheese within Orval Abbey's courtyard   | 154 |
| 4.15 | Bag of Orval honey candies, while walking through the fields of Orval   | 154 |
| 4.16 | Enjoying a meal at À l'Ange Gardien, featuring a Green Orval  | 155 |
| 4.17 | Enjoying a meal at $\dot{A}$ la Nouvelle Hostellerie d'Orval, meal featuring Orval cheese and a regular Orval beer  | 155 |
| 4.18 | Orval beer, poured into the designated Orval beer glass   | 159 |
| 4.19 | Authentic Trappist Product label  | 159 |
| 5.1  | Leffe is a UBB Certified Belgian Abbey Beer   | 165 |
| 5.2  | St. Bernardus produce Belgian Abbey ales, without official certification  | 165 |
| 5.3  | Benedictine Brewery is an American brewery, owned and operated by<br>Benedictine monks of Mount Angel Abbey in Oregon                                     | 165 |
| 5.4  | Petit Orval or Orval Vert has an ABV of 3.4% and served exclusively on draft for public consumption at À l'Ange Gardien, just steps away from Orval Abbey | 168 |
| 5.5  | Orval beer has an ABV of 6.2% and is served exclusively in bottle   | 168 |

| 5.6  | Twitter post following the "The CDC Recommends" popular meme circulating<br>the Internet in late 2021 in the wake of new COVID-19 safety guidelines by the<br>Center of Disease Control (CDC) in the United States of America due to the<br>highly contagious new variant named 'Omicron' | 180 |
|------|---|-----|
| 6.1  | Screenshot taken of the Untappd website on January 4th, 2021  | 191 |
| 6.2  | Screenshot taken of an Untappd review on January 4th, 2021  | 191 |
| 6.3  | Screenshot taken of the RateBeer website on January 4th, 2021   | 192 |
| 6.4  | Screenshot taken of the RateBeer website on January 4th, 2021   | 192 |
| 6.5  | Screenshot taken of the BeerAdvocate website on January 4th, 2021   | 193 |
| 6.6  | Screenshot taken of the BeerAdvocate website on January 4th, 2021   | 193 |
| 6.7  | Word cloud generated by Voyant using the Untappd reviews  | 196 |
| 6.8  | Word cloud generated by Voyant using the RateBeer reviews   | 196 |
| 6.9  | Word cloud generated by Voyant using the BeerAdvocate reviews   | 196 |
| 6.10 | Word cloud generated by Voyant using all reviews  | 196 |
| 6.11 | Orval beer's label indicated how the beer should be served: poured into a glass, preferably a chalice styled glass  | 200 |
| 6.12 | Graph generated by Gephi featuring 50 term nodes, 1,986 review nodes, and 20,238 edges, included the weighted edges   | 206 |
| 6.13 | Graph generated by Gephi featuring 50 term nodes, 1,986 review nodes, and 20,238 edges, without weighted edges  | 207 |
| 6.14 | Graph generated by Gephi featuring 12 term nodes, 1,602 review nodes, and 4,198 edges, without weighted edges   | 208 |
| 6.15 | Graph generated by Gephi featuring 12 term nodes, limited 492 review nodes, and 1,148 edges, without weighted edges   | 209 |
| 7.1  | Different beers are served in different glassware, appropriate to the style   | 225 |

# List of Tables

| 2.1 | Le chant des Wallons [The Wallonians' Song]   | 75  |
|-----|---|-----|
| 3.1 | Belgian beer ambassador's conversion narratives   | 112 |
| 6.1 | Sample of the review nodes spreadsheet providing the Id, Label and Category of the nodes      | 204 |
| 6.2 | Sample of the nodes terms nodes spreadsheet providing the Id, Label and Category of the nodes | 205 |
| 6.3 | Sample of the edges spreadsheet, providing the Source, Target, Type and Weight of the edges   | 205 |

### Prologue

Beer has always been a part of my life. When I was young, I was fascinated by the beer bottle caps that my father collected. He sorted the caps by country and stored them in plastic parts cabinets meant for holding screws and bolts. These were found alongside his bottles of unopened duty-free liquor bottles bought during trips and various beer memorabilia scattered in and around the basement bar, typical of bungalows in the suburbs of Montreal built in the 1950s. From a young age, I knew that we bought Molson (a brand from Québec) and not Labatt (from Ontario), or ideally Boréale/Brasseurs du Nord, Unibroue, McAuslan, or beer produced by other local microbreweries. As a child, I learned about types of beers: blondes, reds, stouts, and lagers, though I never fully understood the differences until I could sip them myself at an older age. When my mother became a Canadian citizen in 2004, I remember her proudly posing on our front lawn in a Molson t-shirt, with their famous tagline "I AM CANADIAN." As I grew older, beer became a form of rebellion in my teens, and then a key part of socializing and meeting new people in my early adulthood. During university, beer was a path of discovery; my then partner and now husband and I began trying every new beer that came into the liquor stores and exploring every local brewery we could find.

This lifelong engagement with beer is part of my larger fascination with food and culture. My parents embarrassingly remind me that I would proclaim to want to be a "cooker" at a young age, begging them for new ingredients and kitchenware that I'd read about in Ricardo magazine or seen on Food Network. I was fortunate to grow up with parents who were excited to explore new foods and to have friends from a variety of cultures whose families generously fed me. Though I had always been curious about beer, I never thought critically about its intersections

xi

with culture until I began my Master's in Social and Cultural Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam. About half my classmates were Dutch and when visiting small "cafés" we usually ordered a "biertje" ("small beer" in Dutch), which was cheap lager, usually made by Heineken, Jupiler or Amstel, served in a small 25cl (about 8.5oz) glass. After a few biertjes, sometimes locals would order a little nicer beer served in an elegant chalice or goblet style glass. These were pale ales that were floral, spicy and made my mouth water, or darker, sweeter beers that tasted like plums. I was in a whole new world, a world where beer glasses mattered and so did the story of the beer. In my eyes, my Dutch peers were connoisseurs, and they particularly caught my attention when they praised Belgian beer. While they often complained that the Belgians did not know how to speak Dutch properly, my friends conceded that Belgians knew how to make some of the best beer in the world. The best amongst them, they said, was made by the Trappists. Trappist beers were explained to me as being the "beer made by monks," which, with my North American upbringing, seemed both odd and mythical. The allure of Trappist beer stayed with me throughout the remainder of my time in Amsterdam as I visited beer bars and stores, tasted different beers, and learned about beer's tasting qualities.

Returning to Canada in 2016 was a shock; no longer could I sip on a Westmalle dark, syrupy quadruple in a wide mouthed chalice in a Belgian café, but every once in a while, I was able to find a Kwak, Duvel or Chimay in local restaurants or liquor stores. Unsure about where to turn next, I began working in restaurants and microbreweries in Newfoundland & Labrador. I became enamored with beer, learning everything I could about the different styles and brewing techniques, and I became part of a community of fellow food and beverage lovers. Eventually in 2016, I was introduced to Orval beer by a friend who was a chef. He mentioned it was "Trappist," a word I longed to hear again. He spoke of the difficulty of finding Orval beer in Canada but thankfully the boom in craft beer had resulted in a wider selection of importations at our local liquor stores. Eventually we shared one and I was enamored. The bottle was a unique, curved shape, the label minimal yet depicting a fish with a ring in its mouth, and the beer itself was bitter, funky, bold and easy-drinking – unlike anything I had ever had before. This experience coincided with having to finalize a thesis topic. I knew I was interested in taste, and remembering my supervisor, Dr. Diane Tye, told me that this would be one of the few opportunities in my academic career where I could study whatever I wanted and I should do what I love most, I decided to examine taste through a case study of Orval beer. I wanted to understand more about the intersections of beer and culture in general and what makes this beer so special in particular. How had Orval risen to a place of prominence as one of the best beers in the world? As a folklorist, I was interested to know more about ways that narrative shapes taste.

Although PhD dissertations do not usually begin with a prologue, I believe it is important to share my own beer narrative in order to help situate the study that follows. Some might dismiss alcohol as fuel for alcoholism and delinquency, and beer as a pedestrian bitter beverage of the working class, but these reductive assumptions diminish the value of a complex beverage and the meaningfulness it brings to people in everyday life. Beer has meant different things to me at different times and it continues to hold a significant place in my life. I know this is true for many others as well; for us, beer's taste is primary and its inebriating qualities are secondary. This dissertation is a celebration of the beauty of beer and to all those who've share a glass with me in the past. Cheers!

### **SECTION I: INTRODUCTION**

Early in my bartending career at a restaurant in St. John's, Newfoundland & Labrador, I approached my good friend and sommelier Megan. A customer had requested a "dry Riesling" which was not on our wine list. In return, she gave me a confused glance and told me, "That doesn't mean what you think it means," which prompted me to ask myself, "What do I mean?" Riesling is a German white grape variety that stereotypically contains a higher amount of residual sugars resulting in a sweeter wine, an antithesis of a "dry" wine. Working within the food service industry, I quickly learned how to interpret customers' requests by not taking them at their word, but rather at what their words *could* mean. People use terminology they are familiar with, such as "dry" and "Riesling," and combining these incompatible terms made sense to the customer I was serving because both described wines that they liked.

Similar interpretations are done at craft breweries where I later worked, where customers regularly search for a beer they are already familiar with and know that they like, requesting something similar to a Belgian Moon, Bud Light or Guinness. When working at craft breweries that produce and sell only their own beer, I interpreted these brands for their styles, as a witbier (Belgian wheat beer), American light lager, and an Irish stout, respectively. If these styles were not available, I would break down what each means and the corresponding tastes that the customer desires: a witbier is pale, hazy, delicate, spiced from the Belgian yeast, citrusy and refreshing in the summer; an American light lager is very pale, clear, easy-drinking, lightly flavoured, highly carbonated and thirst-quenching; and an Irish stout is dark, opaque, roast-y, malty, some coffee-like, and often cozy. Understanding what these beers "mean" by identifying their key tasting notes, allowed me to provide an informed recommendation to customers and, frankly, I became very good at it.

It is through these lived experiences that I began to realize how language and taste are so intensely interconnected. I was an active participant in narrating taste. Customers asked questions about who made the beer and how it was made, typically prompted by the physical location of the brewery, the names of the brewery and beers, and/or information on the label. In response, I happily engaged, building a narrative about the beers and breweries. Because these stories intertwined taste and context, I witnessed customers build their evaluation of gustatory experiences based not only on what they sipped, but on the information I provided them. To study the topic of taste and narrative further, I chose Orval Brewery as a case study due to the beer's unique qualities and its exceptional reputation.

#### **Chapter One**

#### Introduction: Approaches to a Folkloristic Study of the Taste of Orval Beer

In the extreme southeast of Belgium, situated between the lush Ardennes forests and idyllic pastoral Gaume farmland, is the Abbaye Notre-Dame d'Orval. It was founded in 1132 by the monks of the Order of Strict Observance, known commonly as Trappists. Visitors come to the Abbey and the forested surroundings in search of religious tranquility and thoughtfulness, either for a day trip or a few days stay at their hôtellerie ("inn"); others find satisfaction in exploring the Abbey museum and the old monastic ruins that stand in stark contrast to the current art deco-style building; and some make a pilgrimage to the Abbey's gift shop to tow away bright orange cases of the Abbey's famed Orval beer.

Orval beer is a "Trappist product" meaning that it holds an Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label which ensures it is (1) brewed within the walls of an Abbey belonging to the Order of Cistercians of the Strict Observance, (2) produced under the supervision of the monks (Trappists) or nuns (Trappistines), and (3) profits allow for the community to run independently, even though the brewing is not a profit-making venture (International Trappist Association, n.d. "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label"). The ATP label is not unlike appellation labels found across Europe and the world, such as the *appellation d'origine controlée* (AOC) designation in France, as it ensures consumers of the authenticity of the product and deters them from purchasing lower quality imitators. Orval is one amongst ten Trappist breweries in the world, six of which are located in Belgium. As beer expert Garrett Oliver notes, "Belgium is to beer what Cuba is to cigars and France is to wine" (2011b, 120) and in 2016 "Beer culture in Belgium" was

inscribed on UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity (UNESCO 2016).

Orval beer is sold worldwide, and its taste is very highly regarded. For example, beer expert Michael Jackson describes it as "a masterpiece" that "combines intensity, bold aromas and flavours from dry-hopping and Brettanomyces yeast, and elegance" (2008, 280), and Oliver writes that "Orval has a flavor revered not only in Belgium but the world over. There is absolutely nothing like it" (2003, 206). Orval beer is also remarkably highly rated on popular online beer-reviewing websites and mobile device applications: RateBeer has just under 4500 reviews for this brew, with an average rating of 3.92 out of 5; BeerAdvocate has just over 5500 reviews, with an average rating of 4.2 out of 5; and Untappd has over a 133,000 ratings, with an average of 3.76 out of 5.

The reputation of Orval beer precedes itself; I heard about its reputation before my first sip – how had this reputation influenced my experience of tasting Orval beer? Defining Orval beer as Belgian and Trappist is complex, as both carry layers of meaning. Additionally, discussions of the actual taste of Orval beer highlight not only its sensory components but reference these contextual indicators. This thesis explores how taste not only relies on physiological flavour but is highly subjective and culturally constructed (Bourdieu 1984; Mouritsen 2015; Boisvert and Heldke 2016; Korsmeyer 2002, 2007; Trubek 2009). Here I adopt a folkloristic approach to taste by focusing on narratives that construct the taste of Orval beer, to answer the broader question: what are the interconnections of taste and narrative?

In this chapter, I lay the groundwork for the rest of the dissertation. My research lies at the intersection of four areas of scholarship: taste, foodways, personal narrative and computational folkloristics. I begin by outlining some of the foundational texts in each of these

bodies of literature from a folkloristic perspective and revealing the gaps which this study aims to fill. Following this discussion, I describe my own research methodologies and provide a chapter outline for the remainder of the work. Finally, I conclude the chapter with a brief introduction to how beer is made, given that beer and its many facets will be referred to for the entirety of this dissertation.

#### **Reviewing the Literature and Minding the Gap**

## Taste

When referring to the "taste," folklorists and social scientists have treated it as either (1) a physical sense of gustatory taste or (2) expression of refinement. Sometimes taste has been perceived as a "lower" sense alongside touch and smell, against the "high" senses such as sound and sight. Raymond D. Boisvert and Lisa Heldke write in *Philosophers at Table: On Food and Being Human* that Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel, famed Western philosopher of the nineteenth century, divided the senses into "high" senses which relate to the mind and "low" senses which are in closeness to the body (2016, 77). He contended that the distance and detachment in experiencing sight and sound allows the "mind-as-spectator" whereas the proximity of experience in touch, smell, and taste distract. The necessary immediacy of these experiences, Hegel argued, hinders the aesthetic experience and therefore cannot be "high" art (ibid.). While this evaluative ranking and hierarchy of the senses is irrelevant to the present study, Hegel's highlighting of proximity and immediacy underscore how subjective and complex taste is as a research topic and suggest why taste is an under-researched area of study within the social sciences.

Interpreted as either gustatory sensation or expression of refinement, the two definitions of taste are often convoluted. Considering taste as refinement, such as referring to someone having "good taste," taste refers to discernment or something pleasing aesthetically. Carolyn Korsmeyer writes in the introduction to The Taste Culture Reader: Experiencing Food and Drink, that taste finds itself within a paradox. At the same time food is necessary to sustain life, it is also regarded as "a mere matter of physical sensation, unworthy of extensive attention" (2007, 1). Yet, Korsmeyer writes when it comes to food and taste, "The zone for neutrality is relatively small, possibly reserved for water" (ibid.). Gustatory experiences are oftentimes paralleled with hedonistic values. As is evident in religious dietary restrictions, such haram and halal laws in Islam belief, taste is often equated with an individual's morality. Michael Owen Jones writes in "Food Choice, Symbolism, and Identity: Bread-and-Butter Issues in Folkloristics and Nutrition Studies," that identities are expressed through food symbolism, "first, self in relation to how and what one eats; second, food choice and identity related to values, gratification, and other personal characteristics; and third, self in relation to social categories" (2007, 144). Indeed, taste discernment is a meaningful process.

Taste can be an expression of refinement, as a means of discerning whether something is "good," "bad," or somewhere in-between. As an evaluative process, having a sense of "taste" can also be viewed as a higher power – having "good taste" is something some are born with and cannot be learned. Within the fields of folklore studies and cultural anthropology, taste is often defined by an individual's cultural setting. For example, in Diane Tye's *Baking as Biography: A Life Story in Recipes*, taste and food choices are contextualized in Tye's upbringing in Nova Scotia and shaped by her mother's cooking. Similarly, in David Sutton's *Remembrance of Repasts: An Anthropology of Food and Memory*, the author studies taste as part of

interconnected culture, food, and memory on the Greek Island of Kalymnos. I argue that taste is not only culturally bound but as an evaluative process, the concept of taste within folklore studies is relatable to larger discussions of folk art and aesthetics.

Gerald Pocius writes about the creation of art and folk art in the Western world in his article "Art," a contribution to The Journal of American Folklore's special issue "Common Ground: Keywords for the Study of Expressive Culture." He explains that while "in medieval times any activity requiring skill was considered as art, during the Renaissance art became the product of the special skills of privileged individuals" (1995, 416). This shift meant that when Western intellectuals discovered "the Other" in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, they labelled the art they encountered as "folk" art or "primitive" art. These terms recognized the art's aesthetic appeal and value while still distinguishing it from their own Western elite art (ibid., 416-7). Pocius writes, "Objects of other peoples, however, were functional artifacts that were first and foremost utilitarian; it was we, in the West, who recognized their aesthetic qualities" (ibid., 417). The overarching similarity that came to be realized amongst art pieces is the recognition of skill involved in making art, whether it be from a formally trained, institution-educated artist, or a self-taught, traditional artist. Additionally, Pocius notes that the "skill in producing art causes desired positive aesthetic reactions among members of a group" (ibid., 425). If we consider material art, the visual evaluative assessment and discernment of its aesthetic are essential in distinguishing the "skill" needed to produce such art. The shifting definitions of "art" that Pocius describes highlight the dynamic nature of sensory experiences. While he claims that "aesthetic responses seem to be a universal phenomenon" (ibid., 425), he is not suggesting that aesthetic taste is universally the same. Rather, he argues that "all peoples recognize beauty an element of the human condition" (ibid.) even though "each group will have certain canons of taste that

govern which art forms are produced" (ibid.). This consideration of aesthetic within folklore studies can be a difficult one to grasp, as Dorothy Noves writes:

I was reminded of something I always say to my students. When they hear the word "aesthetic," students are likely to think of decoration and embellishment, or of a realm of value set apart from life as we live it. The aesthetic dimension is an add-on, a luxury, something optional. But in folklore courses we are trying to convey a different conception, one that is integrated with the formal and social dimensions of practice. So I tell them is that aesthetic is the opposite of anesthetic: it's about feeling. (2014, 126)

Within folklore studies, the approach to aesthetics is similar to art. Institutions and hegemonic cultures might attempt to standardize perceptions of acceptable aesthetics, but in reality "non-dominant communities" (ibid.) retain other vernacular aesthetic norms<sup>1</sup>. This perspective is reflected in Dan Ben-Amos's very definition of folklore as "artistic communication in small groups" (1972, 13). When it comes to taste as a gustatory aesthetic experience, I argue that the recognition of skill and aesthetic is also contextually and culturally shaped and that evaluation of taste is an essential part of the human condition.

Within writings about Orval beer, there are mentions of the "goût d'Orval," a "taste of Orval," that can be interpreted similar to "taste of place." Amy Trubek writes that this "taste of place," that derives from the French "goût du terroir," conveys a belief that "the natural environment *influences* the flavors of food and beverages, but ultimately the cultural domain, the foodview, creates the goût du terroir" (2008, 27). This concept prevails from the twentieth century French *tastemakers*, who celebrated rural French life through food. Carole Counihan and Susanne Højlund write of it in their introduction to *Making Taste Public: Ethnographies of Food and the Senses*: "the concept of taste expresses *a relation* between humans and their food" (2018, 2); taste is as it is experienced. The "goût d'Orval," therefore, refers not only to the physiological

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For more on aesthetics and folklore, see Brenneis 1993; Noyes 2014; Hymes 1975; Jones 1971; Westerman 2006.

taste of Orval beer, but the natural environment in which the ingredients are grown and where the beer is produced, alongside the people and history which create this unique taste.

Sensory folkloristics has yet to develop into its own subdiscipline as a "folklore of the senses" and as a result much of the work that forms the foundation of this dissertation is based in anthropology<sup>2</sup>. In the 1980s and 1990s, an "anthropology of the senses," later also referred to as sensory anthropology, emerged at the hands of researchers such as David Howes (1991, 1991, 2003), Constance Classen (1993, 1997), and Paul Stoller (1989, 1997). David Howes writes:

The anthropology of the senses is primarily concerned with how the patterning of sense experience varies from one culture to the next in accordance with the meaning and emphasis attached to each of the modalities of perception. It is also concerned with tracing the influence such variations have on forms of social organization, conceptions of self and cosmos, the regulation of the emotions, and other domains of cultural expression. (Howes 1991, 4)

These anthropologists began "re-thinking of the discipline through attention to the senses" (Pink 2015, 8) and were among the first to argue that how the senses are perceived and experienced is culturally bound (Classen 1997, 401). They highlighted "non-visual modalities" (Ingold 2011, 316) given that anthropological study had privileged sight, such as through adopting participant *observation* methods of research. They attempted to balance an "epistemological imperialism" (Howes 2003, 240) that reinforced Hegel's identification of sight as a "high" sense.

Sarah Pink writes that the more recent field of *sensory anthropology* has emerged from the earlier *anthropology of the senses*, which "implies a 're-thought' anthropology, informed by theories of sensory perception, rather than a sub-discipline exclusively or empirically about the senses" (2010, 331). As such, she contends, it represents a significant shift in perspective; rather

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Sensory anthropology, or anthropology of the senses, was an early inspiration for me when approaching the study of taste as a folklorist. In particular, I asked myself how do folklorists study the senses? Could there be a subdiscipline of folklore focused on sensory experiences in everyday life? And, what would sensory folkloristic research look like?

than an anthropological study of sensory perceptions across cultures and comparing the results to their own Western view, Pink notes that sensory anthropology is an interdisciplinary study through sensory ethnography (ibid., 332-333). Within the field of sensory anthropology, researchers such as C. Nadia Seremetakis, highlight "the relationship of food and the senses to memory, to synesthesia, and to place-making in the context of state regulatory regimes" (Sutton 2010, 212). She writes, corroborated by David E. Sutton, that sensory experiences are wholebodied experiences, and this "union of the senses" is known as synesthesia (ibid., 217-8). What started as an anthropology of the senses, focusing on the ways in which sensory perceptions are culturally bound and might differ amongst different groups of people, has developed into a reconsideration of all sensory perceptions. Today many cultural anthropologists include sensory perceptions as a pertinent component of their work and consider them an important part of daily life.

New anthropological approaches to the senses, as well as sensuous scholarship (Stoller 1997), led to the blossoming of sensory ethnography. Sarah Pink expands in *Doing Visual Ethnography*:

ethnography is a process of creating and representing knowledge (about society, culture and individuals) that is based on ethnographers' own experiences. It does not claim to produce an objective or truthful account of reality, but should aim to offer versions of ethnographers' experiences of reality that are as loyal as possible to the context, negotiations and intersubjectivities through which the knowledge was produced. (2007, 22)

Works by Howes (2003), for example, demonstrated how a recentered focus on sensory experiences bring new discoveries to ethnographic inquiries. Ethnography has always been sensory and an embodied experience, however this new approach not only explicitly accounts for the senses, but also rethinks ethnography as sensory. Pink writes, "sensory ethnography involves not only attending to the senses in ethnographic research and representation, but reaches out towards an altogether more sophisticated set of ideas through which to understand what ethnography itself entails" (2009, 10). Counihan and Højlund write in *Making Taste Public*, that in the past ethnographic handbooks often have a "dearth of clear direction on *how* to study the senses of people in other cultures" (2020, 3) and they point to Dara Culhane's article in *Different Kind of Ethnography*, as an alternative. Culhane explains that "humans are embodied, multisensory beings," and provides specific exercises to center tasting, smelling, listening, touching and looking, focusing on sensory knowledge because, she argues, "sensory ethnography offers to enrich our understanding of diverse ways of knowing and being in the world and is therefore vital to ethnography" (2016, 46).

Sutton writes in the article "Food and the Senses," that research on the anthropology of food and research on the anthropology of the senses "have run largely on separate, parallel tracks, drawing from similar inspirations, but only occasionally intersecting in terms of extended ethnographic analysis or theoretical synthesis" (Sutton 2010, 210). In this dissertation, I understand a sensory study of taste to fall under the study of foodways, and as such I learned from writings on sensory ethnography. Because there has yet to be a field of sensory folklore, or folklore of the senses, fully emerge, I build on anthropological works within sensory anthropology/anthropology of the senses, and sensory ethnography, to ask: what would a folkloric approach to the senses look like? More specifically, what would comprise a folkloristic approach to taste?

#### Foodways

My exploration of taste is rooted in folkloristic approaches to foodways. In contrast to the senses that have not been a direct focus of much folklore scholarship, foodways has long been

studied by folklorists. For example, John G. Bourke's 1895 article "The Folk-Foods of the Rio Grande Valley and of Northern Mexico" was the first publication focused primarily on food to appear in The Journal of American Folklore. Bourke insisted his work was "the first description of the foods of the people of Mexico or any other former colony of the Spanish crown" (1895, 41n1). The article consists mostly of a listing of various food items, such as fruits, vegetables, and baked goods, emphasizing how they are prepared. Scattered throughout are a few anecdotes and descriptions that try to translate Bourke's "exotic" experiences to an American audience, along with his own interpretation and opinions. For example, he writes "Mangoes might be mistaken for a small cantaloupe; the fruit is rather insipid to my taste" (ibid., 45). Bourke's foodways study fits within the early context of folklore studies; the American Folklore Society was founded in 1888 with the mission statement to collect "the fast vanishing remains of Folk-Lore in America" (quoted in Long 2015, 11), and Bourke's article aligned with this goal. That said, however, North American and European folklorists did not give food much consideration until the mid-1900s; as Lucy Long notes in her introduction to The Food and Folklore Reader, a shift eventually took place from the study of "folk foods" and "folklore about foods" (such as is Bourke's article) to the study of "foods as folklore." Long writes that this opened up foodways to folklorists as "a domain of cultural and social activity in which groups and individuals interactively and creatively construct, maintain, and negotiate meaningful connections to their pasts, places, and other people" (2015, 1).

European folklorists embraced this shift earlier than their American counterparts (Long 2015, 11) and a monumental development in the study of food within American folklore studies began when Don Yoder, Jay Allan Anderson and Nils-Arvid Bringéus attended the same conference in Lund, Sweden in 1970: it was the first International Symposium on Ethnological

Food Research (Camp 1989, 14; Humphrey, T., Samuelson, and Humphrey, L. 1991, 4-5). Though all three were concerned with new approaches to the study of food and culture, they each took a different angle. Influenced by the European folklife movement that approached the study of a region's vernacular practices wholistically, Yoder published "Folk Cookery" in Folklore and Folklife: An Introduction, edited by Richard M. Dorson. Here he prompted folklorists to collect regional foodways that he felt were quickly disappearing in light of the homogenizing effect of globalized foods. Second, Yoder urged collectors to compare American foods to European foods (1972, 329). Both Yoder and Anderson agreed that American researchers were lagging behind their European counterparts in regard to addressing the significance of food in everyday life. Anderson noted the contributions of British anthropologists, particularly those of Audrey Richards, a student of Bronislaw Malinowski, whose research focused on the ethnogastronomy of the Southern Bantu in sub-Saharan Africa (1971, 156-7) and he lobbied for increased funding opportunities for foodways researchers. Important as well was Bringéus's call for an examination of class issues in regard to people's relationship to food, culture and environment. This appeared in an article in 1970 and then later in his book Man, Food, Milieu: A Swedish Approach to Food Ethnology, first published in Swedish in 1990 (2001). His research can be viewed as a "presaging later work in the field of cultural ecology" (Humphrey, et al., 5).

Accompanying the shift from the study of "folklore" to the more encompassing study of "folklife," a move from the study of "folk cookery" to the study of "foodways" also helped expand and popularize a folkloristic approach to food, as Charles Camp explains in *American Foodways: What, When, Why and How We Eat in America*:

The shift from food to foodways does more than widen the range of the subject; it changes the definition of the things being studied from objects (food) to behaviors. The study of foodways addresses questions about the relationship between food and culture, giving equal attention and value to material and social aspects. (1989, 25)

Yoder indicates that the term "foodways" was coined by John J. Honigman (1961) to encompass "the whole range of cookery and food habits in a society" (Yoder 1972, 325), rather than only the food itself. Anderson adds that "[t]his concept refers to the whole interrelated system of food conceptualization and evaluation, procurement, distribution, preservation, preparation, consumption, and nutrition shared by all the members of a particular society" (1971, 156). Considering this and the emergence of performance theory, an emphasis was placed on the food event (Camp 1989, 15). Camp underlines that this food event "reveals both the material and the social worlds in balance" (ibid., 28), and that "[o]rdinary people understand and employ the symbolic and cultural dimensions of food in their everyday affairs" (ibid., 29). People use food to communicate with one another; sometimes this communication is blatant and understood by all participants and at other times it is more discreet.

An expansion of folklore studies away from an othering "folk" in favour of a more inclusive "folk group" meant a re-examination of who and what could be considered "folk." This reconceptualization meant a drift away from the problematic and elitist study of rural, isolated, impoverished, uneducated people who were thought to possess a lot of "folklore" to an understanding that everyone, even those in their ivory towers, can be considered a member of folk groups and to have folklore. For example, when the first issue of *The Journal of American Folklore* was published in 1888, the main concern of the society was to collect "Relics of Old English Folk-Lore (ballads, tales, superstitions, dialect, etc." and "Lore" of "Negroes in the Southern States of the Union," "the Indian Tribes of North America (myths, tales, etc.)" and "Lore of French Canada, Mexico, etc." (3). It is worth noting that "Lore" only belonged to certain races of people, whereas old English lore were considered "Relics." Starting in the 1970s, however, academic folklorists began embracing the concept of a folk group and adopted more inclusive definitions of folklore, such as Ben-Amos' "small groups" designation above, or by Alan Dundes (1971, 13). But even so, the oftentimes problematic and racist connotations of the terms "folk" and "folklore" are a continued tradition of the discipline (Prahlad 2021, 261-2). Personally, I often refer to Dr. Philip Hiscock's definition as explained to me when I arrived in Memorial University's Department of Folklore in 2012, today folklorists consider folklore to be "informal culture" and culture is "what people do." For folklorists interested in food, the expansion of folk cookery to foodways fit easily into these new paradigms.

With a broadening of folkloristics, was a broadening of food studies within folkloristics; the works of Yoder, Anderson, and Bringéus were followed by anthologies and collections that brought together food researchers from a variety of fields. Just as Pink describes sensory anthropology drifting away from an anthropology of the senses to a multidisciplinary approach, since the 1980s folklorists have expanded foodways studies to create multi-authored and multidisciplinary studies that demonstrate the widespread applicability of foodways research. These works include Michael Owen Jones, Bruce B. Giuliano and Roberta Krell's Foodways and Eating Habits: Directions for Research, and Linda Keller Brown and Kay Mussell's Ethnic and Cultural Foodways in the United States: The Performance of Group Identity. While there was sometimes an unevenness among articles, the collections made significant contributions to understanding American foodways. For example, in "We Gather Together": Food and Festival in American Life, editors Theodore C. Humphrey, Sue Samuelson, and Lin T. Humphrey (1991) bring together a group of articles that explore how "[w]e eat well when we celebrate" (ibid., 1). The papers discuss foodways in a range of group contexts, from the small and intimate to the large and impersonal. Here the interdisciplinary study of foodways is demonstrated by having authors focus on one, specific food event as an example and then draw on research and studies

from a variety of disciplines to help interpret it. Due to folklorists' ethnographic, holistic, and reflexive tendencies, the contributions tend to borrow from other areas of research to provide a more complete, diverse analysis.

Within folkloristic studies of foodways, there are few examples where beverages are the main focus of the study. Camp noted that food is worthy of a folklorist's attention because it is an often-ignored part of ordinary, everyday life (1989, 29); I would argue that this is even truer for beverages that have been more overlooked than food within folkloristics, though this has been changing over recent years. Yoder's "Folk Cookery" is an early exception in that it mentions "drinkways" as an example of the ways in which American and European food habits differ (1972, 340). Yoder explains that the temperance movement rendered "drinking [alcohol], like some older folk-cultural amusements and recreations" a sin (1972, 340) but drinks were more often ignored by early foodways scholars. Recently that has changed and more foodways researchers are including beverages when studying regional foodways. An example is Ritva Prättälä who writes that in the Nordic countries (Denmark, Finland, Norway and Sweden), coffee in the beverage of choice, with fruit juices and milk being a popular, secondary choice (Meiselman 2000, 193). Similarly, Barbara G. Shortridge distinguishes beer, wine, and coffee as a traditional part of Swiss foodways (Long 2010, 275), Jacqueline S. Newman marks tea as quintessential to the Huan Chinese (Meiselman 2000, 170), and Jacqueline S. Thursby notes red wine is present at every food event in Basque Country (ibid., 2010, 194-200). Non-alcoholic beverages have garnered minimal attention and mainly the focus has been on hot beverages, such as coffee and tea. Some studies offered gendered analyses of women's social lives. For example, in "Pouring Out Their Hearts: A Study of How Women Use Coffee," Wendy Welch examines how women use coffee within female spheres as a means to "measure affection, a privacy-

engendering device, a declaration of adulthood, and an extra boost of energy" (1997, 85). Diane Tye writes in *Baking as Biography*, that her mother's "social teas" with the United Church Women's group, accompanied with home-baked squares or loaves, "offered rare opportunities for sociability, personal growth, and even social change" (2010, 161). As well, tea has been studied as a means to examine the labour of historical and cultural markets, such as Sarah Besky's work in India in *The Darjeeling Distinction: Labor and Justice on Fair Trade Tea Plantations in India* (2014) and *Tasting Qualities: The Past and Future of Tea* (2020). Finally, it has been viewed as a means to communicate identity in diasporic Chinese communities, as in Qian Huang's recent Master's thesis, "Drinking Tea in St John's: A Study of Diasporic Chinese Tea Drinking and Ethnic Identity" (2019).

Alcoholic beverages have been more extensively studied in comparison to their nonalcoholic counterparts, but only coming into the spotlight in recent years. In the 1960s, Sherri Caravan, a student of Erving Goffman, called for attention be paid to drinks and drinking. She notes in *Liquor License: An Ethnography of Bar Behaviour* that public drinking places are worthy of scholarly inquiry because the patrons of these establishment are expecting an "unserious" environment (1966, 8). Similarly, in her 1980s Master's thesis, Ingrid Fraser indicates that bars are significant gathering places for folk musicians living in St. John's, Newfoundland and Labrador (1981), and a little more than a decade later Peter Narváez discusses the significance of alcohol in subversive Newfoundland wakes (1994). In more recent years, folklorists have been part of conference panels and special journal issues focussed specifically on the topic of alcoholic beverages. For example, in 2017 the American Folklore Society Annual Meeting included a panel titled, "Hard Thinking about Hard Drinking: Community and Controversy in the Production and Consumption of Alcohol" and a forum discussion in 2018 titled "Beer Goggles in the Field: Who is Overlooked in the Craft Beverage Revival?" A special issue of *New Directions in Folklore* published in 2019 was titled "The Spirits of the Folk: Alcohol-Based Community Identity in the 21st Century." For the purposes of this study, the work of Theresa A. Vaughan, Maria Elizabeth Kennedy, and Anne-Marie Julie Leblanc on beer and cider have been particularly influential. Vaughan writes in "The Alewife: Changing Images and Bad Brews," that during the medieval period in Europe, folklore and literature describe women, and not men, "to be sexualized in relationship to the making and selling of food and ale" (2011, 37). This is despite that fact that "women have long been associated with food and nutrition" (ibid.) in terms of motherhood and lactation. This juxtaposition between late medieval English imagery of the alewife and the lactating virgin is marked as oppositional, and perhaps a symbolic inversion (ibid., 39-40). Though I do not specifically discuss gender in this dissertation, the representation of figures in association with alcohol in medieval Europe informs my own construction of Belgium as a beer nation, as well as the association of monks with beer. Maria Elizabeth Kennedy's work on cider-making in Britain and the United States (2017; 2020) has also been influential. In her dissertation titled "Finding the Lost Fruit: The Cider Poetic, Orchard Conservation, and Craft Cider Making in Britain," she writes:

In the highly literate culture of Britain, books are important modes of transmission for cultural knowledge. They represent a particularly resonant material form of discourse that can be passed from person to person, and from generation to generation. Books are not only useful for passing on practical information, but they are also part of the fiber through which the structure of feeling of the cider poetic is built. Folklore studies of the past have often privileged the tradition passed on through oral and performative modes of transmission, but this is not sufficient for the context of post-modern Britain and its post-modern, post-industrial condition. (2017, 44-45).

Kennedy's work is built upon fieldwork mainly conducted at Bromme Farm near Ros-on-Wye, England, as well as looking at literary works containing "the images, characters tropes, settings, dramatic arcs, and rhetorical style of describing orchards and cider" (ibid., 48) to encompass what she calls a "cider poetic" indicating how to feel and experience the landscape. Written materials act as "powerful material vehicles for circulating narratives" (ibid., 43), especially of consumption products as described by Kennedy. Within my own work, I examine publications about Orval beer and the Orval Abbey in order to explore how cultural knowledge might affect the taste experiences of Orval beer consumers. Finally, Anne-Marie Julie Leblanc's work examines how the microbrewery Unibroue Brewery uses Québécois folklore in their branding to create a consumable sense of place (2015; 2020). Because the labels provide names, depictions and descriptions of folktales, LeBlanc writes that "the beer label acts as a legend transmitter" (2020, 68). In my research, Orval beer is named after the Abbey and place, and the label is designed with the depictions of the foundational legend of the Abbey.

Vaughan, Kennedy and LeBlanc demonstrate a variety of approaches to alcoholic beverages, all of which inform my own. In this dissertation I hope to build on the work of these authors and others by focusing even more deeply on how cultural, lexical, historical, and folkloric aspects provide value and meaning and exploring how contextual components of a food or beverage can influence a consumer's sense of taste.

#### Narrative

The research informing this study stems from very personal curiosity involving Orval beer and leads to the wider question of how taste is constructed as a whole. I began by asking the question, how do people make sense of their own taste experiences in every day life? In the pages that follow, I argue that this is done through narrative, spoken, and written, and that "what is felt and sensed" is translated into language because the process of narration inherently allows

the consumer to make sense of their own sensory experience. Narrating taste is an inherent component of active tasting.

Bernard L. Hermann's article "Swelling Toads, Translation, and the Paradox of the Concrete" in *Cultural Histories of the Material World* lobbies for multivocality when discussing the material world. Namely, he argues, "how we talk about objects all too often constructs the framework that defines and limits how we know them as things" (2013, 120). Writing about a material object is translating it, and therefore words will always be unable to accurately represent it. While I am aware that the same can be said of tasting – that all research conducted on taste can only be a translation of the sensory experience – my goal in this study is multivocality. I do not intend to present Orval beer as a singular symbol but through "individual and collective acts of perception [that] make and remake the artifact" (ibid., 132). By focusing on a singular product and the many surrounding narratives that inherently construct and influence perceptions of its taste, I discovered a web of possible meanings. In the following pages I explore narratives, in written and verbal form, that provide examples of how people use stories to express their senses in their day-to-day lives.

Personal narratives and written accounts play a significant role in constructing the identity of Orval beer. These various narratives form a repertoire that allows individuals to pick and choose elements when shaping their own stories of Orval beer. My approach to narrative draws on a body of folkloristic scholarship that dates back to linguists William Labov and Joshua Waletsky's foundational article, "Narrative Analysis: Oral Versions of Personal Experience" arguing for the linguistic analysis of everyday narratives (1966). Early folklorists were interested in the study of informally transmitted narratives, however they were largely concerned with myths, folktales, and legends. Labov and Waletsky's work helped to demonstrate that not only

are personal narratives structured, but they also function as necessary and evaluative narratives. The authors write that narrative is "a method of recapitulating past experience by matching a verbal sequence of clauses to the sequence of events which actually occurred" (ibid., 20). Personal narratives, they explain, contain an orientation, a complication, an evaluation, a resolution, and a coda. Though they describe performers making an overt evaluation, folklorist Sandra K. D. Stahl notes that this can also be implicit. Stahl contends that while the evaluation is usually present, performers are not always conscious of their own stances within their narratives. Rather, the evaluative component is built into the narrative due to its repeated telling and becoming a staple in the teller's repertoire:

The personal narrative is easily available for use by a teller in any number of communicative situations since it exists as a stable item in the teller's personal repository of usable materials (resources). The reason for its relative stability as an item is its formulation as a "complete" narrative in the sense suggested by Labov and Waletzky. That is, a personal narrative is retained in the teller's repertoire precisely because it does make a point that is not merely referential. (Stahl 1977b, 24)

In 1977, Richard M. Dorson and Stahl co-edited a special issue of the *Journal of the Folklore Institute*, (now *Journal of Folklore Research*), on personal experience stories. They argued that these narratives constitute their own genre of folk narrative (Stahl 1977a, 6). Later, Stahl defined the personal narrative as "a prose narrative relating a personal experience; it is usually told in the first person, and its content is nontraditional" (Stahl 1989, 12). Linda Dégh provided three reasons for the emergence of interest in and collection of personal experience narratives:

(1) in the new era ethnographic fieldworkers were unsuccessful in locating archaic folktales in the modernizing villages, and resorted to the more informal "true stories," so named by the bearers [...];

(2) A new interest in the social function of narrating discovered the storytelling event as a complex forum of exchange between tellers and listeners, producing great forum of exchange between tellers and listeners, producing great diversity in genres;

(3) Recognition of the ethnographic value of personal accounts containing information on the life, work, and worldview of individuals and the community prompted fieldworkers to systematically record autobiographical stories. (1985, 101; also see Dégh 1995, 72)

Initially some folklorists were hesitant to identify the personal experience narrative as a folk narrative genre because it did not seem to be rooted in tradition. Other genres, such as fairy tales, legends or tall tales have lifespans that live on for generations, whereas the personal narrative mostly dies alongside its singular narrator (ibid.). In addition to this, the scope of the tales are not as broad. Larry Small writes when comparing the folk legend to personal experience narratives, that "[u]nlike the legend, which is more or less an embodiment of community knowledge, the personal experience narrative is limited to a very small nucleus of people, maybe no more than one or two" (1985, 15). Stahl posited, however, that even though the form of the personal narrative might not be 'traditional' as other forms of folk narratives, "the telling of personal narrative exists as a part of oral storytelling tradition" (Stahl 1977b, 19). For example, Tom Mould's research on personal revelations of past presidents of the Mormon church argues for "individual performances as part of a collective tradition" (2011, 382), meaning the tradition is not a specific personal story being told over generations, but rather the act of people telling personal stories as a continuing tradition.

Just as with other oral genres, performances of personal experience narratives are shaped by setting and context. Personal narratives can be told publicly by skilled performers in front of large crowds but they are often shared quietly by unaccomplished narrators, embedded in daily conversation. Kristin M. Langellier writes :

Performance varies in intensity, ranging from the most prominent cultural events which are scheduled, restricted in setting, clearly bounded, and widely public, using the most highly formalized performance forms and featuring the most accomplished performers, to the fleeting, mobile, unmarked, and private narratives in the everyday conversation of ordinary people. (1989, 251)

Every storytelling event is a communicative event; it is a unique social experience that exhibits degrees and kinds of similarities (Georges 1969, 317-9). Therefore, the degree of the quality of the performance varies. The performance is consciously constructed by the narrator (Scott 1985, 10A), based on its audience. Marjorie Bard writes that many personal narratives begin with the performance of narrating to oneself, known as idionarrating (1986, 43). Because people "reminisce in narrative form" (ibid.) and constantly tell stories to themselves, this could be distinguished as one of the first steps in narrative construction, that might then be brought to a wider, outside audience. Sometimes these more casual tellings of personal experiences might occur in clusters, also known as second stories (Allen 1989, 237; Bard 1986, 47). Barbara Allen writes that these "second stories can function as a particularly effective and appropriate means of expressing and understanding, and agreement with, the point of the first speaker's story" (1989, 239). In these situations, the audience plays a crucial role in the performance as they themselves might switch into the position of the performer. Additionally, this back-and-forth construction of the narration highlights how the listener plays an important role in the performance of a narrative. Co-narration, Katherine Borland writes, "underscores the crucial role of the audience in the performance of verbal art, since co-narrator is, in essence a listener responding to the performance of another" (2017, 440). John A. Robinson argues that even in narratives told by a singular performer, "the listeners monitor the coherence and meaning of narratives and will interrupt seeking clarification when either quality is lacking or ambiguous" (1981, 71). This relationship between listener and teller are not reserved to the personal experience genre, but carries over to all types of performed oral narrative.

The audience also influences what personal experience narratives are to be told. Teun van Dijk writes that for a personal story to be worth telling, the incident has to either be difficult to
perform, does not have an obvious resolution, is unexpected, or has some aspect that is "unusual or strange in the narrator's experience" (Small 1985, 15). I would argue, however, that personal narratives must be deemed relevant not only by the narrator, but by the audience as well. According to Robinson, the story does not have to be a remarkable or unique event to the narrator, as "ordinary events [...] told as full narrative" (Robinson 1981, 62) can "excite great interest in listeners who are unfamiliar with the sphere of life to be discussed," or they could also be told "as stories where a relationship of intimacy, usually long standing, exists" (ibid.; also see Dégh 1985, 105). What is most difficult to grasp about personal experience stories is that they are highly individualized and constantly being recomposed because of the context of the performance. This understanding of the personal experience narratives has emerged alongside the discipline's own evolution. The discipline of folklore initially concentrated on preserving remnants of the past and then studying this 'past,' but contemporary definitions view the field as a "study of present situations informed by the past" (Mullen 1992, 2). In other words, we are studying why traditions are meaningful today, rather than reflecting on why and how the tradition emerged in the first place. Also, though the narratives are dynamic, they still "draw upon linguistic artistry, cultural knowledge and storytelling competence of the narrator" (Del Negro 2003, 23), alongside having a reason to be told. As Robinson writes, "Like jokes without punch lines, stories that make no point are annoying" (1981, 66), and just like a joke, for people to understand the punch line, the joke is selected to be understood. Personal narratives are at the heart of Orval's construction of taste. Shared online, many of these make individual points at the same time they form part of a larger conversation that makes collective points.

Written accounts also play a significant role in the story of Orval. As mentioned earlier in Kennedy's research on cider making in Britain, literary works construct a "cider poetic" that

indicate how to feel and experience the cider and orchard landscapes. Written accounts are often overlooked in discussions of vernacular narratives because they are found in print rather than orally transmitted. But as Kennedy argues, these printed forms are informative to personal experience and expression. Further, Linda Dégh writes

In the past, we were too preoccupied with "genuine" "oral" texts and did not pay particular attention to the multitude variants in the background of emergent texts. We cannot afford this shortsightedness anymore because a new version cannot be interpreted without the comparative and constrictive analysis of its predecessors in any possible manifestation. Legend tellers are not chosen about their packaging: the relevance and appeal of the message is what matters, not the trimmings. (1995, 89)

Within this study, I consider both written and oral accounts. In the first section, I examine published texts establishing a social and economic history of Orval beer. This leads to the following chapter that discusses conversion narratives of Belgian beer enthusiasts. The second section examines published texts that establish the foundational legend and history of Orval Abbey, followed by a chapter examining how this place is reflected in the discussion, both written and oral, of Orval's *terroir*. In the final section, I consider a hybrid form of narrative, at once both written and oral: online reviews. Through an examination of all these texts, I establish a complicated narrative web that constructs a sense of taste of Orval beer. These dynamic narratives are a form of personal expression primarily focussed on taste. Individuals select "facts" about Orval beer to help create narratives of taste that make sense of their own sensory experiences. As Amy Trubek writes,

However, taste remains profoundly subjective because the taste experience can never be physiologically shared. Instead, taste evaluations must occur through language, through a shared dialogue with others. The complexity of discerning taste, therefore, lies in how that dialogue develops, and what factors shape both the conversation and the final sensory evaluation. (2008, 18)

Narratives of taste demonstrate dynamic and static values, namely repeated objective and subjective descriptors that prove tastes are not created as an isolated event, but rather are

influenced by the consumers' own consumption history, others' taste conclusions, and the context of the product. In other words, narratives of taste are deeply contextualized, creative storytelling performances, performed orally, in writing, or online (which can be thought of as the intersection of writing and speech). They can describe a tasting event usually, though not always, including sensory descriptors, to determine its value. It is through the construction of narratives of taste that the consumer comes to understand their own gustatory experience, meaning that tastes are formed through narrative.

#### Computational Folkloristics

The final major area of scholarship that this study draws on is the emerging field of computational folkloristics. Just as I build on foodways and narrative scholarship to explore the construction of taste through narrative, I also turn to recent work in computational folkloristics. Trevor J. Blank writes in the introductory chapter of *Folklore and the Internet: Vernacular Expression in a Digital World*, "folklorists look to the Internet, not only to expand our scholastic horizons but also to carry our discipline into the digital age" (2009, 2). He writes that with the creation of the World Wide Web in the 1990s, came a growth of Internet culture that folklorists generally overlooked for two decades. In doing so, they lagged behind fields such as anthropology, sociology, and communication studies. Blank hypothesizes that folklorists were leery of the study of online communities perhaps due to fear of collecting unverifiable "fakelore" (Dorson 1976) or the overall infatuation with "the study of vanishing culture and traditions" (ibid., 4). Given the fear of technology and globalization accelerating or even causing the death of said cultures and traditions, the uneasiness some folklorists felt towards the study of Internet culture is easy to understand. As Alan Dundes wrote decades ago, however, "technology isn't

stamping out folklore; rather it is becoming a vital factor in the transmission of folklore and it is providing an exciting source of inspiration for the generation of new folklore" (1980, 17). These days the study of Internet folklore, also known as digital folklore, is widely accepted and increasingly a part of ethnographic projects of all kinds, such as *Slender Man is Coming: Creepypasta and Contemporary Legends on the Internet* edited by Blank and Lynne S. McNeill. Contributions to this volume range from a discussion of Slender Man, a fictional horror figure created online, to Kiri Miller's article "Grove Street Grimm: *Grand Theft Auto* and Digital Folklore." Miller examines individuals' performance practices while playing a digital game and claims that when engaging with the virtual environment as a character, players engage with "a form of expressive culture transmitted through intersubjective performance" (2008. 280)<sup>3</sup>.

Computational folkloristics has been a sub-discipline of folklore since the 2010s, having emerged with the growing digitization of folklore collections (Tangherlini 2013; 2016; 2018; Abello, Broadwell, and Tangherlini 2012; Tangherlini et al. 2016; Broadwell and Tangherlini 2016; Shahsavari, Shadi, et al. 2020). In the *Journal of American Folklore*'s special issue on computational folkloristics (2016) with an introduction by Timothy R. Tangherlini where he argues, "the explosive growth in social media, weblogs (blogs), and other internet resources have made previously hard-to-access records of traditional expressive culture accessible at a scale so enormous that it is hard to fathom" (2016, 5). Tangherlini identifies four main areas of particular interest to the computational folklorist, "(1) collecting and archiving, (2) indexing and classifying, (3) visualization and navigation, and (4) analysis" (ibid., 6). Now that so much data is available and accessible, what can we do with it? How do we make sense of it?<sup>4</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For more work on digital folklore, see Blank 2012; Tolbert and Johnson 2019; Krawczyk-Wasilewska 2006; 2016; and Foley 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For more examples of computational folkloristics, see the Ferrell, Ann K., et al. 2016 and Jorgensen 2019.

In an article by James Abello, Peter Broadwell, and Timothy R. Tangherlini, the authors explain that "[t]he field of computational folkloristics webs algorithmic approaches to classic interpretive problems from the field of folklore" (2012, 60). The researchers use a subset of the Tang Kristensen collection at the Danish Folklore Archives in Copenhagen to illustrate this point and to show how computational folkloristics proves useful in analysis. They demonstrate how older methods of categorization of folklore accidentally overlook interconnections. For example, one story collected by Kristensen is marked by a vengeful haunt yet because it does not overtly mention ghosts it was not categorized as a ghost story. Instead, Abello, Broadwell, and Tangherlini recommend creating complex folklore hypergraphs connecting the people, places and stories, while incorporating traditional folklore categorization. By classifying folklore according to numerous criteria, this approach allows the researcher to identify links that were unnoticed earlier. For example, they explored connections between ghost and house elves stories (ibid., 68). The study utilized a dataset of 342 storytellers and 942 from Kristensen's repertoire, alongside the topic indexes from two of his collections as a basis for the networks. They created weighted graphs by establishing two approaches: a bottom-up approach of generating shared keywords amongst the texts, and top-down approach that "categorized stories according to a shallow ontology for the corpus developed specifically for the realm of Danish folklore" (ibid., 66), using natural language processing tools and topic-modelling methods. Danish folklore expert, Tangherlini helped to ensure accuracy of the automation. The results produced a network of 2,973 nodes and 52,663 edges, the edges being the connections between stories. The efficiency of this system was based on the earlier story describing a vengeful haunt; (1) "the system was to place the target story in a neighborhood of closely related ghost stories" and (2) "suggest candidate stories, given the researcher's interest in a target story" (ibid., 68).

Just as folklorists had an initial hesitancy to study digital folklore, they have been slow to embrace computational folkloristic methods. The computational folkloristic method I employ here is one of what Abello, Broadwell, and Tangherlini describe as "novel methods for classifying folklore data based not only on existing classification schemes and metadata but also on surface-level phenomena (such as the linguistic features of texts)" and the "algorithmic methods for corpus study, including [...] combinatorial graph analytical approaches (such as network-based role discovery)" (ibid., 62). In my research, I look to analyse beer reviews of Orval beer from three different beer reviewing websites: Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate. Namely, I try to identify lexical patterns in 2,100 reviews. In the light of Abello, Broadwell, and Tangherlini's work, I complete a distant reading of online reviews of Orval beer and establish a network to identify connections among language usage in reviews by individual beer reviewers and key terms. Though there have been publications in other fields focusing on online reviews, folkloristic studies focusing on online reviews as digital folklore texts are scarce. One of the only exceptions is Blank's paper on humorous, fake reviews on Amazon.com. Blank writes, "The faux review genre's emergence as a force for performance and vernacular discourse underscores the need for greater scrutiny and folkloristic investigation into the burgeoning hybridized modes of expression that are presently manifesting on the internet and other new media technologies" (Blank 2015, 293). This thesis builds on Blank's conviction that online reviews are a rich expression and utilizing computational folklore methods provide guidelines on how to approach such a large dataset of narratives.

Undertaking online ethnography presents a researcher with complexities and challenges, many of which folklorists are still working out. Robert V. Kozinets terms this kind of ethnography "netnography." He writes that "netnography is ethnography adapted to the study of

online communities" (2002, 61). Kozinets takes his own methodology from marketing; his goals are to identify consumer habits (ibid., 68) and to "provide feedback on brands and products that ha[ve] not been elicited in any way by marketers" (ibid., 70). Kozinets's ethnographic methods are not the same as those of folklorists, of course, however adopting "new qualitative research methodology that adapts ethnographic research techniques to study the cultures and communities that are emerging through computer-mediated communications" (ibid, 62) is important to our work as well. Kozinets's research steps include, "(1) making cultural entrée, (2) gathering and analyzing data, (3) ensuring trustworthy interpretation, (4) conducting ethical research, and (5) providing opportunities for culture member feedback" (ibid., 63).

Leesa Costello, Marie-Louise McDermott and Ruth Wallace write that one key issue with netnography is that researchers tend to distance themselves from the online communities they research; they sometimes view it as an easier way to conduct research. Inspired by Kozinets's research and writing (2012; 2015), the authors write that there is "a distinct need for human presence in netnographic enquiry" (2017, 9). By this they mean that researchers must carry out prolonged, active participation, observation and analysis of online communities, rather than be satisfied with a superficial glance. They urge researchers to immerse themselves in the community they are studying, rather than to simply collect and analyze data from a distance. Netnographic research, like other forms of ethnographic work, demands sustained and engaged interaction. As a beer enthusiast, I was immersed in the community before beginning research, already using the three beer reviewing websites in question. Acting as a netnographer, I took my time in gathering data from these websites and was immersed in the communities as an active user.

In his netnographic study of online reviews of two ethnic-style restaurants in Victoria Falls, Zimbabwe, Muchazondida Mkono warns of pitfalls that can await the online ethnographer. He writes, "The most glaring among these is the loss of context; because the researcher cannot, in this instance, verify the identity of bloggers, the representativeness of the restaurants, the perspectives of locals and so on" (2011, 256). Mkono also indicates that though reviews can be useful and informative, researchers must remember that they are imperfect and do not provide definite answers as to what people truly think about a product. In light of this last point, I am not suggesting the reviews be read as the complete explanation of how people understand the taste of Orval beer, but rather that they be appreciated as one valuable source.

# Methodology

When I began preparing for my fieldwork, people would often exclaim with a crooked smile, "Oh, so you're going to live with monks?" To their disappointment, I would have to respond with a firm "No." When I was first drafting my proposal, living in a monastery for an extensive period of time seemed like the ideal way to better understand this living community. Just the thought of rising before dawn within a medieval Abbey located within the peaceful Belgian countryside was everything I could hope for when producing an ethnography. Maybe I would help them collect honey, tend the gardens, and learn a few hymns. But this turned out to be nothing more than a naive fantasy. The truth is, the more I learned about the Trappists and Orval Abbey, the more I wanted to keep a respectful distance.

There are obvious impracticalities involved in living in a monastery so far away from libraries as well as my university and general academic needs, but truthfully as I thought more about it, the idea just felt wrong to me. For one, having decided on Trappist beer as my research

topic, I was bothered by how Orval is a Trappist brewery run by monks and that as of yet, there are no Trappist breweries run by nuns. Second, I soon learned that stays by visitors are limited at every Trappist Abbey, and at Orval they are possible for a maximum of six nights. The reason for this is partly due to the Trappists' belief in being hospitable to visitors. They limit the length of stays in order to accommodate more people and not operate like a for-profit hotel. Third, I realized that I did not want to be intrusive. While my decision not to do a long bout of fieldwork might be viewed as lazy or superficial by those folklorists or anthropologists who firmly believe that fieldwork must take place over months or years living in a location, the more I read about the Cistercian Order of Strict Observance, the more I wanted to respect their principles. At the same time, I also became aware of my own biases and misconceptions of monastic life. I will expand on this in Chapter Four, but to quickly summarize, the monks strive to maintain a balance between ora et labora, prayer and work. Though outsiders can stay at the Abbey, the monks reside and work apart from visitors, and they are asked to remain silent when visiting the grounds of the Abbey. As you can imagine, this creates a most relaxing, peaceful and thoughtful environment, unlike anything I had ever experienced. As a secular researcher, thankful to have the approval to do research on Orval Abbey and beer, I soon realized I had to reconfigure my own approach to my doctoral fieldwork. The hospitality, generosity and sincerity I witnessed and read about these monks completely overwhelmed me. Monks are often misrepresented in popular culture and marketing (see Jonveaux 2011) and I sincerely wished to represent them as respectfully as I could. The only way I could conduct research is at a respectful distance. To be asking for more interviews with monks would be removing them from their prayer and work; to be talking to people on the grounds about their visit and perceptions of Orval beer would be disturbing the visitors' experience and violating the Abbey's rule of silence; to pester for a

longer stay would be directly opposing the monks' rule of accommodating all as I would be stealing someone else's opportunity to visit. Given all of these factors, I decided to limit my fieldwork at the Abbey.

My first trip to Belgium was in February-March 2019 when I spent two and a half weeks conducting preliminary research. I arrived in Brussels late on February 25<sup>th</sup>, 2019 and began exploring Brussels until travelling to Orval Abbey by train on the 28<sup>th</sup>. My time in Brussels was mostly spent preparing any sort of last-minute arrangements before heading to Orval Abbey and adapting to the time and cultural change. I visited the Beer Museum, located within the beautiful, tourist-riddled Grand Place in central Brussels. This small museum was housed in the basement and consisted of three rooms showcasing how beer is made and Belgian beer culture. It included an exemplary 18<sup>th</sup> century Belgian brewery and videos showcasing current brewing methods, accompanied by electronic dance music. Once done self-navigating, museumgoers may indulge in a Belgian beer, served in a tiny replica of Belgian bar with only two taps. Here I drank the Trappist option, a Chimay White. I participated in Brussels Beer Tasting Tour, where a local guide brought the group to two different bars, taught us the history of Belgian beer and local Brussels bar culture, and guided us through the tasting of one Trappist beer and three Belgian beer samples. On the February 28<sup>th</sup>, I took a train to Florenville and eventually a bus to Orval Abbey, which turned into a whole day affair due to train delays. For the next five days I stayed at the chalet at Orval Abbey. Meant for long-term guests, it includes a kitchenette and shared bathroom. Following, from March 6<sup>th</sup> to 11<sup>th</sup>, I rented a house in the neighbouring village of Villers-devant-Orval. During my stay here, I was able to meet with Frère Xavier, monk at Orval Abbey, whose responsibilities include économe de la communauté monastique [treasurer of the monastic community], cellérier [cellarer], and maître des novices [novice master], on three

occasions. We met in person for a preliminary discussion of my research project, next to conduct a recorded interview, and finally to have a tour of the brewery. He has a great wealth of knowledge and was endlessly generous. I also interviewed Dr. Marc Heyde, a physician and local historian of the Orval area. As President of Aurea Vallis et Villare, an association that promotes the architectural, historic and natural heritage of Orval, he provided me with rich resources and recommendations for studying this area. Otherwise, my time at Orval was spent exploring the grounds available to visitors (namely the courtyard), exploring the ruins and museum, and browsing the giftshop. All the while I also wrote fieldnotes, took pictures, gathered materials, such as flyers and advertisements, and purchased books not available back in Canada. On multiple occasions during this fieldwork visit and the next, I attended community prayers at the Abbey's church which took place at 5:00 a.m. (Vigils), 7:30 a.m. (Lauds), 12:00 p.m. (Sext), 5:30 p.m. (Vespers), and 8:00 p.m. (Compline). I also was able to bike to the nearby town of Stenay, France to visit the European Beer Museum, as well as to explore the village of Villerdevant-Orval and Florenville, taking particular note of local grocery stores, restaurants, and bars. On March 11<sup>th</sup>, I returned to Brussels on my way back to Canada, where I took the opportunity to visit Belgian breweries and bars, including Cantillon, a family-owned brewery established in 1900. It is one of the few brewing traditional Lambic beers in Brussels. I also visited Moeder Lambic and À la Mort Subite, both significant places of pilgrimage for Belgian beer lovers.

My second trip to the Abbey occurred in mid to late August 2019. I arrived in Brussels on August 19<sup>th</sup> 2019, and in Orval on August 20<sup>th</sup>; I returned to Canada on the 24<sup>th</sup>. This time, I rented a car to avoid dependency on infrequent, rural public transportation, as well as to have the opportunity for more efficient travel to Orval for a shorter fieldwork trip. I stayed at the hôtellerie, which was costlier than the chalet, but included continental breakfast as well as hot

lunch and dinner in a group setting. During this second trip I conducted another interview with Frère Xavier, and an interview with Orval brewery's ex-brewmaster, Jean-Marie Rock at his home in Florenville. I also had the opportunity to interview André Odwa, sales and marketing manager at Gengoulf Brewery in Villers-devant-Orval, just two kilometres away from Orval Abbey. Additionally, I interviewed Vital Streignart, production director at Rochefort Brewery within the Trappist walls Abbey Notre-Dame de Saint-Rémy, and Dimitri van Roy, tap room manager at the Brussels Beer Project. Once again, I took photographs, paying special attention to elements I missed last time. I continued to gather more flyers, pamphlets, and books on the Abbey and brewery. Facilitated by a vehicle, I was able to visit two other Trappist breweries: Rocherfort and Chimay. Rochefort is closed to the public but Streignart generously provided me with a tour of the brewery. They allowed me to take pictures and provided me with a lengthy interview; they were beyond generous with their time. I visited Chimay without a guide. There I participated in the self-guided tour called the "Chimay Experience" and tasted some of their beer and food at the Inn of Poteaupré nearby. Visiting these two other locations allowed me to compare Orval Abbey to its Belgian, Trappist counterparts.

Combined, these two fieldtrips to Orval and Belgium provided me with photographs, fieldnotes and interviews on which to base my study. In late 2019, however, I unfortunately lost most of the material on my laptop due to water damage. I lost most of my photographs and all interviews but one with Frère Xavier. Thankfully, I still had hard materials in my possession and fieldnotes from my visits. In 2020, I hoped to return to fill in any gaps by conducting additional fieldwork and redo interviews, but due to the COVID-19 epidemic, I was unable to do so. Like many graduate students, the COVID-19 pandemic greatly impacted my research. By March 15<sup>th</sup> 2020, I was laid off from my off-campus employment. Soon after I left the province to live with

my partner who still had secured employment. In addition, as just mentioned, the pandemic also prevented my planned return to Belgium for additional interviews and research in the summer of 2020. Without employment and funding, and given Memorial University's ban on travel, I "pivoted" my research to include interviews with American ambassadors for Belgian beer, Stu Stuart, Charles Cook, and Tom Peters. Two of these interviews were conducted online. I also turned to online beer reviews as a source for information that I could access from the safety of my own home. Though the final direction of my research was not the one I had originally planned, and finding a way past my mistakes and worldwide crisis was extremely stressful, I was able to successfully adapt to the circumstances. My greatest loss, of course, were my interviews and pictures from Belgium. However, the time I spent within Orval Abbey was essential to understanding the significance of the place in relation to the product. Staying within monastic walls and absorbing my surroundings informed my perception of living, religious communities, something that could not have been perceived from books. Meeting Belgian people and talking to them on the street truly solidified my understanding of Belgium as a proud beer nation. Building these connections would not have been possible without my physical presence in Belgium and Orval Abbey, but new skills such as working with online data and conducting lexical analysis and visualisation, would not have been possible without my change of direction.

The methodology for online review collection will be discussed in detail in Chapter Six, but to briefly summarize, I adopted computational folkloristic methods to collect a thousand reviews from three popular online beer reviewing websites and/or mobile device applications: Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate. Then, I used the online lexical analysis tool, Voyant Tools (<u>https://voyant-tools.org/</u>) to distinguish the most commonly used words within each

website/mobile device application and create word clouds. I used the visualization software Gephi (<u>https://gephi.org/</u>) to visualize networks and relations in these online reviews.

The participants I interviewed in-person signed consent forms and they were each able to keep a copy. Those interviewed virtually were provided the consent forms in PDF format sent by email and provided recorded consent at the beginning of the interviews. In addition to the forms, I provided a verbal description to all participants on the intent of my study and the use of their contribution to my research. I also supplied them with personal contact information if they had any questions in the future. Given that all online reviews used in this study were collected from public sites, which did not require membership or permission to access, I did not attempt to contact the reviewers to complete consent forms. Instead, I opted not to disclose any information about these individuals that was not on the public sites and I based my analysis solely on the texts and not the individuals. For example, in Chapter Six, I analyze the reviews as a collective, rather than identify individuals, rendering the data anonymous as much as possible. Where the reviews are referenced individually in Chapter Seven, I refer to reviews from BeerAdvocate by using the publicly visible username and the sources are cited.<sup>5</sup>

#### **Chapter Outline**

In the following dissertation I examine several types of narrative constructions of taste in relation to Orval beer from three perspectives: Belgian, Trappist and taste. In the first section, I explore narratives that convey meanings of the term "Belgian" in association with beer in general and Orval beer in particular. Part of Orval beer's prominence and stellar reputation comes from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> In addition to referring to the ethics committee's guidelines, I turned to Trevor Blank's article "Faux Your Entertainment: Amazon.com Product Reviews as a Locus of Digital Performance" and Jo Mackiewicz's article "The Co-Construction of Credibility in Online Reviews" as exemplary for ethical research focused on online reviews. For more on the ethics of conducting research on online forums, see Kozinets 2002, 65-66.

its association with Belgium, a place some argue is home to some of the best beers in the world. Chapter Two explores the history of beer in Belgium and its economic significance to the country. I examine Belgium's Patron Saints of Beer, Gambrinus and Saint Arnold(s), who are paired with a unique brewing history, to consider how they help construct Belgium as worthy of the inscription of "Beer culture in Belgium" on UNESCO's Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. Chapter Three expands on this heightened perception of Belgian beer through the lens of Belgian beer tourism. Here, I introduce the conversion narratives of Belgian beer enthusiasts and reflect on how their first consumption of Belgian beer led to an internal transformation. This chapter solidifies Belgium as a beer country by exploring the layered meaning of "Belgian" in association with beer.

Another factor in Orval's renown is that it is a highly regarded Trappist beer and in the next section I explore the significance of "Trappist" narratives to Orval beer. Chapter Four begins by exploring the Legend of Orval, the foundation legend of the Orval Abbey that dates to the 16<sup>th</sup> century and features the medieval countess, Matilda of Tuscany. I follow the legend with a historical account of the foundation of Orval Abbey by Benedictines in the 11<sup>th</sup> century, and its long history of construction, destruction, reconstruction and abandonment, until its eventual adoption in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century by the Order of Cistercians of Strict Observance (OCSO), whose monks are known as Trappists. Chapter Five investigates the Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label found on Orval beer as a protected form of designation. Drawing on the value construction of craft and nostalgic products, and the specific production requirements of ATP products, I identify a *terroir* of Orval beer.

The third and final section extends the examination of the role of personal narrative in creating Orval's taste. In Chapter Six, I use online reviews gathered from popular beer reviewing

websites and mobile device applications Untappd, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate to conduct a lexical analysis, construct word clouds using Voyant Tools (voyant-tools.org), and complete a network analysis and visualization using Gephi. This research helps identify what words are most commonly used on these online platforms to describe Orval beer, as well as the type of descriptors that help construct a sense of taste of Orval beer. Chapter Seven draws on reviews from BeerAdvocate to identify four qualities used to characterize Orval beer: contextual, sensory, personal and performative. This discussion demonstrates the dependency of sensory and non-sensory components within reviews and argues that these reviews act as narratives of taste to construct a story about Orval beer. The study ends with a brief conclusion that summarizes the main findings of each of the three sections.

Before moving onto the next chapter, however, it is essential to review the beer making process. It is important to explain how Orval beer is made because its process marks it as unique amongst other beers.

# How to Brew



Figure 1.1. Panoramic view of the Orval brewery and illustrated guide on how Orval beer is made. *Source:* Picture from Brasserie d'Orval 2012.

An alcoholic liquor obtained by the fermentation of malt (or other saccharine substance), flavoured with hops or other aromatic bitters. - Oxford English Dictionary, s.v. "beer"

This dictionary definition highlights beer's distinguishing factors: it is an alcoholic liquid, fermented, malt-based, and bitterly flavoured. These traits resonate well with the infamous German beer purity law of 1516, known as Reinheitsgebot, restricting beer's ingredients to water, barley malt, hops, and after its discovery in the late 17th century, yeast (Dornbusch and Hyese 2011, 693). I turn now to examine these four ingredients and how they are brought together to make beer. I use the examples of the pilsner, the "original" pale lager that is the most

popular beer type in the world and commonly referred to simply as "lager" (Brown 2011, 651), and compare it to the brewing process of Orval beer to highlight its unique qualities.

### Water

Beer is mostly water and though most waters can be used to make beer, the characteristics of this liquid can greatly impact the taste and quality of the finished product. John Palmer and Colin Kaminski's *Water: A Comprehensive Guide for Brewers* is one of the few tomes to take on water as their main subject matter for homebrewers and professional brewers alike. Water researcher and homebrewer A. J. deLange writes in its foreword, "potable water doesn't appear to directly contribute taste or aromas as potent as those from hops, malt and fermentation products, it is understandable that beginner brewers might conclude water is nothing more than a carrier for flavors from the other beer components" (2013, xvii). Indeed, homebrewers might make decent beer from their own unmodified tap water, however high quality and consistent brews requires an understanding of water chemistry and having the ability to manipulate it.

Anders Brinch Kissmeyer explains in *The Oxford Companion to Beer* (OCB), that historically within Europe, breweries were built near good sources of water and brewers adapted beer recipes to better fit the water type:

The composition of the local water impacted the beer styles and traditions that arose in many of the classical European beer countries or regions such as Plzeň (Pilsen) in the Czech Republic, Burton-on-Trent and London in England, Bavaria in Germany, Dublin in Ireland, Munich in Germany, and Vienna in Austria, etc.. (2011, 825)

The pilsner (also known as "pilsener" or "pils") is a pale, golden lager which originated in Pilsen, Czech Republic, claimed by the brewery Pilsner Urquell. The water in the area is very "soft," meaning that it contains a very low mineral (ion) content, namely that of calcium and magnesium<sup>6</sup>, which contributes to the pilsner's "soft and balanced" taste (Palmer and Kaminski 2013, 166). This beer, first brewed by Josef Groll in 1842, is considered the original pale lager. It is the style of beer that, as just mentioned, has since become the most popular in the world (Brown 2011, 652). Today's home or professional brewers might not have access to an unpolluted, local water source, however regulating water hardness, pH levels, and chemicals, such as chlorine and chloramine, in the water will significantly impact how the beer will brew and taste. Therefore, if wanting to make a pilsner-style beer without access to Pilsen water, the brewer would most likely used filtered water, such as reverse osmosis water, and add a small amount of appropriate salts, rather than attempting to adjust harder water (Palmer and Kaminski 2013, 166-167). DeLange notes that one can also work from the bottom up, meaning instead of manipulating the brew water by adding or removing minerals, one can choose the type of beer to brew based on the type of water at hand (Palmer and Kaminski 2013, xxi).

As for Orval beer, the website states the water is sourced from Mathilde's fountain, the local stream of water associated with the Legend of Orval (explored in Chapter 4, "Legend of Orval"). Beer writer Michael Jackson notes the Abbey's well water is "high in calcium carbonate," which "heightens the firmness and bitterness of the beer" (2008, 284). Stan Hieronymus writes in *Brew like a Monk: Trappist, Abbey, and Strong Belgian Ales and How to Brew Them*, "Orval adjusts the pH of its water, hard and high in bicarbonate. In 1993 the brewery lowered boiling pH from 5.2 to 5.0, creating a smoother bitterness" (2005, 56). This change was made by the master brewer at the time, Jean-Marie Rock, who altered the carbonate

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "The colloquial terms "hard water" and "soft water" actually came from the cleaning industry. The term "hard" means that is it hard to raise a lather due to the chemical binding of the soil-binding sites in soaps by calcium and magnesium ions" (Palmer and Kaminski 2013, 8).

to adjust the post-bitterness for a smoother beer, which was controversial to some (ibid.; Jackson 2008, 284).

#### Malt

Malt is a cereal grain, usually barley or wheat, that has been malted, that is to say, it has been steeped, germinated, and kilned, and sometimes stewed or roasted. Thomas Kraus-Weyermann writes in OCB that these processes are crucial to the resulting beer because, "The duration and temperature of these malting steps affect the technical characteristics of the different malts, as well as their flavor and color" (Kraus-Weyermann 2011a, 560). Additionally, and most importantly, malting alters the grain's internal structure, which ultimately activates the grain's internal enzymes. This in turn alters the grain's starches, proteins and acids. It might seem like a fairly complicated process, but as Kraus-Weyermann writes, malting is simply a controlled version of what happens naturally:

Seed kernels are hardy, compact enclosures...Unless harvested by humans or eaten by wild life, seeds drop to the ground in the fall and lie dormant during the winter...As the rays of the returning sun in springtime melt the snow and warm the soil, the kernels come to life by rapidly absorbing ambient moisture. During this hydration, biochemical changes take place inside the kernels, which initiate the development of roots and shoots, the beginning of new plants. The malting process attempts to harness exactly the same processes that occur in the field-in this case not for growing new plants, but for making beer. (ibid., 560)

The malted grains are then ground (known as "grist") and mixed with hot, temperaturecontrolled brewing water (known as "liquor") for a precise amount of time to create the "mash." Specifically, mashing converts the starches of the grain into fermentable sugars. After the mashing and removing the liquid from the spent grain (known as "lautering"), the grains will be rinsed with hot water to remove any residual sugars off the grain (known as "sparging"), and the resulting sweet liquid (known as "wort") will be moved to the brew kettle. The malting and the mashing are necessary steps to create "highly-soluble, fermentable sugars... [which] are rarely encountered in a free form in nature" (Hornsey 2003, vii).

Considering the pilsner, it is worth noting that there are three main varietals of the style, Bohemian/Czech, German and American, but here I am focusing on the first. The Bohemian pilsner uses 100% pilsner malt, "a type of pale lager malt made from two-row spring barley that is always highly modified...during malting and is kilned to an exceptionally blonde color" (Kraus-Weyermann 2011b, 652). In mid-19<sup>th</sup> century Bohemia, the use of pale malts would have been new in the region. Until that point, beers were typically dark due to the malt kilning being done with direct heat, whereas the relatively new "pale ale" in England at the time was made with malt kilned under indirect heat, rendering a lighter coloured malt. As a result, the pilsner malt provides a "soft, round, direct and sweetly malty" (Kraus-Weyermann 2011b, 653) taste to the classic, golden Bohemian pilsner.

For an Orval, Hieronymus writes that there are three pale malts and two caramels, the varieties of which are selected yearly by the brewmaster. Then, according to Hieronymus, the grain are mashed at 145°F (63°C), then up to 162°F (72°C), then lautered for about three hours. In an interview with Rock, Hieronymus writes that crystal, also known as caramel, malt are selected for their softness, whereas the pale malts can be harder. These malts, particularly the caramel/crystal malts, provide the amber, burnt orange colour to the wort, and some light roasted notes to the beer. In a homebrew immitation recipe found in *Brew like a Monks*, they recommend the grist bill containing 76% Moravian Pilsener Malt and 13% CaraVienna (2005, 252).

Hops

The wort is now transferred to the brew kettle where it is ready to be boiled. Charles W. Bamforth writes in the OCB, that this is typically a less than 90 minute process. It allows for the "inactivation of residual enzymes from the mash, isomerization of bittering hop  $\alpha$ -acids, sterilization of the wort, removal of unwanted volatiles, precipitation of unwanted proteins..., and concentration of the wort" (2011, 141). The bittering and preservative qualities of hops' alpha acids ( $\alpha$ -acids) are what led it to become a main ingredient in European beer in the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> century. Before this time, beers were usually bittered and preserved using an herb mixture called a "gruit," normally comprised of sweet gale, yarrow and wild rosemary. However, when the herbs became almost exclusively sold and highly taxed by the church,<sup>7</sup> breweries adopted hops which were thought to improve flavour and preservation of the beer (Poelmans and Swinnen 2011a, 4). Though hops are currently the standard (Cantwell 2011b, 411), their use in brewing was prohibited in regions in Europe until the fourteenth century in Holland and the midfifteenth century in Britain (Poelmans and Swinnen 2011a, 4). Hops are a cone-shaped flower that provides beer with "its backbone of bitterness, increases its microbiological stability, helps stabilize its foam, and greatly influences its taste and aroma" (Blake 2011, 459). The hops can be purchased kiln-dried and whole, but since the 1960s, they are often used in pellet form; pellets are composed of densely packed, dehydrated and pulverized hops. The amount of time the hops are boiled, the temperature the hops are boiled at, the quantity of alpha acids, and the quantity and type of essential oils in the hops, are all components which will greatly alter the flavors and aromas that occur in the resulting beer. Bittering (or "kettle") hops will be added near the beginning of the boil, whereas aroma (or "finishing") hops will be added within the last thirty

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The Gruitrecht was used as a way to tax breweries, as brewing beer without it was illegal. Additionally, "to avoid tax evasion, the exact composition of grut was kept secret" (Poelmans and Swinnen 2011a, 4).

minutes of the boil, and finally dry hopping is the addition of hops during primary or secondary fermentation, or to the finished beer, which provides intense hop aroma and flavour but not the bitterness (Oliver 2011d, 307-309).

In the case of the Bohemian pilsner, the noble<sup>8</sup> Saaz hop is used. It is native to the Czech Republic. According to Jamil Zainasheff and John J. Palmer's Brewing Classic Styles: 80 Winning Recipes Anyone Can Brew, their recipe for a Bohemian Pilsener calls for Czech Saaz hops, which has a low alpha acid content (3.5%) and delicate aromas, added to the brew in different quantities at different times which will provide the crisp, refreshing taste (2007, 60-62). When Orval's wort is transferred to be boiled, Styrian Golding and Hallertau hops in pellet and extract form are added to the ninety-minute boil, alongside a high amount of liquid candi sugar, which "provides 16 to 17% of fermentables" (Hieronymus 2005, 58). In the homebrew recipe, Perle and Goldings hops are used, and 11% of the grist bill consists of amber candi sugar (ibid., 252). Most of the characteristic hoppiness of Orval beer occurs during the dry-hopping, which occurs in secondary fermentation. Here, whole hop flowers in large meshed bags are placed in the beer. The varieties change, but Hieronymus reports Styrian Goldings being preferred by Rock (2005, 59). The hops added to the boil add a light bitterness to the boil, and the dryhopping provides a "dry freshness," and "peppery and refreshing" hop aroma and flavour (Jackson 2008, 285).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The noble hops is a term that came to be in the 1980s, "which there is neither a set definition nor agreement about which varieties should be included" though they typically include Halletauer Mittelfrüh, Spalter, Tettnanger and Saaz hops (Hieronymus 2012, 58).

Yeast

After the boil, the hopped wort is quickly cooled and moved to a fermentation tank for addition of yeast, which will transform the liquid into beer. According to Sylvie Van Zandycke in the OCB, the most common yeast used in beer fermentation is of the saccharomyces genera, which translates from Latin into "sugar fungus" (2011, 858). Simply put, the yeast eats the wort's sugars and "give off alcohol, carbon dioxide, and a range of flavors that we associate with beer" (2011, 858). There are two overarching types of yeast used in brewing: ale and lager. Ale yeast (saccharomyces cerevisiae) is a "top fermenting" yeast that ferments in warmer conditions (18°C to 24°C) and produces "more of the esters that lead to fruity and/or complex flavors and aromas" (Dunn 2011, 33). Lager yeast (saccharomyces pastrorianus) is a hybrid of saccharomyces cerevisiae and saccharomyces bayanus developed in the late 1800s in Bavaria, resulting in a "bottom fermenting" yeast that ferments in cooler conditions (5°C to 14°C), ferments more of the sugars (and the sugar melibiose unlike its ale counterpart) which results in a crisper tasting beer (Sherlock 2011, 535), and is the most popular type of beer brewed today. On rare occasions wild yeasts are used to ferment beers, such as in lambics and other spontaneously fermented beers. In these cases, instead of adding a yeast strain to a closed batch of wort, the beer is intentionally left open to be contaminated and fermented by "locally and naturally occurring wild yeasts and bacteria" (Taylor 2011, 537) in the air; at other times this type of contamination is undesirable as it can lead to off-flavours and negatively affect the quality of the beer (Van Zandycke 2011, 860).

Turning back to the pilsner, it originated during a revolutionary time for beer, combining the kilned malt that resulted in a light colour and taste from England and the newly developed lager yeast of Bavaria. The malt and yeast combined with the local soft water and noble Saaz

hop, created the first pilsner and therefore the first pale lager, whose "golden, clear, malty, hoppy, and bittersweet" (Protz 2011, 654) liquid inspired the pale lagers that have taken over today's global beer market (Kraus-Weyermann 2011b, 652).

Finally, primary fermentation for Orval beer occurs with a sixteen-generation, primary ale yeast that is "a flocculent, single-cellstrain, low in esters" (Jackson 2008, 285), fermenting between 57°F (14°C) and 72°F (22°C) for four days (Hieronymus 2005, 59). Secondary fermentation follows at 59°F (15°C), adding a yeast with "multiple strains, including one of Brettanomyces" (ibid.), as well as the dry hop flowers. This addition of the wild yeast, Brettanomyces, "promotes the typical "hop sack" and "fresh leather" aromas, they also consume sugars that conventional yeast cannot convert, making for a light, firm, body and more alcohol" (Jackson 2008, 285). After two or three weeks (Orval 2015), the beer is centrifuged to remove some of the old yeast, and then bottled alongside additional sugar and primary yeast to carbonate the beer (Hieronymus 2005, 60). This bottle conditioning allows the beer to ferment and mature for three to five weeks at 59°F (15°C), resulting in a high carbonation of "10 grams of carbon dioxide (5 volumes) per liter in the bottle" (ibid.). The beer is not pasteurised to allow for bottle conditioning, and lack of filtration and addition of yeast results in sediment in the bottom of the bottle. The resulting beer is recommended to be served between 46°F (10°C) and 56°F (15°F), poured in a glass, leaving the sediment in the bottle. Orval Abbey's website writes:

Serving an Orval is an art.

Below are a few practical tips. Open the bottle by using a good bottle opener securely held in the hand. Never use another object for this such as a lighter, a knife, etc. When opening, apply some pressure to the cap so that it stays on the bottle. You will hear the pressure escaping from the bottle. When removing the cap, you will notice that it stays on the open bottle.

Slowly pour the beer into a special Orval glass without shaking the bottle. Hold the bottle horizontally and slightly tilt the glass. In a flowing movement, slowly straighten it until only one cm is left in the bottle.

Enjoy ! (Orval Abbey n.d.b.)

Due to the higher alcohol percentage, about 6.2% ABV, and the bottle conditioning, Orval beer's best before date is five years after bottling. Due to the present Brettanomyces yeast in particular, Orval is often "cellared" as there are distinguishable changes in flavours over the beer over time, Jackson writes:

When the beer is not long out of the brewery, its hop aromas and flavour seems especially peppery and refreshing. At four or five months, the beer pours with a huge head. By six months, its combination of yeasts is beginning to impart some wild, Brettanomyces and lactic, lemon-zest, characteristic. At one year, I have found it to be very dry and perfumy, with a notable creamy head. Some drinkers like three years. At five years, the "best before" date settled upon to please the bureaucrats, it will still be good, but will probably have lost a lot of its hop character. (2008, 285-6)

It was not uncommon for particular enthusiasts to enjoy an Orval long past its best before date. Additionally, because of the variability of this beer based on age, many participate in "vertical tastings" of Orval beer, which consists of tasting Orval beer produced at different ages side-byside (Mosher 2007, 138).

Each of the ingredients selected and the specific brewing process are particular to Orval beer. All of these repeated choices on behalf of Orval Brewery provide its beer with its unique sensory characteristics. What initially attracted me to the Orval beer was its story – I heard about it years before I had the opportunity to take my first sip. The prestige of Orval beer as a prestigious Belgian and Trappist product was already known to me when I was having my sensory experience. Both the contextual and sensory aspects contribute to a rich story of Orval beer's taste. The discussion of Orval's taste begins where many folklore analyses originate: in a consideration of context. The context in which a product is produced greatly influences the tasting experience, and I believe this is best explored through narratives. I begin this folkloric approach to taste in the first section with a look into what separates Belgian beers from the rest.

#### **SECTION II: NARRATING BELGIAN**

My first trip to the Abbey in late February 2019 was a lot more of a struggle than I had initially anticipated. The nearest town with train stop, shops and grocery stores is Florenville, almost nine kilometers from the Abbey. Luckily, there is a bus that travels near my destination, however the sparsity of the public transit system was made evident when I discovered that they mostly operated on the schedule of the school system in the area, running in the morning and in the evening, bringing children from their small communities to and from Florenville where the schools are located. Travelling from Brussels, the four-hour trip I expected to take soon doubled due to a delayed train to Libramont, which made me miss my next train to Florenville, and in turn miss a bus to the Abbey. In my foolish city-dweller thinking, I thought a taxi system might have existed in the area, but once I hopped off the train in Florenville and began walking the two kilometers to the center of town, it became obvious that no such company would exist in such an underpopulated town. I sat at the bus station for two hours, shivering as the temperature dropped and snuggling up to my large rucksack. Finally, I was relieved to see children begin piling at the stop with large binders in hand, followed soon by my bus. It was at this bus stop, cold and overwhelmed with the work ahead of me, that I decided on my next trip I would rent a car.

I did discover, however, that one of the pleasures of being a young woman in rural Belgium is that other older, local women will lend a ride. When I walked alongside the road, which I did either as a result of my impatience with the infrequent buses or simply to visit an area the transit system did not reach, they often stopped and offered me a lift. On one such occasion, I agreed to a ride and the woman asked me what brought me to the area. Thankfully able to speak French, I explained I was a Canadian folklore graduate student conducting fieldwork at Orval Abbey. She recommended I look into Dr. Marc Heyde, a local physician and

community historian who has written quite a bit on the topic. As we chatted more on our short trip, she mentioned she doesn't particularly care for Orval beer. Admittedly slightly wounded by the comment, I asked if she enjoys beer in general, to which she exclaimed, "Bien sûr! Je suis Belge!" (Of course! I am Belgian!)<sup>9</sup>. Her rebuttal did not take me by surprise, as beer writers have long echoed this relationship between the Belgium and beer, as noted in Garrett Oliver's quote at the beginning of the previous chapter.

In this section, I explore what it means for Orval beer to be "Belgian" by focusing on narratives that construct a "Belgian" taste. The first chapter provides a social and economic history of beer in Belgium. I provide a brief history of agriculture and beer production in the area of modern-day Belgium and a short overview of the historical Belgian beer economy. Alongside the adoption of beer production, there were also popular legends of saints and kings associated with beer that became part of national lore and that wove beer into the country's past. I take up some of these legends before discussing the 2016 inscription "Beer culture in Belgium" on UNESCO's Intangible Cultural Heritage list and issues of beer nationalism and globalization. The second chapter in this section explores Belgian beer from the angle of tourism. Still touching on the nation's economy, I investigate beer tourism as a form of culinary tourism or, as David Bell terms it, "alcotourism" (2008). Here I also draw on interviews with three American Belgian beer specialists: Stu Stuart from Belgium Beer Me!, Belgian Beer specialist Charles "Chuck" Cook, and Tom Peters, owner of the "simply best Belgian beer bar in the United States" (Jackson 2008, 476), Monk's Café in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. To build on Clifford Geertz (1973, 448), this section considers the importance of beer to stories Belgians tell them about themselves and unpacks the significance of Orval beer's identification as a Belgian beer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> All French sources translated to English are my own.

#### **Chapter Two**

#### Brewed Belgium: A Social and Economic History of Beer in Belgium

Bien entendue, la bière, boisson nationale, est aussi présente : une rue de la Brasserie, rue du Germoir, rue du Houblon, rue de l'Orge, rue de la Levure, rue des Brasseurs, et, autrefois, la rue du Malt.... Bruxelles, ville de gueule.

[Of course, beer, the national beverage, is also present: Brewery Road, Malthouse Road, Hop Road, Barley Road, Yeast Road, Brewers Road, and previously, Malt Road... Brussels, mouth city.]

- Léo Moulin, L'Europe à table

To understand the significance of beer in Belgium, one must first consider the history of beer within this geographic region as well as its economic significance in shaping the country. The movement towards a domestication of plants and animals occurred globally in at least seven distinct parts of the world in the past 10,000 years. Some of this domestication took place through agriculture colonization, meaning that colonizers moved into an area with their crops and livestock, while other times the hunters and gatherers of a region adopted farming on their own volition. In Greece and central Europe, agricultural practices are linked to the spread of farmers and their livestock (namely sheep, goats, cattle and pigs) and crops (namely barley, wheat and legumes) from the Levant and Zagros during the Neolithic era (Bogucki 1996, 242), whereas in Northern and Western Europe, indigenous adoption of agricultural practices is deemed more prevalent (ibid., 249-52). Agriculture within central Europe occurred around 5600 B.C., reaching the eastern edges of today's Belgium around 5000 B.C.<sup>10</sup> It is worth noting that it was fairly common for Neolithic Europeans to gradually adopt agricultural practices as supplement to their hunting, fowling and fishing; many maintained a semi-agrarian lifestyle until

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Even in "traditionally" wine consuming areas, such as France, Spain, Portugal and Northern Italy, beer was popularly consumed up until the overtaking of the Greek and Roman empires (see Nelson 2003).

3000 B.C. along the loess belt<sup>11</sup> (ibid. 251). The adoption of agricultural practices in Europe was simultaneously to the production of beer.

Eline Poelmans and Johan F. M. Swinnen write in "From Monasteries to Multinationals (and Back)" that "in what is now France, Spain, Portugal and Northern Italy people drank beer, not wine in the millennia before the Greek and Roman empires" (2011b, 2). Although in the fifth century B.C., Greeks began to show distain for beer and to favor wine (Nelson 2005, 25), by the early Middle Ages, beer was popular in northern regions of Europe. This was partly because the climate was more favorable to growing barley than grapes (Poelmans and Swinnen 2011b, 3). A beer economy began with the erection of monasteries across Europe around 800 A.D., with the spread of the Holy Roman Empire by Charlemagne. Monasteries would produce goods, such as beer and wine, for their own consumption as well as for "guests, pilgrims and the poor" (ibid.). This was the first time beer was manufactured on a commercial scale, and not at home for personal consumption. To avoid the "drunken monk" archetype and medieval drunkenness stereotypes, it is worth noting that the high consumption of beer by monks and Abbey visitors at this time was due to the fact that beer was safer to drink than polluted water. As a result of boiling and fermentation, beer had important spiritual and medicinal properties (similar to that of wine), beer was a source of nutrition and cheap to produce, and beer was not considered a drug or food, but a liquid, so it could be consumed during fasting periods (especially by monks) (ibid., 3-4). Belgian sociologist and historian Léo Moulin writes that most alcoholic beverages went through a monastic phase because, "les moines étaient les seuls à avoir des réserves de vin, de

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> "From Ukraine to Belgium stretches a very important region for early farming in central Europe. I have termed this area the loess belt, so named for the pockets of fertile soil called *loess*, a wind-blown sediment deposited under periglacial conditions during the ice age that ended 12,000 years ago. In some areas, where the sediment was trapped by hills and basins, the loess blankets the landscape dozens of meters thick. Small river and creeks cut through the loess to form a dendritic drainage patterns. Loess is very fertile but also very dry. The moister zones are the floodplains of the streams rather than the watersheds that separate them" (Bogucki 1996, 43).

fruits et de grain, les moyens financiers et technologiques de les traiter, l'intelligence et l'esprit d'observation, unis a l'esprit d'invention, pour le faire, les capacités de laisser vieillir le produit, etc." [the monks were the only ones to have kept wines, fruit, and grain, the financial means and technology to process the products, the intelligence and observational mind, united with their inventive spirit, to produce; the capacity to let products age, etc.] (1975, 75). Monks had the physical space, long-term mindset, and intelligence for beer production.

With the growing wealth of the general public in Europe in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, came a higher demand for beer, Poelmans and Swinnen write:

In the Early Middle Ages, many people only drank beer at religious festivities because it was free. Incomes were too low to sustain a large demand for beer. Demand for beer increased in the late fourteenth and fifteenth centuries with income growth, expansion of trade and towns, and increasing awareness of water pollution. (2011b, 5)

Monasteries were brewing on a commercial scale as mentioned, however, they were not seen as commercial ventures because the beer produced was largely consumed on premises by peasants and the monks themselves. Growth in income was in line with a growth in trade which resulted in an increased "demand for lodging facilities, food and drink [and] led to the emergence of 'inns' and 'taverns'" (ibid., 5). This financial growth, and the declining power of the Catholic Church in Europe during the early sixteenth century, meant that commercial breweries soon dominated monastic breweries (ibid.).

In an article by Koen Deconick, Eline Poelmans and Swinnen, "How Beer Created Belgium (and the Netherlands): The Contribution of Beer Taxes to War Finance during the Dutch Revolt" (2016), the authors write that the taxes on beer during the Dutch Revolt (1566-1648) allowed for the Dutch Republic to break from their Spanish occupation, "leaving the territory of present-day Belgium behind as the remainder of the Spanish Low Countries" (2016, 695). Beginning in the 14<sup>th</sup> century, the Low Countries were governed by the Duchy of

Burgundy, consisting of the land of modern-day Belgium, Netherlands and Luxembourg, as well as parts of France and Germany. To quickly summarize a very tumultuous time in European history, the Dutch Revolt was against their sovereign, King Philip II of Spain, led by the governor of the provinces of Holland, Zeeland and Utrecht in the northern Low Countries, William I of Orange. In the 16th century, the three Catholic provinces of the southern Low Countries (Hainaut, Artois, and Douai), sought independence from the Protestant north and signed the Union of Arras in 1579. They expressed their loyalty to Phillip II, forming what is known as the Spanish Low Countries. In response, William I signed the Union of Utrecht, uniting the provinces of the northern Low Countries. After much bloodshed, land claim and disputes, the Dutch Revolt ended with the signing of the 1648 Treaty of Münster as part of the Europe-wide Peace of Westphalia, and the Dutch Republic (what was the northern Low Countries led by William I) was recognized as an independent state, finally having gained recognition of their national sovereignty. This division between north and south, Dutch Republic and Spanish Netherlands was a monumental event that formed the recognizable border between the countries of the Netherlands and Belgium today (fig. 2.2, fig. 2.3).

In 1714, the Spanish Netherlands was handed to the Austrian Habsburg dynasty and, beginning in 1745, invasion and conflict with the French ensued. In 1795, the region became part of France, and in 1815 the Kingdom of the Netherlands. Finally, in 1831, Belgium gained its independence under King Leopold (Oliver 2011a, 120). Deconick, Poelmans and Swinnen focus on Holland because it was the Dutch Republic's wealthiest, most densely populated and most influential province. In 1574, Holland introduced excise taxes on 'common means' products such as "wine, beer, milled grain, peat, slaughtered cattle, soap and fish" (2016, 705) in order to subsidize war. A substantial portion of the revenues were from the taxations of beer:

In 1575 the beer and wine excise jointly accounted for 44% of excise tax revenues. Assuming beer accounted for three quarters, this puts contribution of the beer excise in total excise tax revenues at 33% in 1575. (ibid.)

In this sense, beer taxes greatly funded the Dutch Republic's war against the Spanish Netherlands, allowing them to break from Spanish rule and ultimately helped shape them as a country. As seen in figures 2.2 and 2.3, these beer taxes shaped the borders of Belgium (formerly the Spanish Netherlands) and the Netherlands (formerly the Dutch Republic) into what we recognize today.

# **Belgian Brewers' Annual Report**

Still today, beer plays a significant role in Belgium's economy. The Belgian Brewers is a professional association uniting almost all Belgian breweries with a corporate purpose to "inform, support and advise breweries established in Belgium on issues related to the sector of Belgian beer and by providing in due time correct information to members or public bodies in order to anticipate effectively problems, incidents and challenges" (Belgian Brewers n.d.). The Belgian Brewers' *Annual Report 2019* notes a total of 340 breweries with 1,500 different beers and producing a total of 25 million hectolitres (hl) of beer (4). The Belgian Federal Planning Bureau estimates the beer sectors (directly and indirectly) contribute 4 billion EUR to the Belgian economy (ibid.). In 2019, of the beer produced, approximately 72% was exported (18.1 million hl), making Belgium for the third year running the largest beer exporter in Europe (ibid., 5, 39-40). Of the beers exported, about 12.9 million hl remain in European Union, while the remaining 5.3 million hl travels outside the EU (fig 2.4) (ibid., 40).



Figure 2.2. "The Low Countries with the border of 1648. After 1648: top: The Dutch Republic (Republic of the Seven United Provinces); bottom: The Spanish Netherlands." *Source:* Map by Walter Leisering, printed in Deconick, Poelmans, and Swinnen 2016, 697.



Figure 2.3. "Present-day borders between Belgium and the Netherlands." *Source:* Map by Walter Leisering, printed in Deconick, Poelmans, and Swinnen 2016, 698.

The Belgian Brewers conduct an annual survey named the "beer barometer" with the help of the Beer & Society Information Centre online (ibid., 12-13). The 2019 poll received 8,174 responses through the websites Het Laatste Nieuws and 7sur7.be. In light of the lager beer revolution of the mid- to late 19<sup>th</sup> century that began with the pilsner, it is perhaps unsurprising that in Belgium lagers are the preferred style of beer (23.6%), followed by strong blonds (15.1%), local beer (14.2%), Trappist (13.2%) and Abbey beer (12.8%). Beer consumption has greatly diminished since the 1990s in Belgium, although there has been a slight rise in recent years. Belgians consumed about 7 million hl of beer in 2019 (ibid., 41), making for an average of 68L of beer consumed per capita annually. Although the Czech Republic is the European leader in beer consumption, averaging 142 litres per capita annually (Brewers of Europe n.d.), the beer barometer survey indicates that 96.3% of Belgians think that Belgium is a beer country (Belgian Brewers 2019, 13).

What makes a beer nation? Belgians didn't invent beer, nor do they drink the most per capita (fig. 2.7) or produce the most within Europe (fig. 2.5). Nevertheless, they are the largest exporters in Europe (fig. 2.6) and, perhaps most significantly, a vast majority of Belgians consider Belgium a beer nation. As discussed above, beer prospered within Belgium's geographic region due to its cooler climate and beer taxes helped literally shape Belgium as a country. These historical narratives contribute to a larger story about Belgian beer; they are narratives that help support and sustain Belgium as a beer nation, as Belgians see themselves.


Figure 2.4. Top destination countries worldwide by percentage of exported Belgian beer in the year 2019. *Source:* Data from Belgian Brewers 2019.



Figure 2.5. Production of beer in millions of hectolitres (hl) in 2019 in the European Union. *Source:* Data from Brewers of Europe n.d.



Figure 2.6. Exportation of beer outside country of production in millions of hectolitres (hl) in 2019 in the European Union. *Source:* Data from Brewers of Europe n.d.



Figure 2.7. Consumption of beer in litres (L) per capita in the year 2019. Source: Data from Brewers of Europe n.d.

# **Belgium's Patron Saints of Beer**

Outside of agricultural and economical history, two saints associated with beer and brewing have connections to Belgium, namely, Gambrinus and Saint Arnold(s). Gambrinus is a mythical king who invented beer. Saint Arnold's origins are rooted in oral storytelling traditions though his popularity spread after the publication of his tales by a French author in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Saint Arnold can refer interchangeably to Saint Arnold of Metz and Saint Arnold of Oudenburg, even though the two lived centuries apart. That breweries and beer brands have been named after these legendary figures helps to emphasize Belgium's long-standing identity as a beer nation and the homeland of not only great beer, but of beer legends and saints.

# King Gambrinus

King Gambrinus, or Cambrinus or Gambrivius<sup>12</sup>, is a legendary Flemish king said to have invented beer. This folk legend was published by the French author Charles Deulin in his 1868 collection of short stories *Contes d'un buveur de bière [Tales from a Beer Drinker*], titled "Cambrinus, Roi de la Bière" [Cambrinus, King of Beer]<sup>13</sup>. Although lengthy, I opted to provide a summary of the text in English as it reveals the significant relationship between Flemish and Belgian life and beer. It goes as follows:

Cambrinus is an apprentice glassblower in Fresnes-sur-Escaut, Flanders that falls deeply in love with Flandrine<sup>14</sup>, the master glassblower's daughter. However, due to his low class, she refuses to marry him. Out of desperation to win her over, he quits glassblowing and learns to play the viol<sup>15</sup> and masters it very quickly. When playing in public, the crowd dances and cheers to his music, but once Flandrine walks in, Cambrinus gets flustered and gaffs his performance. The dancers are convinced the musician is now mocking them, rendering them enraged, attacking Cambrinus, and breaking his viol. An odd, local judge, nicknamed Jocko, decides to bring the dancers and Cambrinus to trial. Bribed by the dancers with fat chickens, the judge sentences Cambrinus to one year in prison for assault and disturbance of the peace.

Following his release, Cambrinus, embarrassed and depressed, decides to take his own life. Just as he was placing the noose around his neck, a man in a green hunting outfit appears before him. After a bit of confusion, the mysterious man removes his hat revealing his horns,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> When summarizing the tale of Gambrinus by Deulin, I have decided to use his spelling of "Cambrinus", however otherwise will be using "Gambrinus" as it is the most common English spelling.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> After such popularity of this tale, Charles Deulin would write another book singularly featuring tales of Cambrinus titles *Tales of King Cambrinus* in 1874.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The lady love's name "Flandrine," which is a feminine adjective meaning "from Flanders," the Flemish-speaking northern portion of Belgium (*Larousse*, s.v. "Flandrin/Flandrine").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> "A musical instrument (in common use from the fifteenth to the eighteenth century) having five, six, or seven strings and played by means of a bow" (*Oxford English Dictionary*, s.v. "viol").

confirming he is the Beelzebub. Cambrinus is confused and asks what he is doing there, to which the devil replies that he has just retrieved the soul of Jocko, and now he is waiting for Cambrinus as "Tous les pendus sont gibier d'enfer" [All hangmen are hell's prey]. He makes a deal with the devil that in exchange for promising his soul to the devil in 30 years, he will help Cambrinus fall out of love with Flandrine. The devil then provides a tip for Cambrinus's sadness: replace his love for Flandrine with the love of games and gambling.

Soon, Cambrinus gains a massive amount of gold, and thinks to himself that perhaps this would be enough to win over Flandrine. Alas, when Cambrinus approaches her again, she refuses him because he is not a *gentilhomme* [gentleman]. Once again desperate, Cambrinus is about to hang himself. The green hunter appears and this time recommends he drink wine to forget his sorrows.

Now Cambrinus is spending his time drinking the best wines in the world day and night but he finds that it only made his love grow fonder. He moves on to other alcoholic beverages from across Europe, and still the same. Excited and enraged, he decides once again to take his own life, and as his body falls with the noose around his neck, the Beelzebub catches him. Cambrinus is annoyed and angry at the Beelzebub not allowing him to take his own life, or providing any real relief from his broken heart, but finally the devil shows him the true cure to his love sickness: beer. "C'est avec l'orge & le houblon, lui dit Belzébuth, qu'à l'exemple de ces hommes tu fabriqueras le vin flamand, autrement dit la bière" [With barley and hops, said the Beelzebub, and with the help of these men, you will make Flemish wine, that is to say, beer]. Still angry at the way the people of Fresnes treated him and his viol, the devil provides the

lovesick man with instructions on how to make a magical carillon<sup>16</sup> which forces people to dance. Finally signing in blood, the deal is made.

Cambrinus returns to Fresnes, and though mocked by locals, he builds his magical carillon and a brewery. Finally, when ready, he prepares white and brown ales, and opens on a Sunday for the public. Initially the guests are disgusted by the beers but Cambrinus begins playing the carillon which forces them to dance. Soon all men, women children dance, alongside animals, furniture and houses. They plead for Cambrinus to stop, but he refuses to until they plead for a drink. Now, they drink the beer but this time they adore it! As soon as they have a few pints, they ask Cambrinus to play some more music for them to dance to. Every day following, locals willingly visit to drink beer and dance to the tune of the carillon and soon people from all over begin visiting for these reasons. Soon the carillon and beer begin to spread to other cities and countries. Though many different varieties of beer are brewed and many carillons built and played, the best beer and only enchanted carillon is exclusively in Fresnes. Soon, Cambrinus becomes King of the Low Countries, Duke of Brabant, Count of Flanders and Lord of Fresnes, and he founds the town of Cambrai. More importantly, he gains the title of King of Beer. After about six months, Flandrine hears of Cambrinus's successes and approaches the new king, only for him to no longer recognize her.

Thirty years pass, and the Beelzebub decides to retrieve Cambrinus's soul. He chooses one of his prisoners from hell to do his work: the infamous judge, Jocko. However, once Jocko arrives in Fresnes to retrieve Cambrinus's soul, his body is set to dancing by the enchanted carillon and he becomes so tired and thirsty when the music stops that he begins drinking. Drinking, dancing and making friends with the locals, he completely forgets about his mission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> "A musical instrument, or appendage to one, to imitate a peal of bells" (*Oxford English Dictionary*, s.v. "carillon").

He falls asleep on the side of the road for three days and three nights, to finally awaken too embarrassed to return to Fresnes or to hell. He hides by living out the rest of his days as a poor man. After almost a hundred years, Gambrinus dies and the Beelzebub comes to retrieve his soul but finds a keg of beer in his place<sup>17</sup>.

This tale by Charles Deulin would have been inspired by popular lore. Dick Cantwell writes in The Oxford Companion to Beer, "The stories of Gambrinus, in fact, are a pastiche of historical appearances by a number of actual personages and embellishments of the storyteller's art" (2011a, 383). One potential inspiration could have been Jan Primus or John I, Duke of Brabant (1251-1295), a folk hero in his own right, known for his chivalry and as being a "bon viveur" (Jackson 2008, 16). William Walsh writes that it is possible that this association was made due to "his portrait suspended in their guildhaus represented him as clad in all the ducal insignia and holding a foaming tankard in his left hand" (1915, 117), which in turn could have been misconstrued over time as a representation of the inventor or king of beer (also see Lippincott 1888, 134-6). This Duke's name and likeness is used on the popular Dutch brewery Hertog Jan (fig. 2.8), seemingly identical to portrayals of King Gambrinus. Another potential inspiration could be Jean sans Peur ("John the Fearless") (1371-1419) who had many titles, including that of the Duke of Burgundy and Count of Flanders, and "who in some versions carries the distinction of inventing hopped beer, but whose biography mainly carries a history of courtly and political intrigue" (Cantwell 2011a, 383). Indeed, as Michael Jackson writes in Great Beers of Belgium, "Gambrinus is usually considered to be a corruption of the 13th-century "Jan Primus", or Duke Jean I" (2008, 26).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> This telling is a paraphrase and translation of Charles Deulin's "Cambrinus, Roi de la Bière" (1868, 3-10).

Gambrinus's many names and likenesses have been used for a wide range of beer related products. Gambrinus beer brewed by Pilsner Urquell has been a popular beer from the Czech Republic since 1869 (fig. 2.9). In Belgium, the famed, small family brewery Cantillon founded in 1900, brews exclusively lambics. It makes a Rosé de Gambrinus, a blend of lambics and raspberries (about 200g of raspberries per litre of beer) (fig. 2.10). The image of Gambrinus is also highly recognized outside of Europe. For example, there is a famous statue of King Gambrinus proudly holding a pint of beer at the "Best Place" at the historical Pabst Brewing Company in Milwaukee, Wisconsin. This brewery was originally established as the Best Brewing Co. by John Best in 1844 but was eventually taken over and renamed by his son-in-law in 1889. According to an article by Brian Jacobson in the *Urban Milwaukee*, an original wooden sculpture of King Gambrinus was commissioned in 1857, but after it badly deteriorated, a new metal version was made in 1966 (fig. 2.11) (Jacobson 2011). When the brewery headquarters moved to San Antonio, Texas in 1996, the statue was relocated. Finally, in 2011, it was returned to its original home in Milwaukee.



Figure 2.8. Beer label of Dutch brewery Hertog Jan, in the likeness of Jan Primus or John I, Duke of Brabant (1251-1295). *Source:* Label from Untappd, accessed June 25, 2021, <u>https://untappd.com/b/hertog-jan-pilsener/94130</u>.



Figure 2.9. Beer label of the Czech brewery Gambrinus. *Source:* Label from Untappd, accessed June 25, 2021, <u>https://untappd.com/b/plzenskyprazdroj-gambrinus-patron-12-plna-12-premium-12/1565708.</u>



Figure 2.10. Beer label of the Belgian brewery Cantillon's Rosé de Gambrinus. *Source:* Label from BeerMenus, Accessed June 25, 2021. <u>https://www.beermenus.com/beers/534-cantillon-rosede-gambrinus/label</u>.



Figure 2.11. Statue of King Gambrinus in the "Best Place" at the historical Pabst Brewing Company in Milwaukee, Wisconsin. *Source:* Picture by Brian Jacobson 2011.

The extravagant tales of King Gambrinus, the use of his likeness in statues and advertisements, and his debated origins as either based on real medieval figures, fabricated through oral tradition, or a literary creation of Deulin's, is reminiscent of the North American folk hero Paul Bunyan and his propagation in popular culture. Robert E. Walls describes Paul Bunyan in American Folklore: An Encyclopedia as a "giant, fictitious logger capable of Herculean deeds and perhaps America's best-known folk hero, a demigod symbolic of American aspirations and identity" (1996, 216). Researchers have identified the existence of probable "Bunyan tales among late-19th-century loggers in eastern Canada and the American Northeast and Upper Midwest," (ibid., 217) however Bunyan's widespread popularity came with the publication of several essays by journalist James McGillivray under the title "The Round River Drive" in various newspapers in the Upper Midwest in 1906 and 1910 (ibid.). Beginning in 1914, William B. Laughead began running campaigns for Red River Lumber Company in Akeley, Minnesota featuring Paul Bunyan and he distributed free illustrated booklets of Bunyan tales. Through the 1920s and 1930s other writers wrote stories featuring the folk hero, and later cartoons, children's books, giant statues and more rendered him an easily recognizable figure.<sup>18</sup>

Bunyan's vague origins and rapid popularization through commercial uses led some folklorists to criticize the figure as an inauthentic example of folklore. Richard M. Dorson, who coined the term "fakelore," identified Paul Bunyan as a prime example (1956a; 1956b; 1976). Dorson's concern was that "authors, editors, and publishers [have] misled and gulled the public" into believing Bunyan tales were transcribed from oral tales, when in reality "these parlor

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> For example, Paul Buyan has been the topic of children's books by Ida Virginia Turney (1928) and Harold Felton (1947), poems by Robert Frost (1921, quoted in Hoffman 1951, 14n6) and Shel Silverstein (1974), there are large statues of Paul Bunyan across North America, namely in Portland, Oregon and Bemidji, Minnesota, Walt Disney Studios had a 1958 animated musical short titled *Paul Bunyan*, and in it is reported in 1941 W. H. Auden wrote a unpublished operetta titled "Paul Bunyan" (Hoffman 1951, 14).

folklorists did no fieldwork, adapted printed sources that were themselves suspect, invented out of whole cloth, emphasized jolly, cute, and quaint, and contrived a picture of American folksiness wholly false to social reality" (Dorson 1976, 5). Dorson worried that Bunyan's spurious origins threatened the integrity of the discipline of folklore.

Alan Dundes swooped in as the voice of reason, identifying both folklore and fakelore as one and the same. Rather, he raised questions as to why Paul Bunyan had become such an important symbol for the American public. Whether invented folklore or not, Paul Bunyan lived on as a meaningful folk hero. Dundes provided earlier examples of "fakelore," such as the Ossian poems published in the 1760s by James Macpherson, which were proven to be mostly a fabrication by Macpherson rather than a true collection of ancient poems from the Scottish highlands (1985, 6-7). Even though the authenticity of his collections were debated, "it stimulated an interest in the poetry of the common man throughout Europe" (ibid., 8). Dundes also pointed to Jakob and Wilhelm Grimm's Kinder- und Hausmärchen and Elias Lönnrot's Kalevala, noting that though the origins of both had been disputed, they were adopted as folklore. Dundes argued that the popularity of these works was in part because they conformed to popular, and romanticized, notions of the past and of nationhood. He claimed, "In all cases, the country in question was suffering from a severe case of an inferiority complex" (ibid., 11). According to Dundes, on the world stage, Scotland was constantly under scrutiny by England, Germany was considered backwards in comparison to its neighbours, Finland was dominated by the Swedes, and America was seen as the uncultured, naïve younger brother of England and Europe.

Returning to Paul Bunyan, though there are researchers who can date some of his tales to 19<sup>th</sup> century logger tales from Canada and northern United States, it is not the pedigree of the

folk hero that matters. Bunyan's significance is that 20<sup>th</sup> century Americans adopted him as an important figure in American folklore. As Dundes states "Folklorists cannot prevent people from believing that fakelore is folklore" (ibid., 10). A folklorist's job is not to decree whether something is fake or not, but rather to examine *why* it proves to be so meaningful in people's lives. Though I do not necessarily support Dundes's psychoanalytic stance that "fakelore apparently fills a national, psychic need" (ibid., 13), I do agree that Paul Bunyan seems to have filled Americans' need "to assert one's national identity, especially in a time of crisis, and to instill pride in that identity" (ibid.). Invented pieces of folklore, like Bunyan, help to fill that void.

There are many similarities between the folk hero Paul Bunyan and King Gambrinus, the legendary character who became a figurehead of bon vivant, Flemish life. Some researchers believe that Charles Deulin's writing was inspired by folklore and traditions from around the world and that he purposefully used "traditional fairy-tale stories and motifs" (Zuerner 2015). One of the earliest known accounts of a figure named "Gambrivius" or "Gampar" was by Johannes Aventinus in the 1523 *Annals of Bavaria*, commissioned by William IV, Duke of Bavaria. In this narrative, the mythical Germanic King was taught brewing by the ancient Egyptian goddess Iris,<sup>19</sup> even though, as we saw earlier in this chapter, beer was invented and brewed long before early medieval time or the ancient Egyptians. A few years later in circa 1543 a broadside print depicted "the mythological king Gampar" as king of Brabant and Flanders. He was shown frowning, wearing what appears to be a crown of hops on his head, and with a bushel

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> There is a lot of unclarity when it comes to Aventinus' text and how he would have collected this information. For example, Horst Dornbusch writes on BeerAdvocate that Gambrinus "marries the Egyptian goddess Isis," (2004), whereas Erik Hornung writes that both Osiris and Isis "bestowed the art of brewing beer upon the mythic king Gambrinus" (2001, 104).

of barley to his left. The print, part of a series titled "Ancestors and early kings of Germany," confirmed that this King of Beer had entered popular lore.



Figure 2.12. *Gambrivius Künig in Brabant/Flandern (Gampar, king of Brabant and Flanders)*. Broadside print made by Peter Flötner and Nikolaus Stör and published by Hans Guldenmundt, c. 1543. Ancestors and early kinds of the Germans, The Trustees of the British Museum, London, England. E,8.284. *Source:* Picture from The British Museum, accessed June 25, 2021, https://www.britishmuseum.org/collection/object/P E-8-284.

Although loggers sometimes disputed claims that Paul Bunyan was a creation of McGillivray and Laughead, protesting that they had heard orally transmitted tall tales of Paul Bunyan (Fowke 1979; Walls 1996; Hoffman 1999), there is no doubt that literary reframing and rewriting led to the popularization of both Bunyan and Gambrinus. Finally, I believe one of the most outstanding similarities between the two figures is that Deulin wrote in connection to Gambrinus that Flanders was in need of a national folk hero. Today, Flanders refers to the Dutch-speaking (in the Flemish dialect) area of Belgium. This is the northern area, excluding the bilingual Brussels region, while the Walloon comprises of the southern, French-speaking rest. Historically, Flanders was a county in the Low Countries,<sup>20</sup> which was comprised of modern-day Belgium, Netherlands and Luxembourg, as well as parts of France and Germany. When Flanders gained its first Count in 862, Baldwin I of Flanders, the city was based around the city Bruges. The growth of the cloth industry beginning in the 10<sup>th</sup> century brought prosperity and by the 16<sup>th</sup> century, Flanders expanded "from Antwerp in the east, via Courtrai (Kortrijk) and Tournai in the south, to the North Sea coast west of Dunkirk, encompassing a swath of what is now northeastern France" (Webb 2011, 358). In the 16th century, the Low Countries were divided: the Protestant north from the Catholic south. During this time, in seeking protection from their urban Protestant counterparts, the southern Low Countries sought help from "the Spanish king Phillip II [who] stepped forward offering them administrative freedom and a stringent defense of the faith" (Oliver 2011b, 120). Flanders initially being part of this northern Low Countries, revolted against Philip II, but by 1584 had been absorbed under Spanish rule. Over the 17th century, the French annexed some of the southern parts of Flanders, but the remainder continued to be under

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> The region of the Low Countries is often referred to as the Low Lands, Netherlands, Flanders or Belgica, but refers to "A low-lying region of north-western Europe, now comprising the kingdoms of the Netherlands and Belgium, and the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg" (*Oxford English Dictionary*, s.v. "low country").

Spanish rule until 1714 when the Peace of Utrecht awarded them to the Austrian Empire. In 1797, the Treaty of Campo Formio ceded the remainder of Flanders to the French, however during the 1815 Congress of Vienna, this former Austrian Low Countries was awarded to the Netherlands. Finally, in 1830 Belgium gained its independence, and today Flanders encompasses the five Belgian provinces of East Flanders, West Flanders, Flemish Brabant, Limburg and Antwerp (Webb 2011, 358).

Flanders and Belgium both had fluctuating borders for centuries due to changing governance and war and thus they also had a fluctuating sense of identity. The popularity of Deulin's 1868 tale "Cambrinus, King of Beer," and later in 1874 of Deulin's book *Contes du roi Cambrinus* ("Tales of King Cambrinus") featuring the same folk hero, reflect a need for a binding figure that helped create a unifying sense of identity for Flanders. Dundes's argument that examples of "fakelore," such as Paul Bunyan, fill "a national, psychic need [...] to assert one's national identity, especially in a time of crisis, and to instill pride in that identity" (1985, 13), also apply to King Gambrinus whose popularity emerged in the wake of a new nation. His prominence helped Flanders proclaim their own unique identity within Belgium. Folk heroes express multiple meanings, however, and it is worth noting that King Gambrinus is often seen as Belgium's beer king (Jackson 2008, 26) rather than identified exclusively with the Flemish. An example of this would be the folksong "Le chants des Wallons." This drinking song that features King Gambrinus is popular among university students in Wallon, a French speaking area located outside of Flanders (see table 2.1).

**Table 2.1.** Le chant des Wallons [The Wallonians' Song]

Que jusque tout au bord L'on remplisse nos verres Qu'on les remplisse encore De la même manière, Car nous sommes les plus forts Buveurs de blonde bière, Car nous restons, De gais Wallons, Dignes de nos aïeux, Car nous sommes comme eux, Disciples de Bacchus Et du Roi Gambrinus Until the brim We fill our glasses 'til we fill them again In the same manner, Because we are the strongest Drinkers of blonde beer, Because we stay, Gay Wallonians, Worthy of our ancestors, Because we are like them, Disciples of Bacchus And King Gambrinus

Source: Bitu Magnifique: Le chansonnier étudiant calottin, "Chants sacrés: Le chant des Wallons," Academicus Sanctae Barbae Ordo, accessed June 28, 2021, <u>https://bitu.org/chants/?chant=18</u>.

King Gambrinus serves as an excellent example of how ingrained beer culture is in Belgian life. His image appeared around the world as the "King of Beer" long before Budweiser claimed its title.<sup>21</sup> Though King Gambrinus's true origins are unknown, and it is unclear whether he is based on actual medieval figures or is a fictious character invented long ago, his continued association with Flanders and Belgium renders him a strong symbol of nationalism. The national folk hero of Belgium is also an international figure for beer.

### Saint-Arnold(s)

In centuries-old tales, figures sometimes become entangled and confused and this is the case with Saint Arnold, the Patron Saint of Beer. In terms of individual legacies, Saint Arnold of Metz and Saint Arnold of Oudenburg have the misfortune of possessing similar names and living in similar times within similar geographies. As a result, their histories and tales have been

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "King of Beers" was a slogan for Budweiser beer since the late 19<sup>th</sup> century (Mitenbuler 2020).

confused and intertwined from as early as the fifteenth century (Nip 2002, 59). The first of these saints, Arnold of Metz, was born in 580, and as a Frankish nobleman, served at the court of Theodebert II until he became consecrated bishop of Metz, France in 614 (Farmer 2011, s.v. "Arnulf(1)"). In 629, Arnold retired from his position to live as a hermit near Remiremont until his death in 640. Saint Arnold of Oudenburg (or Aldenburg or Soissons) seems to be the most well known of the two. In Great Beers of Belgium, Michael Jackson describes Arnold of Soissons as "the Belgian brewers' patron," the "best-known of the world's beer saints, and the one most visibly honoured in his own country" (2008, 26). This Arnold was born in 1040 in Tiegem, Belgium and became a soldier with a reputable military career (Farmer 2011, s.v. "Arnulf(2)"). Later, he was a monk at the Abbey of Saint Mêdard in Soissons, France and then a bishop at the same Abbey. He founded the Abbey of St. Peter at Oudenburg, Belgium in 1070. After the foundation of the monastery, he returned to a life as a hermit until his death in Oudenburg in 1087. Renée Nip writes that one of the earliest portraits of Arnold of Oudenburg can be found in a fifteenth-century manuscript subtitled "Arnulf of Oudenburg and Metz and Godelieve; redeem us by your intercession from all impurity" (2002, 60). There he is depicted as a holy bishop by the side of a female saint.

There are many reasons why these two saints are confused. The first is that they both have similar death dates. Nip writes that Arnold of Oudenburg requested to be "buried on the next day, 16 August, the feats of Saint Arnulf of Metz (d.640)" (ibid., 59) meaning that Arnold of Oudenburg died on the eve of the day of Arnold of Metz's death. Additionally, both men had distinguished secular careers, both were bishops, and both pursued a hermit life in later life until their deaths. All these similarities help explain how the two could be easily confused.

When I first came across the Saint Arnold of Soissons in Jackson's guide, I found myself frustrated trying to find more information. King Gambrinus's names and spellings differed depending on language and translation and the same is true for these saints. For example, Jackson calls this figure Arnold of Soissons, Farmer refers to him in *The Oxford Dictionary of Saints* (2011) as Arnulf of Soissons (same substitution for Metz), the medieval historian Nip (2002) names him Arnulf of Oudenburg, and in French references he is Arnould or Arnoul. If a fifteenth-century manuscript written in Oudenburg can confuse and join these two separate figures, there was plenty of room for others to do the same in the more the centuries that followed.

Intriguingly, Nip notes that both these saints are individually venerated as the patron saint of brewers. Arnold of Metz was recognised in Metz and Arnold of Oudenburg was first recognized in Tiegem and later by brewers guilds across what is now Belgium (2002, 61). Why and how these two became associated with beer remains unclear. Jackson writes that Arnold of Oudenburg would have founded the Abbey of his namesake when the plague ended and produced beer which, as noted earlier, was safer to drink than water at the time due to the boiling of the wort and fermentation. This could have created his association with beer. Or, perhaps his fame was due to a popular legend depicting "Arnold miraculously producing beer after the destruction of an Abbey brewery" (Jackson 2008, 26). Nips offers a simpler explanation:

The choice of a patron saint by guilds was not determined by the qualities or deeds of a specific saint, but mostly by accidental circumstances. The guilds often took over the patron saint of the chapel or church where they used to perform their religious duties, and the chosen patronage is only an expression of the existence of a saint's cult in a certain place. Perhaps the brewers of Oudenburg held their meetings in the Abbey, where undoubtedly the monks brewed their own beer. Under the patronage of the dukes of Burgundy, the Abbey experienced a period of prosperity, and the association of their product with the holy founder of the Abbey might have been attractive to the brewers. (2002, 61)

Saint Arnold Brewing Company in Houston, Texas proclaims themselves as Texas's oldest craft brewery, founded in 1994. Their brewery is named after Arnold of Metz; they use the saint's likeness on their beer logos (fig 2.11) and include a history of the patron saint in their promotional literature. However, the company transposes the two saints and also shares three legends of Saint Arnold. This includes the "Legend of the Beer Mug":

It was July 642 and very hot when the parishioners of Metz went to Remiremont to recover the remains of their former bishop. They had little to drink and the terrain was inhospitable.

At the point when the exhausted procession was about to leave Champigneulles, one of the parishioners, Duc Notto, prayed "By his powerful intercession the Blessed Arnold will bring us what we lack." Immediately the small remnant of beer at the bottom of a pot multiplied in such amounts that the pilgrims' thirst was quenched and they had enough to enjoy the next evening when they arrived in Metz. (Saint Arnold Brewing Company n.d.)

The source of this legend is not referenced and otherwise the association of this Saint Arnold being the patron saint of brewers and beer is unmentioned. The certified Abbey brewery Steenbrugge Brewery in Belgium, owned by Palm Breweries, uses Saint Arnold's likeness holding a mash paddle in their logo (fig 2.12). The associated Abbey, Sint-Pietersadbij Steenbrugge, was founded in 1879, and following the peacemaking efforts of Abbott Modest Van Assche during the World War I, "in 1934 the Abbey requested and was given the name and the right of succession of St. Arnoldus' foundation in Oudenburg" (Van Den Steen 2018, 211), making the Steenbrugge brewery in the likeness of Arnold of Oudenburg. The physical similarities of the two Arnolds on the labels of Saint Arnold Brewing Company and Steenbrugge (fig 2.11, fig 2.12) is very apparent in the positioning, halo and bishop's hat.





Figure 2.13. Beer label of the American brewery Saint Arnold's Comeback. *Source:* Label from Saint Arnold Brewing Company website, accessed June 25, 2021, <u>https://www.saintarnold.com/year-round-beers/</u>.

Figure 2.14. Beer label of the Belgian Abbey brewery Steenbrugge's brown ale. *Source:* Photograph from Swinkels Family Brewers website, accessed June 25, 2021, <u>https://swinkelsfamilybrewers.com/en/ourrange/alcoholic-beers/steenbrugge/steenbruggedubbel-bruin.html</u>.

When researching these two saints, I was confronted by a lack of verifiable information. Houston's brewery, for example, proves no sources and to date, I have found no link between those legends and Saint Arnold of Metz. Many blogs and popular media websites include the Arnolds in their lists such as "25 Patron Saints of Really Random Things" (Bussen 2015), "11 Patron Saints of Food, Coffee, and Alcohol" (McRobbie 2013), or "26 Patron Saints to Help You Around the Kitchen" (Stagnaro 2020). They paraphrase their own, usually uncited, findings. Additionally, though I was satisfied that there seemed to be a popular consensus associating these Saints with Belgian beer, I had difficulty locating official sources. For example, *The*  *Oxford Dictionary of Saints* makes no mention of beer in either of their entries on the Arnolds. I couldn't help but wonder why.

Hilary Powell's article ""Once Upon a Time There Was a Saint": Re-evaluating Folklore in Anglo-Latin Hagiography" discusses discrepancies in writings and rewritings of the lives of Saints. Particularly, she studies the life of the seventh-century bishop of Worcester and founder of the Abbey of Evesham, Ecgwine. Vita S. Ecgwini was written in the 11<sup>th</sup> century by Byrhtferth of Ramsey and has been rewritten many times subsequently. Even in its original 11<sup>th</sup> century rendition, Powell was able to identify parallels with folk motifs in Thompson's *Motif-Index of* Folk-Literature. In looking through subsequent rewritings of this hagiography, Powell found that writers took on some creative liberties, going as far as to relocate some of the key events, as "these stories indicate just how fluidly tales swung back and forth between oral and written expression; their every written reappearance was a snapshot of the latest twists and turns the tale had taken" (2010, 180). Indeed, applying a folkloristic framework to the study of hagiographic narratives accords equal weight to both the apparent factual and fictitious portions of the texts (ibid., 171). More particularly, applying a "performer-centered" approach "engenders an awareness that variation naturally results from a performer's personal artistry interacting with communal credibility and is therefore not only the byproduct of, but evidence for, oral transmission" (ibid., 185).

As infuriating and confusing as the confusion between the two Arnolds might be, they provide an important and significant symbol of beer; they tell a good story. Their legends connect brewing with medieval Europe and Catholicism that, as discussed earlier in this chapter, shaped large scale, commercial brewing in Europe. Though Metz is technically located in France today, and Oudenburg is in Belgium, changing historical borders leading up to the 19<sup>th</sup> century

led to the saints being generalized and identified as being from Belgium. As Powell notes, these misunderstandings and confusions prove people's active interaction with the legends, therefore reinforcing a continued relevance and appeal (2010, 177). The subject of religion's interconnections with beer will be expanded on in Chapter Four and Chapter Five, but it is worth noting here that religion is culturally and geographically bound. As Bert Wilson writes in "The Concept of the West," the key issue in many interpretations of Mormon folklore is that Mormons should be "seen not only as a religious group, but also as a regional group" (2006, 175). The Saint Arnolds' lasting value lies in their intersecting identities as Catholic Saints and Belgians, becoming important figures to Catholics, Belgians, and those in-between. They join King Gambrinus as common and recognizable figures in the beer industry. Though these folk heroes have complicated, indeterminate origins, Belgium is their identified place of origin and they have long held a significant and symbolic place in Belgium's reputed beer culture. Elliott Oring writes reflecting on the widespread definitions of legends, "Most legend scholars hold that legend has some relation to belief; most specifically, that legends involve a debate about a belief' (2008, 128). King Gambrinus and Saint Arnold(s) being of Flanders and/or Belgian origin, and associated with the invention and/or popularization of beer and brewing, support the belief of Belgium as a beer nation. The international use of the likeness of these two figures demonstrates that it is not only Belgians who see themselves as a beer nation; the association of beer with Belgium is also made outside the country's borders.

#### Nationalism, Globalization and UNESCO

The formation of Belgium as a beer nation within country's conscious is founded on the history traced above and extrapolated through its associated patron saints of beer. In 2016 it was

legitimatized through heritage status on an international scale when "Beer culture in Belgium" was inscribed on UNESCO's Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity:

Making and appreciating beer is part of the living heritage of a range of communities throughout Belgium. It plays a role in daily life, as well as festive occasions. Almost 1,500 types of beer are produced in the country using different fermentation methods. Since the 1980s, craft beer has become especially popular. There are regions, which are known for their particular varieties while some Trappist communities have also been involved in beer production giving profits to charity. In addition, beer is used for cooking including in the creation of products like beer-washed cheese and, as in the case of wine, can be paired with foods to complement flavours. Several organizations of brewers work with communities on a broad level to advocate responsible beer consumption. Sustainable practice has also become part of the culture with recyclable packaging encourages and new technologies to reduce water usage in production processes. Besides being transmitted in the home and social circles, knowledge and skills are also passed down by master brewers who run classes in breweries, specialized university courses that target those involved in the field and hospitality in general, public training programmes for entrepreneurs and small test breweries for amateur brewers. (UNESCO 2016)

UNESCO's 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage took effect in

2008, and as of June 2021, there are 584 elements from 184 countries on these lists (UNESCO n.d.a). This convention was introduced to broaden the scope of cultural heritage outside of monuments and collections of objects, to include "traditions or living expressions inherited from our ancestors and passed on to our descendants, such as oral traditions, performing arts, social practices, rituals, festive events, knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe or the knowledge and skills to produce traditional crafts" (UNESCO n.d.b). The 2015 special issue of the *Journal of Folklore Research* features a series of researchers whose case studies "focus on the particularly intimate perspectives of people living in communities touched by ICH [Intangible Cultural Heritage] policies" (Foster 2015, 144). In one such articles by Vladimar Tr. Hafstein identifies intangible heritage as the diagnosis, as "it gives a name to a condition that is increasingly common in industrial and post-industrial societies under circumstances of economic, political, technological, and demographic change – for which the shorthand is

globalization" (2015, 284-6). He argues that when there is a fear and worry that heritage is in peril, the only treatment for this diagnosis is safeguarding. This consists of social institutions administering expressive genre practices, namely by "reform[ing] the relationship of subjects with their own practices [...], reform[ing] the practices [...], [and] reform[ing] the relationship of the practicing subjects with themselves" (ibid., 286). Though such proceedings can warrant positive changes, resulting in sustainable, reformed relationships and practices (ibid., 286-94), many also triggered unwarranted side effects such as a disempowerment of local communities and peoples, favouring official intangible heritage institutions (ibid., 294-6).

The 2016 "Beer culture in Belgium" inscription includes mention that advocates have been already practicing safeguarding methods of Belgian beer tradition since the 1970s, and that the "future safeguarding measures pertaining mainly to the development of professional qualifications, the promotion of the element and the establishment of an observatory of the diversity of brewing arts and their appreciation in Belgium" (UNESCO 2016). Unlike the ICH initiatives mentioned in Hafstein's article and the special issue, the sense of urgency in terms of a fear of loss of culture is only loosely defined, and it seems like this inscription was not promoted out of fear of losing these Belgian beer traditions. Voltaire Cang writes about the Inscription of "Washoku, traditional dietary cultures of the Japanese" on UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2013, out of concern of 2000-year-old Japanese food traditions disappearing (2018, 510). Cang notes "for Japan, however, its concerns were colored, if not enveloped, by culinary nationalism" (ibid., 510-511), and it was nationalism and not a loss of culture that "did pervade Japan's motives for inscription and gave it a sense of urgency" (ibid., 496). Inspired by earlier inscriptions of Mexican and French foods on the list, the Japanese committee putting forth their food were increasingly aware and worried of the

potential of South Korean cuisine gaining a spot on the list before them. Cang argues that this competitive nationalistic approach is not surprising because "the desire for inscription inevitably entails a strong belief in the nation's food as deserving of the honor especially in comparison to other national cuisines" (ibid., 496-7). I would argue that the same can be said for "Beer culture in Belgium." Its safeguarding does not fall into the traditional sense of preserving a dying cultural heritage, but rather attempts to claim nationalistic ties and national identity with beer.

As has been argued so far in this chapter, historically beer was a prominent beverage in Belgium. This long history is because the local climate could grow the ingredients and largescale production by medieval religious institutions was a means of sustenance. Later, beer held national economic significance. Legends of a Belgian beer king and Catholic saints demonstrate how deeply entrenched beer culture is in local written and oral lore. The last sentence of the lengthy UNESCO's "Beer culture in Belgium" entry reveals that economic history and culture are significant motives for being added to the list:

...knowledge and skills are also passed down by master brewers who run classes in breweries, specialized university courses that target those involved in the field and hospitality in general, public training programmes for entrepreneurs and small test breweries for amateur brewers. (UNESCO 2016)

Just as beer taxes in the 16<sup>th</sup> century might have literally helped shape the nation (Deconinck, Poelmans and Swinnen 2016), and beer exportation plays a significant role in the Belgian economy (Belgian Brewers 2019), Damiaan Persyn, Johan F. M. Swinnen and Stijn Vanormelingen distinguish five unique trends that ensure Belgian beer is "the true ambassador of the country" (2019, 79). These are: (1) that they have a traditional diversity of beer, (2) Anheuser-Busch InBev, the world's largest multinational drink and brewing company in the world, is based in Leuven, Belgium, (3) Beer consumption by Belgians has been steadily declining over the years, (4) though Belgium has been producing more beer than ever before, and (5) the number of breweries has fallen over the last century, but has stabilized in the past decade and is slowly increasing with the renewed interest in craft and small-scale breweries (ibid., 80)<sup>22</sup>. There is a certain irony in the UNESCO designation of "Beer culture in Belgium" given the organization's goals of safeguarding culture. Belgium presently houses the headquarters of the largest beer company in the world and could be accused of being a vehicle of globalization that is buying out small breweries and "ruining" local beer making traditions.

Some countries are associated with a particular alcoholic beverage: Ireland, the UK, US, Germany and Belgium are all identified as beer-drinking nations, Spain and Italy are regarded as wine-drinking countries, and Russia and China are considered spirit-drinking nations. One might assume these connections develop because of a high per capita consumption of said beverage. However, as seen earlier in the figure charting per-capita beer consumption in Europe (fig. 2.7), this is not always true. Belgium's consumption of beer is not the highest in Europe. Swinnen writes in a 2017 article, that in the case of "beer-drinking nations," an increase in household income brings about a decline in beer consumption. In contrast, nations with traditional wine and spirit drinking traditions have increased their beer consumption. Perhaps unsurprisingly, the top three countries of beer consumers by volume in the 1960s were USA, Germany, and the UK. Now the top three are China, USA and Brazil. Swinnen notes a global increase in beer sales: "The global beer market is around 250 billion U.S. dollars, 2.5 times as large as the global wine market and roughly double the global spirits market" (2017, 1). Alongside this rapid growth of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Steven M. Schnell and Joseph F. Reese write that during the 1990s and the growth of microbreweries that, "The beers brewed by the microbreweries have more distinctive flavors than the lagers brewed by Budweiser, Coors, or Miller. Instead, they are a diverse array of ales that can be found nowhere else, creating a truly local experience. [...] Most microbreweries put the bulk of their effort into darker ales, more akin to European beers, than into the light lagers that characterize the American industry giants" (2003, 46). The diversity of beers in Europe, such as in Belgian, played as inspiration for microbreweries rebelling against the hegemonic lager beers of multinational companies.

beer consumption and production, is a growth of a global beer trade. Swinnen distinguishes

Belgium in this article:

The recent global fascination with Belgian beer is matched by tremendous growth in Belgian beer exports. The export boom started in 1990; since 2005, Belgium has exported more beer than it consumes domestically. the export growth is driven both by mergers and acquisitions – culminating in AB InBev, and the associated global spread in sales of Stella Artois, Hoegaarden, and Leffe – and by the strong growth in exports among much smaller Belgian breweries, mostly selling specialty beers. Small Belgian breweries are now selling their beers in the United States and faraway places in Asia and Latin America. (ibid., 5)

One reason for the fame of Belgian beer has been its diversity of styles. In The World Atlas of Beer, Tim Webb and Stephen Beaumont estimate there to be "over 400 discernably different styles of beer" (2012, 52), while Léo Moulin writes that Belgium "compte plus de 300 espèces de bières (certains disent 800!) qui sont parmi les meilleures au monde" [has over 300 styles of beer, some even say as many as 800!, which are amongst the best in the world] (1988, 137). Other countries are often associated with only one style or a handful of styles of beer, for example, Irish Stout, Festbier (Germany), or British Brown Ale. On the other hand, Belgium has many rich and diverse styles. Eline Poelmans and Jason E. Taylor argue that the institutional history of Belgium, and in particular a lack of national regulation of beer production, explains this diversity. From the time Belgium gained independence in 1830 to the recognizable country it is today, borders and governance shifted greatly. Instability and/or a lack of central governance allowed a variety of brewing styles to flourish. Poelmans and Taylor note that "village-specific laws regulating beer ingredients date at least as far back as 1143" (2019, 704), but larger laws such as the infamous Bavarian/Germany *Reinheitsgebot* of 1516 restricting beer to hops, barley and water, affected a large area and diminished beer diversity. Within the region that is today's Belgium, the regulation of ingredients and taxation was village-specific, therefore promoting variety. Additionally, as noted earlier (Deconinck, Poelmans and Swinnen 2016), beer taxes

greatly benefited local economies in the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> centuries (Poelmans and Taylor 2019, 704). As a result, local authorities showed flexibility in adapting to local brewing habits because it was in their best interest.

Poelmans and Taylor argue that in addition to the local taxes promoting a diverse beer culture, most Belgian breweries were delayed in adopting newer technologies because of consumption patterns. In the 1980s, the United States of America defined a "microbrewery" as any brewery producing less than 1.8 million litres per year (Poelmans and Taylor 2019, 706). Considering that in the newly independent Belgium of early to mid-19<sup>th</sup> century, most breweries were only producing about 200,000 litres per year, it is fair to describe the country as being full of small, or "microbreweries" (ibid.). Poelmans and Taylor continue stating, "rather than bottle and distribute beer, Belgian brewers typically sold beer poured from wooden barrels directly to consumers in their own pub, which was typically adjacent to the brewery," (ibid.) which would in turn explain the relatively high amount of breweries per capita (in 1845 approximately one brewery for every 1,500 Belgians), and the slower adoption of mass brewing techniques, such as steam technology. A taxation scheme based on the size of fermentation tubs, and the challenges of transporting beer in the 19<sup>th</sup> century (ibid.), were factors that favoured localized, small-scale beer production. This, in turn, led to a diversity of varieties of beer, adjusted to local tastes, ingredients and production techniques.

# Conclusion

As discussed above, the climate of Belgium is distinctive in providing the ingredients necessary to make beer. The country's centuries long history of beer production, including its excise taxes of the 16<sup>th</sup> century, helped to shape the nation. Village specific laws and taxation in

place since the 12<sup>th</sup> century resulted in a unique diversity of beer styles. Belgium's beer culture includes the celebration of patron saints of beer, King Gambrinus as well as Saint Arnold of Metz and Saint Arnold of Soissons. Their narratives and images speak to Belgium's long and rich beer history. Finally, the UNESCO inscription formally acknowledges Belgium as having a unique and significant beer culture. All of these factors confirm Belgium's position as a producer of some of the world's finest beers. They help ensure that as a Belgian beer, Orval beer is an elite product and a taste sought after worldwide.

In the next chapter, I examine how Belgian beer tourism capitalizes on the country's beer culture to help construct a "Belgian" sense of taste. In particular, I look at several "conversion narratives" that describe consumers' experiences of Belgian beer as transformative.

### **Chapter Three**

### The Belgian Beer Experience: Belgian Beer Tourism and Conversion Narratives

Every Belgian beer that goes around the world is a calling card that says, "Hey, come visit Belgium."

- Stu Stuart, founder of Belgian Beer Me! Beer Tours of Belgium

When I first moved to Amsterdam in 2015 to begin my Master's programme in Social and Cultural Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam, one of three of my roommates, Wasse, recommended we go out for a beer. We went to Café Gollem in the Oude Pijp district, near our apartment. Having yet to purchase my own bike, I clumsily sat on the back rack of his and we headed down bike lanes to the bar with a Tolkienesque name. Once there, Wasse asked for the hallucinogenic elephant beer, also known as Delirium Nocturnum by Huyghe Brewery in Belgium. Intrigued, I asked for the same. To my surprise, the bartender pulled out two ceramic bottles topped with a blue foil, and bearing a shiny, metallic label depicting a pink elephant in front of a whirlpool of colour. It was very much hallucinogenic-looking, just as Wasse promised. Then, the bartender poured the dark, reddish ale into a tulip glass dotted with small, pink elephants. I took a sip, and I was stunned. This...is beer? Who has kept this from me? So sweet, nutty, malty and a warming taste of alcohol hitting and slipping down the back of my throat. The beer, though unique to my palate, was striking yet inexplicably balanced, smooth and easy to drink.

This event changed the way I saw beer. It also triggered a somewhat obsessive pursuit to better understand beer in general and Belgian beer in particular. Why was it regarded as the best there is? As I began reading works about Belgian beer by well-known American and British beer

writers, I was astounded to find narratives similar to my own; it seems people all over shared my experience. Their random discovery of Belgian beer expanded their knowledge and appreciation of beer and it often triggered an obsessive pursuit for years to come. As discussed in the previous chapter, Belgium earned a prestigious reputation as a beer nation through its history and UNESCO's designation on its Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. As Garrett Oliver writes, "For the beer lover, Belgium is truly heaven on earth" (2005, 173).

This chapter discusses how Belgian beer tourism and narratives construct taste. The first part introduces Belgian beer tourism as a blend of culinary tourism and alcotourism that is distinguished by a concern for authenticity and low-risk pursuit of cultural capital. The second part introduces narratives from five Belgian beer ambassadors, recounting their first encounters with Belgian beer. Sipping on my first Belgian beer, and then learning about Belgian beer culture, transformed me. It dramatically increased my awareness of beer and taste. But I am not alone. In my research on Orval beer, I encountered many "conversion narratives." These stories mark a transformation in an individual, often from naïve consumer to Belgian beer enthusiast. They demonstrate how Belgian beer can trigger a significant and impactful reaction within consumers and underscore the special qualities of Belgian beer.

### **Culinary Tourism**

As indicated in the earlier literature review, early folklorists identified "folk" foods and explored "the use of food in expressing and constructing cultural identities and social relationships" (Long 2010, 8). They laid the groundwork for what would become the study of culinary tourism. Lucy M. Long, who coined the term, defines culinary tourism as:

the intentional, exploratory participation in the foodways of an other – participation including the consumption, preparation, and presentation of a food item, cuisine, meal system, or eating style considered to belong to a culinary system not one's own. This definition emphasizes the individual as active agent in constructing meanings within a tourist experience, and it allows for an aesthetic response to food as part of the experience. (ibid., 21)

Long explains in *Culinary Tourism* that scholarship in shaping this field of study stems from anthropology of tourism, folklore, and food studies (2010, 2). For example, John G. Bourke's 1895 study, "The Folk-Foods of the Rio Grande Valley and of Northern Mexico," mentioned in Chapter One did not examine tourism but this kind of identification of regional food traditions paved the way for later folklorists studying "[t]he significance of tourism in identifying and defining regional foods" in the 1990s (Long 2010, 9; see Lewis 1998; Lockwood and Lockwood 1998; Gutierrez 1998). Foundational studies like Bourke's helped identify reciprocal relationships between tourism and ethnic foods. Today folklorists study the many ways tourism can create and/or strengthen ties between place and foodways.

# Alcotourism

Within culinary tourism is the specialized area of "alcotourism." Cultural geographer David Bell defines alcotourism as "the assorted ways of travelling to drink, travelling while drinking, drinking to travel, and so on, that constitute an important but under-researched dimension of a growing body of work on 'drinking places'" (2008, 291). Bell outlines five forms of alcotourism and provides analytical frameworks for each. First are drinking places where "alcohol and tourism is to see drinking as a way to consume place" (ibid., 294). An example might be consuming a Belgian beer to experience Belgium. Second, is drinking "the other," meaning consuming the beverages of people that you don't see as part of your own group. Bell explains that the "[c]onsumption of local drinks and drinking cultures, whether themed or not,

may also extend beyond particular beverages to the performance of indigenous drinking practices as a kind of alcoholic anthropology- as in the fascination with different serving hours, different attitudes to drinking, different modes of drunkenness, and so on, often a staple of guidebooks" (ibid., 296). This might include tasting a lambic or strong golden ale, served in its appropriate glassware, when visiting Belgium. Third, Bell argues that alcotourism is a form of heritage tourism; there is a form of cultural capital involved in these touristic experiences. For example, for some visiting the historic Cantillon brewery in Brussels to consume lambics would be a way to claim cultural capital and gain knowledge of lambic Belgian beer. Fourth is party tourism. This has been a concern of recent studies that explore the negative implications of binge drinking and the culture surrounding excessive alcohol consumption. An example might be participating in a pub crawl in Brussels. Fifth and last, is "economically- motivated alcotourism" (301). These activities include purchasing alcohol from duty-free shops on the way home or consuming alcoholic beverages with the use of drinks tickets included in the price of the getaway package.

Within folklore studies, there are few examples of the intersections of alcoholic beverages and tourism. Pat Byrne writes about the "Screech-in" in his article, "Booze, Ritual, and the Invention of Tradition: The Phenomenon of the Newfoundland Screech-In." In this ritual, a chief Screecher, a Newfoundlander dressed in stereotypical fishermen's clothing, invites visitors to Newfoundland to eat local fare, typically "dried capelin, a morsel of uncooked bologna, and a peppermint knob" (1997, 242), repeat local sayings trenched in local dialect, kiss a codfish (typically frozen), and finally have a shot of locally bottled, typically low-quality, rum known as Screech. Once all tasks are completed, these "Come-From-Aways" become members of the Royal Order of Screechers and honorary Newfoundlanders, with a paper certificate to bring home as proof. This "tradition" is said to have originated in the 1940s, and in the 1970s, it

was legitimized through government marketing efforts and promoted by the Newfoundland and Labrador Liquor Commission who provided information on the history of Screech and "Ways to Screech" (ibid., 241). The Screech-In is still practiced and enjoyed by some visitors and residents who conceive of it as a playful and innocuous way to ridicule gullible tourists. Others, however, find it offensive and the practice has sparked a great backlash and accusations that it stereotypes and ridicules Newfoundlanders (ibid., 243-46). In terms of Bell's classification of types of alcotourism, the Screech-In fits clumsily into a way for tourists to consume "local drinks and drinking cultures" (2008, 296), including the introduction of local fare, dialect, and, perhaps most significantly, humour.

Diane Tye and Ann Marie Powers write about another form of alcotourism when they examine bachelorette parties in Atlantic Canada. Bachelorette parties celebrate a bride-to-be's last night as a single woman before she transitions into her role as a married woman. Typically these events are fueled by alcohol as well as hypersexualized games, garb, food, and drink. This tradition sometimes consists of travel to large city centres, such as Las Vegas, that are typically associated with binge drinking, erotic dancing, and/or party culture (Tye and Powers 1998, 553; also see Tye 2015, 226-29). This fits into Bell's fourth category of alcotourism: party tourism. Bachelorette party goers engage in binge drinking that they would not typically participate in and Tye and Power highlight the complex messages that result; the event can both reinforce patriarchal gender norms and contest them. The authors write: "The humor and irony that characterize the bachelorette party and its booze" (ibid., 240) – that by being so sexually and over-the-top, it is a way to proclaim control over their sexuality, in their own terms, and express "women are no longer sexual objects" (ibid.).

Both these articles discuss intersections of alcohol and tourism but neither directly addresses alcohol as a form of culinary tourism or as a way to taste place. Their focus is on meanings and interpretations of the rituals and alcohol is seen as a vehicle for the rituals' enactment. My research suggests that in general Belgian beer tourism is a different kind of alcotourism than the Screech-In or bachelorette party in that inebriation is not promoted as a primary goal. In Bell's discussion of alcotourism, he emphasizes alcohol as both a food and a drug and Belgian beer tourism falls more in the first category than the second. Alcohol is considered as a component of Belgian beer but it is not the main attraction. As a result, I consider Belgian beer tourism to be a unique blend of culinary tourism and alcotourism in that it concerns itself with authenticity, is low-risk, and is used to promote cultural capital.

### Authenticity

Within Belgian beer tourism, a focus on drinkways emerges not only through consumption but also through "preparation, and presentation" (Long 2010, 21). Visiting Belgian breweries to understand how specific local styles of beer are made and eating at restaurants that pair and prepare food with Belgian beer, are significant components of this type of tourism. Belgian beer tourism centers around searching for authentic experiences, rather than searching for inebriation. In tourism, Dean MacCannell writes that authenticity is measured by "The tourist's desire to share in the real life of the places visited, or at least to see that life as it is really lived" (1973, 594). Drawing on Erving Goffman's *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life* (1959), MacCannell notes a dichotomy of front versus back distinctions in tourist settings; the front is the staged area intended for visitors and the back is the more "authentic" area, not meant for tourists. Though travellers intend to glimpse "real life" and crave authentic experiences, they often fail to access back areas and to meet these goals. He writes, "the term "tourist" is increasingly used a derisive label for someone who seems content with this obviously inauthentic experiences" (1973, 592). MacCannell argues that at its core tourism is inauthentic; tourists are on a quest for something out of their norm and routine and it is up to the individual to determine the success of their tourism activity which they assess depending on their gaze.<sup>23</sup> That beer tourism is a prevalent form of tourism in Belgium is not surprising given that, as was discussed in the last chapter, beer is an important "real" part of Belgian life and culture and that Belgians view their country as a beer nation. Marketing specifically towards tourists can take the form of tastings and tours. MacCannell might argue that Belgian beer tastings and tours are a staged, inauthentic front created for outsiders and not truthfully how Belgians experience Belgian beer culture. Rather, they offer a controlled gaze through which to look at and learn about Belgian life. John Urry and Jonas Larsen write that the tourist gaze is not restricted to sight, "the most superficial of the senses" (2011, chap. 1), but rather is about the tourist perception. From this perspective, beer can be understood as a gaze through which tourists experience place. Urry and Larsen explain, "Individual performances of gazing at a particular sight are framed by cultural styles, circulating images and texts of this and other places, as well as personal experiences and memories" (2011, chap. 1). Therefore, in the Belgian beer tourism example, the tourist gaze is shaped by many of the same factors that residents rely on when constructing their own sense of Belgium as a beer nation.

Because Belgium is so revered as a beer nation and home to some iconic breweries, it is often a site of pilgrimage for beer enthusiasts. MacCannell asserts in "Staged Authenticity: Arrangements of Social Space in Tourist Settings," that pilgrimages were the original form of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> To read more about the "tourist gaze", see Urry 2011.
tourism (1973, 593). Today tourist pilgrimages are not necessarily religiously motivated but refer to any meaningful, intentional journey to a place of significance, personally and/or popularly. MacCannell writes that just as with religiously motivated pilgrimages, "There are quite literally millions of tourists who have spent their savings to make the pilgrimage to see these sights" (2013, 43), often annoyed at the presence of others in their (personally) sacred place. Further, Thomas S. Bremer explains in the introduction to *Blessed with Tourists: The Borderlands of Religion and Tourism in San Antonion*, that the practices and attachments of tourist and religious visitors are indistinguishable. Oftentimes they "overlap in ways that make it difficult to distinguish between the touristic and the religious" (2004, 3). For example, when pilgrims visit the Virgin of Guadalupe in Tepeyac, Mexico City, they often participate in stereotypical tourism practices, such as buying souvenirs.<sup>24</sup>

Lucy M. Long explains that food pilgrimages "frequently take on the character of a ritualistic quest to fully experience a food or cuisine in its "authentic" and original cultural context" (2006, 393; also see Kennedy 2017, 8). In contrast to a casual food tourist, a food pilgrim seeks a more "authentic" experience. Just like a religious pilgrim might travel in search of a spiritual experience, the food pilgrim ventures to the place of production.<sup>25</sup> MacCannell argues that the "touristic consciousness is motivated by its desire for authentic experiences" (2013, 101). As a tourist, this means pursuing experiences different from our own and diverging from our everyday (Inglis 2000, 12). In this sense, some can argue that at least some Belgian beer tourists seek an authentic experience through the consumption of Belgian beer, which could

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> For more information on the relationship between tourism and pilgrimage, see Turner and Turner 1978.
<sup>25</sup> I found few to no resources on food pilgrimages. This is especially surprising in regards to large, globalised production facilities strongly associated with place that attract large amounts of tourists, such as the Heineken Experience in Amsterdam, The Netherlands, Guinness or Jameson in Dublin, Ireland and Hershey Factory in Hershey, Pennsylvania. From my own experiences at these locations, I was overwhelmed with my family, myself and others stating the product tasted better when consumed at the location it was made.

include making a pilgrimage to Belgium. This might include making a pilgrimage to Belgium, and once there, travelling to a specific location such as the Orval Abbey.

## Low-Risk

Different forms of culinary tourism and alcotourism carry different levels of risk. Bell describes "the holiday as a liminal experience, a time-limited escape from 'normal life,' a chance to let go, to be someone else, do something new" (2008, 293; also see Inglis 2000; Jayne, Gibson, Waitt, and Valentine 2012). This liminality can bring heightened risk. As well, evaluating risk versus reward on vacation can feel different than making similar judgements in an everyday context. Suddenly it is easier to agree to one more glass of wine because you're on vacation. In The Delicious History of the Holiday, Fred Inglis writes that one characteristic of the holiday is its plentifulness and licentiousness: "I shall eat what I like and drink more than I can" (2000, 12). In addition to excess, it can also be a time to eat foods that are foreign and unfamiliar. Exploring new cultures through food consumption can be risky, as Jennie Germann Molz writes: "No matter how eager or reluctant culinary tourists may be to try foods that are strange to them, food adventures entail a sense of risk" (2007, 86). Every taste has the potential to make the traveller sick and in this context one becomes aware of cultural boundaries and learns what limits they are not willing to cross. Long further explains that we evaluate the level of otherness in food or drink before we decide to consume it: "The question of edibility automatically occurs at the extreme end of the exotic continuum since the unknown raises questions not only about whether a food can be eaten, but also whether it should be eaten" (2010, 33). Risk is culturally constructed and we rank the risks we perceive and know about based on a perceived degree of danger. Mary Douglas expands on this in *Risk and Blame*:

97

'Risk' is the probability of an event combined with the magnitude of the losses and gains that it will entail. However, our political discourse debates the word. From a complex attempt to reduce uncertainty it has become a decorative flourish on the word 'danger.' (1992, 40)

Therefore, consuming a beer with 8% ABV<sup>26</sup> in Belgium might be considered risky to an American tourist used to 4-5% ABV beers. Or, perhaps trying an acidic lambic beer that some consider an acquired taste would be seen as a gamble.

The risk involved in most Belgian beer tourist activities is limited, however. In light of Inglis's holiday maxim, "I shall eat what I like and drink more than I can" (2000, 12), there is more of an immediate risk involved in the higher consumption of alcohol than that of food, due to the inherent inebriating properties of the former. Natan Uriely and Yaniv Belhassen write in "Drugs and Risk-Taking in Tourism," that tourists "are ready to take risks while on vacation, which they might deny themselves in everyday life" (2005, 339). Uriely and Belhassen's study on drug tourism concluded that tourists "cope with their fears by believing that being a tourist protects them from hazards, including the possibility of arrest, being labeled a deviant, and becoming a drug addict" (ibid., 353-354.), however they still take extra precautions, such as in not travelling internationally with drugs or only engaging in drugs while safe in a group of friends, therefore not fully succumbing to the stereotyped 'untouchable tourist' (ibid.). So, a Belgian beer tourist might consume many beers every day of their trip, not fearing that someone would judge them negatively because of their high consumption. Alcotourism differs from drug tourism, however, in that alcohol is legal in most countries. This lowers the issues of risk, especially in terms of law enforcement and social stigma. So, though Belgian beer tourism involves the consumption of a drug, it is not nearly as risky as the consumption of "harder," illegal drugs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Alcohol By Volume

Compared to other forms of alcotourism, Belgian beer tourism tends to be low risk, placing an emphasis on the taste and quality of the product, rather than its inebriating properties and the quantity consumed. As mentioned above in relation to the Screech-in and bachelorette parties, this lies in stark contrast to other kinds of drinking activities and destinations. For example, in Mark Jayne, Chris Gibson, Gordon Waitt, and Gill Valentine's study of backpackers and drunkenness, they write that "[a]lcohol, drunkenness and hangovers are constitutive of the notions of freedom and flexibility of individual and collective notions of backpacking" (2012, 223). These backpackers associate alcohol with having a more "authentic" experience. Unlike drug tourism previously discussed, alcotourism tends to be more widely accepted, even when alcohol is consumed in excess. In his study of Danish tourists in Sunny Beach, Bulgaria, Sébastian Tutenges notes that his participants saw "heavy drinking [as] perfectly acceptable, as long as it takes place in the company of friends and, preferably, in a festive context" (2015, 137). Even if binge drinking is practiced throughout the stay, the behavior is associated with vacationing rather than the solitary negativeness of alcoholism because they intend to return to "normal" behavior of responsible drinking once home.

Stu Stuart is owner of Belgian Beer Me! Beer Tours of Belgium (BBM!), a beer tourism company specializing in tours of Belgium. He explained to me that his tours draw beer enthusiasts who usually get tired or full rather than drunk. The tours don't attract bachelor groups (Stuart 2019). Drunkenness can be a side effect of the tour, but it is not the goal. He also explained that the maximum number of breweries they visit in one day is two. According to Stuart's description, his tours fit into David Bell's first form of alcotourism: as a way to consume place, to experience the other, and as heritage tourism. The goal of these Belgian beer tours is to allow visitors to learn and taste Belgium, as well as learn about local beer tradition and culture.

99

With the low brewery and beer count, the focus is not on consuming beers in large quantities, but rather providing a cultural-educational experience. That said, there are other companies in Belgium that offer alcotourism opportunities where the focus is more on alcohol consumption and fit into Bell's category of party tourism. These include a pub crawl in Brussels that visits at least three bars in three hours, includes free and discounted drinks, and its purpose it to "make the most of Brussels nightlife"<sup>27</sup> – the sensory, cultural, and educational components are not present.

Pub crawls notwithstanding, the majority of Belgian beer tourism experiences do not fall into the high-risk category of extreme tourist activities or forms of alcotourism even if the consumption of alcohol makes they are higher risk than culinary tourism experiences centering around eating food. They are more closely related to forms of wine tourism (Demossier 2020, 32-33) and tea tourism (Besky 2013, 105-112), where a primary purpose of the travel is education. As Sarah Besky says of tea tourism in *The Darjeeling Distinction*, it reinforces the connection between taste and place, or *terroir*, and distinguishes that the tourists are on a quest for knowledge. Besky writes: "We drink their tea, and we wanted to know more about it" (2013, 110). This is true for much Belgium beer tourism as well where intoxication is a side effect rather than the main purpose.

## **Cultural Capital**

Bell lists "heritage tourism" as the fourth form of alcotourism, emphasizing the importance of cultural capital to tourists' motivation. Josée Johnston and Shyon Baumann underline the continued significance of the work of Pierre Bourdieu in gourmet food writing's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Brussels Pub Crawl, last updated July 2022, <u>https://www.brusselspubcrawl.com/</u>.

omnivorousness: that food choices are indicative of cultural hierarchy (2007, 170). Allan G. Johnson explains, "According to French sociologist Pierre Bourdieu, cultural capital consists of ideas and knowledge people draw upon as they participate in social life. Everything from rules of etiquette to being able to speak and write effectively can be considered cultural capital" (2000). In a society where openly declaring one's status is frowned upon, Johnston and Baumann write, status is communicated through one's "individual tastes and lifestyles, which are posited as sophisticated, savvy, and cosmopolitan" (2007, 173). Many Belgian beer tourism activities provide participants with a vehicle to discover what they define as authentic experiences. These tourists can be motivated by the pursuit of cultural capital. Tourism is an occupation of the privileged and the willful participation in consuming the "other" can have some problematic connotations. As Molz writes in "Eating Difference: The Cosmopolitan Mobilities of Culinary Tourism," "definitions of culinary tourism are as much about the way food operates within a symbolic economy that trades on Otherness, the exotic, the strange, difference, and novelty as they are about eating as a material encounter" (2007, 78). Molz investigated round-the-world travelers who actively participate in culinary tourism. She found that this group performs cosmopolitanism by travelling and actively consuming and pursuing "strange" and "other" foods, demonstrating "the cosmopolitan characteristic of openness to other cultures and display a kind of worldly cross-cultural competence" (ibid., 84). Long's description of culinary tourism is the exploration of a distinct, singular "other" (2010), however Molz explains that in the case of round-the-world culinary tourists, they are "in the privileged position of being able to play with estrangement and belonging through food" (2007, 82). They become adept at "moving between and consuming many other cuisines" (ibid., 90), actively performing their cosmopolitan mobilities. As is evident in the narratives of Belgian beer ambassadors, the desire to consume the

"other" is definitely present for some Belgian beer tourists. Also a factor is the definite international privileging of Belgian beer, especially over American beer. Many Belgian beer styles might be considered odd or strange, especially to an American audience who is used to pale lagers. For example, lambics are beers fermented through the exposure to wild yeast that can give beer a sour, funky or tart taste. Vincent Cilurzo writes in *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, that with the rise of craft brewing in the United States, some brewers took inspiration from classic Belgian sour beers to make "new world" sour beers (2011, 744). Additionally, the mobility of these beer ambassadors is also highlighted as travel is an important feature within their narratives and the pursuits that follow. In this sense, the ability to travel to try a variety of beers, even if that travel is just within Belgium, reflects cosmopolitan mobilities.

This privilege to actively participate in the culinary tourism of another country is discussed in Josée Johnston and Shyon Baumann's article "Democracy versus Distinction: A Study of Omnivorousness in Gourmet Food Writing." Johnston and Baumann write that in the early 2000s there was a recognition and appreciation of "traditionally undistinguished foods" (2007, 166) such as hamburgers, meatloaf and hotdogs by elite food publications such as *Bon Appétit* and *Food and Wine*. The authors claim that it seemed as if a "new age of food democracy was dawning – out with the snobbish history of elite foods for elite people" (ibid.). The result should have been a leveling out of what makes for good food between sociopolitical classes but Johnston and Baumann remain skeptical that this democratic shift actually took place. Instead, social elitism took on a new expression. They state, "the broadening of the high-status culinary repertoire is part of a larger cultural trend of… cultural "omnivorousness"" (ibid., 167). Now rather than consuming singularly highbrow foods, elite eaters sought an accumulation of a wide variety of foods from different social spheres. Additionally, Johnston and Baumann write that in

culinary tourism, there is search for authentic foods of "lower" classes, but these "authentic food items are primarily accessible to cosmopolitan, upper-middle-class individuals with ample grocery budget who are capable of extensive global travel" (ibid., 188). Culinary tourism is the exploration of the exotic in comparison to the consumer's familiar. Therefore, it inherently raises issues of social, economic, cultural and racial disparity. In the case of the Belgian beer tourist, they can experience this same need for a culmination of a wide variety of beers, including from some different social spheres. Beer is largely seen as an affordable, working-class beverage, and Belgian beers such as saison ales, were traditionally beers made to be consumed by farm workers in the French-speaking area of Belgium (Markowski 2011, 711). However, with the craft beer boom (Thompson 2018; Carroll and Swaminathan 2000; Garavaglia and Swinnen 2017), these traditional styles have seen a huge resurgence worldwide and specialty beers come with a higher price tag and exclusivity.

Both articles by Molz, and Johnston and Baumann, acknowledge the privilege involved in participating in culinary tourism, as well as the gain of cultural capital that comes with taking part in such activities. As will be discussed in later chapters, beer enthusiasts of all sorts, not just Belgian beer tourists, keep track of the large volume of beer produced and consumed worldwide through social media websites and applications, such as Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate. Being able to claim that one has consumed an extensive variety of types and brands of beers builds one's credibility and demonstrates one's knowledge and understanding of beer. Additionally, visiting Belgium to consume beers that are unavailable or very difficult to find in one's home country can also play a significant role in a person's expertise. Beer writer Charles D. "Chuck" Cook explains in his interview that a large motivation behind his visit to Belgium was to gain access to hard-to-find beers:

103

I can't go buy Cantillon off the shelves [in Virginia, USA]. It's impossible in most places, unless you're really lucky. So certain places that are like, this place is a pilgrimage, I want to go to Cantillon and just sit there and drink what I can't get here because that's the only way to do it. Same thing for other lambic breweries that have tasting rooms that are accessible. I think people who love the Belgian styles want to go there and experience that. (Cook 2019)

Belgian beer tourism allows visitors access to a beer nation whose tastes can be difficult to

experience otherwise. Due to the wide variety of beer styles and the large number of breweries in

Belgium, there are an infinite number of possibilities and ways to explore Belgian beer.

The adoption of technical beer language, which will be explored more thoroughly in later

chapters, is another way to display cultural capital. Wes Flack writes in "American

Microbreweries and Neolocalism: "Ale-ing" for a Sense of Place" that there is a new

sophisticated trend amongst small-production beer consumers:

A subculture of beer connoisseurs has emerged in tandem with the rise of microbrewers. These people are sophisticated beer drinkers who are familiar with terms like *hallertauer*, *lambic*, and *doppelbock*. They know how to pronounce *wort*, and scoff at the insipid Pilsener. Perhaps in response to growing anti-alcohol sentiment, and groups such as Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD), many beer drinkers have changed the nature of their consumption from beer swilling to beer tasting. As with almost everything in this society of conspicuous consumption, the beer that a person drinks has become a sociological marker or symbol of self-definition (1997, 46).

Microbrewery consumers and Belgian beer enthusiasts are very similar and in fact sometimes the two groups overlap. Flack suggests that boutique wineries' approach to tasting might have heavily influenced this beer connoisseurship that sees visitors enjoying tasting selections at breweries. With this slow, low-risk consumption, comes a focus on taste and emphasis on

knowledge.

# **Gateway Beer to Belgium**

Culinary tourism and alcotourism encompasses consuming food and drink within the country and place of origin but are not confined to that. In the following paragraphs, I introduce five Belgian beer ambassadors. The first two stories, by Michael Jackson and Garrett Oliver, are from books, and the last three from Stu Stuart, Chuck Cook and Tom Peters, are pulled from interviews. Each of the narratives is similar to my own that began this chapter. I classify these as conversion narratives, a particular type of personal experience narrative. Similar to religious conversion narratives that solidify and express a person's faith, these stories recount an individual's alcotourism experience, when they tasted their first Belgian beer, as a turning point. The significance of such retellings is that they indicate a transformation within the consumer that turns them from an average beer consumer into a Belgian beer enthusiast. Through this Belgian beer tourism experience, reinforcing both its singularity and Belgium's reputation as a producer of superlative beer.

#### Michael Jackson

Michael Jackson (1942-2007) was a famous British journalist specializing in the topics of whiskey and beer; he was host of the television series *The Beer Hunter* (1989), and author of *The World Guide to Beer* and *Great Beers of Belgium*. In the latter publication, he recollects his first journalist posting outside of Edinburg and London, in Amsterdam in the mid-to-late sixties. After drinking Amstel, Grolsch, and Heineken beers, he was introduced to a whole other type of beer:

Amid the endless golden glasses of Dutch lager, someone wearing a John Lennon mask handed me a chalice containing a darker beer. Caution long to the winds, I took a gulp. I was quite unprepared for the richness of the brew and, a moment later, the hit of alcohol, somewhere around the top of the head. "You like it?" He looked surprised, dazed even. Perhaps he had enjoyed a few glasses himself. "Yes", I replied. "It's terrific".

"That is a Trappist beer," he intoned, almost gravely. "If you like that sort of thing, you are in the wrong country. You really ought to go across the border." Then the night and the alcohol and the jostling crowd and the music took us our separate ways. I never learned his name, nor saw the face behind the mask.

Next day, hungover and bedraggled, I crossed the border, a refugee from The Netherlands' annual moment of uninhibition.

It was my first visit to Belgium. I had discovered that not all continental European beer was Pils. I soon began to realise that Belgium had a selection of beer-styles such as I had never seen. I sampled De Koninck, Westmalle Dubbel and Tripel and an unidentified Gueuze, each astonishing me more than the last.

I stayed for a long weekend. When I left, my perspectives and passions had been re-aligned.

Journalism would take me to Belfast and Bangladesh, hastily here, briefly there, but eventually the blood of John Barleycorn called me to its trails. I have found great beers in Alaska and Patagonia and wonderful whiskies in Islay and Hokkaido, but in Belgium a Beer Hunter can never rest on his bar-stool. (Jackson 2008, 9)

## Garrett Oliver

Garrett Oliver is a world-renown beer expert; he is author of The Brewmaster's Table,

editor of The Oxford Companion to Beer, brewmaster at Brooklyn Brewery in Brooklyn, New

York, and the choice expert on WIRED magazine's series Tech Support on YouTube with

almost a million views (WIRED 2021). In the introductory chapter of The Brewmaster's Table,

Oliver writes of graduating from college and setting off for London. There he tasted his first

British "real ale" and experienced lively English pub-life, forever changing his understanding

and perspective of beer (2005, iii-ix). After a year in Britain, he travelled across Europe and

experienced other country's beer scene, one of which was, of course, Belgium:

It was spring 1984, and I had just left London, which had been my home for a year. I'd fallen in love with English ales in London and thought that I now knew everything about beer. I pulled up to a café, locked up the bike, and walked in. There must have been a dozen taps, and I didn't recognize the beers pouring from any of them. There were dozens more beers in bottles on the back bar. The barkeep then poured a drink with a startlingly pinkish hue and handed it to the fellow next to me. "What is that?" I asked, assuming that it was some sort of soft drink. "It is kriek," he answered, "a beer made with

cherries." I stood there like an idiot, dumbfounded and staring. He smiled, poured me a small glass, and handed it to me. "Welcome to Belgium," he said.

Nestled between France, the Netherlands, Germany, and the North Sea, tiny Belgium is home to 12 million people, three languages, and some of the finest, most complex beer in the world. Belgium was once ruled from Burgundy but while Belgians retain an appreciation of fine wine, they save their passion for beer. Visit a Belgian café and this passion is evident, even palpable. Beers in dozens of styles, each with its own special glass, will be lovingly displayed even in the most modest establishment. Look past the ever-present industrial pilsners, and you'll see the ones we're looking for. Some will be swaddled lovingly in tissue paper. Some will stand tall in champagne bottles with the full regalia of a cork and wire hood. Many boast a secondary fermentation in the bottle and sit on a fine sediment of slumbering yeast. Some have been married with fruit and stand on the border between wine and beer. Some have been fermented spontaneously, using techniques thousands of years old. Others are redolent of herbs and spices. Some have been reverently brewed by monks. For the beer lover, Belgium is truly heaven on earth. (Oliver 2005, 173)

## Stu Stuart

Former stand-up comedian Stu Stuart is the founder of Belgian Beer Me! Beer Tours of Belgium (BBM!), an American beer tour company specializing in Belgian beers. Tours are multi-days in length such as the six-day Legendary Zythos Beer Festival & Beer Tour and the ten-day Lonely Monks Trappist Beer Tour of Belgium and The Netherlands. Stuart has expanded to offer beer tours in Croatia, Germany, United States, and cider tours in Normandy, France. His impressive roster of beer tours led me to contact him for an interview over video chat in the spring of 2021. When asked how he became interested in Belgian beers and why he started this company, he explained:

When I was a small child, like in elementary school, I collected beer cans. Then I started collecting beer signs. So I was interested in the, kind of romantic imagery of beer as a young person and then, later on when I got old enough to drink beer, I was fond of drinking beer and I learned more about it, and eventually became a homebrewer and then when I lived in Seattle back in the late 80s, I had a girlfriend who knew about Belgian beer and she gave me a Chimay red label and that was my first Belgian beer. I never had anything like that before, so I was instantly interested and hooked, and I kept buying more Belgian beer. I'd buy a mixed six-pack of beers that I had no ideas what they were and just try them. And then, this what kind of late 80s, early 90s, when craft beer was really starting to take hold in Seattle, and then in 2004 I went to Belgium on a beer tour

run by a guy names Mike Saxton out of Missoula, Montana<sup>28</sup>. And then, I kept going back to Belgium on my own. Then I started a Belgian beer appreciation class called "Belgian Beer Me!". People said, 'well you know so much about Belgian beer and Belgium, you should lead tours,' and I thought, 'yeah.' So then I started - when I went to Belgium I would think about chronological progression of events, efficient use of time, yeah. Visit hotels and restaurants. And then I'd produce some three tours, that's how I started out in 2007 and then kind of grew from there. It turned into a kind of second income, I was doing stand-up comedy full-time at the time, and I ran Belgian Beer Me! for about five years while I was doing comedy, and I expanded a number of tours and it just got to the point where really it required all my time, so I retired my comedy show and since 2013 I have been leading and producing tours full-time. (Stuart 2021)

## Charles D. "Chuck" Cook

Charles D. "Chuck" Cook is a Belgian beer enthusiast, writer, and photographer. Known as "The Belgian Beer Specialist," he traveled to Belgium thirty-eight times between 1994 and 2021, visiting about 190 breweries. He has written for a wide array of beer magazines and *USA Today* and contributed to the book. Based out of Virginia, Cook updates his website, Belgian Beer Specialist (drinkbelgianbeer.com), providing news and thoughts on the ever expanding Belgian beer scene in its home country, and the United States. A main focus and interest of Cook's is lambics (or "sour" beers, as Americans like to call them), and he has accompanied Stuart on BBM!'s Wild & Spontaneous Beer Tour, several times, educating participants as they explore Belgium's wild yeast beers, such as lambics, krieks and Flemish reds. He came to Belgian beer by chance while visiting Europe and has been addicted ever since:

So I was in Spain, actually in France doing fieldwork in 1991, and I went to Spain, to San Sebastian, and I found a cervecería and I was intrigued by all the bottles. It was basically just a display case full of crazy-looking labels, and I'm from North Carolina, and at that point we had a law that you couldn't sell beer over 6%, so we didn't have that many Belgian beers, and I was not aware of the existence of these beers. So I started drinking Chimay and other Belgian beers at that point. I was back for a two-month backpacking trip in Spain and Portugal in '93, and I sought out any cervecería I could find in different cities like Salamanca, Toledo, Madrid, and Barcelona, and other places that I went to. I would try a lot of Belgian beers then, and then in '94 I went to Belgium for the first time. I was kind of hooked after trying the Belgian beers at beer bars in Spain. (Cook 2021)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Mike Saxton is the founder and president of BeerTrips.com.

## Tom Peters

Tom Peters is the co-owner of Monk's Café in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. This legendary establishment was described by Jackson as "Simply the best Belgian café in the United States" (2008, 476) and is highly praised by local and international bar and restaurant ranking lists (Monk's Café 2022). In 2019, it was a James Beard Foundation Finalist for Outstanding Bar Program, and since 2008 has been a Ambassadeur d'Orval.<sup>29</sup> Before opening Monk's café in 1997, Peters worked as a bartender in Philadelphia. It was in 1984, when visiting Europe for the first time, that he encountered Belgian beer:

Tom Peters was travelling to Paris with his girlfriend and decided to fly through Brussels and take a train to Paris because it was cheaper. Once in Brussels, they went to a bar and asked for a Heineken because he heard that it tasted better in Europe than back home in the United States. Once they received a beer, he took a sip and tried to whisper discreetly to his partner, "Still taste like shit here." The bartender overheard and laughed then asked, "Want to try some real beer?" and he said sure! Tom was served a Duvel. The beer had a large head on it, and assuming the beer was poorly poured, he waited for the foam to diminish and subside. The bartender noticed the delay in consumption, and so approached the couple and told them that the foam is an important component of the beer and that the designed Duvel glassware is shaped in way, that when the glass is tilted, the liquid beers slips below the foam. Peters, working as a bartender back in the US, was impressed at the design of this glass and when he took a sip, stunned by the beer. Then, he was served an Orval and that surprised him even more. And finally, he had a Chimay bleu. All three of these beers were wildly different from one-another and he was surprised they were all made within the same small country. Instantly, as he was drinking, he began taking tasting notes on the beers on the coasters. After heading to the planned destination in Paris, they had some flexibility at the end of their trip to visit other

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> The Ambassadeur d'Orval label is given yearly to bars and restaurants that serves Orval beer with distinguished honour, based on the criteria of Presence, Service and Knowledge. In 2021, there were 395 establishments worldwide, and nine awarded in the United States of America (Orval n.d.).

parts of Europe, but decided to return to Belgium to enjoy more of their culture and, of course, their beer.<sup>30</sup>

## **Conversion Narratives**

After reading the excerpts above by Jackson and Oliver, I noticed similarities with my own experience with Belgian beer. Therefore, when I was interviewing Stuart, Cook and Peters, I was sure to ask them what their first encounter with Belgian beer was like. Jackson and Oliver's accounts are a little more structured and straightforward because they are written accounts, whereas the others were verbal and have been transcribed. Even so, there is no doubt a consistency runs throughout these narratives that hints at a repeated performance on behalf of the author.

Inspired by Vladimir Propp's analysis of the functions of the dramatis personae in *Morphology of a Folktale* ([1958] 2015, 24-59), I have broken down these five conversation narratives (table 3.1) that describe the taste of Belgian beer triggering a new sense of purpose or direction within the narrator's life.<sup>31</sup> It dramatically influences the teller's future life choices and their appreciation of taste. In her article on religious conversion narratives titled, "The Night I got the Holy Ghost...": Holy Ghost Narratives and the Pentacostal Conversion Process," Elaine J. Lawless determined that in the Pentecostal sect she studied, "the completed conversion [...]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> This narrative was told to me by Peters during our interview on October 20<sup>th</sup>, 2021. However, just as any researcher has experienced, I did not yet have my voice recorder on when we started chatting. This is typed out from notes and memory. I have also filled in some of the blanks thanks to an article published about Monk's Café in October magazine on February 23, 2018 (Koczwara 2018).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> To assume conversion narratives are reserved for only "serious" topics such as religion of changing of worldview, is inaccurate and naïve. For example, as an avid Conan O'Brien fan, I have been listening to the Podcast *Conan Needs A Friend*, where the famous comedian interviews other comedians, actors and public figures. When interviewing other comedians, O'Brien often asks for the event or moment in which they knew they wanted to be a comedian; these tales hold similar structures to the ones noted above and would be considered conversion narratives.

has three components: a water baptism, a personal but public encounter with the Holy Ghost which must include the verbal glossolalia, and the subsequent narrative re-construction of that spiritual encounter" (1988, 18). These personal encounter stories are told and retold countless times over, adapting and restructuring to the contexts, which might be as formal as in church or simply at the dinner table (ibid., 11, 2). Lawless identifies these narratives as "memorates that embody their religious beliefs," (ibid., 13) that are structured and told to fit into a Pentecostal worldview.

Taking a closer look at the Belgian beer conversion narratives above, one can see both a development and transformation in the narrators and a common structure to the narratives (table 3.1). It was obvious from interviews with Stuart, Cook and Peters, that their narratives had been practiced and told repeatedly over time. First, as is often common in legend, the narrators set up the **context**. The setting is usually unassuming and they identify the year when the event took place. Following, they describe an **unexpected encounter**, which will lead to a powerful response. In this example, the unassuming beer consumer encounters Belgian beer. Now, the narrator has experienced a **change** within themselves and their eyes are open to new opportunity. In this case, it is a change of taste which leads the individual to be intrigued and to develop an interest in Belgian beer. Finally, now that the narrator has identified this new interest, they are in **pursuit** of it for, seemingly, the rest of their days. For the Belgian beer enthusiast, this means continuing to find and drink the wide range Belgian beer and visiting (or revisiting) Belgium. It is as if their life purpose has been changed.

Context **Unexpected encounter** Change Pursuit Narrator Michael Jackson Amid the ...someone wearing a John "You like it?" He I soon began to realise that Belgium endless golden Lennon mask handed me a looked surprised, had a selection of beer-styles such glasses of Dutch chalice containing a darker dazed even. Perhaps as I had never seen. he had enjoyed a few beer. Caution long to the lager When I left, my perspectives and winds, I took a gulp. I was glasses himself. passions had been re-aligned. quite unprepared for the "Yes", I replied. "It's ...but in Belgium a Beer Hunter can richness of the brew and, a terrific". never rest on his bar-stool. moment later, the hit of alcohol, somewhere around the top of the head. Garrett Oliver I pulled up to a café, It was spring I asked, assuming that For the beer lover, Belgium is truly 1984, and I had locked up the bike, and it was some sort of heaven on earth. walked in. There must just left London, soft drink. "It is which had been have been a dozen taps, kriek," he answered, my home for a and I didn't recognize the "a beer made with beers pouring from any of cherries." I stood there year. them.... like an idiot. dumbfounded and The barkeep then poured a staring. He smiled, drink with a startlingly poured me a small pinkish hue and handed it glass, and handed it to to the fellow next to me. me. "Welcome to "What is that?" Belgium," he said. I lived in Seattle I had a girlfriend who so I was instantly and hooked, I kept buying more Stu Stuart knew about Belgian beer Belgian beer. I'd buy a mixed sixback in the late interested and she gave me a Chimay pack of beers that I had no ideas 80s red label and that was my what they were and just try them.

#### Table 3.1. Belgian beer ambassador's conversion narratives

|                            |   | first Belgian beer. I never<br>had anything like that<br>before  |  |   |
|----------------------------|---|--|--|---|
| Charles D.<br>"Chuck" Cook | So I was in<br>Spain, actually<br>in France doing<br>fieldwork in<br>1991, and I went<br>to Spain       | I found a cervecería and I<br>was intrigued by all the<br>bottles. I was not aware of<br>the existence of these<br>beers.                                | So I started drinking<br>Chimay and things<br>like that  | at that point and I was back for like<br>a two-month backpacking trip in<br>Spain and Portugal in '93 and I sook<br>out any cervecería I could find in<br>different cities like Salamanca,<br>Madrid and places like that I went<br>to. I would try a lot of Belgian beers<br>then<br>I was kind of hooked after trying the<br>Belgian beers at beer bars in Spain. |
| Tom Peters                 | Travelling to<br>Paris by chance<br>was passing<br>through<br>Belgium and<br>decided to grab<br>a beer. | After being unimpressed<br>with a Heineken, bartender<br>offered "real" beer. Served<br>a Duvel with a lot of head<br>and served in unique<br>glassware. | Surprised by the<br>engineering of the<br>glassware and the<br>unique beer, he went<br>on to try Orval and<br>Chimay bleu. | Returned to Belgium at the last leg<br>of his trip, and when returning to the<br>US continued a pursuit of Belgian<br>beer and requested his bar manager<br>to carry Belgian beer.  |

Sources: Text from Jackson 2008, 9; Oliver 2005, 173; Stuart 2021; Cook 2021; Peters 2021.

In many ways, these narratives follow a similar pattern to the one Arnold van Gennep identified in rites of passage in his foundational work *Rites of Passage* (date). Van Gennep suggested that for important events within a person's life, such as birth or marriage, "there are ceremonies whose essential purpose is to enable the individual to pass from one defined position to another which is equally well defined" ([1960] 2004, 3), allowing for the individual to change status in society. He distinguished three stages of these types of rituals: separation (preliminal), transition (liminal), and reincorporation (postliminal) (ibid.,11). Though not a formal event or ceremony, the Belgian beer narratives do convey a change in the individual's status from an undistinguishing consumer to a person of more refined taste who appreciates exceptional, Belgian beer. The accounts trace the narrator's passage through a transitional stage when they unexpectedly encounter Belgian beer and seem uncertain. Raven Haymond writes in "Tasting the Forbidden Fruit as Rites of Passage: Former Mormons Reflect on Their First Sips of Alcohol and Coffee," that former members of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (LDS Church) have powerful narratives when recounting their first sips of coffee or alcohol, similarly demonstrating the three stages of a rite of passage:

Participant narratives highlight how these drinks move them through symbolic separation from their former LDS community and identity, into a liminal period of transition where the work of identity recreation occurs, and finally into a space of incorporation into their new community outside of the Church. (2018, 317)

These narratives, Lawless's Holy Ghost narratives, and Belgian beer ambassador's narratives all highlight a "critical change" (ibid.) on behalf of the narrator.

To an outsider, comparing the first taste of Belgian beer to a religious awakening or rite of passage might seem inappropriate, however, it is worth emphasizing that these Belgian beer ambassadors have dedicated their lives to the topic of beer, and for some, made it their livelihood. For Jackson, Oliver, Stuart, Cook and Peters, their introduction to Belgian beer, and the narrative they tell of it, not only serves as a way to convey how lifechanging this moment was, but also as a justification of why they have devoted their lives to the connoisseurship of Belgian beer. Devotion is not singularly a trait of the religiously devout. These conversion narratives function as a tool for Belgian beer enthusiasts to claim that their connection and relationship with Belgian beer is beyond themselves and that they didn't have control over the impact it had on them; it was otherworldly. Therefore, they are meant to pursue it; it is their calling. These narratives personalize the specialness of Belgium beer and its transformative powers for all who hear or read them.

#### **Belgian Beer Tourism**

Through the consumption of Belgian beer, individuals experience a taste of place. In the case of Jackson, Oliver, Stuart, Cook and Peters, their awakening narratives highlight Belgian beer tourism's transformative attributes as a search for authenticity, as a low-risk activity, and a pursuit of cultural capital. The mystery that surrounds the beer before and during its consumption in conversion narratives, attests to its unique authenticity. In Jackson's account, the mysterious John Lennon-mask-wearing person redirects him to Belgium after he enjoyed the strange beer served in a chalice, because "you are in the wrong country." In Oliver's narrative, he bikes to a bar in Belgium and randomly encounters a kriek lambic being poured, a unique Belgian cherry sour beer. In Peters's narrative, the bartender introduces "real" beer, in the form of iconic Belgian classics, Duvel, Orval and Chimay. These chance encounters support MacCannell's contention that authentic experiences "often [occur] by accident" (2013, 97). Following their conversation or awakening, the narrators visit Belgium, or perhaps more appropriately put, they undertake a pilgrimage to Belgium. As highlighted in the comment by Peters's bartender about

115

Belgian beer being "real beer," the narratives reflect a shift in thinking: there is undoubtedly a hierarchal categorization of beer with "real" Belgian beer at the top. The use of the word "real" here suggests the presence of the authentic, especially in comparison with placeless and popular mass-produced lagers by multi-national companies. Belgian beer's authenticity is expressed through its rootedness in place as well as its unique variety and histories.

The Belgian beer enthusiasts whose narratives are shared here were beer drinkers, some more avid than others, before the consumption of their first Belgian beer. Jackson was already a journalist specializing in beer and whiskey, Oliver had just experienced the wonders of British beer, Stuart had been collecting beer cans as a child, Cook enjoyed visit beers and trying out new beers in foreign lands, and Peters was a bartender. Though Jackson mentioned binge-drinking and a hangover in his narrative, otherwise the narrators do not distinguish their first interaction with Belgian beer as being risky or even overindulgent. It is presented more as a coming home; it is a recognition of what "real" beer tastes like. As experienced alcoholic beverage consumers, these individuals are familiar with beer and its effects, rendering the occasion familiar but different.

These awakening narratives mark the narrators' expanded knowledge about beer ("this... is beer?"), which then became a consuming pursuit of knowledge about Belgian beer. Initial sips led the individuals to write books, articles and blogs, start a tour company, or open a bar. In general, they became Belgian beer ambassadors to everyone willing to lend an ear. These individuals didn't just have a beer, they experienced a change from a beer drinker to a Belgian beer enthusiast. This obsessive pursuit of Belgian beer has parallels to being part of "foodie" culture. Josée Johnston and Shyon Baumann explain in *Foodies: Democracy and Distinction in the Gourmet Foodscape*, that "foodie" is a term originating in the 1980s, meant to be a less-

116

snobbish alternative to gastronome or epicure, hoping to encompass this same dedicated food lover, though it still largely negotiated and hated by the very people it is trying to define<sup>32</sup> (2010, 53-54). Through interviews with foodies, Johnston and Baumann identify four ways in which foodies express their devotion to food: education, identity, exploration, and evaluation (ibid., 61). Education, the subject discussed in this chapter, is the demonstration of the relationship between food and knowledge, and "[t]he knowledge dimension of being a foodie is at the forefront of interviewee's understanding of the nature of a foodie" (ibid., 63). In the Belgian beer enthusiasts' conversion narratives, there is a heightened level of awareness surrounding their knowledge of beer and Belgian beer that did not exist before that first sip. Not only are these consumers advancing their knowledge, they are also experiencing a change of taste which will draw them to try more Belgian beers, visit Belgium, write about Belgian beers, and educate others about Belgian beer.

## Conclusion

Whenever I talk about how much I enjoy Belgian beer, I always begin with my conversion narrative in Amsterdam with Wasse at Café Gollem. Then, I discuss grabbing beers with my peers and being introduced to Trappist beers and lambics, all served in their respectfully branded glasses. Returning to Canada after completing my degree, I sought Belgian beers and began reading and studying about the varieties and histories. When I started working at craft breweries and bars, I found myself correcting people on the proper amount of head on Belgian beer (two fingers is ideal!) and informing people on the different styles. Belgian beer had changed me, for the better or for the worse. Studies of culinary tourism and alcotourism discuss

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> As an avid food-lover, I hate the term "foodie" personally because of the pretentiousness and elitism associated with it, however I very much meet the criteria Johnston and Baumann identify.

the motivations behind these types of tourism, however rarely do emphasize the powerful impact that they can have on an individual. The Belgian beer ambassadors' conversion narratives make clear the transformative change that can occur when participating in Belgian beer tourism. They tell how understandings of beer are expanded and tastes dramatically changed. For my participants and I, this change was so powerful that it developed into lifelong careers, passions or scholarly pursuits. For listeners and readers, the stories underscore the potentially powerful nature of Belgian beer and place it above all other beer. Belgian beer tourism and the Belgian beer ambassadors' conversion narratives serve as clear examples of how narratives can strengthen the significance of beer being 'Belgian,' reinforcing once again as Oliver writes, "For the beer lover, Belgium is truly heaven on earth" (2005, 173).

This section demonstrated the use and strength of defining a beer as Belgian, through a discussion of the history and lore of Belgian beer and an examination of conversion narrations of Belgian beer ambassadors. Classifying a beer as "Belgian" not only identifies where the beer was made or the style it was meant to replicate, it imbues the product with historical and social significance, as is reflected by the 2016 "Beer culture in Belgium" inscription on UNESCO's Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. Narratives about "Belgian" beer help to construct a taste and provide context to the special status of Belgian beer. They provide the first clue both to the answer to my initial question why Orval is regarded as the best beer in the world, and to my quest to better understand how taste is constructed. In the following section, I examine meanings that emerge in a second set of narratives, those surrounding another identifier of Orval beer: "Trappist."

## SECTION III: NARRATING TRAPPIST

#### March 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019

I've only been here for under twenty-four hours, and I find it very soothing and peaceful. They ask visitors to be silent in shared spaces, and so it's very quiet. You see, I am one of those people who blares music or Netflix in the background when doing anything, but here it's just me and my thoughts. It's unnerving at first because suddenly I'm very in tune with my thoughts, my memories, my tasks... I'm not as stressed as I was before arriving because I have the time to think about what needs to be done. This "busy" life that I live at home isn't necessary – I really need to take a step back and just think, relax and work, versus just being busy and rushed. Don't get me wrong, occupying oneself and keeping busy is important, but not overexerting yourself. Ensuring you can get everything done well is also important. I need a way to find this silence at home.

This passage from my fieldnotes was written while I was staying at the chalet at Orval Abbey for the first time in early March 2019. Before beginning my fieldwork, I had been concerned about the impact the Abbey's serene environment would have on me and my work. Leading to focused intention, the silence of the Orval Abbey proved to be ideal for a researcher beginning a large project. André Louf, a Trappist monk at Mont des Chats Abbey in Berthen, France renown for his writings, explains the silence in *The Cistercian Way*:

The Cistercians, particularly the Trappists, owe some of their fame to their legendary silence. The Trappist is known as the monk who never speaks. Although the details of the rule of silence have varied down the ages, a predilection for silence is always found among monks. Even today, speaking is subject to serious restrictions in a Cistercian monastery. There is, for example, the great silence of the night, which means that the time between Compline and Laus is a special time for silence. During the rest of the day the monks speak only to the extent necessary for work and for the good ordering of the house. Recreation is exceptional. Private conversation between monks is subject to

previous permission or approval by the abbot. Conversations in small groups or with the whole community take a place more frequently but in general not more often than once a week. (1983, 92)

This silence is paired with a lifestyle based on a balance of prayer and work. Even my brief experience of the silence and life lived with intention left a mark on me. It also changed the way I thought about Trappists and Orval beer.

In addition to being Belgian, another marker of Orval beer's uniqueness on the global beer market is that it is a Trappist beer. This section explores what it means for a beer to be "Trappist." The first chapter traces the history of Orval Abbey, beginning with the famed Legend of Orval, which is used in the beer's branding. Next, I overview the foundation of Orval Abbey and the history of the Cistercians of Strict Observance. Place-making through legend and history are useful tools in beer branding, as can be seen in craft beer branding. The second chapter examines the Authentic Trappist Product label and designation. Here, I discuss the significance and meaning of this label and compare it to wine designations, such as France's *appellation d'origine controlée*. I explore issues of authenticity and argue for a terroir of beer.

#### **Chapter Four**

#### Aureavallis: The Legend of Orval and History of the Abbaye Notre-Dame d'Orval

Matilde was a widow and her wedding-ring had accidentally fallen into the fountain. She prayed to the Lord and at once a trout rose to the surface with the precious ring in its mouth. Matilde exclaimed: "Truly this place is a Val d'Or<sup>33</sup>!" In gratitude, she decided to establish a monastery on the site.

- Orval Abbey, "Legend of Orval"

I first heard of Orval Abbey through its beer; it served as my introduction to the place. In this chapter I discuss the legends and histories of Orval Abbey that help create its unique sense of place. In doing so, I demonstrate how Orval not only provides the consumer a taste of beer, but a taste of history and place as well.

## Legend of Orval

The legend of Orval is told many times and in many ways at Orval Abbey: in the stained glass "Countess Matilde of Tuscany with the Orval trout at her feet" by Jean Huet (fig. 4.1); at Mathilde's Spring on the old monastic grounds, featured alongside a mural of Matilda and the fish (fig. 4.3); by Belgian comic book creator Jean-Claude Servais's *Orval*, a two-volume history for sale in the gift shop (fig. 4.2; Servais 2012); and the label of Orval beer with a fish with a gold ring in its mouth at its center (fig. 4.4). The tale of Matilde and the subsequent founding of the Orval monastery is alluded to or retold in countless publications about Orval beer (see Jackson 2008, 281-282; Verdonck and de Raedemaeker 2016, 248; Van den Steen 2018, 73; Hieronymus 2005, 54), but when did the narrative originate and how has it changed? What purposes does it serve today?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> "Val d'Or" translates to Valley of Gold in English, and is said to be the origin of the name of the place: Val d'Or - Val Or - Or Val - Orval.



Figure 4.1. "Countess Matilde of Tuscany with the Orval trout at her feet" by Jean Huet. *Source:* Photograph from Wallonie Magazine, accessed February 7, 2023, <u>https://www.wawmagazine.be/fr/etiquettes/monasterecistercien</u>.



Figure 4.2. Tableau of Matilda of Tuscany and the fish returning her ring from a comic book, detailing Orval's history. *Source:* Servais 2012, 5.



Figure 4.3. Mathilde Fountain located on the old monastic grounds of Orval Abbey with a mural by Jean-Claude Servais. *Source:* Photograph from Tourist Office of Florenville, accessed February 7, 2023, <u>https://www.florenville.org/en/to-see-mf/florenville-and-its-villages/orval?tmpl=component.</u>



Figure 4.4. Orval beer bottle label, featuring the Orval trout with a golden ring in its mouth. Photograph by author.

The history and veracity of the Legend of Orval has been an interest of historians since the mid-twentieth century. Charles Grégoire and Christian Grégoire write that the earliest proof and attestations of the Legend of Orval is probably in a coat of arms from this location. Consisting of a gold ring on a green background, it dates from as early as the 13<sup>th</sup> century (1967, 93-94). In the 1969 article "Les origines de l'abbaye d'Orval," Christian Grégoire notes that there are five authors from the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century who helped shape the narrative into what it is today: Richard de Wassebourg (1549), Jean d'Anly (1569/79), Christophe Brower (1591/1670), Jean Bertels (1595/1605) and Chrysostome Henriquez (1632). Richard de Wassebourg's 1549 text reads as follows:

Un jour entre autres que ladite Mathilde chassait les bois et forêts du comté de Chiny, elle se trouvait de fortune en une plaisante vallée où était une bien belle fontaine, sur laquelle se reposant et voulant boire de l'eau d'icelle, y laisse par mégarde choir un anneau d'or qu'on ne put depuis jamais retrouver...à raison de quoi elle nomma ladite fontaine

Orvaulx, don't il advent que depuis l'abbaye fondée audit lieu retint le nom d'Orvaulx. Grégoire 2011, 21)<sup>34</sup>

[On a day just like any other, Matilda was hunting in the woods and forest of Chiny county, when she luckily found herself in a pleasant valley where she found a beautiful fountain on which, resting and wanting to drink water, accidentally dropped her golden ring which she has never been able to retrieve...this is why she named the fountain Orval, and that the Abbey founded in this area also carries the name Orval.]

Curiously, Wassebourg notes that this event occurred around the year 1053, seventeen years

before the first monks are known to have arrived in the area from Calabre in 1070. Within

d'Anly's 1569/79 account, the monastery is already established but the tale remains otherwise

the same<sup>35</sup>. Accounts by Bower, Bertels and Henriquez are similar, however they include

Mathilda regaining her ring after a prayer and making a donation to the nearby monks.

Henriquez writes:

Vers cette époque Mathilde, veuve de Godefroid le Bossu, duc de Lorraine, vint en visite chez son parent Arnould (le Comte de Chiny) pour calmer la double douleur qu'elle ressentait de la perte récente de son mari et de son fils. Elle était en effet veuve depuis peu de temps, lorsqu'un jour son fils unique, dont l'éducation était confiée à Godefroid de Bouillon, jouait et courait avec quelques compagnons de son âge sur la Semois pris par le gel; soudain la glace céda sous le léger poids de l'enfant, qui fut englouti par les flots, puis se referma en arrachant la tête du frêle corps.

Le comte s'efforce de la consoler de cette double épreuve et il lui parle incidemment des ermites qui mènent dans la forêt voisine une vie tout angélique. À la nouvelle de ces merveilles, elle brûle d'aller les contempler ; le lendemain elle y va, regarde et reste frappée de surprise. Elle entra ensuite dans la petite église, une solide construction en chêne, et demeure quelques instants en prière. De là elle va s'asseoir au bord d'une limpide fontaine et, tandis que ses compagnons discutent entre eux, elle trempe dans l'eau ses mains délicates ; mais voici que l'onde fait glisser de son doigt l'anneau qu'elle y porte (cet anneau, tout étincelant d'une pierre précieuse, était un cadeau que Godefroid lui avait offert le jour de son mariage ; cher souvenir d'un époux et d'un fils). Elle poussa un cri et se met à chercher, mais l'anneau reste introuvable ; les autres aussi cherchent en vain. Alors ils décident d'aller tous implorer la Vierge, patronne de ce lieu ; ils y vont et prient, puis ils retournent à la fontaine où la bague apparaît à repose dans le bouillonnement des eaux.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> The original text is written in an older French, therefore I am using here a modern rewriting of the text to render it legible to today's French readers and to ease my own translation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Jean d'Anly's account is the only once that does not mention where their resources came from, though the sources mentioned by Wassebourg, Bertels and otherwise have disappeared and can no longer be verified (Grégoire et Grégoire 1967, 89; Grégoire 1969 759-761).

Calmée, elle montre aux autres le bijou et s'écrie : "Voici l'or que je cherchais : Heureuse la vallée qui me l'a rendu ! Ainsi je désirerais que désormais on l'appelle le Val d'Or". C'est ainsi que la bague est à l'origine du nom et des armoiries d'Orval, *qui portent un anneau orné d'une pierre précieuse*. [...]

Elle y ajouta de l'or pour construire la petite église au seuil de laquelle, près du versant de la colline, la fontaine dont nous avons parlé fait couler ses eaux fraîches et limpides, où vivent depuis toujours de petits poissons que le peuple appelle des truites. Mathilde persuada aussi le comte d'ajouter de nouvelles libéralités à ce lieu qu'il avait concédé aux moines. (Tillière 1967, 5-7)

[During this era, Matilda, widow of Godfrey the Hunchback, Duke of Lorraine, visited Arnold (Count of Chiny) to calm her double woe of losing both her husband and her son. She was a widow for only a short while, when her only son, whose education was under the supervision of Godfrey of Bouillon, was playing and running with friends of his age on the frozen Semois river; suddenly the ice broke under the light weight of the child, and the floating sheets of ice enveloped him and eventually closed on his neck, detaching his head from his frail body.

In hopes to console her on this double tragedy, the count spoke to her of the hermits that lived in the neighbouring forest, living a holy life. In such wonderful news, she eagerly wanted to visit; the next day she went, watching and stunned. She then went into the small church, made of solid oak, and stayed a little while to pray. From there, she went to sit on the edge of the clear fountain and, while her companions chatted, she dipped her hands delicately in the water; but the ripples of the water slipped the ring from her finger (a ring, sparkling with a precious stone, was a wedding day gift from Godfrey; a dear memory of her husband and son). She cried out and began searching for it, but the ring was impossible to find; the other also helped search in vain. So, they decide to pray to the Virgin Mary, patron of this place; they go and pray, and then return to the fountain to find the ring floating on the bubbling water.

Calmed, she showed the other her piece of jewelry and cried, "Here is the gold I was searching for: Glorious valley that has returned it to me! Henceforth I name this area the Valley of Gold!" This is why a ring is the origin of the name and the coat of arms of Orval, carrying a gold ring with a precious stone. [...]

She donated gold to construct a small church near the slope of the hill where the fountain we have spoken off makes the fresh and clear water flow, where small fish have always lived that people call trout. Matilda also persuaded the count to give additional liberties to the land granted to the monks.]

This text is much more detailed than those by Wassebourg and d'Anly, providing the details of

Matilda becoming a window, the traumatic death of her child, and her closeness with Arnold,

Count of Chiny. It describes her visiting the monks, praying for the ring's return, experiencing

the return of the ring, and donating funds to the monks. Interestingly, the mention of trout in the

water of the fountain after Matilda regained her ring foreshadows the version of the tale currently

most popular. Grégoire and Grégoire write that the first association of a trout with the ring is seen in a cast iron plaque made in 1735, currently conserved at the Abbey's museum (1967, 93-94). Anny Stalpaert credits in their article "La légende d'Orval. Ses attestations, son origine et ses attaches avec d'autres légendes" [The Legend of Orval. It's Testimonies, Origins, and Relations to other Legends] (1957, 134), J.B. Sibenaler's 1899 rendition of the legend as the first version to include a fish retrieving the ring from the water for Matilda:

Mathilde de Toscany, veuve de Godefroid le Bossu, duc de Lorraine, avait perdu son fils dans la Semoys. Comme elle visitait Orval en 1079 pour calmer ses chagrins et se lavait les mains dans la fontaine, elle laissa tomber son alliance dans l'eau. Comme elle se désolait, et priait, un poisson lui rapporta sa bague. (Sibenaler 1899, 168)

[Matilda of Tuscany, widow of Godfrey the Hunchback, Duke of Lorraine, lost her son in the Semois river. As she was visiting Orval in 1079 to calm her woes, she washed her hands in the fountain, letting her ring fall into the water. As she remorsed, and prayed, a fish brought her back her ring.]

Sibenaler's version appears to be the first circumstance of the ring being returned by a fish. In comparison to the narrative by Henriquez (Tillière 1967, 5-7), Sibenaler's lacks much detail, including a mention of the Count of Chiny, monks, the Virgin Mary, and the donation. Stalpaert writes that the images of the fish and the ring have become emblems of the Abbey, used on postage stamps during the Abbey's reconstruction in 1928 and in advertisements for the brewery on site.

Today, a pamphlet produced by Orval Abbey includes the following version of the

legend:

Around 1076, the lady of the locality was Countess Matilda of Tuscany (Italy). Seated at the edge of a clear spring, she inadvertently dropped her wedding ring, a keepsake of her deceased husband, Godfrey the Hunchback. In despair at having lost this piece of jewellery, the countess went to the oratory nearby to pray. When she came out, a trout miraculously emerged at the surface of the water and gave her back her ring. Filled with wonder, the countess cried: "Here is the golden ring I was looking for. Blessed be the valley that returned it to me. I shall henceforth and for always call it "aurea vallis" (golden vale)." The emblem of Orval – the trout and the golden ring – has preserved the

gracious remembrance of this legend. As to the spring, it still provides water for the Abbey and its brewery.<sup>36</sup>

Interestingly, the first version of legend that opens this chapter, and comes from the Orval website, indicates that Matilde decided to establish a monastery: "In gratitude, she decided to establish a monastery on the site," but this detail is not included in the flyer. Also, in this version, Matilde is marked as a suzerain of the land. This piece of information is contested due to the suspected fraudulent nature of a charter dated 1124 that has since disappeared, but likely was fabricated between 1620-1622 by the abbot Bernard de Montgaillard (Grégoire and Grégoire 1967, 82-83). Finally, the mention of the brewery at the end of the legend serves modern interests by connecting the present and the past.

While the evolution of this legend over centuries is memorialized through writing, it is largely assumed that many written accounts have been lost or destroyed, and it is also safe to assume that oral variations of the tale could have been shared before, during and after Wassebourg's 1549 written account. Stalpaert's article "La légende d'Orval, ses attestations, son origine et ses attachés avec d'autres légendes" (1957, 137; also see Grégoire and Grégoire 1967, 85), compares the theme of the legend to Polycrates' Ring. Classified under the Aaron-Thompson-Uther Tale Type Index, 736A Ring of Polycrates (University of Missouri Libraries n.d.), and the Thompson Motif Index of N211.1 Lost ring in fish (Thompson 2000), it goes as follows:

The ruler of Samos was blessed by such exceedingly good luck, that his friend, the Egyptian king, worried about him and urged him to sacrifice some valuable thing in order to avert the envy of the gods. Polycrates threw a precious ring in the sea. The next morning, the cook brought back the jewel to him. It had been found in the stomach of a fish caught that morning. Fate and coincidence could not be averted. (Loomis 1941, 44)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Abbaye d'Orval, *Orval Abbey*. 2015. Pamphlet acquired at Orval Abbey during fieldwork in August 2019.

Similar motifs in the Thompson Motif Index include B470 of the Helpful Fish and B548.2.1 Fish recovers ring from sea. Of course, these motifs may only apply to versions published after Sibelaner's 1899 narrative if the author introduced the detail of the fish returning the ring. The earlier mention of the trout in Henriquez's 1632 version (Tillière 1967, 5-7), however, raises the possibility that this popular folk motif could have been a part of earlier oral versions or at least helps explain its possible inclusion by Sibelaner. The question remains: who is Matilda?

## Matilda of Tuscany

Originally Matilda<sup>37</sup> of Canossa (c.1046-1115), or Matilda of Tuscany, was an Italian noblewoman and considered one of the most powerful people in medieval European history. She was the great-granddaughter of Azzo of Canossa who gained title of count and marquis over Modena, Reggio, and parts of southern Lombardy after pleasing Emperor Otto the Great (Byrne 2004). Boniface, Matilda's father, "received control over Tuscany and the titles of duke and marquis of Tuscany, first recorded in 1031" (ibid.). Matilda's mother, Beatrice, was daughter of the imperial duke of Lorraine known for developing a significant court in Canossa recognized for "its splendor and learning" (ibid.). Matilda was highly educated and also had martial training, both of which were rare for women of the time.

Boniface died while hunting in 1052, possibly murdered through the doings of the Holy Roman Emperor Henry III. In 1053, Matilda's brother, Frederick, and sister, Beatrice, died, rendering Matilda the sole heiress (Spike 2004, 38). In 1054, Beatrice, Matilda's mother, became the wife of her first cousin, Godfrey of Lorraine,<sup>38</sup> in a marriage arranged by Pope Leo IX. At the same time, eight-year-old Matilda was engaged to Godfrey's son, nicknamed Godfrey the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> To avoid confusion, I will refer to this figure as Matilda in my own text and translations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Also known as Godfrey III, or Godfrey the Bearded.

Hunchback, in an attempt to protect the family's political position and wealth (Spike 2004, 38-39). In 1069, Matilda and Godfrey the Hunchback married to secure the connection between the Houses of Lorraine and Canossa. Later that year, on Christmas Eve, Godfrey of Lorraine died. Michèle K. Spike, biographer of Matilda, writes in *Tuscan Countess: The Life and Extraordinary Times of Matilda of Canossa*, "the marriage was unhappy and the spouses were in disaccord" (ibid., 270), and sadly in 1071, Matilda is reported to have lost their child, either during pregnancy or shortly after giving birth (ibid., 62). Having spent a total of two years in Lorraine, Matilda left her husband and moved to Italy to join her mother. Though Godfrey the Hunchback continued to attempt to persuade her to return to Lorraine, he was unsuccessful.

To complicate matters further, Matilda became involved in the Investiture Controversy between Pope Gregory VII and the Holy Roman Emperor Henry IV. Spike writes that before being elevated to Pope, former monk at the monastery of Cluny and archdeacon Hildebrand, supported the movement of his fellow monks:

These monks [of Cluny] sought to reform the Church by ending the custom by which the German kings named and invested bishops (called lay investiture). The custom incorporated the bishops into the government of the German state, depriving the Church of its administrators and its property and transforming clerical offices into positions of secular wealth and power. The reforms sought by the monks were opposed by German and Lombard bishops who had paid good money for their position and/or who were married. (2015, 53)

Pope Gregory VII's elevation to pope in 1073 was opposed to by Henry IV and led to a collapse in the relationship between the German state and the Roman church (ibid., 57). Matilda's husband, Godfrey the Hunchback, however, was a loyal knight to the king (ibid., 55). The relationship between Pope Gregory VII and Matilda was strong, as she supported his reforms and he supported her rights to her father's lands (ibid., 57). Though "intellectual attraction and common political goals" (ibid., 58) between the two may explain their relationship and regular visitations, there was suspicion that the two were lovers and rumours surrounded the duo. Though their level of intimacy is largely speculative and inconclusive, in 1076 Henry IV did attempt to prosecute the Pope with accusations of "ascending to papacy in violation of the Papal Election Decree; usurping from the body of the Bishops of the Church 'all the divine power conferred upon them through the grace of the Holy Spirit' and cohabitation with a woman who was another man's wife" (ibid., 60). Godfrey supported this humiliating accusation (Spike 2004, 98). In response, Pope Gregory VII excommunicated the king. Soon after, Godfrey was murdered on the road from Worms to Verdun. His nephew, Godfrey of Bouillon, was his heir, however, Matilda governed the Canossa territories after his death (Spike 2015, 60-61).

Before her death in April 1076, Beatrice was able to establish the Justinian's *Digest* of Roman Law, which "allows a daughter to inherit, own and manage property at her father's death, as an alternative law to the feudal laws of the German kings, Henry II and IV" (ibid., 61). In 1077, Gregory and Matilda took refuge in Canossa. The excommunication of the king had dire consequences on his reign and he was threatened with deposition if he did not reconcile his relationship with the Roman church. So, on January 22, 1077, King Henry IV arrived at Canossa, where he begged barefoot in the snow for three days outside the castle walls for pardon. Matilda convinced Gregory to forgive the sins of the King, though as soon as he was pardoned, the king immediately realigned oppositions to the church reform, and even went so far as to plan a capture and imprisonment of Matilda and Gregory.

Following Pope Gregory VII's death in 1085, Matilda continued to carry out his program, known as the Gregorian reform. The following years consisted of a scandalous and failed marriage to Duke Guelf V, who was seventeen and she forty-three at the time of their marriage; battles against the German empire over land ownership and sovereignty; and construction to

130

churches and infrastructure within her reigning lands. In 1106, Henry IV was deposed by the German dukes and died in exile, and his son, Henry V, took over the crown. He continued the mission of his father in attempting to "return the Italian territories to feudal dominion" (Spike 2015, 101). In 1111, he approved Matilda and offered her the sovereign title of vice-queen of Liguria, the first of its kind. This move finally legitimated her feudal status, and "her right to be a lord, based on her father's legacy, in spite of the cultural allergy to her gender" (Spike 2004, 233). At the age of sixty-four and suffering from severe gout, Matilda's closest heir was Henry V and therefore her sole inheritor. However, he agreed that the "Canossan properties would be excluded from the lands that he would claim at Matilda's death" (2015, 101), which took place in 1115.

#### Legends and Historical Figures in Place-Making

Michèle K. Spike, Matilda's biographer, visited Orval Abbey while lecturing in Belgium, because it is reputed to be the "monastery founded by Matilda" (2004, 57). She hoped to find proof that Matilda donated money in memory of her deceased child to establish the monastery, but was disappointed to find no trace of any connection to Matilda. Orval Abbey was founded in 1070, and Matilda had lived for about two years in nearby Lorraine until December 1071 when she moved to Mantua, Italy to join her mother. However, considering the complicated relationship with her husband at the time, there are many unanswered questions. Spike's research demonstrates three main holes in the Matilda foundation legend as it is told currently by Orval Abbey. First is that Matilda's husband would have still been alive when she was living in Lorraine during the only reasonable time period when she would have been conveniently nearby. Second, there are no financial records or other documents associating Matilda with Orval Abbey.
Third, and most significantly, the legend about Matilda seems to contradict the difficult and unloving relationship she had with her first husband, Godfrey the Hunchback. As Spike writes, "Knowing how little she cared for her husband, it is more likely she threw away the ring, and never despaired its loss" (2004, 61). Other than the obvious magical elements that would have had to result in Matilda miraculously discovering her ring after prayer, either floating on the fountain's water or from the mouth of a fish, there are other inconsistencies throughout versions of the legend that challenge its veracity. For example, Grégoire and Grégoire write that in the earliest account by Wassebourg, Matilda's recovery of her ring was said to take place in 1053. This would have been when Matilda was seven years old and neither married nor widowed (1967, 88).

There is a great deal of conflicting information in regards to Matilda even visiting Orval, but whether fact or fiction, the Legend of Orval continues to be told by many as truth. An association of the Tuscan Countess with Orval has existed for almost five hundred years; it continues to benefit Orval Abbey given that Matilda was such a significant figure in medieval European history. Spike writes:

She transformed Italy north of Rome. Her protest against an unfair and violent feudal system inspired people in her father's lands to demand a better life for themselves – at her death, the history of the free Italian communes begins. The sense of personal responsibility she instilled in those over whom she ruled contributed to the creative fervor that erupted during the space in her lifetime. Matilda readjusted the compass. She made God the center, freedom the choice, and community the objective. (2004, 265)

The legend of Matilda adds a layer of distinction and intrigue to the Abbey's foundation as well as to the beer itself. That the label of Orval beer carries a trout with a ring in its mouth (fig. 4.4) is a direct reference to Matilda's legend. It is not uncommon for microbreweries to look to the past for their marketing symbols (Leblanc 2015, 2018; Schnell and Reese 2003), and Orval adopts this practice by using Matilda and her legend to create a sense of history and of place.

### Legends and Beer Branding

Stalpaert writes, "Le but visé par l'auteur iconnu de la légende est d'attacher la foundation et la denomination du monastère à un personage historique de qualité, place dans le temps reculés" [The goal of the author of the legend is to attach the foundation and denomination of the monastery with a significant historical figure, in a time long ago] (1957, 137). The legends about Matilda add distinction to the founding of the Abbey; they indicate that its establishment was out of the hands of the people. It was a miracle that resulted in the place being named and the Abbey built there. Anne-Marie Hede and Torgeir Watne's article "Leveraging the Human Side of the Brand using a Sense of Place: Case Studies of Craft Breweries," shows how craft breweries often use heroes, myths, and folklore to create a sense of place in their brand and beer names; this is purposeful and strategic brand humanisation (2013). Matilda, though not technically a "man-of-action" hero due to her gender, fights against, and eventually changes, unfair laws based on sexist gender norms of the day. In the Legend of Orval, Matilda acts as a catalyst for change. She leaves the place forever altered; she bestows on it a new name and a monastery.

Hede and Watne single out Trappist breweries for their unique method of humanising their brands:

...brands may also be humanised through long-running religious traditions specific to a particular region. In Belgium and the Netherlands, seven<sup>39</sup> breweries are authorised to produce and label their beers with the 'Authentic Trappist Product' logo. The SoP [Sense of Place] for the Trappist breweries is derived from both the monasteries where, according to Trappist policies, the beers must be brewed, and from the sense of order that the Trappist ethos espouses. The strict rules relating to the production and the operations of the breweries, and their religious settings, offer the Trappist breweries a unique mythical position in the world of beer. (2013, 217)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Now, in 2022, ten Abbeys produce Trappist beers worldwide.

The authors argue that this trend in humanising beer brands (ibid., 208-209) allows the consumer to participate in and engage with the narratives of a microbrewery. By creating this sense of place through heroes and folklore it "connects with the heritage of a locale and with consumers" (ibid., 220). In the context of placeless, large-scale beer producers, Orval relies on the Legend of Orval to ground its beer in a particular, and special, place in a way that actively engages the consumer. Considering Hede and Watne's argument, Orval beer is humanised by being a Trappist brewery and through its attachment to Matilda. As we will explore in the next chapter, the strict set of rules surrounding Orval beer's production and the religious environment also humanises the beer. As for the Legend of Orval and its attachment to Matilda, she might be appealing to consumers due to her significance in Medieval history, but also because in many ways she was a rebel that countered gendered norms and fought for what she was owed, namely her title and inheriting the land of her parents. As a figure for a beer brand, she is unique, especially given that beer is a male-dominated industry and brands oftentimes use "man-ofaction" figures as described by Hede and Watne (2013). When female figures are used in beer branding and advertisements, they are often portrayed as sexual objects or obstacles to men (Khuehn and Parker 2021, 522). Both Trappist and Matilda are relatively subtle strategies to humanise the brand, however, because consumers can only discover the deeper meanings of Trappist, the fish symbolism on the bottle, or the name "Orval," by reading further.

Julie Anne-Marie Leblanc's PhD dissertation, "Marketing Traditional and Contemporary Folklore: How Microbreweries and Community Events Process Local Legends and Folklore in Québec," describes the use of folklore by beer companies, specifically Unibroue in Québec, Canada. She writes, "[a] brewing company using folkloric elements in their labels, intends not simply to attract a variety of beer drinkers but also to choose a subject matter dear to the

population, the folk legends, and to exploit it in a way that will ensure the product's survival" (2015, 47). Unibroue, based out of Chambly, Québec, draws on Québécois folktales for their brand names and imagery, such as references to the devil, "a popular antagonist...in the Québécois legendary tradition" (ibid., 134). Based on an interview with the Public Relations officer, Leblanc confirms that "the choice of labels and the association of legends were explicitly used as a marketing tool" (ibid., 30), and that "Unibroue did not deliberately pick a legend to then create a beer; the beer recipe came first and the name and label, second" (ibid., 31). The legends existed long before the beer, however Unibroue actively chose to use local folklore and history to sell beer. LeBlanc writes in a later article that Unibroue's success is associated with the strategic marketing towards an ethnic market or ethnic niches, particularly the Québécois culture in this case: "submarkets of people with a perceived cultural difference from the received standard culture, the marker must look at how cultures may be exploited in a way that would profit the business while creating loyalty with this target market" (2018, 66). This niche appeal means only members of an exclusive group understand the meanings of the titles and imagery in the beer branding. Additionally, this marketing "choose a subject matter dear to the population such as folk legends" (ibid., 68). Orval beer's marketing is also directed towards a similar niche appeal. An understanding of its branding, namely the meaning of the fish with a ring in its mouth and the Authentic Trappist Product symbol on its label, is confined to select groups. These include locals and those familiar with local lore and history but also beer afficionados who desire a deeper meaning to their beers (ibid., 67). More generally, however, Orval's choice of a label depicting a trout carrying a ring on label is a direct reference to the Legend of Orval that is intrinsically attached to the place, its history and its name.

#### Foundation of Orval Abbey

Abbot Nicholas Tillière's *Histoire de l'Abbaye d'Orval* is the most commonly cited and well-respected history of Orval Abbey. In 1880 the author moved to Villers-devant-Orval, the town neighbouring the Abbey, to work in their parish and live near the ruins. He spent twelve years visiting the ruins and exploring ancient texts. The book was originally published in 1897 and has been reprinted numerous times since.

Abbaye Notre-Dame d'Orval, here referenced as Orval Abbey, had a triple foundation (Grégoire and Grégoire 1967, 83), first by the Benedictines from Calabre between 1070 and 1108, followed by the Canons regular between 1110 and 1130, and finally by the Cistercians in from 1132 onwards, with a few interruptions (Tillière 1967, 3-12). Though there are rumours of religious groups having settled here earlier (ibid., 3; Grégoire 2011, 15-17), the Benedictine monks were attracted to the area around 1070 by the serene environment and clear water source. Their request to settle was approved by Arnold I, the Count of Chiny (Tillière 1967, 4). Tillière notes that prior to the arrival of the Benedictines, the area was already known as Orval. He traces the name to the expression, "Val d'Or." It was a common tradition to name places based on impression topographique ("topographic impression"), for example Bonnevoie ("Goodview") or Clairefontaine ("Clearfountain") (ibid., 5). That said, Tillière also mentions the Legend of Orval even though it is unproven that the legend predates the naming of the place. Though the Benedictine monks started construction of monastic buildings upon their arrival (Orval: Vie monastique 1995, 4), they hurriedly departed back for Italy, abandoning the area in 1108 (Tillière 1967, 7).

In 1110, a community of Canons Regulars were given the abandoned, partiallyconstructed buildings, and they quickly got to work. On September 30<sup>th</sup> 1124, the church was

consecrated in honour of the Virgin Mary by Henry of Winton, bishop of Verdun, in the presence of the Otton II, the Count of Chiny, and his family. In similar generous fashion to his father Arnold I, the Count gifted eleven thousand acres of land and rights to farms. Sadly, this prosperity came to a quick close, and with dying and failing leadership, the community experienced poverty and eventually abandoned the site in 1130 (Grégoire 2011, 25; Tillière 1967, 8-10).

The new Count of Chiny, grandson of the original founder of the Abbey, Arnold I, Albert was disappointed by the second abandonment of the Abbey. In late March 1131, Albert's uncle, Albéron, was in Liège to be consecrated as bishop of Verdun by Pope Innocent II. There he met Bernard de Clairvaux, later known as St. Bernard, who was one of the most influential early members of the Order of Cistercians, a relatively new religious order. Bernard accepted the property of Orval and Guy, Abbot of Trois-Fontaines, was sent over with eight members of their community, including the first abbot of Orval Abbey, Constantin (Tillière 1967, 10-11). The group arrived on March 9<sup>th</sup>, 1131.

#### **Order of Cistercians**

The Cistercian Order began as a reform of the Benedictine tradition, founded by the 6<sup>th</sup> century monk, Benedict of Nursia, later known as Saint Benedict. Benedict was born into Roman nobility and in his early adulthood moved to Rome to study (Grégoire 2011, 27). Soon after he left the city and began living the life of a hermit in Subiaco, Italy where he slowly garnered followers (Zincone 2014, 1:352). After founding twelve monasteries in the Aniene Valley, Italy, he then settled in Monte Cassino between 525 and 530, where he established his monastery and

wrote *Rule*, later referred to as *The Rule of Saint Benedict* (ibid.; Grégoire 2011, 27). Zincone comments:

Benedict's fundamental work is the *rule*, whose prologue and 73 chapters sum up the spiritual journey of return to God through obedience (ch. 5), under the guidance of Christ, to whose love nothing must be preferred (chs. 4 and 72). There is a notable emphasis on humility, which gives complete freedom to conform to one's will to God's. The cenobitic community devised by St. Benedict is founded on the authority of the abbot, with the monks under him, bound to their monastery by a vow of stability. Essential parts of Benedictine spirituality are the celebration of the divine office, and a balanced synthesis of prayer and work, esp. manual labor, but also intellectual work, centered on the reading of sacred texts (ch. 48). (2014, 1:352)

The number of followers of the Order of Saint Benedict, known as Benedictines, continued to expand in the decades that followed. Criticism of the Benedictines followed its popularization and expansion, however. They advocated a life of simplicity and poverty whilst living surrounded by wealth within their monastic walls and had abandoned observance of the Rule. In 1098, Robert of Molesme and a group of 20 monks left Molesme monastery for a remote location in the diocese of Chalon, near Dijon (Burton 2011, 10; Grégoire 2011, 31). It would be known as the New Monastery (*Novum Monasterium*), later Cîteaux, and their first abbot was Robert. Janet Burton and Julie Kerr write in *The Cistercians in the Middle Ages* "observation of Rule according to their profession was a concern, but the main reason for departure was to seek poverty, and it was thus that, armed by authority of church officials and with the backing of the duke of Burgundy, they sought 'a desert place', 'a place of horror and of vast solitude'" (2011, 12). It was believed that only then, in a desolate place, could they truly follow the pure interpretation of *The Rule of St. Benedict* (jbid., 83).

In 1100, Alberic (or Aubrey), a hermit from the nearby forest of Colan, succeeded as abbot of Cîteaux due to Robert having to return to Molesme on order of Pope Urban II and Molesme monks (Order of Cistercians of the Strict Observance. n.d.a.). According to *The* 

*Exordium Cistercii*, a 12<sup>th</sup> century document describing the foundation of Cîteaux, "For the sake of a truce and peace between the two churches, this was stipulated, and confirmed by apostolic authority: that from then and on neither of them would receive a monk of the other into community without commendatory letter provided for by the Rule" (Order of Cistercians of the Strict Observance. n.d.a.). Though Robert began as a spiritual leader, it was Alberic who brought legitimacy to the monastery. Then, in 1109, the position was taken over by the third abbot, Stephen Harding, an Englishman. E. Rozanne Elder writes that though his literary legacy is slight amongst the early Cistercians, it was "Stephen who established the constitution, the *Carta Caritatis* and formed the character of what became the Cistercian Order" (2013, 199). Even so, the order struggled to gain a following, until 1112, when the charismatic Bernard de Fontaine, later known as Saint Bernard, arrived with about 30 supporters (Grégoire 2011, 31; Tillière 1967 21-22; Pranger 2013, 186). By 1119, Cîteaux had already founded twelve daughter houses, and in 1132, Orval officially became the 53<sup>rd</sup> Cistercien Abbey (Grégoire 2011, 35; Tillière 1967, 11-12).

#### **Prosperity and Destruction, and Back Again**





What started as a seemingly prosperous and well-funded venture in the 12<sup>th</sup> and beginning of the 13<sup>th</sup> century (fig. 4.5), experienced serious trials and tribulations. A devastating fire in 1252 destroyed the monks' hard work, and the monastery was never fully rebuilt afterwards as it struggled with community engagement and support (Tillière 1967, 80-82; Grégoire 2011, 42-46). At the Cistercian general chapter meeting in Cîteaux in September 1313, the 25<sup>th</sup> abbot of Orval Jean de Huy was faced with serious questions about the stability of the apparent "dying" Orval (Tillière 1967, 119). Even with the help of mother Abbeys, and the sale of lands and resources, they weren't able to recover for a long time. Tillière writes: Trois siècles ont passé depuis l'incendie de 1251. La reconstruction du monastère, la crise financière qui la suivit, le développement des maisons de refuge, le privilège des insignes pontificaux, les États provinciaux, l'extension de la propriété foncière, l'érection des forges, le passage périodique des armées, tels sont les principaux fait extérieurs qui ont troublé l'abbaye durant cette époque.

[Three centuries have passed since the fire of 1251. The reconstruction of the monastery, the financial crisis that followed, the development of houses of refuge, the privilege of papal insignia, the provincial states, the extension of land ownership, the erection of forges, the periodic passage of armies, were the main external factors which troubled the Abbey during this period.] (1967, 160)

Thankfully, in 1529, the Emperor Charles-Quint allowed a forge to be built on the Abbey's land, easing financial woes. In 1605, Bernard de Montgaillard, a previous member of the Congregation of Feuillants and affiliated with the Cistercians in the Netherlands since 1593, was appointed Abbot of Orval by Albert VII, Archduke of Austria (ibid., 172-178). Though initially his entry was opposed to by the community, his efficient financial management and charisma brought the Abbey back to its feet and onto solid ground. The success rendered him loved by the community and one of the most revered Abbots of Orval to this day (ibid., 178-187). In fact, he is represented on the cover of Tillière's book. Orval's website notes that Bernard's efforts greatly increased membership to the Abbey; in 1619 it was "composed of 43 members: 27 professed monks, 8 lay brothers and 8 novices," whereas in 1602 there was only 20 professed monks and 2 novices (Tillière 1967, 184).

Shortly after Bernard's death in 1628, Orval and much of the surrounding area found itself a victim of the Thirty Years War. In late July 1637, troops of the Maréchal de Châtillon made their way to the Abbey. Initially the Abbey was hospitable to the troops and they left appreciative. However, on August 2<sup>nd</sup> of the same year, what began as a regular visit met with generosity, soon turned into pillaging, vandalising, and setting the Abbey afire, bringing it into a state of disrepair (ibid., 203-205). Most of the monks had to reside at Montmédy due to their

inhabitable Abbey until adequate repairs were made. In 1668, Charles de Bentzeradt became the 46<sup>th</sup> abbot of Orval, and just like Montgaillard before him attempted to bring reform to monastic life, Bentzeradt became interested in the work of Armand-Jean le Bouthillier de Rancé, Abbot of La Trappe Abbey, and founder of the Cistercian Order of Strict Observance, known as the Trappists. In 1672, he sent a member of Orval to study at La Trappe, and in 1674, declared his own dedication to Strict Observance, such as "l'abstinence, le silence, les veilles, les travaux de champs, la couche du'e, l'usage de mourir comme a La Trappe sur le cendre et la paille" [abstinence, silence, vigils, labourous work in the fields, rigid mattresses, dying like at La Trappe, on ashes and straw] (Tillière 1967, 221). This was slowly enforced, despite some resistance, throughout the Abbey as a whole.

In 1681, Louis XIV violently annexed the Luxembourg province, which had been abandoned and depopulated by the wars (ibid., 230). In 1686, in order to incentivise a repopulation of the area, Louis XIV decided to grant access to the land to outsiders without having paying fairs to the bourgeoisie (ibid., 231). This plan worked, and Orval Abbey owning a fair amount of property, prospered during this period (fig. 4.6). After Bentzeradt's death in 1707, Orval continued to prosper thanks to its agricultural and industrial enterprises, especially its well known forges. Funds were used in building a new monastery starting in 1760 by the famous architect Laurent-Benoit Dewez, but slowed down after the consecration of the church in 1782, and then again with the French Revolution. Tillière asks, "Cette prospérité inouie d'Orval futelle avantageuse ou funeste à l'abbaye?" [Was this incredible prosperity of Orval advantageous or disastrous for the Abbey?] (1967, 256). In light of its prosperity during the 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> century, Orval became a target during the French Revolution. Its lands were seized and under alert but it wasn't until June 23<sup>rd</sup> 1793 that troops led by the General Loison ransacked and set aflame the Abbey (fig. 4.7), displacing its members. On November 7<sup>th</sup>, 1795 the community was disbanded and the Abbey abandoned, left to ruin.



Figure 4.6. Comic book drawing of Orval Abbey under construction during the 18<sup>th</sup> century, prior to the destruction during the French Revolution. *Source:* Servais 2012, 36.



Figure 4.7. Comic book drawing of troops destroying Orval Abbey on June 23<sup>rd</sup>, 1793. *Source:* Servais 2012, 60.

In the introduction of his second edition of his book published in 1906, Tillière writes with a melancholic disappointment of the abandonment of the Abbey, "Bientôt devaient s'envoler tous les rêves de résurrection et de vie!" [Soon all dreams of resurrection and life flew away!] (1967, 337). In the 7<sup>th</sup> edition I am citing here, Christian Grégoire writes in the introduction of how at the time of his death in 1916, Tillière thought the Abbey would always be in ruin. In the years following 1795, Orval, the land and the ruins, were passed onto many owners, until 1926 when the property came into the possession of the de Harenne family. By chance, at the time Jean-Marie Clerc, abbot of the La Trappe Abbey, accompanied by another monk of the Abbey, Marie-Albert van der Cruyssen, was travelling to Belgium in search of a place outside France's religiously strict measures to settle their community. As part of their trip, they visited Orval ruins, and there, "Mis en courant de ces circonstances, les propriétaires offrit spontanément à l'Ordre de Cîteaux le site du monastère et les terres nécessaires au rétablissement de la vie cistercienne en ces lieux" [Informed of these circumstances, the owners spontaneously offered the site of the monastery and the necessitated land to the Order of Cîteaux to re-establish Cistercian life in this place] (ibid., 338). Cruyssen led the reconstruction of the Abbey that was designed by the architect Henri Vaes. The monastery was reconstructed on top of the 18th century monastery foundations, however keeping the old monastery ruins of the 12<sup>th</sup>-13<sup>th</sup> century to explore and adding and making some other modern additions, such as the famed brewery (Tillière 1967, 340, 343-344; fig. 4.5). Construction began in 1926 and in 1936 Pope Pius XI granted Orval the status of Abbey. Also in 1936, Marie-Albert van der Cruyssen became the 53<sup>rd</sup> abbot of Orval Abbey (Grégoire 2011, 318). On September 8th, 1948, the construction was completed, marked by the consecration of the church to the rank of basilica and flooded with visitors.



Figure 4.8. "... a cathedral!" Comic book drawing of the reconstructed Orval Abbey in its full glory, sometime in the mid-twentieth century. *Source:* Servais 2012, 110.

# **Trappist Revival**

Though Bentzeradt introduced some of the reformed ideals of Armand-Jean le Bouthillier de Rancé at Orval Abbey in the 17<sup>th</sup> century, it wasn't until the de Harenne family encountered monks from the La Trappe Abbey in 1926 and donated the land to them that Orval officially became a member of the Cistercian Order of Strict Observance. As discussed earlier, the Order of Cistercian began in the eleventh-century as a monastic renewal focusing on the Rule of Saint Benedict, namely being guided by the three basic ideals of "poverty, eremitism and apostolic life" (Lekai 1977, 5). During the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> centuries similar concerns resurfaced, and growing number of monks expressed a need to return to the *Rule of Saint Benedict*.

Venerated Cistercian historian and member of the order, Louis J. Lekai, explains in his article "The Beginnings of the Cistercian Strict Observance," that the reforms of the Cistercian Order started after regular meetings of the chapters became nearly impossible to hold due to "continuous religious or civil wars both in France and abroad" (1955, 129). Up until this time, monasteries operated under the commendatory system; they "were controlled by commendatory abbots, usually high ranking members of the secular clergy appointed by the king" whose "interest [...] rarely went beyond the collection of abbatial revenues" (ibid., 130). Denis Largentier, Abbot of Clairvaux, popularized the adoption of "Strict Observance," as opposed to the "Common Observance," which, despite some dissension, quickly spread to other monasteries (Lekai 1953, 95-96). Under the Strict Observance monks saw themselves returning to the true ideals and following of the Rule, an embrace of the ideals of 12th century Cîteaux. De Rancé, Abbot at La Trappe Abbey, became a key figure in the acceptance of the Strict Observance and was known as the founder of the order. De Rancé's interpretation of Cistercian discipline consisted of viewing "monasticism [as] basically a form of penitential life" and "[t]he monks were never to be permitted to feel any satisfaction in their works or exercises" (1953, 106). De Rancé and his followers upheld a strict schedule and lifestyle, "returned to hard manual labor, restored perpetual silence, and banned not only meat from their table, but also fish, eggs and butter" (ibid., 106-107). However, even amongst the other followers of the "Strict Observance," de Rancé and La Trappe's interpretation was seen as extreme (ibid., 106). Instead, Cistercian communities found themselves involved with members of nearby secular communities, which opposed de Rancé's ideal of utmost isolation from society (ibid., 128). Indeed, this balance of withdrawal from and engagement with society is a common concern within Cistercian circles, as Janet Burton and Julie Kerr write in *The Cistercians of the Middle Ages*:

The Cistercians therefore had an obligation to the world but they were also dependent on it, for the ties that bound them were mutually beneficial. [...] Not least, through their links with society monasteries could draw in new recruits and thereby secure the continuance of Cistercian life. These ties were therefore instrumental to the development of the Order and the fulfillment of Cistercian ideals. But just as each abbot had to balance his role as head of an institution with his spiritual life as a monk, so communities - and the Order as a whole - had to control the nature and extent of external links lest these endangered rather than enhanced monastic observance. (2011, 200-201)

Because each Cistercian monastery was self-sufficient within the Order, monks had to be involved with their physical environments and local economies for the monastery to survive and, hopefully, prosper (ibid., 56; also see De Waal 1998, 81). Indeed, though the Cistercians purposefully sought areas that were wastelands, isolated and seemingly inhospitable – as mentioned earlier, Cîteaux's name derives from the Latin word *cisterna* meaning marsh or bog – they were renown for their ability to "convert inhospitable deserts into rich meadows" (Lekai 1977, 298). So, though de Rancé is considered the order's founder in 1666, its common nickname is "Trappist" after La Trappe Abbey. After attempts to absorb the Common Observance into the Strict Observance were unsuccessful, in 1902 the "Order of Cistercians of Strict Observance" was officially recognized as a separate and self-governing sect (Lekai 1953, 129).

### **Orval Today**

After the reconstruction of the Orval monastery began in 1926 under the new ownership of the Trappists, Grégoire wrote in Tillière's seventh edition of *Histoire de l'Abbaye d'Orval*, that the Abbey's buildings could be grouped into four types: welcoming buildings, museums, workshops and commons, and conventional areas (1967, 343-344). Figure 4.10 provides a detailed architectural layout of the buildings as they are today; Figure 4.11 is a photograph of the main areas; and Figure 4.12 shows a plan of the museum. It is worth noting, however, that the

entire Abbey is not accessible to visitors. Outsiders can visit the church and main courtyard during specific sermons, however visitors are restricted to the giftshop located at the entrance of the museum/ruins entrance – the latter for a fee. Guests of the hotel and chalet have access to the museums/ruins free of charge and can liberally visit the courtyard and specific rooms within the hotel and chalet. Hotel guests are also welcome to two hot meals with other guests, hosted by the monks of the Abbey. Chalet guests do not have access to these meals, however pay a lower fee than hotel guests and cook for themselves in a kitchenette. The management offices, brewery and cheese production facilities are off limits to outsiders, however laypeople who work for the Abbey populate these places during working hours. The monks' workshops and living areas are separate, situated behind and surrounding the basilica. These are restricted to only the monks and is the area where they mainly reside throughout their days. Hence, when visiting Orval Abbey, unless in a scheduled meeting with a monk, attending a hot meal as a hotel guest, or participating in a sermon at the basilica, you are unlikely to encounter or even see a monk.



Figure 4.9. General plan of the construction of Orval Abbey by the Architect Henry Vaes. (1) Ruins of the first Abbey. (2) Matilda's Fountain. (3) Notre-Dame of the Scouts Chapel. (4) Old pharmacy. (5) Old hotel pavillion (lapidary museum). (6) Hotel court. (7) Hotel for parents of the religiously devout. (8) "Cour d'honneur" (principal and formal forecourt). (9) Notre-Dame Basilica – the Abbey's church. (10) Royal chapel. (11) Courtyard. (12) Large scriptorium. (13) Chapter. (14) Refectory. (15) Library (on stage). (16) Abbey and bishop quarters. (17) Noviciate. (18) Novice's court. (19) Barn. (20) Commons, stables, cheese production facility, forge, etc. (21) Sheepfold. (22) Brewery. (23) Workshop. (24) Cemetery. *Source:* "Le Grand Oeuvre de l'Abbaye d'Orval," Special issue, *L'Artisan et Liturgiques* by Abbaye de Saint-André, back cover.



Figure 4.10. Orval Abbey today. (1) The Ruins. (2) The courtyard. (3) The workshops. (4) The cheese production facility. (5) The chalet. (6) The brewery. (7) The hotel. (8) The gatehouse. *Source:* Photograph and numbering by the Orval website, *Orval, Accès, https://www.orval.be/fr/page/450-pour-atteindre-orval.* 



Figure 4.11. View from the courtyard. Photograph by author.



Figure 4.12. Map printed on a pamphlet provided at Orval Abbey giftshop, numbering stops along the way to guide you through the museums and ruins. The "Communs Abraham" ["Abraham Commons" in English] is a brewery museum, providing details on how beer is made and the history of Orval beer.

Today, a large portion of the revenue for Orval Abbey comes from their products and tourism. This revenue is used for renovating and upkeeping the Abbey, paying their employees, and funding projects. A significant portion is donated to local people and causes in need. They have about twelve monks at the brewery (Kearney 2016) and employ about forty-five laypeople. Because Orval Abbey is a small space with limited public transportation, I was a little surprised to discover it is a bustling small community. Employees of the monastery were mostly aside from the visitor entrances, but they could occasionally be seen on the outskirts of the Abbey and their vehicles seen parked nearby. Especially during the summer months and on weekends, the parking lot filled with cars from mostly Belgium, France, and Luxembourg, as well as a few cyclists and ragged backpackers. The most popular attraction was the giftshop where tourists can purchase beer, cheese (fig. 4.14), honey sweets (fig. 4.15), black bee honey, and original painted icons by Brother Charbel, all produced at Orval. Additionally, the shop sells a wide variety of products outside of their own as well as souvenirs such as books, soap, jams, music CDs, religious paraphernalia, and much more (fig. 4.13). Most popular is Orval made beer and cheese.

In a pamphlet produced by Orval Abbey, it notes that cheese has been produced at Orval Abbey since 1928, "using the recipe created in 1816 by Trappist monks from Port du Salut Abbey"<sup>40</sup>. The cheese is made from pasteurised cow's milk from neighbouring farms in the Gaume region. It has a natural, orange-coloured rind, and is non-cooked and pressed. This results in a semi-firm cheese that has a deliciously creamy, easy-to-melt texture. The brewery at Orval Abbey was constructed in 1931 and the recipe was developed by a German master brewer, Martin Pappenheimer, with the help of brewers Honoré Van Zande and John Vanhuele. The unique dry-hopping method is said to have been introduced by Vanhuele who lived and worked

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Abbaye d'Orval, *Orval Abbey*. 2015.Pamphlet acquired at Orval Abbey during fieldwork in August 2019.

in England, which was known for this style of hopping. The recipe has changed significantly since the 1930s. In our conversation on February 28<sup>th</sup> 2019, Frère Xavier noted that until the 2000s, they would wait six months after bottling before selling the product to allow the wild yeast to express its complex flavours and mellowing the hoppy flavours. However, with changing taste, they now sell their beer youngers, just three weeks after bottling, which is why the bitterness of Orval beer became more apparent in the 2000s.<sup>41</sup>



Figure 4.13. Picture taken within Orval Abbey's giftshop, which includes locally made products such as beer, candy, and honey candies, as well as books and information on the Abbey, local history, Trappist belief and Christianity, and products made by other Abbeys. Here, we find soaps and perfumes produced at the Benedictine Abbey Notre-Dame de Ganagobie in France, and cleaning products and soaps produced TRAPP, made within the Trappistine Abbey Our Lady of Nazareth in Brecht, Belgium. Photograph by author.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> This change of taste is often presumed to be a change of recipe and ingredients between the 1980s and 2000s (such as in Hieronymus 2005, 57), however in an email correspondence with Frère Xavier through email on January 21<sup>st</sup>, 2023, he informed me that this is a false claim and that the significance taste changes occurred in an earlier distribution of their beer.





Figure 4.14. Showing off a kilogram block of Orval cheese within Orval Abbey's courtyard. Photograph by author.

Figure 4.15. Bag of Orval honey candies, while walking through the fields of Orval. Photograph by author.

Visitors also visit the Orval Abbey's ruins and museum (fig. 4.11), as well as the basilica during sermons. During particularly nice days, visitors who are staying in the hôtellerie and chalet sit out in the courtyard enjoying the silent tranquility and sunshine. Orval Abbey is definitely the main attraction in this rural area, however there are other activities within close proximity. The *Prés d'Orval* [Orval Prairies] nature reserve includes three walking trails on Orval Abbey's land and surrounding area: *Promenade de la réserve naturelle* [Walk through the fields of Orval], a 5.5 km walk where you can "Discover the life of bats, meet aheard of Highland cattles and find roots of a Cistercian valley; *Promenade des Bornes* [Abbey vicinity itinerary], a 6.5 km walk where you can "Explore the vicinity of the Abbey, encounter oaks over

a hundred years old, and walk to the rhythm of birdsong to the heart of the Bati woods"; and finally *Promenade de Chameleux* [Tour of Chameleux]. This is a 11.5km walk where you can "Venture along the Gallo-Roman paths between France and Belgium, guided by the murmurs of a brook, toward the old forges of Orval" (Delbeuck n.d.). Another option, especially for those who are hungry, is the À l'Ange Gardien, a restaurant situated just a few meters away from Orval Abbey. This restaurant is the only establishment that serves "Green" Orval on draught, also known as *Petite Orval* [Small Orval] at only 3.5% ABV. They also serve regular Orval beer, fresh and aged. Their menu features Orval cheese and *terroir* ingredients and dishes from the Gaume region (fig. 4.16). A little further down Orval Road is À la Nouvelle Hostellerie d'Orval, another restaurant featuring similar fare (fig. 4.17). A couple kilometres further away is the microbrewery Gengoulf in Villers-devant-Orval.



Figure 4.16. Enjoying a meal at À l'Ange Gardien, featuring a Green Orval. Photograph by author.



Figure 4.17. Enjoying a meal at À la Nouvelle Hostellerie d'Orval, meal featuring Orval cheese and a regular Orval beer. Photograph by author.

#### Conclusion

When ordering an "Orval" or buying an "Orval" at the store, one echoes the name of the Abbey in whose walls it is brewed, and in turn recalls its legend and history. Naming a beer after a place helps create a sense of place; it is a trend found in micro- and craft breweries. Wes Flack writes in "American Microbreweries and Neolocalism<sup>42</sup>: "Ale-ing" for a Sense of Place," that after a 100-year decline in the number of microbreweries in the United States due to large corporations absorbing, buying and placing them out of business, that suddenly in the 1980s a revival of microbreweries began. It started in California, as a result of consumers seeking a taste of the local (1997, 37-39). Flack writes, "[m]uch of the appeal of microbrewed beer is that it is a rejection of national, or even regional, culture in favor of something more local" (1997, 49). Placeless, multinational and multibillion dollar beverage companies are cold in comparison to these small, production breweries, that rely on neolocal techniques. (2013, 2011). Additionally, Hede and Watne underline how Trappist breweries turn to "long-running religious traditions specific to a particular region" (2013, 217) in order to humanize their brands and create a sense of place. This approach distinguishes Trappist breweries as particularly unique:

The SoP [Sense of Place] for the Trappist breweries is derived from both the monasteries where, according to Trappist policies, the beers must be brewed, and from the sense of order that the Trappist ethos espouses. The strict rules relating to the production and the operations of the breweries, and their religious settings, offer the Trappist breweries a unique mythical position in the world of beer. (2013, 217)

Orval beer fits into this pattern of signalling the local and claiming the distinct; it is named after Orval Abbey, a site first settled by Benedictine monks in 1070, Canons Regular in 1124, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Neolocalism is the "deliberate seeking out of regional lore and local attachment by residents (new and old) as a delated reaction to the destruction in modern America of traditional bonds to community and family" (Shortridge 1996, 10).

Cistercians in 1132. It has undergone tremendous turmoil and changes in over nearly a millennium.

Celebrating locality through brewery imagery and names appeals to beer consumers because it provides them a sense of place that larger corporations cannot (Schnell and Reese 2003, 2014; Eberts 2014). Ann M. Fletchall's article "Place-Making through Beer-Drinking: A Case of Montana's Craft Breweries" argues that "drinking a beer at a craft brewery<sup>43</sup> is a very effective form of place-making" (2016, 540). Fletchall, whose research is based on craft breweries in Montana, found that a vast majority of the breweries are named after their immediate physical environment, "playing upon Montana's much-loved and widely accepted identity as an outdoor paradise, many breweries use this inherent attractiveness to sell their beer" (ibid., 552).

Examining Orval's label (fig. 4.18), we see large, golden lettering of the capitalized word "ORVAL" over the image of a fish with a ring in its mouth. This is encased in a gold, diamond shaped frame, and surrounded by purple. It is framed by the words "Trappist ale" in five different languages. There is a small "Authentic Trappist Product" hexagon (fig. 4.19), the brewed and best before dates, ingredients list, brewery address and a small depiction of how to pour the beer into the proper Orval-branded chalice. The label is on the neck of the bellied beer bottle and is rather small. Orval relies on its name and its reputation to sell its beer. After learning about the etymological Legend of Orval, the fish suddenly makes sense. After learning about the long history of Orval, the name being front-and-center is logical as well. Finally,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> According to the Brewers Association of America (BA), a craft brewer is a small and independent brewer, whose "[a]nnual production is of 6 million barrels of beers or less" and "less than 25% of the craft brewery is owned or controlled... by a beverage alcohol industry member" (Brewers Association, n.d., "Craft Brewer Definition"); and a microbrewery, on the other hand, is a "brewery that produces less than 15,00 barrels of beer per year and sells 75 percent or more of its beer off-site" (Brewers Association, n.d., "Craft Brewer Market Segments"). Orval brewery produces 80,000 hectolitres of beer annually (van den Steen 2018, 83).

learning of Orval's religious history, particularly the influence of the Cistercians and Trappists, helps consumers understand the value of these iterations on the label. Similar to Fletchall's observation about Montana craft breweries' reliance on widely understood imagery for their name (2015, 541-547), Steven M. Schnell and Joseph F. Reese write that microbreweries "have purposefully catered to these cravings for connection through targeted marketing strategies that emphasize local identity and distinctiveness," (2003, 47). The name "Orval beer" signals a place that has been known as Orval for nearly a millennium and is already deeply entrenched in local lore, history, belief, and meaning. When sipping an Orval beer, the consumer gains a sense and taste of this place.

The next chapter extends the discussion of Orval beer's relationship to a place and its terroir through an examination of the "Authentic Trappist Product" label. Here I consider narratives that inform the term "Trappist" when it is generally associated with a product and specifically connected to Orval beer.



Figure 4.18. Orval beer, poured into the designated Orval beer glass. Photograph by author.



Figure 4.19. Authentic Trappist Product label. Picture from International Trappist Assocation, n.d., "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label," accessed February 16, 2022, <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/about-ita/atp-label/#</u>.

## **Chapter Five**

# Trappist Terroir: Savouring Trappist Life through Orval Beer

Depuis 1131, Orval est donc une *abbaye cistercienne*. Or une Communauté monastique n'est pas n'importe quel groupe humain. Bien qu'elle s'enracine profondément dans le terroir où elle est plantée, on ne peut la réduire à son activité économique et politique. Le genre de vie des moines est même le principal élément de leur histoire.

[Since 1131, Orval has been a Cistercian Abbey. A monastic community is not your average group of people. They are deeply rooted in the terroir in which they settled, they cannot be reduced to their economic activities or politics. The way the monks live is at the core of their history.]

- Nicolas Tillière, *Histoire de l'abbaye d'Orval* 

## **Authentic Trappist Product**

A key component of monastic life is the balance between *ora et labora*, prayer and work.

At the same time, as self-sustainable communities, monks participate in the modern market

economy to sustain themselves and others:

A small part of what the monks and nuns produce in their Abbeys is for their own use. Most of it is intended for sale. The Trappists and Trappistines use the proceeds to finance the needs of their religious communities. Anything extra is given to third parties. In this way, they support projects in developing countries as well as at home, or they offer help to those in need. (International Trappist Association, n.d., "About the Trappists")

In 1998, the International Trappist Association (ITA) was founded by eight European Trappist Abbeys containing breweries: LaTrappe (Netherlands), Achel (Belgium), Chimay (Belgium), Orval (Belgium), Rochefort (Belgium), Westmalle (Belgium), Westvleteren (Belgium), and Engelszell (Austria). Not all Trappist Abbeys are members of ATI, however joining the association gives Abbeys the exclusive right to the Trappist® trademark used "to inform consumers of the origin and authenticity of Trappist products with no ambiguity" (International Trappist Association, n.d. "About the Trappists"). The use of "Trappist" as a designation of origin had previously been established by the Belgian Trade and Commerce court in Ghent in 1962 (Van den Steen 2018, 7-8). As a non-profit organization, the association's main goal is to "[assist] the members of the ITA in the production of goods and in the pursuit of standards of excellence" (International Trappist Association, n.d., "About the Trappists"). Additionally, the association ensures collaboration and assistance between Abbeys:

- by protecting the Trappist® trademark and the common economic interests of Trappist communities;
- by providing reliable information about the Order of Cistercians of Strict Observance (OCSO);
- by fostering cooperation between Abbeys;
- by developing a network of solidarity and cooperation with other Trappist Abbeys. (ibid.)

The official website, trappist.be, lists twenty-one Trappist Abbeys as members of the ITA and list a wide array of Trappist® products including: beers, bread, brewers' yeast, care products, cheeses, chocolate, cleaning products, cookies, honey, jams and preserves, liqueurs, mushrooms, olive oil, religious garments, and wines (see Appendix A for a list of the members of the ITA, brief information on each member and the products they produce; see Appendix B for a chart of the Trappist® and ATP products members of the ITA produce). ITA members may also apply for the Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label for their products. For an Abbey to gain the ATP label for one of its Trappist® products, they must meet three distinct criteria:

- All products must be made within the immediate surroundings of the Abbey;
- Production must be carried out under the supervision of monks or nuns;
- Profits should be intended for the needs of the monastic community, for purposes of solidarity within the Trappist Order, or for development projects and charitable works. (International Trappist Association, n.d. "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label")

Of the Trappist® and ATP labelled products, beer is the most famous. Of the fourteen Abbeys producing beer, ten have the ATP label: Westvleteren, Westmalle, Chimay, La Trappe,

Rochefort, Orval, Stift Engelszell, Spencer, Zundert, Tre Fontane, and Tynt Meadow (see Appendix C for more information on all the Trappist breweries).

Trappist beers are well-known to the average beer enthusiast and an inexhaustible number of articles, blogs and books have written on the topic (for example, see: Barleypop 2010; Hieronymus 2005; Cook and Kins 2013; Kearney 2016; Miller 2007; Van Den Steen 2018). Additionally, non-beer-related writers have taken special interest, particularly noting the Trappists' business style that falls outside capitalist models. For example, John W. Miller's 2007 *Wall Street Journal* article "Trappist Command: Thou Shalt Not Buy Too Much of Our Beer," discusses St. Sixtus Abbey in Belgium which produces Westvleteren beer. Their beer is notoriously difficult to find and because it is known to be exceptional, resellers, restaurants, and bars often inflate the price. Miller writes that Brother Joris of Westvleteren takes it upon himself to find resellers online who are overcharging. Joris reports that when he asks them to desist, most oblige (Miller 2007). Entrepreneur August Turak writes in *Business Secrets of the Trappist Monks: One CEO's Quest for Meaning and Authenticity*:

Why have monastic businesses thrived for more than 1,500 years when modern corporate success is so fleeting? How do monasteries produce and sell "me, too" commodities like fruitcakes, beer, eggs, mushrooms, and cheese with the kind of pricing power usually associated with dominant brands? Why does demand for these prosaic products consistently outstrip supply? How do monks compete so successfully in the open market while maintaining only the highest ethical standards and commitment to quality? And, most importantly, how can we apply these Trappist techniques to our secular corporations, nonprofits, families, and even our personal lives with equally explosive results?

The short answer is that monks have discovered an amazing secret: it is our own self-interest to forget our self-interest. Paradoxically, the reason for Mepkin's business success is that the monks are not actually in business at all. Instead they are utterly committed to a high, overarching mission and a management philosophy this book will refer to as *service and selflessness*. Business success for the monks is merely the by-product of a life well lived. (2013, 4-5).

Miller writes that Chimay, brewed at Scourmont Abbey, has sales exceeding 50 million dollars a year (2007). Considering the high reputation of Trappist products and the considerable profits they generate, it should not come as a surprise that imitations have become a concern. This led to the creation of the ITA and the ATP label.

A confusion often exists between "Trappist" and "Abbey" beers. Though technically the Trappist trademark can be used for all 13 beers produced by members of the ITA, it is typically associated only with those with the ATP label. The term "Abbey" beer is more vague. Though the Union of Belgian Brewers (UBB) does have a "Certified Belgian Abbey Beer" label available for brewers associated with a Belgian Abbey and following certain regulations (Belgian Brewers n.d.b.), it is not regulated and as exclusive as true "Trappist" beers. Rather, as Jef van den Steen writes in Belgian Trappist and Abbey Beers: Truly Divine, "Every Trappist beer is an Abbey beer, but not every Abbey is a Trappist one" (2018, 7). Abbey beers refer to beers made in similar style to the Trappist, and most, unlike the Trappists, use blatant visual references to monastic life, such as images of monks and saints, medieval lettering, and lancet and/or tracery window shapes (fig. 5.1., fig. 5.2., fig. 5.3.). Isabelle Jonveaux writes, "Le silence dans les techniques de présentation des produits a aussi une significance capitale" [The silence in the technique in the products presentation is also capital significance] (2011, 123). True Trappist beers do not need to make allusions to their monastic tenure because they have nothing to prove: they are the real thing. As Roger Mittag summarizes, "the designation of Abbey is for those beers that are currently brewed in commercial breweries, monasteries other than Trappist or simply have monastic traditions" (2014, 71).

Additionally, though Trappist and Abbey beers are not a particular beer type, they do have some common attributes. As van den Steen notes, "they are all top-fermented beers that have undergone secondary fermentation in the bottle or in the tank" (2018, 8). Garrett Oliver more specifically writes in *The Oxford Companion to Beer*:

They are all top-fermented ales and often employ very warm fermentations, with temperatures ranging up to  $86^{\circ}F(30^{\circ}C)$ . Warm fermentations combine with Belgian yeast strains to produce a range of fruity and spicy flavors. Many of the beers are strong, with most ranging from 6% alcohol by volume (ABV) to 9.5% ABV, although there are outliers at either end of that range. Darker beers tend to attain color through the use of dark candi sugar as opposed to roasted malts, and other sugars are widely used. A few are spiced, but most are not. (Oliver 2011a, 3)

The Beer Judge Certification Program (BJCP) *Beer Style Guidelines*, widely considered the goto beer style reference in North America, marks 'Monastic Ale'<sup>44</sup> as its own definitive class of beer, listing Belgian Single, Belgian Dubbel, Belgian Tripel and Belgian Dark Strong Ale as subtypes (2021, 53-55). Largely speaking, Abbey beers refer to beers following these styles but that have some relationship to an Abbey, and "monastic" beers are the general style that we find. Trappist beers, however, are the elite eleven carrying the rare ATP label and, as Van den Steen writes, "should therefore be regarded as a PDO (Protected Designation of Origin)" (2018, 8). The purpose of the Trappist and ATP label is to protect the product from imitators but what exactly are they protecting?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Previous to the 2021 updated version of the BJCP Beer Style Guidelines, the most recent version from 2015 listed this category as "Trappist ales" with a warning pertaining to the legal usage of "Trappist" (Strong and England 2022)



Figure 5.1. Leffe is a UBB Certified Belgian Abbey Beer. The brewery is owned by Anheuser-Busch InBev, the largest multinational drink and brewing company in the world. *Source:* Picture from Saveur Bière, accessed August 17, 2022, <u>https://www.saveurbiere.com/en/bottledbeer/1304-leffe-blonde.html</u>.



Figure 5.2. St. Bernardus produce Belgian Abbey ales, without official certification. Though they had an agreement brewing beer in collaboration with St. Sixtus Abbey (Westvleteren), they are not brewed within the Abbey's walls and could no longer be considered a Trappist ale since the founding of ITA and the ATP label. *Source:* Picture from Beer Connoisseur, accessed August 17, 2022, https://beerconnoisseur.com/beer/brou werij-st-bernardus/st-bernardus-abt-12.



Figure 5.3. Benedictine Brewery is an American brewery, owned and operated by Benedictine monks of Mount Angel Abbey in Oregon. Though their beers aren't of the typical "Monastic Ale" style (by BJCP standards), their ownership and management by monks would render them an Abbey brewery. *Source:* Picture from Benedictine Brewery, accessed August 17, 2022, <u>https://www.benedictinebrewery.com</u> /beer.

#### **Orval Beer as Craft Beer**

There is a particular distinction to be made on behalf of Trappist breweries in a world of multi-national beverage conglomerates, and that is that they fit into the "craft brewery" category. The Brewers Association (BA) in the United States defines craft brewers as a small (producing

under 6 million barrels, or 7 million hectolitres, of beer annually) and independent (less than 25% owned or controlled by a non-craft brewer member) brewer (Brewers Association, n.d., "Craft Brewer Definition"). *The Oxford Companion* to Beer explains:

Craft brewing is the pursuit of small, independent commercial breweries, making beer by largely traditional means and with largely traditional ingredients, with the goal of making beer that is far more flavourful than the common brands made by large international breweries. (Oliver 2011b, 272)

This last definition places emphasis on the significance of flavour and tradition, which sets them apart from large beer producers. Orval beer fits well into this category.

The brewery was founded at Orval Abbey in 1931 by laypeople in order to generate income to fund the reconstruction of the Abbey that occurred between 1929 and 1936 (Jackson 2008, 282; Van Den Steen 2018, 79). Initially, 150 public shares were purchased to support the reconstruction, however these were slowly transferred to the monks and Abbey who gained their final shares in 1987 (Van Den Steen 2018, 79). It is important to highlight that the brewery was not intended as a form of work for the monks and was always worked by laypeople, though supervised by the Managing Director of the Abbey, which is currently Frère Xavier. After a few experimental brews, the first Orval beer sold was on May 7, 1932 (ibid.). Stan Hieronymus's *Brew like a Monk: Trappist, Abbey, and Strong Belgian Ales and How to Brew Them* and Michael Jackson's *Great Beers of Belgium* both provide rich detail and recipes on how the Orval beer is produced, and during my visit in August 2019, I was provided a tour of the brewery by Frère Xavier.

Even amongst Trappist beers, Orval is one of the most unique and stands out due to the use of Brettanomyces yeast and dry-hopping. These elements create the distinct *goût d'Orval* (the taste of Orval). The brew<sup>45</sup> is made with water from the Abbey's own well, found in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Details on the brewing process and key terms is discussed in Chapter One, "How to Brew".

Legend of Orval featuring Matilda of Tuscany, which is high in calcium carbonate. Jackson writes that "This no doubt heightens the firmness and bitterness of the beer" (2008, 284). The initial mash uses pale and caramel malts and the boil features Styrian Goldings and Hallertau hops in form of hop extract and pellets. Some liquid candi sugar is added to create additional fermentable sugars and this bitter wort is set to ferment for a few days (ibid., 2008, 284-285; Hieronymus 2005, 57-59). Then, secondary fermentation takes place over three weeks, after the addition of large bags of Styrian Golding hop flowers and a new yeast medley, which includes semi-wild Brettanomyces that adds a "phenolic, estery character [...] often described in literature as "horse blankets"" (Villa 2011, 631). In the final stage, known as the third fermentation or as bottle conditioning, the beer is centrifuged to rid of older yeast. Then sugar is added to the beer, and the whole bottled (Hieronymus 2005, 60). This refermentation in bottles lasts five weeks before being distributed. Orval beer, as with most Trappist beer, is higher in ABV than the usual mass market beers, at 6.2%, and also ages well. Its Brettanomyces characteristics develop over time and its hoppy characters mellow out (Jackson 2008, 285).

According to Van Den Steen, Orval brewery increased their production from 34,000 hectolitres a year to 80,000 hectolitres in 2007, however "there has been a shortage since 2010, with demand outpacing supply" (Van Den Steen 83). When I visited last in 2019, Frère Xavier informed me that there were plans to expand the brewery sometime in the future. Additionally, it is worth noting that Orval brewery does also produce a more elusive, second beer known as Petit Orval or Orval Vert (Small Orval or Orval Green, respectively). At only 3.4% ABV, it is produced for consumption by monks and sold exclusively on draft at the restaurant just a few meters from Orval Abbey, À l'Ange Gardien (fig. 5.4, fig. 5.5). Petit Orval is a diluted version of the original and is only brewed about three times a year (Hieronymus 2005, 55).
Orval brewery fits well into BA's and *The Oxford Companion to Beer*'s definitions of craft brewing. It produces well-under 7 million hectolitres, is independent, has distinct flavours from the brewing process, and has a unique setting within history and place.



Figure 5.4. Petit Orval or Orval Vert has an ABV of 3.4% and served exclusively on draft for public consumption at À l'Ange Gardien, just steps away from Orval Abbey. It is lighter and easier to drink than the standard Orval, and has a nice, fresh, zippy hoppiness. Notice that though the glass is the same as the standard Orval glass but that the lettering is green to differentiate. Beer glassware in Belgium is taken seriously. Photograph by author.



Figure 5.5. Orval beer has an ABV of 6.2% and is served exclusively in bottle. Due to its higher alcohol percentage, Brettanomyces yeast and hoppiness, it ages well and changes over time, though the bottle recommends consumption within five years. As opposed to the Petit Orval, it is fruitier, maltier and has a lot more depth. Photograph by author.

# **Trappist Economy**

When I first visited the Abbey, I lacked an understanding of monastic life and

community. It was only through conversation with Frère Xavier and reading works by

Cistercians such as Louis Lekai and André Louf, the Order of Cistercian's of Strict Observance's

charters and regulations, and the history of OCSO and Orval Abbey, that I began to understand

the balance between prayer and work.

My second trip to Orval Abbey took place during the second half of August 2019 and I was astounded by the number of vehicles in the parking lot. They came from all over Europe, though mostly from the surrounding countries of France and Luxembourg. On clear, blue-skyed days, the courtyard was filled with people sitting about, reading and soaking in the silence and sun. Outside the monastery, people carted away bright orange cases of Orval beer from the gift shop, there was a joyous hubbub from the À L'Ange Guardien just down the street, and curious tourists wandered within the monastery's ruins and museums. Within the monastic walls, however, the feeling was different. This space was restricted to those staying at the Abbey or attending service. Here was silence and stillness. As mentioned in the last chapter, the monks who reside at Orval Abbey, are completely separated from the hôtellerie and visitors, though one might pass through on occasion, commuting during their busy schedule.

This dichotomy between the monastic community's public and private life seemed constrained to me as an outsider. Additionally, still holding on to an American-centric view of the oddity of a monastery producing alcohol for public consumption, I was confused as to how the monks maintained a balance between their religious life and the production of goods. Do these tourists not get in the way? Doesn't this involvement with the outside world interrupt monastic life?

In Louis Lekai's *The Cistercians: Ideals and Reality*, he writes that at the core of Cistercians' observance of *The Rule of Saint Benedict*, was rendering oneself entirely self-sufficient (1997, 310). However, Lekai writes, "no Abbey was able to achieve absolute economic independence, therefore even the earliest legislation of the Order made allowance for the selling of surplus products and the buying of needed articles that the monks could not otherwise procure" (ibid., 311). Additionally, and again as mentioned in the last chapter, the Cistercians

moved to isolated, unfavourable lands, such as deserts, marshes and heavily wooden areas, and were praised at their ability to adapt to the landscape, build their Abbeys, and produce goods (ibid., 298). Amongst these items, alcoholic beverages were produced based on the local climates and cultures. In Burgundy grapes produced wines, while in colder climates in Europe, such as in the United Kingdom, Scandinavia and Belgium, beer was favoured. Additionally, they were also known to produce liqueurs, meads, ciders and more (ibid., 316-318; Mittag 2014, 71; also see Jackson 2008, 131-132). These products would have been produced for the consumption of the monks, pilgrims and visitors (Mittag 2014, 71) but Lekai notes that popular demand led the monks to move from selling their surplus to selling their products wholesale. He writes:

A major incentive behind the gradual commercialization of the Cistercian economy was undoubtedly the extensive tax-exemption of the Order, enhanced by privileges for the long-distance shipping of goods without the payment of ubiquitous tolls. Such fiscal immunities made possible the combination of low prices and high quality, making monks formidable competitors with less privileged producers and sellers of similar commodities. (1977, 311)

The production of goods is a significant component of Cistercian and Trappist Abbeys because participation within the local economy is a necessity to flourish and prosper as a community.

Trappist life seems to be filled with dichotomies between withdrawal and engagement with society and retaining silence and prayer while also welcoming outsiders into their Abbeys and helping those in need. When speaking with Frère Xavier, Trappist monk at Orval Abbey and Managing Director of Orval Brewery, he explained to me that regardless of the work that needs to be done or the influx of tourists during certain times of year, "le rythme de la journée monastique ne change pas [the monastic day's rhythm does not change.]" He underlined that hospitality is inscribed in *The Rule of Saint Benedict* and is a key component of identity of their community. Additionally, though visitors may stay within the monastic walls, there is a separation made between the monks and laypeople, as indicated in the construction of the Abbey

as seen in Chapter Four:

Sinon pour accueil, voilà il y a ce qu'il est typiquement Cistercien Trappiste c'est que voilà la vie de la communauté reste séparer de l'accueil des autres. Il y a un réfectoire indépendant de la communauté pour accueil des retraitants, et puis le rythme, comme je l'ai expliqué, au niveau de liturgie bin c'est le même rythme [...] Donc ça n'entre pas en concurrence, ce n'est pas un, disons une espèce de tension, de difficulté pour la communauté, je veux dire que ce n'est jamais, que ce que nous ne vivons et ce qui peut être perçu par les personnes dans notre rythme de vie est essentiel que nous partageons c'est, c'est notre cadre de silence et de permettre aux gens, quel que soit leur itinéraire personnelle au niveau spirituel de rejoindre d'un manière ou d'une autre dans un mystère de communion, ce que nous célébrons ensemble. (Frère Xavier 2019)

[As for the reception of visitors, it is typically Cistercian Trappist that monastic community lives separately from the reception of others. There is an independent refectory from the community for the visitors, and so the rhythm, as I explained, is at a liturgic level, and so it is the same rhythm [...] So, it doesn't enter in competition, there is no tension or difficult for the community. I mean, how we live and how we are perceived in our daily rhythm essential in how we share, which is our silence which allows people, no matter their personal purpose on the spiritual level, to join us in the wonder of communion in one way or another, so that we can celebrate together.]

This life of balance is not one of stress nor are competing demands a source of friction, as I had assumed. Indeed, Frère Xavier placed significance on the importance of community within the monastery, and particularly, as a "*communauté vivante*" ["living community"]. This idea of a *living community* was brought up when we discussed the significance of the word "Trappist," the ATP label, and how these allowed for the protection of Orval's living community.

## **Craft Quality**

The association of high quality handmade products with the Trappists parallels that of other small, religious communities, such as the Amish. For example, Thomas E. Meyers conducted research among tourists to Shipshewana, Indiana about their interest in Amish culture and tourism. The vast majority of Meyers's participants were white Americans over the age of 50 (Meyers 2003, 111). To Meyers's surprise, most were attracted to Amish country by the flea market and local shops (ibid., 115-116); they were particularly interested in purchasing Amishmade goods which they felt were of superior quality:

When asked whether the label "made by the Amish" was important to them, 65% of our sample said yes. 59% of the respondents said they would be willing to pay more for Amish-made products. Why? The most common response was that Amish means quality and homemade. (ibid., 123)

Meyers notes that some of the products sold in Amish Country are not made by the Amish, however these articles gain value just by their proximity to or association with the Amish. According to Susan L. Trollinger, author of *Selling the Amish: The Tourism of Nostalgia*, part of the appeal of food sold in Amish Country in Walnut Creek, Ohio, is that it is "slow food" that contrasts to the industrially produced and "fast food" that is the mainstay of the North American diet. Trollinger writes, "[t]he opposite of slow food, fast food, relies on industrialized methods of food production and preparation that often strip the ingredients of their nutritional value and flavor, which are frequently then replaced artificially" (Trollinger 2012, 54).

Similarly, the Trappists offer consumers a counter to modern beer manufacturing. In writing about Westmalle, a Trappist brewery in Belgium, Isabelle Jonveaux notes that even though the company's beer is not technically produced by monks, monastic values and the attention to detail are present in the work of the lay employees: "Les consommateurs savent qu'une bière trappist, c'est une bière fabriquée avec des ingrédients très naturels, avec beaucoup de temps pour la qualité et beacoup de soin pour la qualité. Et ça a créé une image que notre bière est un bière de qualité, très forte, mais bien sentie." [The consumers know that a Trappist beer is a beer produced with natural ingredients, spending a lot of time on the quality and concerned about the quality. And it has created an image of our beer as a beer of quality, strong, but well-meaning] (Jonveaux 2011, 118). To at least some beer enthusiasts, this distinction is

significant. As noted earlier, Orval Brewery produces only 80,000 hectolitres of beer annually. This is a very small amount when compared to AB InBev, the largest beer company in the world, that produced about 530.6 million hectolitres in 2020. Orval is small scale even when compared to many other craft breweries. For example, the well-known Flemish family-owned company, Duvel Moortgat Brewery, is one of the largest craft breweries in the world. Owner of Duvel, Vedett, La Chouffe, Ommegang and Boulevard breweries, they produced 2.2 million hectolitres of beer in 2019 (Duvel Moortgat n.d.). As a craft brewery, Orval Brewery is seen as counter-hegemonic to large-scale producers (Rice 2016, 240; Markowski 2004, 3; Koontz and Chapman 2019, 355; Vehaal and Dobrev 2022, 258-259; Barlow, Verhaal, and Hoskins 2018, 2942-2945; Frake 2017); as a small producer within craft breweries, they are even more distinguished. Orval's smaller production size can be viewed as an endeavour led by passion rather than financial gains.

Susan Terrio writes in an article on craft chocolate production that, "French and American chocolatiers resist producing on a larger scale in order to retain control over their work and businesses. This choice has ideological components as they situate themselves within a moral economy of honest work and fair trade against the capitalist drive for profit" (2016, 137-138). Orval beer belongs to the moral economy Terrio describes; it is slow food and craft that fits well into anti-capitalist, anti-greed ethical business practices. Additionally, holding the ATP label, Orval Brewery is non-profit. This means, as stated earlier, that "Profits should be intended for the needs of the monastic community, for purposes of solidarity within the Trappist Order, or for development projects and charitable works" (International Trappist Association n.d., "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label"). This further elevates their position as a business driven

by quality and passion over financial profit.

## Nostalgic Folk versus Living Community

Susan L. Trollinger writes about the allure of the Amish. Regarded as "a premodern and, thus, exotic other, the Amish are fascinating because they seem to live an authentic life" (Trollinger 2012, 36; also see MacCannell 1999, 91-107). Her observations echo Ian McKay's findings about the construction of twentieth century Nova Scotia as antimodern. In *The Quest for the Folk*, McKay argues that part of the province's revival in handicraft and rural crafts depended on a romanticization of the past and an embrace of antimodernism. He writes:

In this imagined history, the crafts were once aspects of rural economy of selfsufficiency. The "old ways" of the country Folk were then "forgotten" through some collective lapse in memory or through mass outbreak of laziness caused by modern conveniences. In truth, they vanished in a process of social change and struggle. In the cities, workers who had invested their lives in the old ways faced painful and difficult adjustments. (2009, 156-157)

Today, the romantic allure of past traditional practices that McKay describes in Nova Scotia applies to largely self-sufficient communities existing outside of the mainstream, such as the Amish or the Trappists. As McKay argued, in one sense this construction of the seemingly antimodern folk helps to sell products, but it can also lead to a misrepresentation of the living communities that make the artifacts. Looking again to the Amish, their belief that "idleness is a gateway to sin" (Trollinger 2012, 31) helps frame them as both morally good and hard workers; their products are material expressions of this belief. Here there are clear parallels to the Trappist monks's commitment to a life balanced between *ora et labora*. Again, it is a life philosophy that finds material expression in the products produced in the monastery. Inherent in the embrace of a nostalgic ideal of the Amish is a tendency to see them as actors or tour guides rather than as real people participating in their modern economy. For example, Meyers writes that tourists were

openly upset at their inability to go backstage to "really" get to know the Amish, and "couldn't understand why the Amish don't open their houses to people" (ibid., 118). Some tourists search for an authentic experience of the Amish by arguably pushing aside any consideration for community members' privacy. Instead, they view the Amish as embodiments of unrealistic nostalgic ideals.

Frère Xavier's emphasis on living community sheds new light on these types of stereotypes of religious communities. He argues that the need to identify Trappist products through labeling and trademarks not only protects the quality of the product but protects the living community from misrepresentation. Jonveaux writes that in imitators' labels there is a tendency to feature medieval rather than modern day monks through the depiction of gothic stained-glass and monks dressed in medieval outfits:

La tendresse nostalgique pour ce monde religieux quasi disparu qui ferait parties du socle traditionnel et culturel de l'Europe peut être réinvestie par le marketing qui va emprunter cette image comme preuve de qualité. (2011, 122).

[There is a tender nostalgia for these quasi-lost religious folk that represent historically foundational traditions and cultures of Europe, and how they can be revived through marketing by borrowing their imagery as proof of quality.]

Jonveaux stresses that it is both the unique identity of the monks and their reputation for quality that form a "charismatic economy," often imitated but never replicated (2011, 118). The Trappists are not a static religious group that lives in an idyllic past; they are a modern group of people dedicated to their set of values, which can only be attained and realized by living on the periphery of society, but they are still very much a part of contemporary life. Their distance from, say, the greediness of capitalist society, may contribute to their ability to produce a unique brew but they also participate in today's global economy. The International Trappist Association's authentication designation through the Trappist trademark and the Authentic Trappist Product label not only ensure consumers of high quality and a particular production

context, it also assures the Trappist community that they have control over the representation of

their own community.

## Terroir and Appellations d'Origine Controllée labels in France

**Tom Peters (TP):** I got a cease and desist letter from a law firm in D.C.<sup>46</sup> because I had a burger called the Trappist burger.

Ema Kibirkstis (EK): No way.

TP: Yeah, so-

EK: What year was that?

**TP:** Probably '98 or '99, and she goes, she sends to me this letter and then I call her, she goes, "I have your menu in front of me and it has Trappist burgers and that, you know, there's no logo by it," – it's just called a Trappist burger because I had Ardennes ham on it-

EK: Oh cool, yeah!

**TP:** -and Orval cheese, that's how it started. So she goes, "It leaves people to believe this is a product of the Trappist monasteries." I'm like, "Well, that's not what it is, and by the way, why do you have a menu of mine? Did you steal it?" And she got all flustered by that, and so I called Francois [de Harenne] and he sent over a letter, and then I called my friend Paul Arnott at Chimay, and he sent over a letter, then I sent a letter to them and I never heard from them again.

As this example shows, sometimes to extreme extents, labelling and designation systems

exist to guarantee the authentic origin of a product. The ATI protects its members and products

from greedy, fraudulent intimidators while also ensuring the utmost quality of the products

carrying the Trappist name and ATP label. This system of labelling is largely influenced by

principles of Geographical Indication (GI) systems, and perhaps most infamously, the French

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Miller writes that since the ITA's conception, "[they] retain lawyers in Washington and Brussels ready to sue brewers who try to use the word Trappist" (2007).

*appellations d'origine contrôllées*, or AOC. Amy B. Trubek writes in *The Taste of Place: A Cultural Journey into Terroir* that though links between place and taste have been noted for centuries (2008, 18-20), a focus on the relationship between place and quality, as well as its economic advantage of placing such emphasis, only came about in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century (ibid., 22). This link between taste and place, used to argue for official GI recognition and in France an AOC, is known as *terroir*. Compellingly elusive, *terroir* as a word and concept originated in the Renaissance, derived from the Latin word for territory, *terratorium* (Lukacs 2012 quoted in Patterson and Buechsenstein 2018: 37). In Jancis Robinson's *The Oxford Companion to Wine*, terroir's three-page entry begins with a singular sentence defining terroir as "the total natural environment of any viticultural site" (2015, 737). A particular focus on the soil emerges further into this definition. James E. Wilson writes in *Terroir: The Role of Geology, Climate, and Culture in the Making of French Wine:* 

Terroir has become a buzz word in English language wine literature. This lighthearted use disregards reverence for the land which is a critical, invisible element of the term. The true concept is not easily grasped but includes physical elements of the vineyard habitat – the vine, subsoil, siting, drainage, and microclimate. Beyond the measurable ecosystem, there is an additional dimension – the spiritual aspect that recognizes the joys, the heartbreaks, the pride, the sweat, and the frustrations of its history. (1998, 55)

Wine expert and geologist, Wilson devotes two pages of this book on French to defining "terroir" and admits his own inconsistent use of the term. Barham writes that historically the concept of terroir was associated with wine: "wine production is a complex dance with nature with the goal of interpreting or translating the local ecology, displaying its quantities to best advantage" (2003, 131). In contrast, the current notion of terroir focuses more on "how the old is made new in the ongoing process of history...[,] the involvement of powerful social actors...[and] all things to do with history, heritage or 'patrimoine'" (ibid.). These natural and social factors in conceptualizing terroir are also seen in AOC designations which, arguably, are a

verification process of terroir; the designation process has also grown from a concentration on ecology to an acknowledgement of the significant impact of social factors.

In 1995, Sandrine Scheffer and Bertil Sylvander's surveyed 112 agents working for Institut national de l'origine et de la qualité (INAO) concerning the concepts they considered most important in regulating AOCs. Although the majority of agents identified "terroir" as the most significant concept, there was not unanimous agreement on what the term means. The authors write that half the agents "estimate that the natural characters of the terroir confers to it its typicity ("*area where notions of ground and climate contribute to give to the product which are coming from it some original characterises*")" and "[t]he other half integrates human factors ("general human and natural factors which contribute to make a particular product")" (Scheffer and Sylvander 1997, 476). Even within the INAO that regulates AOCs in France and considers terroir its most important concept, there is lack of agreement concerning the significance of human (or social) factors.

American *terroir* experts, Amy Trubek, Kolleen M. Guy, and Sarah Bowen write in "Terroir: A French Conversation with a Transnational Future," that though *terroir* is a core principle for AOC label applicants, the concept of *savoir-faire* has gained even more importance since its conception in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. Drawing on an interview with Mario Zalay, then director of the INAO, they write:

Once a group has defined their *savoir-faire* and created a dossier to be submitted to the INAO for approval, Zalay does not rely solely on the producers who argue for their unique *terroir* but also brings in sensory scientists, geologists, historians and others to confirm their claims. Thus what might be understood as an indigenous discourse on *terroir* is no longer the final word; in this case present and future practice reflects but does not mimic the past" (2010, 145)

From a folkloristic perspective, designation of AOC labels, overseen by INAO, can be interpreted as an attempt to conserve and protect "living folklore." These efforts are not to revive or reconstruct past *savoir-faire* of a people that once were, but rather to protect that which already exists and which is/might be wrongfully imitated, ensuring its recognition and uniqueness. In an article by Elizabeth Barham on terroir and French AOC labelling, she writes, "[a] great deal of knowledge about the local terrain is needed for success as well as respect for natural conditions that can be expressed through the wine" (2003, 131).<sup>47</sup> Indeed, Orval promotes *savoir-faire* or "know-how" in their products. In the 2015 informational flyer on Orval Abbey, "Orval Know-How" is marked in large lettering before a discussion of their brewing and their cheese and on Orval's honey candy packaging, *savoir-faire* is marked under the modern Orval logo and name (fig. 4.15). *Savoir-faire* is a condition of *terroir*; producing something with a distinguishable taste of place means having an underlying understanding of *how* to produce with a distinguishable taste of place.

Terroir gained recognition through its use in AOCs for French wine, regulated by the INAO and French wine (Demossier 2011, 690). Perhaps one of the most renowned examples of an AOC, and one of the first designations, is Champagne (fig. 5.6). Kolleen Guy writes in *When Champagne became French: Wine and the Making of a National Identity*, that "fine wine producers lobbied for very specific legislation to safeguard, not the "purity" of the common beverage, but what they believed was the reputation of their product" (Guy 2003, 120). They did so because the name "Champagne" was being used to refer to other sparkling wines, misrepresenting what they considered to be actual Champagne. The name carried a meaning and an allure that attracted imitators. That the word "Trappist" is regulated much like the restricted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> For more on the labour of taste and terroir, see the special issue on Sensory Labor in *Food, Culture & Society* edited by Amy Bentley, 2019.

term "Champagne," and that the ATP label is similar to the AOC designation, demonstrates a parallel between beer and wine terroir spheres.<sup>48</sup>



Figure 5.6. Twitter post following the "The CDC Recommends" popular meme circulating the Internet in late 2021 in the wake of new COVID-19 safety guidelines by the Center of Disease Control (CDC) in the United States of America due to the highly contagious new variant named 'Omicron'. This Tweet makes fun of Champagne's famed designation, demonstrating its use in everyday speech. *Source:* accessed Jan 11, 2022, https://twitter.com/mikeVcella/status/1475924319150612485.

# Considering a Terroir of Orval Beer

Drawing on definitions of terroir by Trubek (2008), Robinson (2015) and Wilson (1998), as well as work by Scheffer and Sylvander (1997) and Trubek, Guy and Bowen (2010), here I understand terroir to be the natural and human environmental contexts which construct a product's distinctive taste of place. I consider "natural environmental contexts" to include everything involving the product outside of human control, such as the climate, soil, terrain, and surrounding non-human living things (i.e. insects, animals, bacteria, and plants) that impact the taste of the finished product. "Human environmental contexts" include everything involving

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> For more fuller discussion on French gastronomy, terroir and the French designation system, see Trubek 2008, 18-53.

human interaction, such as agricultural techniques, savoir-faire, traditions, history, and sociopolitical influences that impact the taste or perception of the finished product.

In the context of this definition, how can Orval beer have terroir? How does it provide a taste of place? The beer connoisseurs I interviewed all think that beers like Orval do have terrior. For example, Chuck Cook believes beers, specifically those with wild yeast such as Orval and lambics, have terrior. For Cook, terroir comes from the fact that each batch of beer is unique. "Trying to replicate the microclimate is almost impossible," Cook explained. Even using the same yeast and method, there is variety in the finished product year after year, just as there is with wine production.

Stu Stuart also understands beer to have terroir. He takes a different approach, however, based on the history and context of the beer during the tours he hosts. When discussing his Belgian Beer Me! Beer Tours of Belgium's Lonely Monks Trappist Tour, a ten-day excursion exploring the Trappist Abbeys and breweries in Belgium and The Netherlands, he explained,

Well, because the Trappist [beers] are so widely distributed and they're accessible, and people have had them, and when they have these magical beers, and they're so good and they are so consistently good, and they are so different from American beers, the people they want to go and see where this comes from and who makes them and experience the terroir, you know? And then when you have the mysticism of the monks behind it and their involvement, that really piques peoples' curiosity too. They want to come to understand what the Cistercians are about, what their daily life is like, how and why they have these incredible beers. And what people come to realize is that these beers have some historical significance, they have some geographical significance, and they some religious significance.

Tourists choose to participate in this tour, even though they are already familiar with the beer, because they want to learn more about the beer and the taste by visiting the location in which it is produced. Tom Peters explained to me that he learned the connection between place, people and taste through Michael Jackson, the famed British beer writer: I met him when I was at the other bar [before opening Monk's Café], and he came in. I never knew him, never saw a photo of him, and he was mumbling under his breath, and we were talking about beer and we were discussing things. Then, I'm pouring a beer he never had from the States and I'm describing the colour and everything about it, and he asks, "Well who's the brewer," I'm like "What?" "Where's the family from? Where's the brewery located?" [...]

Then we talked about another beer, you know, we poured a beer, and again I wanted to impress him with my tastebuds and then he goes into, "Oh yeah that family's been there since 1800s and they're fifth generation and it's all this farmland," and so he's describing the terroir and the family history. And it's like, "Well, I know how it tastes, now I need to know why it tastes the way it does." And that's what I do now, I travel to breweries, I meet brewers, I have dinners with them, sometimes I stay at their houses. I have to visit the brewery and meet the people to see the terroir and understand why the beer tastes the way it does. (Peters 2021)

Stuart and Peters both see terroir as being closely related to the people as well as place. For them, it is not enough to simply read about the history and brewery. To truly understand terroir requires visiting the brewery and meeting the people. Cook, however, highlights the actual ingredient, yeast, as a source of terroir, as it fits with the more traditional understanding of terroir depending on the physical environment. These experts all dismiss the argument sometimes made against a terroir of beer due to the fact that "breweries are not usually located at the source of their main ingredients" (Fletchall 2016, 557). Orval Brewery is selective about their hops and malts which they source rather than grow themselves in order to get the best possible product. The water and wild yeast are both "local," however. Additionally, a significant portion of their *terroir* comes from their status as a Trappist brewery, as a product produced by a *living community* of Trappists.

# Conclusion

The immense worldbuilding involved in talking about terroir brings together climate, geology, history, and ownership to tell the story of a particular product's relationship to a particular place. In his examination of *terroir* narratives of wine produced at Mile East Farm in

the Cizhong, Yunnan, Xiangchun Zheng focuses on those told about the Rose Honey grape said to have been brought to the region by a native of France. Zheng concludes, "Narrating *terroir* should be seen as a linguistic and cultural practice and process, drawing upon the history of French wine introduction and production in Cizhong, and bringing a rich story onto the farm" (2019, 293). Narrative practices, like the ones Zheng explores, create a sense of belonging to the product. When consumers learn about the *terroir* and consume the product, literally and figuratively absorbing the *terroir*, they become a part of the story. The "social imaginaries" (Trubek, Guy, and Bowen 2010, 140) and "imagined communities" (Guy 2003, 192; Anderson [1983] 2016) featured in terroir narratives emphasize the selectivity and superior value of craft products in ways that reflect positively on the consumer. They can also help create nostalgic stereotypes of peoples and places, however, and Heather Paxson warns that by emphasizing *terroir* when marketing, producers risk transforming it into a commodity fetish (2010, 454).

A significant part of Orval beer's appeal is that it is an Authentic Trappist Product; it has a proven association with Trappist monks. As a Trappist beer, Orval allows consumers to participate in a monastic tradition deeply rooted to place. Terroir is used to justify the quality and the superior taste of a product. As such, I would argue that terroir plays a key role in consumers' taste perception of Orval beer. Customers share terroir narratives that include foundation legends for both Orval Abbey and beer as well as stories of its ATP. These create a social imaginary that they can participate in and actually consume, allowing them to understand why the product is the way that it is. Terroir stories of Orval beer provide consumers with opportunities to participate in Belgian tradition, monastic tradition, and the Trappist tradition of Orval Abbey. How exactly consumers experience the taste of Orval beer is the subject of the next section.

## SECTION IV: NARRATING TASTE

#### March 1<sup>st</sup>, 2019

Interesting how Frère Xavier described Orval beer as âmer, meaning "bitter," (it is a dryhopped beer), he said it goes well with bitter food, unlike other Belgian beers, which tend to be sweet. He named *chicon*, which is an endive, as a traditional Belgian food that goes well with Orval beer. This I found particularly interesting, food and beer pairings...

This fieldnote was written the day after my initial discussion with Frère Xavier at Orval Abbey. Though I was not asking particular questions about the *goût d'Orval* (the taste of Orval), it inevitably made its way into our first conversation. Having examined how narratives of Belgian and Trappist help construct Orval beer's taste contextually, I now take a closer look at what specific terms and sensory descriptors are used to characterize Orval beer. Adopting a folkloristic approach to taste, the first chapter in this section offers a computational analysis of online reviews of Orval beer found on the popular beer reviewing websites and/or mobile device applications Untappd, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate. Conducting lexical analysis with Voyant and data visualization using Gephi provides a distant reading of the reviews that helps to better identify key themes and terms used in Orval beer reviews. Drawing on themes that emerge in select reviews on BeerAdvocate, the last chapter develops the concept of narratives of taste as a sub-genre of personal experience narrative, distinguished by being personal and performative as well as containing both sensory and contextual descriptors. Both chapters point to the value of investigating taste through narrative and argue for the unique contributions folklorists can make to multidisciplinary discussions about taste.

#### **Chapter Six**

## "This truly is a blessed beer": Lexical and Network Analysis of Online Reviews of Orval Beer

As beer enthusiasts, we know the difference between simple, enjoyable drinking and a more serious activity called tasting. Drinking is mindless and unstructured, while tasting has rules. Drinking comes naturally, while tasting requires training and effort. Mastering the latter opens a lot of doors and steps up in seriousness and prestige in the world of beer.

Randy Mosher, Tasting Beer

Online reviews play a significant role for today's beer producers and consumers; breweries depend on them to garner feedback on their products while customers consult reviews as a guide when purchasing new brands, or they write their own reviews in order to share opinions and to engage in conversations with fellow beer enthusiasts. Orval beer's online reviews extend the many layered narratives that surround and help to construct a sense of taste of Orval beer discussed in earlier chapters, namely those that explain and identify the value of the words "Belgian" and "Trappist". While online reviews have only recently attracted the attention of folklorists, for example in the work of Trevor J. Blank on fake Amazon.com fake product reviews (2015), I see them as rich vernacular texts.

In the following chapter, inspired by works on wine talk and research conducted on beer reviews in other fields, I conduct a lexical and network analysis of Orval beer reviews on the popular beer reviewing websites and/or mobile device applications Untappd, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate. Like the narratives discussed in previous chapters, the reviews highlight the value of non-sensory, or contextual, descriptors in forming taste evaluations.

### Wine Talk

Frédéric Brochet and Denis Dubourdieu's "Wine Descriptive Language Supports Cognitive Specificity of Chemical Senses" was one of the first articles that expanded my understanding of taste perception in relation to language. As oenologists at the University of Bourdeaux in France, the authors analyzed and compared the texts of one popular European wine guide, two wine writers and one private taster. Brochet and Dubourdieu used ALCESTE software to calculate the co-occurrence of words in the texts, and found that, "When the taster speaks of a specific wine describing flavors, he or she mainly uses a series of words he or she has used previously for this category of wine and is not describing the specific wine" (2001, 192). Each corpus, meaning each body of texts from a single source, demonstrates a repetition of language, rather than summoning new words for a new wine. Participants communicated through an already established language rather than by adopting a new one for new wines and tastes.

An additional point of interest in this study is that the researchers distinguished that sensory descriptions of the wines were "contaminated by an appreciation that the tasters can obviously not taste" (ibid., 193). Here the authors are referring to non-sensory properties which I call contextual descriptors. As they note, and is demonstrated elsewhere (Morrot, Brochet and Dubourdieu 2001), these contextual descriptors, as opposed to sensory descriptors, are used by expert as well as novice wine tasters. Contextual descriptors are an essential component of taste reviews no matter the level of expertise on behalf of the taster; they are used by everyone. While these contextual descriptors are often removed from studies of taste reviews focused on lexical analysis (such as in the case of Brochet and Dubourdieu 2001, and Morrot, Brochet, and Dubourdieu 2001), my research retains them and emphasizes their equal importance to sensory descriptors. Inspired by Brochet and Dubourdieu's work that demonstrates through language

analysis that the sensory cognitive functions are informed by personal preference (Brochet and Dubourdieu 2001, 195), I expand on their work to also include lexical analysis of the contextual descriptors within reviews.

Gregg Eric Arn Solomon's article "Psychology of Novice and Expert Wine Talk" provides rich insight into the similarities between new and seasoned wine drinkers and demonstrates fluency in wine talk as a main indicator of a wine expert. Similarly, Michael Silverstein views fluency in wine talk, or *oinoglossia*, as a necessary step to achieving connoisseurship within wine circles (also see Isani 2017). Just like "wine talk," "beer talk" depends on a language that is particular and distinct. Though the dialectics of beer sociolinguistics is beyond the confines of this study, it is significant to note that beer reviewers, even those who are not so-called "experts," adopt a specific type of language when referring to Orval beer.

## **Beer Reviews**

There has been an impressive amount of research conducted on beer reviewing sites and/or mobile device applications Untappd (see de Brito, Baldykowski, Miczevski, and Silva 2018; Paiva and Hantao 2020; Santala, Costa, Gomes, Gadda, and Silva 2020), RateBeer (Price 2018; Schoenmueller, Netzer and Stahl 2020; McAuley and Leskovec 2013; Nelson 2020) and BeerAdvocate (Koontz and Chapman 2019; Verhaal and Dobrev 2022; Barlow, Verhaal, and Hoskins 2018; McAuley and Leskovec 2013; Muhammad, Lawlor, and Smyth 2017; Peng, Cui, Chung, Li 2019); most of this work has been done by computer scientists. Chandler Price's "Brewfinder – An Interactive Flavor Map Informed by Users" (2018), is the only lexical analysis of beer reviews and therefore is most relevant to this study. Price used RateBeer reviews of craft

beers within the American state of Georgia to help consumers find new beers. After conducting a focus group on preferred visualizations, he created Brewfinder to help consumers find beers that match their own flavour and style preferences. Price's use of data visualization, including his reliance on the software Voyant, further prompted me to explore its application to Orval beer reviews.

## **Beer Reviewing Websites**

Inspired by this work on wine talk and beer reviews, it became obvious that the first step in conducting my own research on Orval beer reviews was to gather data. I began by collecting and examining user submitted textual beer reviews which were written on Untappd (untappd.com), RateBeer (ratebeer.com), and BeerAdvocate (beeradvocate.com). For the purposes of this study, I refer to these three data sources as websites. I extracted data from the browser website and entered the information into a Google Sheets document until 1000 written reviews were gathered from each. I consider the data (the reviews) from each website to represent a corpus.

*Untappd* is a social networking service that can be accessed on browser and as a mobile device application. Amongst the three mediums, Untappd is the most popular, with approximately 8 million users. As Courtney Iseman writes in an article for *Vinepair*, when Gregory Avola and Tim Mather created Untappd in 2010, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate were the only online beer reviewing websites with "both representing an older generation in beer" (2021). Additionally, Iseman writes, "whereas BeerAdvocate's pages were filled with long, thoughtful beer reviews, Untappd catered to a generation of beer drinkers that was always on to the next and wanting an app to keep up" (ibid.). As a result, however, most Untappd reviews consist of only a

star-rating and written comments are much briefer than those on the other sites although they can include photos. Price writes that Untappd is largely used as a rating system and written reviews are "few and far between" (2018, 343). Untappd also allows consumers to tag the specific restaurant or bar where their beer was consumed, the store at which they purchased the beer, or "Untappd at Home" to promote safe at-home consumption during the COVID-19 pandemic. In 2016, Untappd was purchased by a subsidiary of Next Glass (Untappd 2020), a "provider of software, content, and experiences in the beverage alcohol industry" (Next Glass 2022). I collected 5001 check-ins between October 2020 to January 2021, 1000 of which included a written review. The average rating was 3.77 on a rating scale of 5 with 0.25 increments, with an average word count of approximately 9.36 (fig. 6.1). Over half of the entries included a photo, usually of the beer, the bottle, or the reviewer or their drinking companions (fig. 6.2).

*RateBeer* is a website and mobile device application providing use ratings of beers and editorial content. It was founded in 2000 by Bill Buchanan who was eventually joined by Josh Oaks and Joe Tucker. According to their website, they have 20,000 unique visitors daily, and claim to have the most page views amongst beer guide sites (RateBeer n.d.). Similar to Untappd, their rating system is on 5, however in increments of 0.1. In 2017, the largest beer producer in the world, Anheuser-Busch InBev, purchased a portion of RateBeer through ZX Ventures, and in 2019 purchased the website in its entirety. This created some controversy about the website and generated fears of it being biased towards their products (Furnari 2017; Paradiso 2019). I collected 1000 reviews between December 2014 and February 2021. The average rating is of 3.92; the average word count of 50.84 is significantly longer than reviews on Untappd. Additionally, users may choose to tag the city and country where they are consuming their beer (fig. 6.3, fig. 6.4).

*BeerAdvocate* is the oldest of the three beer reviewing websites, having been founded in 1996 by brothers Todd and Jason Alström. Of the three, BeerAdvocate is the only one without a mobile device application, however, they are in process of developing one. In 2020 BeerAdvocate reported having 106,329 active users (Alström 2021). This is a very engaging forum and boasts longer reviews. In this sense, the site is very different from Untappd, which has been criticized (Krommydas 2022; Pomranz 2020) for promoting "ticking" which is the "peculiarly English beer-related hobby involving the tasting of as many different beers as possible" and "every new beer encountered by a ticking aficionado receives a "tick," as in making a tick (check) mark on a list" (Avery 2011, 793). In the same 2020 report, Todd Alström expresses the creators' desire to return to their roots in hopes of encouraging more lengthy reviews (Alström 2014b). In 2020, BeerAdvocate was purchased by Next Glass. BeerAdvocate's rating system is also out of 5, in increments of 0.25. Here, however, reviewers provide differently weighted ratings for look (6%), smell (24%), taste (40%), feel (10%) and overall (20%) (Alström 2014b). The overall rating, with a deviation percentage (rDev), is calculated, showing the deviation from the mean for the beer overall (Alström 2014a). Though Untappd and RateBeer publish detailed reviews that comment on all aspects of a beer, BeerAdvocate is the only site to actively encourage reviewers to specifically comment on individual components such as look, smell, taste, feel, and overall impression. As a result, many of the reviews on BeerAdvocate are written as commentaries on each of these separate elements (fig. 6.6) rather than as a single, fluid paragraph. For the purposes of this study, I collected 1000 reviews dated from November 2010 to January 2021. The average rating was 4.35; at 126.5, the average word count was significantly higher than that of reviews on the other two sites.



Figure 6.1. Screenshot taken of the Untappd website on January 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021.



Figure 6.2. Screenshot taken of an Untappd review on January 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021.



Figure 6.3. Screenshot taken of the RateBeer website on January 4th, 2021.

|              | kolemkoukolem (2,600)<br>im Pilsen, Czech Republic<br>★★★★★ 3.7 April 17, 2020   |
|--------------|--|
| head<br>belg | 968; 4/2020. Strong apple aroma. Amber, hazy body. Long lasting white<br>d. Full body, fruits, apples, hops, spices, very dry finish. Interesting dry pale<br>jina ale with strong apple notes. 0,33 l, bottle, shop with specialities,<br>age without fridge, Pilsen (Bohemia, CZ). |

Figure 6.4. Screenshot taken of the RateBeer website on January 4th, 2021.

| MENU              | WE AR  | LOG IN ■ SIGN UP  |
|-------------------|--|---|
| Beers             | Brasserie d'Orval S.A.   |   |
|                   | appist Ale<br>l'Orval S.A.   | Beer Tool:  |
| 94<br>Outstanding | Beer Geek Stats   Prin   | nt Shelf Talker<br>Pale Ale - Belgian<br>Ranked #1  |
| 2                 | ABV:   | 6.2%  |
|                   | Score:   | <b>94</b><br>Ranked #1,303  |
|                   | Avg:   | 4.24   pDev: 12.26%   |
|                   | Reviews:   | 2,457   |
|                   | Ratings:   | 5,737   |
|                   | From:  | Brasserie d'Orval S.A.  |
|                   |  | Belgium   |
|                   | Avail:   | Year-round  |
|                   | Wants  | 375   |
|                   | Gots   | □ 1,031   |
| between the       | beer's full-bodied yet con<br>s first brewed in 1931 and<br>wery has selected very a<br>vailed from Bavaria. The b | on beer. The ageing process adds a fruity note, which strikes a subtle balance<br>nplex flavour and bitterness.<br>I owes its unparalleled taste to the quality of the water, the hops and the yeast<br>romatic and unique hop varieties, which hark back to the first brewmaster of<br>eer's aromas are very pronounced while maintaining the right level of<br>od of dry hopping. |

| 22   | <b>3.8/5 rDev -9.5%</b><br>look: 4   smell: 4   taste: 3.75   feel: 3.5   overall: 3.75<br>by <b>plutonash</b> from Latvia  |  |  |  |
|--|---|--|--|--|
|  | L: At first pour, half glass was foam with stormy bubbles. Later dissipates to a nice thick head. Clear (w/o sediment),<br>copper/amber in colour. Nice lacing.<br>S: Immediately funk - leather, barnyard, rubber. Some malt. Pairs, bananas, some hint of cucumber.<br>T: Very bitter foam. Expected sourness as my brain associates the funk described earlier with sour beers, but I didn't<br>get that, which was suprising. Woody, nutty, lightly malty.<br>F: Low/mid carb, a bit too bitter for my taste, low/mid body with a refreshing touch.<br>O: Interesting sort of beer that needs getting use to, but seems to grow on me with every sip. Unique. |  |  |  |
|  | May 09, 2021  |  |  |  |
| Figure 6.6. Some web at taken of the Door A days and such aits on January 4th 2021 |   |  |  |  |

Figure 6.6. Screenshot taken of the BeerAdvocate website on January 4<sup>th</sup>, 2021.

After gathering the reviews from Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate, I was faced with an overwhelming amount of data. The number of reviews was staggering, and unlike dealing with conventional interviews, I required a new approach to analyze these narratives. Indeed, instead of conducting a close reading of a few texts, I was interested in identifying the key features of this large dataset, a total of 3000 reviews. The question still remained, how do I access the key features of these reviews? And how do I analyze them? These texts required a different kind of methodology than what I had previously been accustomed to in traditional folklore narrative research.

After attending a Keynote Address by Timothy Tangherlini at the Folklore Society Association of Canada in 2021 titled "Tracking Bill Gates: Computational Folkloristics and the COVID-19 Pandemic," I was inspired to consider a computational folkloristic approach to my dataset. I reached out to Tangherlini in search of guidance and he pointed towards Voyant and Gephi as lexical analysis and visualization software. From the 1000 reviews gathered from each website, I selected only the English reviews, totalling 438 reviews from Untappd, 664 reviews from RateBeer, and 998 reviews from BeerAdvocate for a total of 2100 reviews.<sup>49</sup> Then, I edited the remaining dataset for better entry into the software <sup>50</sup> and entered the data into Voyant and Gephi. This lexical analysis and visualisation of Orval beer reviews allows for a better reading of the sensory (describing the taste, smell, look, and mouthfeel of the beer), and contextual (describing where the beer was brewed, who brewed it, where it was drank, etc.) descriptors of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> As Abello, Broadwell and Tangherlini write, "Each language poses special challenges, from transcription and representation in machine- readable form to morphological and syntactic complexity" (2012, 69). To accurately conduct a multi-language analysis, would require a larger team of collaborative researchers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> I edited the reviews to correct any typos or inconsistencies in the text, such as "spicy ness" to "spiciness" and edited punctuation, such "apricot, funky" to "apricot, funky," altered to Canadian spelling, such as "flavor" to "flavour," and removed creative spelling, such as "Trapiiiiiiiiste," to "Trappist." However, I left intact derivatives containing the -y, -ish and -iness suffixes, such as "breadiness," "ovalish" and "peary.," and only editing terms for consistency, such as "breadyness" to "breadiness" so that they would be grouped together.

the reviews, by determining which descriptors are the most prevalent, the frequency of each of these types of descriptors and the relationship between the descriptors and reviews. Beer reviews are not conventional narratives in that they are meant to specifically discuss the taste of the beer; they are narratives of taste. In this chapter, I further my argument that narratives construct taste by focusing on words consumers use to describe Orval beer.

## Generating Word Clouds and Conducting Lexical Analysis using Voyant

I used Voyant (voyant-tools.org) to create visualizations and a lexical analysis from the edited data. I began by converting the whole dataset into a .xlsx file to create an "overall" corpus and then saved each website's corpus into its own .xlsx file, making for a total of four files or corpuses (overall, Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate). Voyant can read and transfer information directly from tables, in this case .xlsx files, and reading the content only from a specified cells in each row of the table. In this way, I was able to have Voyant only analyse the text from the reviews and to sort each review as a separate "Document." After each corpus was processed, a word cloud, known as a Cirrus on Voyant, was created with its 55 most used words. Voyant automatically generates a list of "Stopwords" which are words excluded from the end results. Their website explains that they remove "function words that don't carry as much meaning, such as determiners and prepositions (the, a, in, to from, etc.)" in the detected language (Voyant Tools Help n.d.). Figures 6.7., 6.8., 6.9. and 6.10 illustrate the word clouds. Each is a visual representation of the most commonly used words. The size of the words are proportionate to the frequency of their use so the larger the font, the more frequently the word appears in the reviews.



Figure 6.7. Word cloud generated by Voyant using the Untappd reviews. Stéfan Sinclair and Geoffrey Rockwell, Voyant Tools, accessed March 29, 2022, https://voyant-

tools.org/?panels=cirrus%2Creader%2Ctrends%2Csu mmary%2Ccontexts&corpus=0d655c34bb984f75163 e77625ee594fc.



Figure 6.8. Word cloud generated by Voyant using the RateBeer reviews. Stéfan Sinclair and Geoffrey Rockwell, Voyant Tools, accessed March 29, 2022, https://voyant-

tools.org/?panels=cirrus%2Creader%2Ctrends%2Csum mary%2Ccontexts&corpus=e526896a6e236f41fa552100 69373498.



Figure 6.9. Word cloud generated by Voyant using the BeerAdvocate reviews. Stéfan Sinclair and Geoffrey Rockwell, Voyant Tools, accessed March 29, 2022, https://voyant-

tools.org/?panels=cirrus%2Creader%2Ctrends%2Csu mmary%2Ccontexts&corpus=ed2cc4d4ad871eebd9f6 407d89eb18e1.



Figure 6.10. Word cloud generated by Voyant using all reviews. Stéfan Sinclair and Geoffrey Rockwell, *Voyant Tools*, accessed March 29, 2022, <u>https://voyant-tools.org/?panels=corpusterms%2Creader%2Ctrends%2Csummary%2Ccontexts&corpus=734689e872e2ca6de87cc89a6b1f457f.</u>

Voyant also generates a descending list of the most frequently used terms, as well as a count for each term (see Appendixes D, E, F and G for a list of the top used terms). The word clouds and the list of top terms demonstrate both regularities and irregularities across all three websites. Additionally, it is worth noting that despite the higher word count per review in BeerAdvocate, their word cloud and terms are very similar to the others. According to the analysis, on Untappd there are 5,036 total words and 1,291 unique word forms; on RateBeer there are 35,698 total words and 3,356 unique word forms; and on BeerAdvocate there are 131,247 total words and 6,566 unique word forms. This should not come as a surprise because along with the higher word count in reviews comes a wider variety of vocabulary.

In his article, Price scraped reviews to create word clouds. When compiling the master list, he ranked words based on their commonality and removed all words that were "not adjectives or flavor descriptors" (2018, 344). I was specifically interested in the non-taste related language used in the reviews because I wanted to determine if it was relevant in taste making. As can be seen in Appendix G, however, despite Voyant's automated stopwords, some words, such as *bit* and *it's*, have snuck in and these do not contribute to an understanding of how taste is formed. Additionally, though descriptors such as *good* might appear in the list, there is no system in place to identify whether or not the adverb "not" was placed in front of them, subverting the positive meaning of the word. In Price's research, limiting the terms to "adjectives and flavor descriptors" (ibid.) allowed for a narrow, more focused list. My decision to keep seemingly neutral words, however, allowed me to identify what elements of the beer reviews are most important to constructing a sense of taste, and how these vary across platforms.

## **Understanding Voyant**

The analysis revealed that the top ten terms across all platforms are: beer, head, taste, bottle, dry, carbonation, white, light, aroma, and yeast (Appendix G). While none of these terms surprised me as a researcher with a qualitative knowledge about beer, their significance might not be obvious to those unfamiliar with beer talk. Probably no one would be surprised to see beer and taste among the top three terms. Both words are straightforward and are expected by readers when discussing of the taste of beer. The other term in the top three is *head*. Also known as foam, it refers to the foam that forms on top of a freshly poured beer. While even the uninitiated might anticipate that foam would be a point of discussion, those with knowledge of Belgian beers would be even less surprised. As Garrett Oliver writes in The Oxford Companion to Beer, many Belgian beers are bottle conditioned, which allows them to "often emerge with wonderfully complex aromatics, very high carbonation, attendant voluminous rocky foam, and a scintillating pinpoint mousse on the tongue" (2011b, 122). Until I encountered Belgian beers, I was accustomed to pouring beer a way that produced the least amount of foam and ensured the most amount of liquid beer in the glass.<sup>51</sup> This changed when I started working at a craft brewery and was taught to pour Belgian styles with "two-fingers of foam" as measurement; this translates to roughly 2.5cm or one inch of foam. My instruction was to be a little more generous than Garrett Oliver's advice that "the appropriate amount of foam varies widely between beer types, but "1.5 fingers" might be said to be average" (2011f, 726) but our goals were similar. Significantly, within Belgian beers, Orval has its own reputation for foam. For example, Michael Jackson writes in his *Great Beers of Belgium* that Orval beer's head fluctuates over time "[a]t four to five months, the beer pours with a huge head" and "[a]t one year, I have found it to be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Garrett Oliver also notes, "Many American bars serve beer with very little foam, leaving the beer looking soapy and unappealing" (2011f, 726).

very dry and perfumy, with a notable creamy head" (2008, 285). Understandably, for an American lager drinker or English cask ale drinker who is used to very little head on beer, the uniqueness of Orval beer foam is note-worthy and this is demonstrated through the beer reviews.

Several of the other most frequently used terms indirectly refer to Orval's distinctive foam. The first of these is glass. Orval beer, like many European beers, is meant to be served and consumed from a glass, and not straight from the bottle (see fig. 6.11). This helps explain why glass is one of the top terms used (Appendix G, no. 22). Indeed, Tim Hampson writes in The Oxford Companion to Beer that "In the central European beer cultures, especially in Belgium and Germany, matching a beer with its proper glass is considered de [rigueur], and every establishment has several styles of beer glasses conveniently positioned right next to the dispensing taps" (2011, 304). As can be seen in Figure 6.11, the glassware considered appropriate for Orval beer is an authentic Orval-branded beer chalice, although other chaliceshaped glassware, a Belgian tulip glass, or a stemmed wine glass also would be satisfactory (Oliver 2011e, 398). One pours Orval beer in a manner that respects its generous head, often times pausing mid-pour to allow the beer to settle before finishing the pouring. This results in the head rising elegantly above the rim of the glass. Other terms, such as white (no. 7), refer to the colour of the foam. Lacing (no. 50) is the lace-like residue from the head that builds up on the side of the glass as the beer is consumed and the foam dissipates.

*Bottle* refers to Orval beer's bottle which is distinctive not only amongst Trappist beers, but all beer. I have yet to see anything similar to Orval's conical, bulbous shaped, sometimes called "skittle-shaped" (Oliver 2005, 216), bottle among other brands, though the size of 33cl (or 12 US oz), is standard for Belgian breweries (Dornbusch and Oliver 2011, 151). Additionally, Orval beer is only served in bottles and is not available on draft. This contrasts to other large

brands or craft beers that commonly produce draft and sell their beer in easily transportable and impenetrable-to-light cans. As a result, the unique Orval bottle was a common point of discussion and distinction in the reviews.



Figure 6.11. Orval beer's label indicated how the beer should be served: poured into a glass, preferably a chalice styled glass. Photograph by author.

Another frequently used term was *dry*. Within the wine industry, *dry* refers to wines with "no perceptible sweetness" (Robinson 2015, 248), and the EU classification of sweetness levels strictly defines the adjectives dry, medium dry, medium or medium sweet, and sweet by grams per litre (g/l) (ibid., 71). Sweetness levels can be impacted by acidity, tannings, carbon dioxide, and serving temperature (ibid). For example, a dry wine is defined as "up to 4[g/l] (or not exceeding 9[g/l] provided the total acidity expressed as grams of tartaric acid per litre is not more than 2 grams below the RS [residual sugar] content", and sweet wines are "at least 45 [g/l]" (ibid.). A friend who is a sommelier explained to me that dryness can be felt in one's mouth after sipping the wine. If when one opens their mouth and breathes in after tasting the wine, they feel a retracting, pulling sensation on their teeth and gums, the wine is dry. With beer, sweetness is not as strictly defined as with wine although it is also perceived through mouthfeel and similar influences affect the dryness of both beer and wine. Dry is the antithesis to a sweet beer.

Carbonation appears as another top term (Appendix G, no.6). Chad Michael Yakobson writes in *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, that mouthfeel is perceived mainly through the "carbonation, fullness and aftertaste" (2011b, 598) of the beer. The carbonation of Orval beer is particularly high, bottle conditioned for a goal of approximately 10 grams of carbon dioxide per litre (Hieronymus 2005, 60). This is, of course, closely related to the *head* just discussed and the higher carbonation is typical in Belgian bottle-conditioned beers (Oliver 2011b, 122). The fullness of the beer refers to the "perceived weight and flow resistance of a beer" (Yakobson 2011b, 598), referenced sometimes as the body of the beer. The top term *light* (Appendix G, no. 8), references this weight, meaning that it is easy to drink. In contrast, a heavier, full-bodied beer could be perceived as syrupy due to its heightened sweetness levels and higher alcohol content (Yakobson 2011, 598). Perhaps one reason *light* appears so often in reviews is that despite Orval's alcohol content of 6.9% ABV, the lack of residual sugars means it tastes dry and lighter. Although in keeping with many Belgian beers (Oliver 2011b, 121), Orval's low amount of residual sugars result in a beer whose light taste surprises many consumers who expect a heavier taste given the high alcohol content.<sup>52</sup> Garrett Oliver notes that afterfeel can encompass the "stickiness, astringency, dryness, bitterness, oiliness, or mouth-coating characteristics" (ibid.) in the beer's finish, referring to any lingering tastes and sensations. He writes in The Brewmaster's *Table* that during Orval beer's fermentation, "[t]he sugar ferments out completely, lending the beer a light-bodied dryness" (2005, 206; also see Mosher 2017, 86). Oliver goes on to talk about pairing such a beer with food:

Orval is the perfect aperitif. Bone-dry, bitter and aromatic with a zippy acidity, it has everything that the French and Italians would look for in a predinner drink. It's mouthwatering, and few brews set you up for a good meal the way this one does. [...]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Michael Jackson writes, "The complex nature of this beer's fermentation, and its potential for the development of more alcohol, has at times led even the brewery to underestimate its strength" (2008, 285).

Because Orval has bright aromatics (lemon zest) and dark aromatics (damp earth and leather) in a unique interplay, it goes with almost anything. (Oliver 2005, 215-216).

Oliver goes into great detail about the various aromas and flavours of the beer as well as the broad possibilities of food pairings.

*Aroma* (no.9), another popular term, obviously relates to the sense of smell and is a significant component of any beer tasting. It is also one of the components of BeerAdvocate's rating system. Oliver writes, "Orval has a complex nose of citric hops, lemon zest, sage leaves, saddle leather, wet wool, and damp earth" (2005, 215). Jackson expands on Orval's aromatic qualities:

When the beer is not long out of the brewery, its hop aroma and flavour seems especially peppery and refreshing. At four to five months, the beer pours with a huge head. By six months, its combination of yeasts is beginning to impart some wild, Brettanomyces and lactic, lemon-zest, characteristic. At one year, I have found it to be very dry and perfumy, with a notable creamy head. (2008, 285)

The senses, particularly aroma and taste, are often intertwined and so strongly interconnected that consumers can find them impossible to differentiate. Brettanomyces yeast, abbreviated in the top terms as *brett* (Appendix G, no.40), provides a significant amount of aromatic components unique to this beer that is described as "horse-blankets," "floral," "earthy" and *funky* (no. 54; *funk*, no. 32). Yakobson writes:

One feature of Brettanomyces is its ability to produce certain acids. In the presence of large amounts of oxygen, acetic acid production can be high, as Bettanomyces oxidizes ethanol and residual sugars into acetic acid. [...] When using Brettanomyces for bottle conditioning oxygen is minimal so less acidity is produced leaving clean Brettanomyces flavors. (2011a, 158)

Though more common now than in the past, *brett* is still not frequently used in brewing; it is even more rarely used in primary fermentation. In the case of Orval, Brettanomyces yeast is added during the secondary fermentation and the bottle conditioning. Orval uses chiefly Belgian ale yeast which typically provides "spicy, fruity, complex flavors" (Oliver 2011b, 121). *Spicy* 

(no. 60), *spices* (no. 97), *fruity* (no. 42), *fruit* (no. 49), and *complex* (no. 36) are all amongst the top terms and their presence helps explain why *yeast* is in the tenth (no. 10) top term. Clearly consumers distinguish Orval for both its *brett* and Belgian yeast characteristics.

These top terms shed light on what is most striking and most valued by consumers even if they are more easily interpreted by the beer connoisseur with background knowledge. Many of the top terms indicate the most defining aspects of Belgian beer in general, and Orval in particular, and point to future directions for deeper analysis. It is also clear that many of the terms are interconnected which is an aspect I was able to explore further using Gephi's data visualization software.

### Generating Visualisations and Conducting Network Analysis using Gephi

Having identified the most frequently used terms, I next wanted to investigate their interrelationships using the Gephi application. To do so required building nodes and edges. Nodes are represented by a circle on Gephi and edges by the connections (or lines) between nodes<sup>53</sup>. Nodes represent the reviews and the top terms, and the edges were built between the review nodes directed towards the term nodes. These links were done by building two separate Excel spreadsheets, one with the nodes detailing their Id, the Label and the Category (table 6.1 and table 6.2). The review node Id lists 1 to 2100 of the overall reviews used in the study, starting with Untappd, then RateBeer and finishing with BeerAdvocate. The term nodes started with the number 10001 to clearly distinguish from the review nodes. The labels for these nodes are the top 50 terms used overall (see Appendix G.). The Labels provide a name for the node;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> On the Gephi diagrams, the nodes for the descriptors are large circles, but the review node circles are not visible on graphs because they are so small, but they are present at the end of the edges (i.e. lines drawing away from the descriptor nodes).
labels beginning with A identify Untappd nodes, B labels are RateBeer nodes, and C labels identify BeerAdvocate nodes. The Category includes each website name for the reviews.

The edges detail the edge, target, direction and weight of the reviews. The Source lists the review in question, as the Id is identified in the review nodes table. The Target is the Id of the term nodes table. The Type indicates whether the relation between nodes is directed or undirected. In this case the source is directed towards the target, meaning the reviews are directed towards the terms, in a one-way relationship. The weight indicates the strength of the relation between nodes; here it is indicated by the number of times a single review uses the term. Any review that uses a term once has a weight of 1, whereas a review mentioning a term three times would have a weight of 3.

| Id  | Label | Category |
|-----|-------|----------|
| 439 | B1    | RateBeer |
| 440 | B2    | RateBeer |
| 441 | B3    | RateBeer |
| 442 | B4    | RateBeer |
| 443 | В5    | RateBeer |
| 444 | B6    | RateBeer |
| 445 | B7    | RateBeer |

Table 6.1. Sample of the review nodes spreadsheet providing the Id, Label and Category of the nodes.

| Id    | Label  | Category    |
|-------|--------|-------------|
| 10001 | beer   | Descriptors |
| 10002 | head   | Descriptors |
| 10003 | taste  | Descriptors |
| 10004 | bottle | Descriptors |
| 10005 | dry    | Descriptors |
| 10006 | B6     | RateBeer    |
| 10007 | B7     | RateBeer    |

Table 6.2. Sample of the nodes terms nodesspreadsheet providing the Id, Label and Category ofthe nodes.

Table 6.3. Sample of the edges spreadsheet, providingthe Source, Target, Type and Weight of the edges.

| Source | Target | Туре     | Weight |
|--------|--------|----------|--------|
| 1103   | 10001  | Directed | 1      |
| 1104   | 10001  | Directed | 1      |
| 1107   | 10001  | Directed | 3      |
| 1108   | 10001  | Directed | 1      |
| 1112   | 10001  | Directed | 1      |
| 1113   | 10001  | Directed | 4      |
| 1114   | 10001  | Directed | 1      |

I generated four Gephi graphs that I then edited so they would be visually

comprehensible to the viewer. The nodes and edges of each graph are colour coded: purple for term nodes, orange for BeerAvocate, blue for RateBeer and green for Untappd. Additionally, because the edges were directed towards the term nodes, the term node size increases with the most edges directed towards them. This renders the most used terms larger, similar to the word clouds created in Voyant. In the end, I had 2,150 nodes (2,100 of the review nodes and 50 term

nodes) and created 20,238 edges. Once I entered the data, I ran the Giant Component Topology filter to remove all nodes that did not have edges. This left a total of 1,986 nodes. The first graph, Figure 6.12, is the result. When adjusting the appearance of the graph, higher weights shortened the length between the review node and term node and increased the size of the arrow. Due to the clustered appearance of the graph, I removed the weights which produced Figure 6.13.







Figure 6.13. Graph generated by Gephi featuring 50 term nodes, 1,986 review nodes, and 20,238 edges, without weighted edges.

Due to the continued cluttered appearance of the figure, I decided to limit the term nodes to help clear some space and make apparent some clusters. I chose twelve terms from the list of fifty; these were descriptive terms, either sensorially or contextually, and unique within the list. They included: dry, Belgian, amber, sweet, bitter, sour, citrus, funk, hazy, Trappist, brett and fruity. Once I generated the dataset and entered it in the Gephi, 2,112 nodes (2,100 review nodes and 12 term nodes), and 4,189 edges remained. Once again I removed all unconnected nodes; 1,602 nodes remained, creating Figure 6.12.



Figure 6.14. Graph generated by Gephi featuring 12 term nodes, 1,602 review nodes, and 4,198 edges, without weighted edges.

Finally, I limited the review nodes to the first 250 of each Untappd, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate, as well as the restricted 12 descriptive terms. This created 762 nodes (750 review nodes and 12 term nodes) and 1,148 edges. After filtering out unconnected nodes, 492 nodes remained to create Figure 6.14.



Figure 6.15. Graph generated by Gephi featuring 12 term nodes, limited 492 review nodes, and 1,148 edges, without weighted edges.

# **Understanding Gephi**

Gephi reveals the connections between contextual and sensory terms, and between online beer reviewing websites, as well as the strength of these relationships. Perhaps most obvious from these graphs, is the strength of terminology use on the BeerAdvocate website in the prominence of its edges, displayed with the colour orange, in Figures 6.12 through 6.14. The higher word count in BeerAdvocate renders the connections stronger due to stronger weight, meaning repetition of terms within reviews. This is a curious phenomenon that ties well with Brochet and Dubourdieu's study examining and comparing wine tasting corpuses; the authors write, "When the taster speaks of a specific wine describing flavors, he or she mainly uses a series of words he or she has used previously for this category of wine and is not describing the specific wine" (2001, 192). In the case of Orval beer, reviewers, most noticeable on BeerAdvocate, repeat words within the same review. BeerAdvocate promotes itself now as the non-performative, anti-ticking beer reviewing website. They distinguish themselves from other reviewing websites by having beer review guidelines (Alström 2017a) and a more detailed rating system (rating each sensory component individually to render a overall score). Though BeerAdvocate reviews might contain a wider variety of language overall (as seen earlier, Untappd has 1,291 unique word forms, RateBeer has 3,356 unique word forms and on BeerAdvocate has 6,566 unique word forms), the top words remain the same across all three websites. They are simply more frequently repeated in longer reviews, explaining these stronger connections (i.e. the sea of orange edges seen in the graphs).

When adjusting the graphs physically to showcase the stronger relationships between nodes, I was under the assumption that groupings or clusters would form indicating that particular review websites use certain terms more frequently than others. Instead, the graphs

formed a more spherical shape, even when modifying its contents from Figures 6.12 through 6.15. Even though BeerAdvocate had a higher word count and review count, I was surprised the relationships or edges with Untappd and RateBeer reviews were strong and frequent enough with the nodes to retain this shape, as they all use the same terminology consistently. A portion of this research was stimulated by reflecting on my own actions when tasting: that I inform my own tastings by looking up what others have said or written about the product I am tasting. I assumed that reviewers on these websites looked exclusively at other reviews on the website they would be reviewing on; an Untappd reviewer would look exclusively at other Untappd reviews for inspiration. If this was the case, I think more clusters of terminology, or even differing top words in the Voyant word clouds, would have emerged. This lack of clusters indicates one of many possibilities, including: (1) beer talk vocabulary is limited and therefore reviewers have a select number of words to describe the same product; (2) beer reviews are interreferential and even though different beer reviewing websites exist with different values and reviewing mentalities, reviewers look at all resources possible before building their own critique; and/or (3) beer reviewers reference the same outside resource. This last possibility suggests beer reviewers do not reference other reviews but might look towards renown beer writers, such as Garrett Oliver and Michael Jackson, and mimic their vocabulary. All three explanations assume that beer reviews are self-referential but drawing on my own personal experience, and witnessing how others build their own opinions of beer, I know this is true for at least some beer reviewers.

## Conclusions

The lexical analysis and visualisation of Orval beer reviews using Voyant and Gephi reveals key features about these narratives that would not have been evident through a close

reading of the reviews. James Abello, Peter Broadwell, and Timothy R. Tangherlini, in their article "Computational Folkloristics," argue for a distant reading, as described by Franco Moretti. They see this as a useful, complimentary approach to the close-reading regularly found in folklore and the humanities:

It is a particularly apt approach to folklore, since folklorists are not only interested in the particular features of a discrete text but also the much broader picture of how that discrete text (or performance) fits into the wide range of traditional expression through time and space. We endorse this view of the need to fuse close reading and distant reading. (2012, 62)

There are three main observations revealed using this methodology that help to further an understanding of beer reviews as a form of narrative. First, using Voyant, it became obvious that similar language is used across Untappd, RateBeer, and BeerAdvocate's Orval beer reviews. As can be seen visually in Figures 6.7 to 6.10 (alongside Appendixes D-G), the most used words in the reviews are repeated across websites. Twenty-three terms (42%) made the top 55 list of all three websites, of the top 55 terms of each website, Untappd shared 32 top terms with either or both other websites (58%), RateBeer shared 47 top terms (85%), and BeerAdvocate shared 45 top terms (82%). This demonstrates that beer reviews are not unique in lexical composition, meaning that a majority use the same diction to describe the same object, even across separate websites. This is reflective of research conducted by oenologists and linguists on wine talk mentioned at the beginning of this chapter. The researchers argue that wine experts use similar language when describing the taste of wine (Brochet and Dubourdieu 2001; Morrot, Brochet and Dubourdieu 2001; Solomon 1990; Silverstein 2003; Isani 2017) and that there is not much unique use of words. This is also the case with Orval beer reviews.

Second, even though words are similar across websites, there is a slightly higher lexical repetition within each website. That being said, I thought the distinction between each website

would have been a lot more obvious and that the top words from each website would have been a lot more distinct, represented through Gephi as clusters of nodes. In figure 6.12, for example, we can see that the lower left side of the graphs has a more prominent orange edge (BeerAdvocate), whereas the upper right side has a more prominent blue edge (RateBeer). Here, the weight of the edges is considered, meaning the amount of repetition of that term in the review is represented through a higher "weight" and a stronger bond between the review node and the term node. These stronger edges mean that "beer" has a stronger relation to BeerAdvocate's reviews, and "head" has a stronger relation to RateBeer reviews, proportionate to each website's overall word count. Due to the fact that BeerAdvocate had an exceedingly larger word count overall and word repetition, the graphs are by-and-large overpowered by orange edges. In Figure 6.15 where only 250 reviews are used and only the top 12 selected terms, orange remains prominent. All the same, the repeated diction and the subtle differences between top terms on each website does suggest that perhaps reviewers read other reviews before writing their own. Therefore, a reason for this repetition may be because reviewers are self-referential on their own website. These high repetitions also suggest that taste is often shaped socially, rather than in isolation.

Third and perhaps most significantly, reviewers use both sensory and contextual descriptors to evaluate the taste and quality of Orval. As mentioned earlier, research by Brochet and Dubourdieu (2001, 193), and Price (2018, 344) purposefully removed any words unrelated to sensory components of either wine or beer in their lexical analysis of reviews, deeming them irrelevant of the taste evaluation. These researchers see contextual terms negatively as factors that propel bias and therefore influence the consumers' impressions unjustly. However, by using Voyant and Gephi, one can see that these contextual descriptors are significant components of taste reviews. From the top terms indicated by Voyant and Gephi, it is clear which elements of

the beer reviewers draw on to construct a sense of taste. The qualities and descriptors most associated with the beer emerge. These top terms, even when not adjectives or descriptors, provide a better understanding of the components consumers find outstanding and focus on most heavily. The reviews support the idea that taste evaluation relies not only on the sensory experience of the consumer, but on an understanding and/or rationalization of the contextual information of the beer. Additionally, on Untappd where the word count is significantly lower than the other two sites (~9 words per review), contextual descriptors such as "Orval," "Trappist," and "Belgian," are within the top five terms. In contrast, the longer the review, the more sensory descriptors that are present, diluting the frequency of contextual descriptors. Does this mean that when forced to distil one's perceptions into the briefest of evaluations, reviewers find contextual descriptors to be more significant than sensory descriptors? It is unclear, however terms such as "Orval, "Belgian," and "Trappist" carry layers of significance and meaning, oftentimes transmittable to sensory aspects. For example, as seen earlier, a large white head of foam atop the beer and spicy yeast are both qualities associated with "Belgian" beer, and so describing the beer as Belgian not only assumes the place of origin and history of the beer, but also envelops certain sensory traits. Gephi graphs highlight a close relationship of sensory and contextual descriptors and how they come together to inform reviews.

Within the previous chapters of this dissertation, I focused on examining the meanings of the terms "Belgian" and "Trappist" and how they are significant to beer, in terms of history, tradition, but also in certain sensory attributes. By evaluating these reviews using Voyant and Gephi, it is clear that not only are both descriptive and sensory terms significant in Orval beer reviews, but that the term "Trappist" placed 4<sup>th</sup> on Untappd, 31<sup>st</sup> on RateBeer, and 50<sup>th</sup> on

BeerAdvocate. "Belgian" placed 5<sup>th</sup> on Untappd, 28<sup>th</sup> on RateBeer, and 11<sup>th</sup> on BeerAdvocate. Overall, across all three websites, "Trappist" placed 39<sup>th</sup> and "Belgian" 13<sup>th</sup>. These are commonly used terms in the beer reviews because they provide essential information about the beer.

Orval beer reviews are rich vernacular texts that reflect how people experience and construct taste in everyday life. Published online, they are largely informal and meant for public readership. However, the reviews are created for other beer consumers, as is evident in the unique diction, or "beer talk," that can only be fully understood by others with shared knowledge of the subject. The top terms used in Orval beer reviews highlight many of the qualities of Orval beer, such as the head and the yeast. These are deeply rooted in Belgian beer traditions. This corresponds to what was noticed by Brochet and Dubourdieu in their analysis of wine texts: "When the taster speaks of a specific wine describing flavors, he or she mainly uses a series of words he or she has used previously for this category of wine and is not describing the specific wine" (2001, 192). Similarly, beer tasters reflect on how Orval beer fits into Belgian and Trappist beer traditions based on its highlighted qualities. These references indicate how taste is constructed not in isolation, but as an informed and often communal event. This analysis suggests that tasters classify Orval beer in order to construct its taste, which explains a level of consistency in the qualities that are mentioned throughout the reviews. Our tastes are informed by our experiences and therefore depend on contexts to make sense of them.

Orval beer attracted me as a consumer, and as its eventual researcher, because it was a good beer paired with a good story. Looking back, I do not think knowing and learning about the context of the beer fogged my taste perception. On the contrary, I would say that it elevated it. Though some sources might overembellish various characterizations of Orval beer, an analysis

of the beer reviews demonstrates the complex relationship between taste and context. One does not necessarily overshadow the other but instead they both come together to create the description of a sensory experience. In the following chapter, I take a closer look at individual reviews found on BeerAdvocate to further explore the qualities that are important to consumers when narrating Orval beer's taste.

#### **Chapter Seven**

### Narratives of Taste: A Folkloristic Approach to Taste

Une bière brassée avec savoir se déguste avec sagesse [A beer made with knowledge is savoured with wisdom]

- Belgian saying<sup>54</sup>

When reading reviews, in particular those on BeerAdvocate, I began to notice trends and repetitions in aspects other than words. These similarities encouraged me to think more deeply about the reviews' narrative qualities. They brought to mind William Labov and Joshua Waletsky's foundational article "Narrative Analysis: Oral Versions of Personal Experience" where the authors conduct a linguistic analysis of everyday narratives. As I noted in Chapter One, within folkloristics this work helped inspire an important step away from the trend of analyzing texts with "long-standing literary or oral traditions" (1966, 12) such as myths and folktales. Writing about what is now referred to in Folklore as personal narrative or personal experience narrative, Labov and Waletsky began to identify their structural elements. They understood the narratives "as one verbal technique for recapitulating experience, in particular, a technique of constructing narrative units which match the temporal sequence of that experience" and function are referential and evaluative (ibid., 13). Over a decade later, Sandra Dolby Stahl argued for personal narrative's place in the discipline. She characterized the personal experience narrative as "a prose narrative relating a personal experience; it is usually told in the first person, and its content is nontraditional" (Stahl 1989, 12), and exists as a part of everyday storytelling tradition (Stahl 1977b, 19). The more I reflected on these definitions by Labov and Waletsky,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> This saying was told to me by Frère Xavier during a conversation on February 28<sup>th</sup>, 2019. Originally thought to be a proverb, Frère Xavier informed through an email correspondence on January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023 that it isn't a proverb at all, but rather a slogan used by the *Fédération des Brasseurs Belges* [Belgian Brewers Association], as a preventative statement against alcoholism and excessive drinking.

and Stahl, the more I felt that they applied to the reviews of Orval beer found on BeerAdvocate and that the reviews could be interpreted as a sub-genre of personal experience narrative.

Indeed, BeerAdvocate's reviews share many structural similarities with Labov and Waletzky's personal narrative, including an orientation, a complication, an evaluation, a resolution and a coda. The orientation provides context, meaning preliminary information for narrative. In beer reviews we see this in the provided date of when Orval beer was consumed, where it might have been bought or consumed, on what occasion it was consumed, and even the provided context about the beer, such as listing the bottling date and how it was served. Labov and Waletsky write, "The main body of narrative clauses usually comprises a series of events which may be termed the complication or complicating action" (1966, 32). This is the turn that renders this narrative worth telling. For beer reviews, it might not be evidently stated in the text, but the problem the reviewer needs to solve is to disseminate the taste and evaluate their own opinions on the taste. The beer reviewer's complication is answering the question, what do I think about this beer? The evaluation portion of a personal narrative, Labov and Waletsky argue, is what provides these texts their significance. The evaluation finds itself between the complication and the result; it establishes the point of the narrative. They write, "The evaluation of a narrative is defined by us as that part of the narrative which reveals the attitude of the narrator towards the narrative emphasizing the relative importance of some narrative unites compared to others" (ibid., 37). This evaluation is not strictly found in this section of the narrative but oftentimes embedded in other stages of the narrative as well. The beer review is obviously evaluative in its nature. When describing the look, smell, taste, and mouthfeel of Orval beer, the reviewer might hint about their opinions of these elements, such as not enjoying certain flavours, however it is mainly after having described the beer in its entirety that the true

evaluation begins, and this will result in the conclusion. Now, the resolution provides closure. The narrator resolves its crisis. Within beer reviews, this is made evident through the grading system and any explanations to their opinions in the text. Finally, the coda is sometimes present in these personal narratives, as "a functional device for returning the verbal perspective to the present moment" (ibid., 39). We find a similar phenomenon at the end of reviews. Usually the writer includes a send-off or bridges the review to the present instance. Based on these parallels, I argue that the online reviews share many structural similarities to personal narratives. In general, they are evaluative narratives describing a tasting experience.

Under the heading of evaluative narrative, however, reviews can vary widely, even when written about the same beer. For example, some like the following review by r-m-kaylor (2020), are packed with details:

Bottled on 1 April 2015, Best Before 1 April 2020...stored and aged in cellar conditions

6.9%abv (+/-) depending with whom you speak

Poured into an Orval Chalis (gifted to me by the staff of a nice establishment in Brussels) a murkey tan with interesting white to off-white cap of tightly bound bubbles which dissipated relatively quickly (as compared to a younger vintage)

On the nose, classic Orval highlights - pungent malts, yeasts and Orval Barnyard Funk (brettanomyces) which has taken center stage - front and center - reminiscent of a fine French Vin Rouge and Fromage - les pieds des anges, or the feet of angels, which can be off putting to some, but once one acquires the taste, one craves the taste - and this is only the nose...

The taste follows the nose up front, through the middle and back and a bit thin (an artifact of aging perhaps?), but a taste most delightful and satisfying...sediment/yeast cake remains...

Even though this is not my first Orval, the nature of the brewing method and aging always yields up front, in your face, tastes and subtle nuances which linger and beg to be savored and contemplated.

Another rewarding experience.

Thanks for reading....

Cheers.

Containing 203 words, this is a detailed account of the reviewer's consumption of Orval beer. The author elaborates on the best before date and the best cheese pairing. Other reviews are not as lengthy but provide similar details, such as this one by MisterRevPaul (2018):

It's got a weird back bite to it, almost salty. My biggest issue with the beer, the mouth feel is completely wrong for a trappist, it feels thin, that milky mouth feel is non existent. Considering the yeast, and it's definite taste to the beer I don't know what you'd call it but a trappist, but this is not even a La Guillotine let alone a Chimay

Both reviews identify contextual components about the beer ("Poured into an Orval chalice" and "trappist") and provide sensory descriptions of the beer ("The taste follows the nose up front...", "It's got a weird back bite to it..."). Also, both offer a personal opinion about the beer; r-m-kaylor calls the tasting "Another rewarding experience" reflecting their high rating of 4.53 on 5, whereas MisterRevPaul's review is more critical, noting "the mouth feel is completely wrong for a trappiest." Their negative response is reflected by an overall rating of 3.1. Finally, these reviews also contain performative aspects. The first directly speaks to the readers by including "Thanks for reading..." and "Cheers," whereas the second demonstrates their knowledge of beer by comparing Orval to Brouwerij Huyghe's La Guillotine and the Trappist Chimay beer. Even though the reviews express opposing opinions of the beer, and have a different length and approach, they share many similarities.

For the purposes of this chapter, I am looking particularly at beer reviews of Orval beer collected on BeerAdvocate; this is a corpus of 998 English reviews out of the thousand collected dated November 2010 to January 2021. As mentioned earlier, in comparison to the other two beer reviewing websites and/or mobile device applications mentioned in the previous chapter, Untappd and RateBeer, BeerAdvocate has a higher word count. Reviews in the corpus average

126.5 words. I chose to focus on BeerAdvocate's reviews due to their higher word count and because the site is the oldest beer reviewing platform. This chapter extends the findings of the lexical analysis and visualization used in the previous chapter. Here I continue to explore the importance of contextual, sensory, personal, and performative qualities of narratives that construct the taste of Orval beer and argue that taste is a story.

# Contextual

"Contextual" in reference to the reviews signifies all non-sensory traits ascribed to Orval beer that provide a context to the beer as well as how the beer was consumed. Dan Ben-Amos writes that "context" refers to "a broadly defined background of a composition or a structure, as well as to the parts that precede and follow a given passage" (1993, 209). Within folklore studies applied to narrative, this approach to context involves looking at the physical, social, and cultural circumstances surrounding an oral narrative performance. Here, I am approaching context not in terms of the performance of the reviews themselves, but rather am considering the contextual information provided by the reviewer about Orval beer.

As has emerged throughout this study, Orval's identity as a Belgian beer is primary. In the first section of this dissertation, I examined the term "Belgian" and its significance in relation to beer, first by detailing the social and economic history of beer in Belgium in Chapter One, and second, by examining Belgian beer tourism in Chapter Two. In the last chapter, an examination of top terms used in online reviews also demonstrated that identifying a beer as "Belgian" not only locates its country of origin but conveys certain assumptions such as its quality and flavours. As such, reviewers often distinguish Orval beer as Belgian beer or mention Belgium. For example, SierraNevallagash (2020) writes:

Smells like Belgium. It's an interesting nose. Some soft malt, some pale grains, some spicy, slightly herbal hops, and then just an explosion of Belgian yeast. Part of it is very farmhouse-inspired, nodding towards saison, while other parts lend more of a Belgian pale ale vibe.

Here the reviewer highlights the aromas of Belgian yeast and Belgian pale ales while acknowledging Orval's departure from the standards. Garrett Oliver writes in *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, that "in Belgium [...] top-fermenting yeasts tend to produce spicy, fruity, complex flavors, often driven by strong worts and very warm fermentation temperatures" (Oliver 2011b, 121), and the Beer Judge Certification Program (BJCP) *Beer Style Guidelines* identifies Belgian Pale Ale as "a top-fermented, all malt, average strength Belgian ale that is moderately bitter, not dry-hopped, and without strong flavors. The copper-colored beer lacks the aggressive yeast character or sourness of many Belgian beers, but has a well-balanced, malty, fruity, and often bready and toasty profile" (Strong and England 2022). Due to Orval's unique qualities, such as dry-hopping and the use of Brettanomyces yeast, reviewers often identify the beer as Belgian due to its place of origin and some particular sensory traits, while other times they acknowledge it as a departure from Belgian beer. Indeed, this comparison of Orval to Belgian beers, and an evaluation of how it does or does not meet the consumer's expectations of a Belgian beer, is often included in these reviews. DeFaz (2013) writes:

Some may fail to appreciate the beer because it doesn't have the high ABV of some Belgians, or the bitter hop taste of some of their favorite IPAs, but for what it is, it's just about perfect, and I use that word as sparingly as I can.

The uniqueness of Orval is seen as either a positive or a negative in the reviews, either praised for standing out or criticized for not fitting the profile or standard of a typical Belgian beer. In acknowledging the Belgian origin and flavours, some reviewers mention a desire to visit Belgium in response to consuming this beer, asserting this taste of place and need for food pilgrimage. BaryMFBurton (2011) writes: And, while it isn't my favorite Trappist, you can certainly add this beer to my list of "Reasons to Visit Belgium."

DrDavek (2020) writes similarly:

Between the artfully shaped bottle and my memories visiting Belgium, this ale provides a very pleasurable experience.

Reviewers confirm that Orval beer provides a taste of place, a taste of Belgium. As Stu Stuart, founder of the beer tourism company Belgian Beer Me! Beer Tours of Belgium, eloquently stated in an interview, "Every Belgian beer that goes around the world is a calling card that says, 'Here, come visit Belgium'" (Stuart 2020). Drinking Orval beer is a form of culinary tourism in that it is a "intentional, exploratory participation of the foodways of an other" (Long 2010, 21), but it also beckons Belgian beer enthusiasts on a pilgrimage.

Another defining contextual feature often found in the reviews is Orval's identification as a beer made in an Abbey; it is "Trappist." As discussed in the second section of this dissertation, "Trappist" is used to discuss the history and lore of Orval Abbey (Chapter Three) and acknowledge the specifications of the Authentic Trappist Label and perceptions of Orval beer's terroir (Chapter Four). MisterGone (2014) writes:

Very enjoyable, complex Abbey Ale. Caveat: I drank this while reading about the Abbey and the legend of Matilda of Tuscany, so my experience may have been artificially enhanced by the power of suggestion.

References in reviews to the Legend of Orval are few, however those that highlight the monastic place of origin and religious connection, as well as the long tradition of monastic brewing and the history of Orval, are frequent. It is worth noting that MisterGone expresses a common perspective in relation to contextual information about a beer: that stories about the place might bias a person's perception of the taste of the product. As they put it, their pleasurable experience of Orval beer might have been "artificially enhanced" due to learning about its history and lore.

Their comments acknowledge the impact that non-sensory information can have on taste. More often than not, however, reviewers identify Orval beer as a Trappist ale as a type of style, similar to how they would identify Orval as a Belgian golden ale. Monkist (2020) writes at the beginning of his review:

Hey hey ho! I think I'm starting to like Belgian beer! At the same time I think this rather classifies as a "Trappist beer" instead of a typical "Belgian beer" because it's just different - the yeast, the hops, the feel, the whole thing.

The term "Trappist" creates expectations for the taste of the beer. As discussed earlier, officially, "Trappist" is identified by the Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label and is designated by the International Trappist Association (ITP). Again, as examined in Chapter Five, this label ensures that the product is produced within the walls of a Trappist (Order of Cistercians of the Strict Observance) Abbey, undergoes supervision by the monks and/or nuns, and is a non-profit venture (International Trappist Association n.d., "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label"). MattyG85 (2012) writes:

There is a lot of talk about Trappist beers. It's a cool concept... beers that are made by monks, within a monastery that produce \$0 in profit. All of the money made either goes back into the brewery/monastery or is donated to charity. Now that is what I like to call drinking for a purpose! It's just funny to me to think that monks made this. Seems wrong. Oh well, I have heard great things about this beer... so let's see. It is the only beer this brewery makes, so it better be tasty!

Reviewers often equate the taste of Orval beer with all other Trappist ales, as HuskerTornado

(2018) writes:

Overall, a great example of a Trappist ale.

It is not an indication of the beer style though many Trappist breweries produce similar styles.

These are referred to in the Beer Judge Certification Program's 2021 Style Guidelines as

Monastic Ale, consisting of the Belgian Single, Belgian Dubbel, Belgian Tripel, and Belgian

Dark Strong Ale. Orval, once again, does not fit into this criteria, though it does share some

qualities. As such, there is no typical Trappist yeast or characteristics that define a Trappist ale. Rather, the label solely refers to the beer's producers and context of production. That said, because five of the ten Trappist breweries are located in Belgium, and they are amongst the oldest, it is not surprising that features of Belgian ales are often equated with features of Trappist ales. By describing the beers as "Trappist," reviewers distinguish the special circumstances in which the beer was produced (i.e. made by monks) or point to qualities associated with the Monastic Ale style or other Trappist beers that they feel Orval beer does or does not conform to.



Figure 7.1. Different beers are served in different glassware, appropriate to the style. Ideally, the beers are poured into brand of glass of the beer, meaning an Orval beer is ideally served in an Orval chalice. *Source:* "Belgian Beers." By Em Saunter [@PintsandPanels], Instagram, accessed August 23, 2021. https://www.instagram.com/p/CS6qcN9ruKU/.

Finally, reviewers often describe contextual aspects of where and how they consumed Orval beer. For example, many reviewers mention the bottle size and glassware type. MisterGone (2014) writes:

Pour from 330 into tulip.

The 330ml bottle size and the type of glassware used are often highlighted in the reviews. As discussed earlier, glassware is an important factor in beer tasting, and of particular significance to Belgian beer connoisseurs. Beer writer Michael Jackson explains in his *Great Beers of Belgium*, "In Belgium, every beer has its own glass" (2008, 18). This is also an observation I made when frequenting dedicated Belgian beer bars: each beer has its own branded and uniquely shaped glass, and the bars have an impressive stock of glassware (fig. 7.1). Some consumers purposely seek out the appropriate glass for each beer because they believe it improves their experience of taste. Weareallfalafel (2016) writes:

Poured from a funny shaped 11.2 oz bottle into (sorry) a wine glass. I don't have an Orval chalice, but perhaps I'll get me one now!

When an Orval chalice is unavailable, Garrett Oliver writes that "Belgian-style "tulip" glasses, and similar glassware styles have been adopted by craft brewers worldwide" (2011e, 398) as appropriate beer-tasting glassware. Or, in desperate times, "there is no reason for any hesitation to use wine glasses, which are well suited to the appreciation of most complex drinks" (ibid.). More ideal for many beer enthusiasts, as weareallfalafel (2016) notes, is to have the specific branded glassware of the beer being consumed, as it is made specifically for it.

Other than glassware, reviewers also mention where they purchased, stored, and consumed Orval beer. Under what circumstance they consumed it can also be significant, as highlighted by Bibendum (2012):

I have known Orval since 1979, when I worked for Merchant du Vin. It is a favorite beer that I rarely drink for reasons of cost. However I received 6 bottles as a gift recently that were dated 20-5-11. And to my surprise there was no peppery nose, instead the smell of bubblegum. I did not have to pour with great care to contain the head, in fact I could and did pour it down the center. Something I could not have done 3 years ago. So today I had one from another batch, this one dated 18-08-11.

Bibendum notes how they acquired the beer as a gift and what the brewing dates were on the beer labels. They also share the conditions under which they consumed the beer. In doing so, Bibendum and other reviewers draw on contextual features to create and share their own stories about Orval beer and their own unique tasting experiences of it. Though some, like MisterGone (2014), express concern that learning about the beer's Belgian and Trappist origins may influence their perceptions, reviewers routinely consider context within their Orval beer reviews, thereby reinforcing the importance of context to taste.

### Sensory

"Sensory" descriptions make up a significant portion of Orval beer reviews. This comes as no surprise, given that these reviews are assessments of the taste of Orval beer, and that BeerAdvocate asks users to rate out of five, in 0.25 increments, the look (appearance), smell (aroma), taste, feel (mouthfeel) and overall assessment. The individual ratings are then calibrated by BeerAdvocate for total rating out of five.<sup>55</sup> That BeerAdvocate has a much higher word limit in comparison to the other beer reviewing websites might be yet another factor explaining the prevalence of sensory information. The length was a deliberate decision on behalf of the website developers. As co-owner Todd Alström wrote of his goals in a forum post on the website titled "How to Review a Beer," BeerAdvocate "aims to bring some objectivity to consumer-based beer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> For more information on the BeerAdvocate's rating system, please see Altröm 2014a.

evaluations by using BeerAdvocate's rating system and encouraging a more thoughtful approach to rating and reviewing beers" (2014). The site provides explanations, examples, and tips on how to rate and write about each portion. It offers no direction, however, to include any information on contextual aspects of the beer. The structure of the rating system does influence the way some reviewers write and format their reviews, as the following post by duracell (2012) indicates:

A - Pours a bright golden color with copper hue and a very active apparent carbonation. The super creamy, white head has an excellent retention and leaves a beautiful lacing on the glass. The appearance of this beer is simply from heaven!

S - Smell is very complex. Dominated by yeast (clove, pepper and spices), it's also very flowery with a nice touch of sweetness besides some hop. I also pick out some dark fruits. A delight for the noze!

T - Taste is rather acid, quite lemony, mineral. I'm a bit disappointed since it doesn't feature all the complexity of the smell.

M - Medium-light body with very active carbonation on the tongue. It's a bit overcarbonated to my taste. The finish is quite dry.

O - Featuring an old school character, an amazing appearance and a great taste, this beer is such an experience. Unfortunately, the mineral and acid flavors are not my cup of tea...

Some reviewers use an abbreviation of the first letter of the aspect being evaluated, as presented

here, while others write it out in full. Still others opt to simply devote a paragraph to each

aspect, as seen in the first review presented in this chapter by r-m-kaylor (2020). While

reviewers do sometimes stick closely to this format, simply assessing sensory aspects and

providing their own opinion about the beer, they oftentimes embed the elements in a narrative, as

was the case when BaryMFBurton (2011) wrote about Orval's smell:

S: My first thought: wine. The grape and apricot sweets are so big that it makes this nose more comparable to a semi-dry port, or even sweet vermouth. There are some very evident beer aspects, of course, but they come mostly in the form of a bright, bottom-layer yeast aroma that only serves to enhance the sweetness of the front-end fruits. Apart from the sweets, there's a dryness that exists, too; however, it shows up completely in the back-end as the signature of a rich note of fine alcohol. A very pleasant nose, albeit in a different way.

At other times, reviewers capture their sensory experiences by making long lists of comparable aromas, as in the case of superspak (2015):

Aromas of big lemon, pineapple, cherry, pear, apple, white grape, hay, straw, pepper, grass, toasted biscuit, musty funk, light leather, and herbal/yeast earthiness. Fantastic aromas with great complexity and balance of fruity/funky/spicy yeast, earthy hops, and moderate bready malt notes; with great strength.

The sensory description of a beer is essential to a review as it provides key information about the beer but even within a relatively rigid rating system and consequential popular review format, taste proves to be multi-sensory and not reserved to matters of the tongue. Raymond D. Boisvert and Lisa Heldke write in Philosopher's at Table: On Food and Being Human, "Taste happens when tongue, nose, brain, teeth, lips - even finger, ears and, of course, eyes collaborate to converge on a foodstuff and take it in" (2016, 115-116). Reviewers share a personal representation of their sensory experience so that others might decide whether or not to try this beer, or to reflect on their own tasting experience. These accounts are highly variable in both the beer drinker's perception of Orval's sensory aspects and in their presentation of them. The variation underlines that fact that sensory aspects are not objective, but rather subjectively interpreted by the consumer. Indeed, as seen in the previous chapter, there is a high degree of repetition in words found within the 998 BeerAdvocate reviews, with the most frequently used sensory descriptors being head (look/taste; 1090 occurrences), referring to the large amount of foam that sits atop Orval beer; carbonation (look/taste/feel; 629 occurrences), referring to the taste and mouthfeel; dry (taste/feel; 571 occurrences); light (look/taste/mouthfeel; 562 occurrences), referring to the appearance and body of the beer; yeast (smell/taste; 534 occurrences), which can be smelled and tasted; white (look; 522 occurrences), describing the colour of the foam or head; orange (look; 446 occurrences) referring to the colour of the beer;

and so on. However, a reviewer can interpret any of these traits, such as the large head atop Orval beer, as a positive, negative and neutral attribute. Sensory words have a variety of interpretations. Randy Mosher writes in his chapter on sensory evaluation in *Tasting Beer: An Insider's Guide to the World's Greatest Drink*:

Each of us has dramatically different sensitivities differing levels of pleasure or distaste to the sensations. A beer that seems harmonious, pleasant, and balanced to one person might taste harsh and unpalatable to another. Our whole life's tasting experiences persist strongly in our memory, modulating every taste and sip. Culturally, biographically, and genetically, each of us is absolutely unique. We all inhabit utterly different worlds when it comes to our senses. (2017, 50)

Whereas duracell (2012) enjoyed the smell, they did not appreciate the "the mineral and acid flavors." BaryMFBurton (2011) shared a rich description of the aromas of the beer and highlighted their uniqueness; for them, smell positively contributed to the experience. Superspak (2015)'s tone is largely neutral but they do mention the "fantastic aromas" in their generally positive review. These examples suggest that sensory experience is just as biased and variable as contextual information; learning that a beer is fruity can influence a consumer's assessment just as much as learning that the beer is brewed in a monastery.

# Personal

Given that the Orval beer reviews are created for the benefit of both the reviewers themselves and an audience of readers, they are at once personal and performative. For example, the personal quality is found in the reviewer's expression of personal preferences, the informal nature of the reviews, and the change of taste. As noted, interpretations of bodily senses and rationalizations are deeply personal, however these are often expressed as sensory and contextual fact. I became particularly interested in how reviewers use personal aspects to construct their own interpretation of taste as fact. To revisit duracell's (2012) review, their extrapolation of the taste of the beer does not necessitate their approval:

Unfortunately, the mineral and acid flavors are not my cup of tea...

Duracell's perception of flavours are presented as fact, but implies that someone else's opinion might vary. The personal quality of taste is not only found in reviews, but proven in everyday experiences of taste. In the famous madeleine scene written by Marcel Proust in the first volume of *The Remembrance of Things Past*, titled "Swann's Way," the author is transported back to his childhood with one madeleine dipped into lime tea ([1913] 2003, 58-64). After the madeleine has successfully transported Proust, and us as a reader, back to another place and time, can anyone argue that the madeleine was bad and that Proust has poor taste? Because the personal quality of taste is often developed through long associations built on personal experience, it can be unnegotiable. Duracell's (2012) statement of what Orval tasted like, followed by their expression of dislike, is difficult to argue with. They did not like it. Orval is not to their taste. A review by Steve\_Studnuts (2018) explores their personal response, while also touching on the contextual factors that might have influenced the beer, and therefore their personal experience of it:

This is really quite magnificent on the pour; GIGANTIC fluffy white head that slowly dissipates. Had to pour three times to fit the entire 11.2 ounces into your standard pint glass. The beer itself looks like really cloudy apple cider (not the hard variety). My positive impressions stop there, however. The nose is just rough on this one. Lots of off scents; cat piss being the most egregious and repugnant. Tastes a little better than it smells, thankfully, but there's still something off-putting on the backend. I can't quite put my finger on it. This particular bottle was filled on 04/06/2015 and I'm guessing that has something to do with it. Belgians may typically age well, but a dusty grocery store shelf under constant fluorescent lighting probably isn't the optimal condition for doing so. Very disappointed (I love a good Belgian), but I'll have to sample this again before writing it off completely.

Steve\_Studnuts provides a brief description of the look of Orval beer, including its generous foam and orangey colour. However, other than cat piss, the reviewer admits being at a lost for

words, or comparisons: "I can't quite put my finger on." They decide to stop exploring the flavours and settle on the possibility that the beer was stored in less-than-ideal environment that this could have caused the flaws they tasted. Given their uncertainty about the beverage, they plan to try it again in the future. Orval beer is known to change over time, particularly due to the Brettanomyces yeast and the dry-hopping methods. When it is best consumed is up to the interpretation of the individual consumer, though as mentioned earlier, Orval recommends drinking it within five years of bottling. As indicated in the review, the environment has a significant impact on the beer's flavours, and factors such as light, temperature and humidity of storing and/or cellaring can influence taste. The beer changes over time, adapting to its environment. The same is true for beer consumers. FFreak (2014)'s is an interesting review in that it reflects their two conflicting views of Orval beer and documents their change of taste:

I've heard so much about this beer that I picked it up when I saw it on the shelf. Its not at all what I was expecting. Poured into a glass, the beer is highly carbonated, which is expected of a Belgian. What was not expected was the odd spicy bitterness that completely overwhelms the malt in this beer. I didn't find it pleasant at all. I couldn't even finish the bottle. Its like biting into a raw bitter cinnamon stick or something. Maybe I don't have a sophisticated enough palette. I've had trapist beer that was amazing, and some funky (brett) beers that I really enjoyed, but this beer has a different and not at all pleasing funkiness. Sorry, i just don't get it.

[EDIT] With the hype about this beer from truly knowledgeable folks in the beer industry, I could not believe that I had such a bad experience to cause the review above. I stand by that review and now attribute it to a bad or very old bottle. Due to my disbelief, I decided to give it another try. This time the bottle was labelled differently, with a manufactured date (almost two years old) and a best by date (almost two years in the future). That puts this bottle right in the sweet spot. This time I was thoroughly impressed with the beer and I see why it is so highly regarded. My numbers are readjusted to reflect the second tasting.

In the first review, FFreak (2014) captures their experience of Orval's sensory elements; they

describe the beer as being "highly carbonated" and write of "the odd spicy bitterness," and

"funkiness." These are presented as neutral facts, albeit ones the reviewer experiences as

unpleasant. In the update, the reviewer offers a different, more positive assessment but in doing so they do not retract any of their previous sensory notes. Though they do indicate that their first tasting might have been from a bad bottle, they do not adjust their earlier sensory description. Rather, they consider the second tasting as a completely separate event and assess the beer as pleasant based on their positive experience of it on that day. When a reviewer updates an earlier review on BeerAdvocate, they can either confirm or contradict their earlier evaluation. Sometimes the reviewer credits a change to their own "growth" as a beer enthusiast. This was the case for Ninjakillzu (2015) who reviewed Orval for a second time, nearly a year after their first encounter. They write in the update:

I haven't had this since I first got into craft beer, and the rating improvement shows my acquired appreciation and liking for funky beer.

Even FFreak (2014) notes in their original review that "Maybe I don't have a sophisticated enough palette." The reviewers reflect how taste is changing and variable.

It is worth questioning if the willingness to give Orval beer another chance is due to its high appraisal in the beer world. FFreak (2014) wrote that they decided to re-examine the beer due to "the hype about this beer from truly knowledgeable folks in the beer industry." Had it not been "hyped" or had overall high reviews, would they have revisited this beer? Regardless, it demonstrates the evaluative aspect of the review which is also a key component of personal experience narratives, as noted by Labov and Waletzky. Through their linguistic analysis of the structure of narratives, Labov and Weletzky determine that narratives must contain an orientation, complicating action and result, however this does not form a complete narrative; a narrative needs an evaluative component (1966, 33-34). Participating in the review means participating in a personal evaluation of the beer, further demonstrating how these reviews can be interpreted as a type of personal experience narrative.

Not only do reviews express personal aspects about the author, they also demonstrate that at least sometimes they are written primarily for the author. Reviews can be a useful tool for keeping track of the beers one has consumed and what a consumer did and did not like. All of this information could prove to be useful in the future. For example, many reviewers have typos and, generally, are informal. As texts meant to be read personally, but that are publicly available, they contain informal elements that distance them from the work of professional beer writers. For example, this review by ztaylor1 (2010) is typical of many posted in that it contains many grammatical and spelling mistakes and typos:

First belgian I've ever had. Don't know what to expect. Appearance-cloudy golden brown color with a massive tan head. Smell- light malts and almost a champaigne fragrance. Taste- sweet candylike malt into a bitter finish. Mouthfeel- very carbonated. Again, champaignelike. Drink- not my cup of tea, but a solid beer.

The informalities and minor errors are less important when the review is directed toward its author and is meant largely for them. Proper grammar is irrelevant. In a similar vein, any errors would not get in the way of reviewers conveying their sensory experiences and their opinions on the product. Errors or not, the review still successfully conveys their opinions, including personal aspects, such as this being their first Belgian beer and not particularly enjoying Orval beer. Robert V. Kozinets, well known for his work on netnography, wrote about online communities in an article titled "The Field Behind the Screen: Using Netnography for marketing Research in Online Communities." He notes:

Deriving from naturally occurring, communal, cross-consumer interaction that is not found in focus groups or personal interviews, netnography reveals interesting consumer insights, impressions, linguistic conventions, motivations, consumptions web linkages, and symbols. It [Netnography] provides feedback on brands and products that has not elicited in any way by marketers, eliminating the researcher-induced demand effects of these methods and of traditional ethnographic inquiry and interview. (2002, 70) Because the BeerAdvocate reviews lie at the intersection of oral and written speech, they potentially offer a relatively "raw" and unrefined version of taste expression, one more reflective of how everyday people experience and articulate taste. These "personal" narratives reveal something about the reviewer's perspective of Orval beer, and they do so in a wide variety of ways. They attest to ways that taste is both individual and interpretive.

## Performative

Richard Bauman defines performance in the introduction to Story, Performance, and Event: Contextual Studies of Oral Narrative as, "a mode of communication, a way of speaking, the essence of which resides in the assumption of responsibility to an audience for a display of communicative skill, highlighting the way in which communication is carried out, above and beyond its referential content" (1986, 3). The "performative" qualities of BeerAdvocate's Orval beer reviews emphasize the awareness of an external readership and in their function as an evaluative text. Reviews are intended to be read by others and, as noted earlier, are often composed in response to earlier reviews. Though the platform does not allow users to directly comments on other people's reviews, the performative qualities of reviews do highlight a relationship between readers and reviewers. As much as such reviews are meant to reflect on one's own tastes and judgements, many distinguish this readership by simply including ending remarks such as "cheers" and "thanks for reading" acknowledging the presence of others. Curiously, many reviewers go a step further, and performatively display the reviewer's own knowledge and connoisseurship about beer. The reviews can help build the cultural capital of the reviewers, which in turn can also heighten the credibility of the review. For example, Lanas (2020) offers advice to readers:

Orval. Another of my old favourites. If you do not store this correctly (leave in fridge for at least a day, and not too cool) it will explode/pour cloudy/have some floaty yeasty bits in it. But, if you follow the rules it remains one of the all time classics. Dry, hoppy, undertones of sage, spot of yeast, clear, rocky 'crunchy' head. It's utterly unique. One of THE best beers you can get - nothing compares. Pork eater - I shouldn't promote this, but THE perfect accompaniment to piggy wiggy. Oink for Orval. Pigs, quick, hide.

The review begins with an acknowledgement that the author is familiar with Orval beer and has consumed it many times over a long period of time ("Another one of my old favourites"), before providing a recommendation on how to properly chill and serve the beer ("leave in fridge for at least a day, and not too cool"). Sensory notes are brief ("Dry, hoppy, undertones of sage, clear, rocky 'crunchy' head"), however the reviewer does proclaim their fanaticism for the beer ("One of THE best beers you can get - nothing compares"), as well as a humorous recommendation for food pairing ("THE perfect accompaniment to piggy wiggy"). In "The Co-construction of Credibility in Online Product Reviews," Jo Mackiewicz demonstrates through reviews of digital cameras on Epinions.com, how reviewers use different strategies to build credibility in their online reviewing personas and help co-construct credibility amongst themselves. Mackiewicz argues that reviewers build credibility through co-constructed trustworthiness and expertise, either situated or invented. Though BeerAdvocate does have forums that allow for a more conversational post-and-response format, as found on Epinions.com, the reviews on BeerAdvocate do not allow for replies and discussion and therefore reviewers are unable to coconstruct credibility in the same way as reviewers in Mackiewicz's study. Visitors to BeerAdvocate can click on the reviewer's name to discover information about them but there seems to be no obvious engagement between reviewers in the reviews area of this website. So though situated expertise and situated trustworthiness might not be applicable in this circumstance, there are examples of invented expertise and invented trustworthiness. Mackiewicz writes, "Product reviewers invent expertise when they state or demonstrate that they possess the background knowledge needed to make valid assertions about the product" (ibid., 413). In Lanas's (2020) review, for example, they mention that Orval is "Another of my old favourites," claiming their familiarity with the product and then providing details on how best to store and serve the product. These proclamations assume experience on behalf of the reviewer. In addition, as Mackiewicz writes, "reviewers' use of technical vocabulary demonstrates facility with using relevant language and thus demonstrating knowledge about the product" (2010, 416). Lanas's use of beer talk vocabulary and expressions such as "Dry, hoppy, undertones of sage, spot of yeast, clear, rocky 'crunchy' head" indicate a familiarity with and expertise in beer. Both these components, the expressed knowledge and use of language, build credibility just as they do for Lanas's reviewers. The invented trustworthiness is created through the reviewer demonstrating "sincerity and honesty" in their review (ibid., 419). This trustworthiness is difficult to assess without commentary from other website users. However, as someone familiar with Orval beer and engaged with the beer community for years, I can attest to the review's trustworthiness.

Reviewers' assurances of their credibility parallel with how tellers of legends attest to their trustworthiness. Initially folklorists understood legends to be false stories (Bauman 1986, 11-12) but Linda Dégh and others pointed out that "belief is an inherent and most outstanding feature of the folk legend" (Dégh and Vázsonyi 1976, 119). Veracity may be questionable but rhetoric of truth is an underlying feature of the legend. One of the ways a legend might debate its credibility is through the narrator. Elliott Oring explains in "Legendry and the Rhetoric of Truth," that the narrator plays a significant role in the credibility of the narrative by establishing their judgement, authority, perception of risk, and distance between both the audience and the source of the narrative. Judgement is perhaps most prominent in BeerAdvocate's online reviews.

Oring names reflexivity, providing alternative explanations, the narrator's reluctance, confessions of ignorance, and testing to authenticate their experiences as examples of how narrators might demonstrate how their judgement as credible. In beer reviews, the reviewer might include contextual clues of their own authority on the topic, but as semi-anonymous reviews online, they must rely on their text to provide their credibility and prove their strength of judgment.

Though Lanas's review is brief and has a silly ending, it is trustworthy because the review appears to be relevant and enthusiastic about the beer. Brevity does not indicate a lack of trustworthiness or expertise; rather, sometimes the opposite can be true, as can be seen in this review from superspak (2015):

330 ml bottle into tulip glass, bottled on 4/15/2013. Pours slightly hazy orange/amber color with a 2-3 finger foamy and fluffy off white head with great retention, that reduces to a nice cap that lasts. Nice dense soapy lacing clings around the glass, with a large amount of streaming carbonation retaining the head. Aromas of big lemon, pineapple, cherry, pear, apple, white grape, hay, straw, pepper, grass, toasted biscuit, musty funk, light leather, and herbal/yeast earthiness. Fantastic aromas with great complexity and balance of fruity/funky/spicy yeast, earthy hops, and moderate bready malt notes; with great strength. Taste of big lemon, pineapple, cherry, pear, apple, white grape, hay, straw, pepper, grass, toasted biscuit, musty funk, light leather, and herbal/yeast earthiness. Good amount of yeast spiciness and earthy hop bitterness on the finish; with lingering notes of lemon, pineapple, cherry, pear, apple, white grape, hay, straw, pepper, toasted biscuit, and herbal/yeast earthiness on the finish for a short bit. Incredible complexity, robustness, and balance of fruity/funky/spicy yeast, earthy hops, and moderate bready malt flavors; with a great malt/spiciness balance and zero cloying flavors after the finish. Moderate dryness after the finish from the carbonation. High carbonation and medium bodied; with a very smooth, crisp, fairly creamy/bready, and lightly prickly mouthfeel that is great. Alcohol is very well hidden with minimal warming present after the finish. Overall this is an absolutely incredible Belgian Trappist ale. All around fantastic complexity, robustness, and balance of fruity/funky/spicy yeast, earthy hops, and moderate bready malt flavors; and very smooth and crisp to drink for the ABV. A highly amazing offering all around. I feel this is at it's best right around the 3 year mark, and this one was getting near to that age.

These long lists of sensory notes could be perceived as proof of knowledge, however, the

exaggerated use and extensive list could also be read as an inexperienced and clumsy use of beer

talk. As Mackiewicz notes in regards to reviews of digital cameras, using the proper language is not enough. One must use the proper language in the proper circumstances:

a reviewer might write a long, detailed review of a product, conveying a sincere attempt to be helpful, but the reviewer could confuse auto exposure with white balance bracketing or show that the reviewer does not understand what ISO is. Such error would negatively affect perceptions of that reviewer's expertise. (2010, 407)

Similarly, evidence of beer talk is not enough; it must be used properly. Superpak (2015) engages in the performative nature of reviewing, however their credibility and expertise might be considered debatable due to the review's exaggerated nature. As a member of the beer connoisseurship community, I find the overuse of sensory descriptors suspicious as it usually indicates uncertainty on behalf of the taster. It is possible that they want to use as many descriptors are possible to avoid missing anything relevant. Pierre Bourdieu's Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste emphasizes that cultural capital determines what constitutes taste, based on empirical research and ethnography conducted in France between 1963 and 1968 ([1979] 1984). Though some of the class distinctions are now dated and perhaps irrelevant, there are still visible parallels with today's taste making. For example, Bourdieu writes that the bourgeoisie are not as concerned with class and distinction as lower classes because they are taught and accustomed to this privilege. However, "the petit bourgeois or nouveau riche 'overdoes it,' betraying his own insecurity, bourgeois discretion signals its presence by a sort of ostentatious 'showy,' 'flashy' and pretentious, and which devalues itself by the very intention of distinction" (ibid., 246). Perhaps this is why superpak's (2015) review seemed suspicious to me; it has a performative nature that seems over-the-top in comparison to other reviews. Indeed, sometimes the performative knowledge completely overpowers any sensory aspects of the reviews. It is noticeable in Lanas's (2020) review and here in Beginner2's
(2016) review where even though their familiarity and knowledge of the beer is extensive, they

knowingly place all tasting notes aside:

This is a complicated beer to review. I've Had Orval at least eight times and now overhaul my review. But in reviewing the pros below, I am so humbled that I will forego the BA format and instead share the best of the books I still study.

"Michael Jackson's Great Beers of Belgium" reviews Orval for 7 pages. (This length has no rivals, certainly for just one beer.) MJ gives a great summary of Orval and its role in brewing culture. Too many highlights to quote. But a Highly Recommended read for ale students and Orval fans alike.

MJ's 1999 "guide" gave Orval 4 of 4 stars (I'm sure less than 2% of the beers in this book get the full 4.) And despite the book's pithy format, MJ also gave Orval the book's longest review.

And while MJ never stated his "favorite" beer during the course of his career, he once responded to that question saying that Orval was "quintessential." Perhaps that is enough to win the crown.

Reviewed also in Roger Protz' CAMRA classic "300 Beers To Try Before You Die!", he gives a detailed treatment of Orval's taste and history.

Orval also reviewed in the "1001 Beers To Taste Before You Die." Orval obviously deserves to be on the list and the review is worth a read. He makes the point that many think that no two bottles of Orval are the same because it travels badly, but that the ale ages well.

As for me, I had Orval at various intervals and have enjoyed it most at 2&1/2 years before its five year Best By cycle. (But I also cannot seem to keep it longer than 30 months in the bottle.)

So, the lesson is that if you like malt (as I do), then wait and the hops will recede. Like an old friend who is brilliant, I will always welcome Orval. But I suspect the key missing ingredient is my patience.

More important, I went on their website for the first time and it is fascinating. Should I put this monastery on my Bucket List?

I will return to edit this review, but I'm now keeping count on UnTappd.

Perhaps the most significant component of them all.

To take part in the community of beer lovers on BeerAdvocate means adopting the appropriate

language in order to fit in. To properly contribute to this discussion of beer, to provide a "proper"

review, means having a firm command of beer talk. This is a trained component to tasting that

has been widely written about in wine (Trubek 2009; Trubek, Guy and Bowen 2010; Gade 2004; Isani 2017; Solomon 1990; Silverstein 2003; Brochet 2001; Paradis 2010), as well as in coffee (Kozinets 2002; Goldstein 2011), cheese (Paxson 2010), and chocolate (Terrio 2000). Amongst the literature, Michael Silverstein's "Indexical Order and the Dialectics of Sociolinguistic Life" identifies fluency in wine talk, or *oinoglossia*, as a necessary step in accessing a level of connoisseurship within the micro-contextual surrounding of wine circles. He writes,

Within the complex pattern of class and other kinds of stratification, wine, a per-duringly constant prestige comestible, has been aggressively marketed to what is sometimes called "yuppiedom" or "the yuppoisie" (viewed through age, income, profession, etc.) and has seized the imagination of a wide sectorial swatch of people concerned with or anxious about mobility. As a comestible, this aesthetic object, wine, is, of course, consumed in the aesthetic experience; but its consumption is the culminating moment of cooperative performance art, to be sure, in which "educated connoisseurship" can be manifested while doing away with the artifact of perceptual encounter. (2003, 222)

With the rise of craft brewing and overall heightened appreciation for highly praised and priced beers, beer has gained a similar reputation. Perhaps because beer is still usually considerably more affordable than wine and does not maintain the level of elitism seen in high bourgeois arts, its performative value is more evidenced within the beer-drinking community than in society in general. The capital reviewers gain from acquiring and properly utilizing beer talk is generally only recognized and valued within beer-drinking circles. Indeed, articulating the tasting, in written form in the circumstance of written beer reviews, and properly using beer talk, authenticates and perhaps elevates the taster's status. Bourdieu writes, "As we consume the wine and properly (ritually) denote that consumption, we become, in performative realtime, the well-bred, characterologically interesting (subtle, balanced, intriguing, winning, etc.) person iconically corresponding to the metaphorical "fashion of speaking" of perceived register's figurations of the aesthetic object of connoisseurship, wine" (2002, 226; emphasis in original). Reviewers perform *beer talk* in their Orval beer reviews as a way to demonstrate their

competency or to become beer connoisseurs; they prove themselves worthy of creating a review. This performance can be read as either convincing or unconvincing, depending on the reader's interpretation. While readers' reactions can be difficult to predict, as discussed here, certain qualities of reviews render one reviewer more credible than another.

#### Conclusion

Dan Ben-Amos famously defined folklore as "artistic communication in small groups" in his article "Toward a Definition of Folklore in Context" (1971) published in the *Journal of American Folklore*. Ben-Amos reflected on this definition in *Folklore Concepts: Histories and Critiques* where he wrote about folklore's *artistic* component:

*Artistic* was not an evaluative but a descriptive term, indicating the aesthetic dimension of its performance. It is artistic by the very nature of its distinction from the quotidian forms of communication that we encounter in society. Using verbal folklore as an example, speakers discern the forms of speaking folklore by employing such verbal markers as opening and closing formulas, style and register, narrative patterns, and thematic domains. These markers distinguish them from other forms of verbal communication and subject them to culturally cognizant performance rules. Folklore scholarship engages in the analysis and interpretation of these verbal genres that are conceived as artistic by the community of speakers. (2020, 211)

When Ben Amos was writing in 1971, folklore was understood to exist in small groups within performative contexts and was identified as face-to-face communication (ibid.). Close physical proximity brought members of these "small groups" together and enabled an exchange of knowledge and face-to-face performance among them. With the evolution of technology, and particularly the internet, folklorists questioned the applicability of the "small group" concept as their exploration of vernacular expressions spread to groups that were scattered across the country and world. But not withstanding, folklorists continue to consider "artistic communication" essential to folklore. Orval beer reviews vary widely on BeerAdvocate in style and content, yet these texts contain markers that indicate reviewers are engaging in artistic communication with other group members. This is evidenced through reviewers' use of contextual, sensory, personal and performative qualities, as well as of *beer talk*. There are "culturally cognizant performance rules" evident in these reviews, such as formally writing sensory notes on each look, smell, taste, feel and overall, or informally such as including the serving glassware of choice and comparison to other beer of similar type. Just as with in-person performances, the performer/reviewer chooses whether to respect, reject, or imitate norms. This performative element, linked to persuasiveness, is also evident in other aspects of beer culture. As we have seen in Chapter Three's discussion of conversion narratives of Belgian beer connoisseurs, these narratives help establish the significance of Belgian beer in their everyday life through the telling of their first Belgian beer experience that triggered a life-long pursuit hereafter. Having an ethereal experience help prove their authority on the topic of Belgian beer.

Viewed through a folkloristic lens, these reviews emerge as informal expressions of taste; they tell a story about taste. Narratives of taste, which I define as personal and evaluative narratives describing tasting experiences, often contain contextual, sensory, personal and/or performative qualities. As a subset of personal experience narrative, these are informal narratives of a personal experience, but they also include components of belief and testimonies of trustworthiness, just as is found in legends. Online reviews are narratives that describe taste in everyday practice. They highlight the fact that taste cannot be reduced to only its sensory components; this is not the way people experience and express taste as an everyday practice. Rather, as has been shown throughout this dissertation, taste is constructed through narratives, sometimes, but not always, detailing the contextual, sensory, personal and performative qualities of product to build a story about taste.

#### **SECTION V: CONCLUSIONS**

Today is August 16<sup>th</sup>, 2022 and I am editing the first full draft of my dissertation. After writing hundreds of pages about Orval beer, I realize I have yet to write my own review of this beer. A slight anxiety in me worries I will no longer like my research subject, so I might get this over with. I head into the basement of my rental in London, Ontario where I have stowed away in the dark a box of a dozen Orval beers that my father generously bought and gifted to me. I bring six to the upstairs fridge, four in the fridge and two in an ice bath in the sink to quickly cool for a few hours, one for me and one for my partner. It's now 7:46pm, and I open the bottle with my wood-handle Orval-branded bottlecap opener. I bought this opener in 2019 during my second fieldwork trip to Orval Abbey. I was staying at the hôtellerie at the time and that included meals. Everyone sat at the set tables, each plate crowned with an Orval beer. The food was served by two monks, and then one of them made their rounds to each seat, opening the bottles of Orval with just one hand, with this very same wooden bottle opener. Funny enough, I was somehow skipped and did not enjoy an Orval beer on this first night, and I was too shy to ask in this quiet dining room once he had passed me by. However, when I saw the bottle opener for sale in the gift shop, I needed to bring it home.

Now, with a newly opened Orval beer in front of me, I pour it into my Orval-branded, chalice-shaped beer glass, also purchased at Orval Abbey's gift shop. The beer is dated 09/10/2019, with a best before date of 09/10/2024, close to three years old. The foam retention is noticeably weaker than I remember but it's most probably due to the age of the beer. The foam is off-white and the beer liquid is a beautiful copper-orange colour with a slight haze. It truly is a beautiful beer and, on this rainy and stormy evening, it looks comforting. I bring the beer to my desk and take my first sip en route, forgetting that I should wait to be in front of my laptop so I

can actively type as I drink. Finally here, the carbonation is prevalent, but definitely lighter than a younger Orval. Indeed, rather than a rocky foamy head, this one has a flat, thin half-centimetre layer. The scent is fresh and lightly floral and on the palate slightly bitter and hoppy and a slight funky barnyard taste from the Brettanomyces yeast. It's not particularly malty or sweet, it's just very... drinkable. Refreshing. Satisfying. It not only holds up to my memory but I am reminded how delightful a well-balanced beer is. Where other beers might try to be strong, sour, and malty, Orval makes a statement by being delicate and seemingly effortless. I take a while longer to look at the odd "skittle" shape of the bottle, the purple label with gold on the "Orval" lettering, the ring in the trout's mouth, and the small Authentic Trappist Product logo. I think back to my travels to Orval and am reminded of the overall calmness that I experienced at the Abbey and the generosity of Frère Xavier for allowing me to conduct my research on Orval Abbey and beer, as well as lending me his time and ear for questions. I am reminded of exploring the old monastic ruins, the Abbey's museum, and spending too much at the gift shop... and of all the time I spent thinking and reading about Orval beer. Now it is somehow coming to a close. This isn't my last Orval, but it is definitely the most satisfying.

#### **Chapter Eight**

#### **Conclusions: Narrating Taste as Folklore Practice**

Taste is an underexplored area of study within folklore scholarship. Though food has been part of the field since at least 1895 when John G. Bourke examined foods of Rio Grande Valley and Northern Mexico, and there have been examinations of cultural and personal preferences for food, folklorists rarely have directly discussed taste as a sensory and cultural experience. In its focus on Orval beer, this dissertation builds on the growing interest in beverages within foodways studies to argue for the importance of a folkloristic approach to taste.

I chose Orval beer as a research topic because I found it interesting. The fact that I enjoy its taste was a bonus. Learning about the Trappist breweries and noticing the uniqueness of taste and bottle of Orval beer made it stand out. Orval was the first Trappist Abbey and brewery that I visited, and frankly after Frère Xavier gave me the Abbey's approval to conduct research on Orval beer, it was an easy transition. My capability to speak French eased my research there tremendously as well so it was a natural progression. Sometimes I felt as though I chose Orval beer on a whim, but in reality what I found interesting about Orval beer were aspects that helped construct the taste of Orval, and provided an example of a folkloristic approach to studying narratives of taste.

This dissertation began with a discussion of the meanings of "Belgian" in the context of beer and the meanings that identification brings to Orval beer. Chapter Two explored the historical and economic history of beer in Belgium. Belgium's climate is ideal for growing ingredients for beer, local beer taxes literally helped fund war efforts to shape the country, and local laws allowed for Belgian beer diversity to prosper. Indeed, UNESCO's inscription of "Beer culture in Belgium" on its Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in

2016, states that "Making and appreciating beer is part of the living heritage of a range of communities throughout Belgium" (UNESCO 2016). It also states, "some Trappist communities have also been involved in beer production giving profits to charity" (ibid.). To further add weight, Belgium is said to be the home to three patron saints of beer: King Gambrinus, Saint Arnold of Metz and Saint Arnold of Soissons/Oudenburg. In this sense, Belgium is beer country.

Chapter Three explored Belgian beer tourism, focusing on the conversion narratives of Belgian beer ambassadors. Culinary tourism is "the intentional, exploratory participation in the foodways of an other" (Long 2010, 21) while alcotourism is the "assorted ways of travelling to drink, travelling while drinking, drinking to travel, and so on, that constitute an important but under-researched dimension of growing body of work on 'drinking place'" (Bell 2008, 291). Beer tourism fits somewhere in-between these two, as beer tourism is the intentional, exploratory participation of the beer culture of another. Here, I examined the narratives of Belgian beer ambassadors, Michael Jackson, Garrett Oliver, Stu Stuart, Charles "Chuck" Cook and Tom Peters. Through written and interview accounts they describe their first taste of Belgian beer. I drew similarities with religious conversion narratives which focus on a significant event that brings about a significant change within a person. These narratives indicate how impactful Belgian beer can be; its affect was similar to a spiritual shift in that it shaped the future of all the individuals. It helped set them on a path of pursing additional experiences and knowledge of Belgian beer. These narratives highlight the seemingly transformative quality of Belgian beer as a substance that can surprise, beg pursuit, and sometimes change lives.

The next section focused on another key quality of Orval beer, its Trappist origins. Chapter Four explored the foundation of Orval Abbey through legend and history. The Legend of Orval, featuring Matilda of Tuscany an iconic medieval figure, is referenced on Orval beer's

label through the depiction of a small fish with a ring in its mouth. The legend appears most places where the history of the Abbey is concerned and Matilda's fountain can be visited at the Abbey itself. This legend, paired with the monastic origins of the Abbey dating back to the 11<sup>th</sup> century, creates a rich story that balance prosperity and deterioration, as well as the power of the perseverance of religious devotion which was ultimately led by the Order of Cistercians of Strict Observance.

Chapter Five expanded the discussion of "Trappist" by considering the International Trappist Association's Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label. This is a coveted label only found on ten beers worldwide. It ensures that the beer is made within Trappist walls, under the supervision of monks, and that it is non-profit. All excess profit is donated to charities. These unique standards, paired with a reputation of monastic beers and the fascination of beer-brewing monks, renders Trappist beers highly sought after, praised, and often imitated. The ATP labels protects the living community of Trappist monks and ensures an accurate representation of their products in quality and ethics. Though Trappist beers have a variety of styles, their unique context of production makes them a terroir product and provides consumer with a taste of Trappist life

The final section explored the narration of taste through an analysis of online beer reviews. By exploring beer reviews, one can see how reviewers use descriptors of Orval beer to examine its taste and quality. Chapter Six looked at Orval beer reviews from the websites and/or mobile device applications Untappd, RateBeer and BeerAdvocate. After gathering a thousand reviews from each platform, I selected the English-language reviews and analyzed the remaining 2100 using Voyant Tools to discover the most common terms on each website and across all three platforms. I constructed word clouds based on these. Following this, I conducted a network

analysis and visualization of the terms using Gephi. These methods established a common vocabulary among reviewers and demonstrated that the top used terms and networks not only describe sensory descriptors, but also non-sensory, or contextual, elements. Online beer reviews prove that taste evaluations are not created in isolation. Nor are they singularly based on the sensory experience but also take into account the contextual circumstances of the beer production and tasting event.

Chapter Seven takes a closer look at the reviews on BeerAdvocate and examines them as narratives of taste. As a subset of personal narratives, these are evaluative narratives describing a tasting experience. They often contain contextual, sensory, personal and/or performative qualities. These reviews serve as illustrations of how taste is discussed in everyday life and provide specific examples of how beer customers understand the taste of Orval beer. I examined the top terms discussed in the previous chapter and further explored consumers' use of the terms Belgian and Trappist. These descriptors are used not only to provide context but also in reference to the sensory taste of the beer. Narratives of taste are stories that people build to explain their taste experiences and negotiate their evaluation of the product. In this sense, narratives not only provide individuals with a vehicle by which to explain their taste experience, they render the taste evaluation possible. Taste is constructed through narratives.

I believe my research and approach to taste through narrative has the potential to contribute to future folkloristic work on sensory studies, foodways, and computational folkloristic methods. Orval beer proves to not only be a delicious beer but a Belgian and Trappist product deeply entrenched in meanings that you can taste.

## References

## Interviews

Cook, Chuck. 2021. Interview by author. Virtual. March 18, 2021.

Frère Xavier. 2019. Interview by author. Orval Abbey, August 20, 2019.

Peters, Tom. 2021. Interview by author. Philadelphia. October 21, 2021.

Stuart, Stu. 2021. Interview by author. Virtual. March 15, 2021.

## **Beer Reviews**

Benjamin W. 2020. "Pass the Flemish gatorade." Untappd, February 2, 2021.

- Beginner2. 2016. "This is a complicated beer to review." BeerAdvocate, May 4, 2016. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=640</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- Bibendum. 2012. "Orval has changed." BeerAdvocate, May 2, 2012. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=348</u> <u>0#lists</u>.
- DeFaz. 2013. "Is Michael Jordan the best basketball player?" BeerAdvocate, October 4, 2013. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=236</u> <u>0#lists</u>.
- DrDavek. 2020. "This wonder Trappist ale packs a lot of flavor, good carbonation, and a frothy head." BeerAdvocate, June 27, 2020. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&Show=recent&start=1-0#lists</u>.
- duracell. 2012. "A Pours a bright golden color with copper hue and a very active apparent carbonation." BeerAdvocate, May 5, 2012. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start'348</u> <u>0#lists</u>.
- FFreak. 2014. "I've heard so much about this beer that I picked it up when I saw it on the shelf." BeerAdvocate, April 30, 2014. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=188</u> <u>0#lists</u>.

- HuskerTo<sup>rn</sup>ado. 2018. "Bottled on May 15th, 2018." BeerAdvocate, December 9, 2018. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=240</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- Lanas. 2019. "This was very rare leer in my country but somehow i find it despite is one of the best out there.." BeerAdvocate, September 21, 2019. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=160</u> #lists.
- Matt L. 2020. "This beer is one of the finest that is made." Untappd, November 11, 2020.
- MattyG85. 2012. "Poured from 11.2 oz bottle into a Duvel tulip glass." BeerAdvocate, March 24, 2012. https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=360 0#lists.

MermaidMomma. 2020. "A bit too funky and carbonated for me." Untappd, October 14, 2020.

- MisterGone. 2014. "Pour from 330 into tulip. Bronze-caramel with a massive beige head." BeerAdvocate, September 28, 2014. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=144</u> <u>0#1'sts</u>.
- MisterRevPaul. 2018. "It's got a weird back bite to it, almost salty." BeerAdvocate, May 30, 2018. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=280</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- Monkist. 2020. "Hey hey ho!" BeerAdvocate, June 12, 2020. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=120</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- Ninjakillzu. 2015. "Original Rating: 4.5, S: 4, T: 4, F: 5, OA: 4.5, 10/15/15." BeerAdvocate, October 15, 2015. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=840</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- r-m-kaylor. 2020. "Bottled on 1 ApriI015, Best Before 1 April 2020...stored and aged in cellar conditions." BeerAdvocate, November 15, 2020. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=80#</u> <u>lists</u>.
- SierraNevallagash. 2020. "It's Orval Day!" BeerAdvocate, October 4, 2020. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=80#</u> <u>lists</u>.

- Steve\_Studnuts. 2018. "This is really quite magnificent on the pour; GIGANTIC fluffy white head that slowly dissipates." BeerAdvocate, September 27, 2018. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=240</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- superspak. 2015. "330 ml bottle into tulip glass, bottled on 4/15/2013." BeerAdvocate, September 26, 2015. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=840</u> <u>#lists</u>.
- t0rin0. 2016. "9:35 AM on a Tuesday." RateBeer, October 4, 2016. https://www.ratebeer.com/beer/orval/835/73230/.
- weareallfalafel. 2016. "Poured from a funny shaped 11.2 oz bottle into (sorry) a wine glass." BeerAdvocate, October 30, 2016. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=Beer&show=recent&start=52</u> <u>0#lists</u>.
- ztaylor1. 2010. "First belgian I've ever had." BeerAdvocate, November 24, 2010. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/beer/profile/37/129/?view=beer&show=recent&start=432</u> <u>0#lists</u>.
- ++gary++. 2020. "Bottle no 2# heaven knows I'm miserable now." Untappd, October 28, 2020.

# **Secondary Sources**

- Abbaye d'Orval. 2015. Orval: Abbey. Villers-devant-Orval: Abbaye d'Orval.
- Abbaye de Saint-André. 1947. "Le Grand Oeuvre de l'Abbaye d'Orval." Special issue, L'Artisan et Liturgiques: Revue trimestrielle d'art sacré publiée par les Bénédictins de l'Abbaye de Saint-André no. 2-3.
- Abello, James, Peter Broadwell, and Timothy R. Tangherlini. 2012. "Computational Folkloristics." *Communications of the ACM* 55, no. 7 (July): 60-70. https://doi.org/10.1145/2209249.2209267.
- ABInBev. 2020. 2020 Annual Report. Accessed February 16, 2022. <u>https://www.ab-inbev.com/content/dam/abinbev/news-media/press-</u>releases/2021/02/AB%20InBev%202020%20Annual%20Report\_FINALpdf.pdf.
- Adams, Walter Radolph. 1980. "The Interaction of Caffeine and Alcohol in Native American Populations." *Digest: A Journal of Foodways and Cuklture* 3, no. 1: 23-44.
- Adler, Thomas A. 1988. "Bluegrass Music and Meal-Fries Potatoes: Food, Festival, Community." In *We Gather Together: Food and Festival in American Life*, edited by

Theodore C. Humphrey and Lin T. Humphrey, 195-204. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press.

- Albala, Ken. 2012. "Cookbook as Historical Documents." In *The Oxford Handbook of Food History*, edited by Jeffrey M. Pilcher, 227-40. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Albala, Ken and Trudy Eden, eds. 2011. *Food & Faith in Christian Culture*. New York: Columbia University.
- Allen, Barbara. 1989. "Personal Experience Narratives: Use and Meaning in Interaction." In *Folk Groups and Folklore Genres: A Reader*, edited by Elliott Oring, 237-43. Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Alström, Todd [Todd]. 2014a. "BeerAdvocate Ratings, Explained." *BeerAdvocate*, June 5, 2014. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/community/threads/beeradvocate-ratings-</u> <u>explained.184726/</u>.
- ------. 2021. "The Year in Beer: Breaking Down 2020." *BeerAdvocate*, February 1, 2021. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/articles/18304/the-year-in-beer-breaking-down-2020/</u>.
- Amez, Frédéric. 2013. Guide à l'attention de l'impétrant de la Régionale bruxelloise des Étudiants Louvanistes. Updated ed. Brussels: Régionale Bruxelloise des Étudiants Louvanistes. <u>https://bruxelloiselln.be/wp-</u> content/medias/BXL Guide impetrant 2014 2015.pdf.
- Anderson, Benedict. [1983] 2016. Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism. London: Verso.
- Anderson, Jay. 1971. "The Study of Contemporary Foodways in American Folklife Research." *Keystone Folklore Quarterly* 16: 155-63.
- Aoyama, Yuko. 2006. "The Role of Consumption and Globalization in a Cultural Industry: The Case of Flamenco." *Geoforum* 38, no. 1: 103-13. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2006.07.004.
- Appadurai, Arjun. 1990. "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy." *Theory, Culture & Society* 7, no. 2-3: 295-310. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/026327690007002017</u>.
- ———. 1996. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Atkins, P.J., and Ian R. Bowler, eds. 2001. *Food in Society: Economy, Culture and Geography.* London: Arnold.

- Avery, Zak. 2011. "ticking." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 793. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Bamforth, Charles W. 2011. "boiling." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 141-2. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Bard, Marjorie. 1986. "Of Memories, Memorabilia, Personal Narratives: Life Events in Introspect and Retrospect." *Folklore and Mythology Studies* 10: 42-51.
- Barham, Elizabeth. 2003. "Translating Terroir: The Global Challenge of French AOC Labeling." *Journal of Rural Studies* 19: 127-38. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0743-0167(02)00052-9</u>.
- Barjamovic, Gojko, Patricia Jurado Gonzalez, Chelsea A. Graham, Agnete W. Lassen, Nawal Nasrallah, and Pia M. Sörensen. 2019. "The Ancient Mespotamian Tablet as Cookbook: Kitchen-tested recipes from four thousand years ago for your dinner party." *Lapham's Quarterly* (June 11). <u>https://www.laphamsquarterly.org/roundtable/ancientmesopotamian-tablet-cookbook.</u>
- Barleypop. 2010. "Beer Review: Orval Trappist Ale." June 10, 2010. http://www.barleypop.com/orval-trappist-ale/.
- Barlow, Matthew A., J. Cameron Verhaal, and Jake D. Hoskins. 2018. "Guilty by Association: Product-Level Category Stigma and Audience Expectations in the U.S. Craft Beer Industry." *Journal of Management* 44, no. 7: 2934-60. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206316657593</u>.
- Bastian, Mathieu, Sebastien Heymann, and Mathieu Jacomy. 2009. "Gephi: An Open Source Software for Exploring and Manipulating Networks." International AAAI Conference on Weblogs and Social Media. http://www.aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICWSM/09/paper/view/154.
- Bauman, Richard. 1986. *Story, Performance, and Event: Contextual Studies of Oral Narrative.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Belasco, Warren James, ed. 2008. Food: The Key Concepts. Oxford: Berg.
- Belgian Brewers. 2019. Annual Report 2019. Brussels: Brewers' House. http://www.belgianbrewers.be/en/economy/article/annual-report.
  - -----. n.d.a. "Who are we?". Accessed June 25, 2021. <u>http://www.belgianbrewers.be/en/who-are-we/</u>.
    - . n.d.b. "Collective marks." Accessed February 16, 2022.
      <u>http://www.belgianbrewers.be/en/beer-culture/the-art-of-beer/article/collective-marks.</u>

- Bell, David. 2008. "Destination Drinking: Toward a Research Agenda on Alcotourism." *Drugs: Education, Prevention and Policy* 15, no. 3: 291-304. https://doi.org/10.1080/09687630801934089.
- Bell, David, and Gill Valentine, eds. 1997. Consuming Geographies: We Are Where We Eat. London: Routledge.
- Ben-Amos, Dan. 1971. "Toward a Definition of Folklore in Context." *Journal of American Folklore* 84, no. 33: 3-15. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/539729</u>.
- ———. 2020. "A Definition of Folklore: A Personal Narrative." In *Folklore Concepts: Histories and Critiques*, edited by Dan Ben-Amos, Henry Glassie, and Elliott Oring, 203-23. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Bendix, Regina. 1997. In Search of Authenticity: The Formation of Folklore Studies. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Bentley, Amy, ed. 2019. "Sensory Labor: Considering the Work of Taste in the Food System." Special issue, *Food, Culture & Society* 22, no. 2: 141. https://doi.org/10.1080/15528014.2019.1575586.
- Bérard, Laurence and Philippe Marchenay. 1995. "Lieux, temps et preuves: La construction sociale des produits de terroir." *Terrain* 24 (March): 153-164.

——. 2000. "A Market Culture: *Produits de Terroir* or Selling of Heritage." In *Recollections of France: Memories, Identities and Heritage in Contemporary France*, edited by Sarah Blowen, Marion Demossier, and Jeanine Picard, 154-67. New York: Berghahn Books.

- Berger, Arthur Asa. 2004. Ads, Fads, and Consumer Culture: Advertising's Impact on American Character and Society. 2nd ed. Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.
- Beriss, David, and David E. Sutton. 2007. *The Restaurant Book: Ethnographies of Where We Eat*. Oxford: Berg.
- Besky, Sarah. 2013. *The Darjeeling Distinction: Labor and Justice in Fair-Trade Tea Plantations in India.* Berkeley: University of California Press.
- . 2014. "The Labor of Terroir and the Terroir of Labor: Geographical Indication and Darjeeling Tea Plantations." *Agriculture and Human Values* 31: 83-96. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10460-013-9452-8</u>.

-. 2020. *Tasting Qualities: The Past and Future of Tea.* Oakland: University of California Press.

- Besky, Sarah, and Sandy Brown. 2015. "Looking for Work: Placing Labor in Food Studies." *Labor: Studies in Working Class History of the Americas* 12 no. 1-2: 19-43. <u>https://doi.org/10.1215/15476715-2837484</u>.
- Biesecker, Susan. 2008. "Heritage Versus History: Amish Tourism in Two Ohio Towns." In *The Amish and the Media*, edited by Diane Zimmerman Umble and Daniel L. Weaver-Zercher, 111-30. Baltimore, MD: The John Hopkins University Press.

Blake, Victoria Carollo. 2011. "hops." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 459-65. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Blank, Trevor J. 2009. *Folklore and the Internet: Vernacular Expression in a Digital World.* Logan: Utah State University.
- ———. 2012. Folk Culture in the Digital Age: The Emergent Dynamics of Human Interaction. Logan: Utah State University.
- ———. 2014. *Toward a Conceptual Framework for the Study of Folklore and the Internet.* Boulder: University Press of Colorado.
- ———. 2015. "Faux Your Entertainment: Amazon.com Product Reviews as a Locus of Digital Performance." *Journal of American Folklore* 128, no. 509: 286-97. <u>https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.128.509.0286</u>.
- Blank, Trevor J., and Lynne S. McNeill, eds. 2018. *Slender Man is Coming: Creepypasta and Contemporary Legends on the Internet*. Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Bogucki, Peter. 1996. "The Spread of Early Farming in Europe." *American Scientist* 84, no. 3: 242-253. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/29775670</u>.
- Boisvert, Raymond D. 2014. *I Eat, Therefore I Think: Food and Philosophy*. Lanham, MA: Farleigh Dickinson University Press.
- Boisvert, Raymond D., and Lisa Heldke. 2016. *Philosophers at Table: On Food and Being Human*. Islington, UK: Reaktion Books.
- Borland, Katherine. 1991. "That's not what I said.": Interpretive Conflict in Oral Narrative Research." In *Women's Words: The Feminist Practice of Oral History*, edited by Sherna Berger Gluck and Daphne Parai, 63-75. New York: Routledge.
- Borland, Katherine, Patricia Sawin, and Diane Tye, eds. 2017. "Introduction: Difference and Dialogism in Family Narratives." Special issue, *Journal of American Folklore* 130, no. 518: 377-93. <u>https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.130.518.0377</u>.

- Bottéro, Jean. 1987. "The Culinary Tablets at Yale." *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 107, no. 1: 11-19. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/602948</u>.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. [1979] 2010. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste.* Translated by Richard Nice. London: Routledge.
- Bourke, John G. 1895. "The Folk-Foods of the Rio Grande Valley and of Northern Mexico." *The Journal of American Folklore* 8, no. 28: 41-71. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/533082</u>.
- Brasserie d'Orval. 2012. Orval: Presentation of the Abbey Brewery. Villers-devant-Orval: Brasserie d'Orval.
- Brenneis, Donald L. 1993. "Some Contributions of Folklore to Social Theory: Aesthetics and Politics in a Translocal World." *Western Folklore* 52, no. 2/4: 291-302. https://doi.org/10.2307/1500091.
- Brenner, Thomas S. 2004. *Blessed with Tourists: The Borderlands of Religion and Tourism in San Antonio.* Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Brewer, Teri, ed. 1994. "The Marketing of Tradition: Perspectives on Folklore, Tourism and Heritage Industry." Special issue, *Folklore in Use: Applications in the Real World* 2, no. 1. Enfield Lock: Hisarlik Press.
- Brewers Association. n.d. "Craft Brewer Definition." Accessed February 10, 2023. <u>https://www.brewersassociation.org/statistics-and-data/craft-brewer-definition/</u>.
- . n.d. "Craft Beer Industry Market Segments." Accessed February 10, 2023. <u>https://www.brewersassociation.org/statistics-and-data/craft-beer-industry-market-segments/</u>.
- Brewers of Europe. n.d. "Country Profiles." Accessed June 25, 2021. https://brewersofeurope.org/site/countries/key-facts-figures.php.
- Briggs, Charles L. 2016. Making Health Public: How News Coverage Is Remaking Media, Medicine, and Contemporary Life. New York: Routledge.
- Briggs, Charles L. and Richard Bauman. 2003. Voices of Modernity: Language Ideologies and the Politics of Inequality. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brillat-Savarin, Jean Anthelme. [1825] 1843. *Physiologie du goût*. Paris: Garnier Frères. HathiTrust. <u>https://hdl.handle.net/2027/uc1.c024933539</u>.
- Bringeus, Nils-Arvid. 1971. Man, Food, Milieu: A Swedish Approach to Food Ethnology. Edinburgh: Tuckwell Press.

- Broadwell, Peter M., and Timothy R. Tangherlini. 2016. "WitchHunter: Tools for Geo-Semantic Exploration of a Danish Folklore Corpus." *Journal of American Folklore* 129, no. 511: 14-42. <u>https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.129.511.0014</u>.
- Brochet, Frederic. 2001. "Wine Descriptive Language Supports Cognitive Specificity of Chemical Senses." *Brain and Language* 77, no. 2: 187-96. https://doi.org/10.1006/brln.2000.2428.
- Brown, Linda Keller, and Kay Mussell, eds. 1984. *Ethnic and Regional Foodways in the United States: The Performance of Group Identity.* Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.
- Brown, Martyn. 2013. "Cider Making in the Channel Islands." *Journal of Ethnological Studies* 25, no. 1: 100-5. <u>https://doi.org/10.1179/flk.1986.25.1.100</u>.
- Brown, Pete. 2011. "pilsner." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 651-652. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Brulotte, Ronda L., Michael A. Di Giovine, eds. 2014. *Edible Identities: Food as Cultural Heritage*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Bruner, J. S. 1957. "On Perceptual Readiness." *Psychological Review* 64, no. 2: 123-52. https://doi.org/10.1037/h0043805.
- Brunvand, Jan Harold. 1978. *The Study of American Folklore: An Introduction*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- ———. 2003. *The Vanishing Hitchhiker: American Urban Legends and Their Meanings*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Buell, Paul D., and Eugene N. Anderson. 2010. A Soup for the Qan: Chinese Dietary Medicine of the Mongol Era; As Seen in Hu Sihiu's Yinshan Zhengyao. Leiden: Brill.
- Burton, Janet and Julie Kerr. 2011. *The Cistercians in the Middle Ages*. Woodbridge, UK: The Boydell Press.
- Bussen, Therese. 2015. "25 Patron Saints of Really Random Things." *Focus: Fellowship of Catholic University Students*. November 2, 2015. <u>https://focusequip.org/25-patron-saints-of-really-random-things/</u>.
- Byrne, Joseph. 2004. "Matilda of Canossa." In *Great Lives of History: The Middle Ages*, edited by Shelley Wolbrink. Pasadena: Salem Press. CREDO Reference.
- Byrne, Pat. 1997. "Booze, Ritual and the invention of Tradition: The Phenomenon of the Newfoundland Screech-In." In *Usable Pasts: Traditions and Group Expressions in North America*, edited by Tad Tuleja, 232-48. Logan: Utah State University,

- Camp, Charles. 1989. American Food Ways: What, When, Why, and How We Eat in America. Little Rock, AS: August House.
- Cang, Voltaire. 2018. "Japan's Washoku as Intangible Heritage: The Role of National Food Traditions in UNESCO's Cultural Heritage Scheme." *International Journal of Cultural Property* 25, no. 4: 491-513. <u>https://doi.org/10.1017/S0940739118000267</u>.
- Cantwell, Dick. 2011a. "Gambrinus, Jan," In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 383-384. New York: Oxford University Press.
- ———. 2011b. "gruit." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 410-411. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Carroll, Glenn R., and Anand Swaminathan. 2000. "Why the Microbrewery Movement? Organizational Dynamics in the US Brewing Industry." *American Journal of Sociology* 106, no. 3: 715-62. <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/318962</u>.
- Cashman, Ray. 2006. "Critical Nostalgia and Material Culture in Northern Ireland." Journal of *American Folklore* 119, no. 472: 137-60. <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.2006.0016</u>.
- Cassagnes-Brouquet, Sophie. 2014. "In the Service of the Just War: Matilda of Tuscany (eleventh-twelfth centuries). In "Gendered Laws of War," translated by Michèle Greer. *Clio: Women, Gender, History* 39. <u>https://doi.org/10.4000/cliowgh.454</u>.
- Cavan, Sherri. 1966. Liquor License: An Ethnography of Bar Behavior. Chicago, IL: Aldine.
- Charters, Stephen, Nathalie Spielmann, and Barry J. Babin. 2017. "The Nature and Value of Terroir Products." *European Journal of Marketing* 51, no. 4: 748-71. http://doi.org/10.1108/EJM-06-2015-0330.
- Cilurzo, Vincent. 2011. "sour beer." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 743-745. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Clark, Les, director. 1958. Paul Bunyan. Walt Disney Productions.
- Classen, Constance. 1993. Worlds of Sense: Exploring the Senses in History across Cultures. London: Routledge.
  - ———. 1997. "Foundations for an Anthropology of the Senses." *International Social Science Journal* 49, no. 3: 401-12.
- Cook, Chuck D., a-d Carl Kins. 2013. "The Trappists "O Brother, where are thou?"" *Belgian Beer Specialist* (blog). Published on December 29, 2013. <u>http://drinkbelgianbeer.com/news/the-trappists-o-brother-where-are-thou</u>.

- Costello, Leesa, Marie-Louise McDermott, and Ruth Wallace. 2017. "Netnography: Range of Practices, Misperceptions, and Missed Opportunities." *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 16, no.1: 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406917700647.
- Counihan, Carole, and Susanne Højlund, eds. 2018. *Making Taste Public: Ethnographies of Food and the Senses*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Coulombe-Demers, Jerome. 2015. "Biere, terroir et Patrimoine au Quebec: Le cas du style de biere annedda." Master thesis. Université de Laval.
- Culhane, Diane. 2017. "Sensing." In *A Different Kind of Ethnography: Imaginative Practices and Creative Methodologies*, edited by Denielle Elliott and Dara Culhane, 45-67.
- Dalby, Andrew. 2014. "Apicius." In *The Oxford Companion to Food*, edited by Tom Jaine. 3rd ed. Oxford University Press. https://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/oupof/apicius/0?institutionId=379.
- De Brito, Saulo Alves, Ariane Lao Baldykowski, Sandro A. Miczeski Jr., and Thiago H. Silva. 2018. "Cheers to Untapp! Preferences for Beer Reflect Cultural Differences Around the World." 24<sup>th</sup> Americas Conference on Information Systems, New Orleans. https://aisel.aisnet.org/amcis2018/SocialComputing/Presentations/13/.
- Deconinck, Koen, Eline Poelmans, and Johan Swinnen. 2016. "How Beer Created Belgium (and the Netherlands): The Contribution of Beer Taxes to War Finance During the Dutch Revolt." *Business History* 58, no. 5-6: 694-724. https://doi.org/10.1080/00076791.2015.1024231.
- Dégh, Linda. 1985. "When I Was Six We Moved West…': The Theory of Personal Narrative." *New York Folklore* 11, no. 1: 99-108. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/when-i-was-six-we-moved-west-theory-personal/docview/1290855903/se-2?accountid=12378</u>.
- . 1994. "The Approach to Worldview in Folk Narrative Study." Western Folklore 53, no. 3: 243-52. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1499811</u>.
- ———. 1995. Narratives in Society: A Performer-Centered Study of Narration. FF Communications 255. Helsinki; Bloomington: Suomalainen Tuedeakatemia, Academia Scientiarum Fennica; Distribution in North America by Indiana University Press.
- Dégh, Linda, and Andrew Vázsonyi. 1986. "Legend and Belief." In *Folklore Genres*, edited Dan Ben-Amos, 93-124. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Delbeuck, Claude. n.d. *Discover the Nature Walks around the Prés d'Orval Nature Reserve.* Direction Général des Ressources Naturelles et de l'Environment.

- Del Negro, Giovanna. 2003. Looking through my Mother's Eyes: Life Stories of Nine Italian Immigrant Women in Canada. Toronto: Guernica.
- Demossier, Marion. 2000. "Culinary Heritage and Produits de Terroir in France: Food for Thought." *Recollections of France: Memories, Identities and Heritage in Contemporary France*, edited by Sarah Blowen, Marion Demossier, and Jeanine Picard, 141-53. New York: Berghan Books.
- ———. 2001. "Beyond Terroir: Territorial Construction, Hegemonic Discourse, and French Wine Culture." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 17: 685-705. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/41350750</u>.
  - —. 2005. "Consuming Wine in France: The wandering Drinker and the Vin-anomie". In Drinking Cultures: Alcohol and Identity, edited by Thomas M. Wilson, 129-54. Oxford, UK: Berg.

———. 2010. *Wine Drinking Culture in France: A National Myth or a Modern Passion?* Cardiff: University of Wales Press.

—. 2020. Burgundy: The Global Story of Terroir. New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Denby, Priscilla. 1971. "Folklore in the Mass Media." Folklore Forum 4: 113-125.

- Deulin, Charles. 1868. "Cambrinus, Roi de la Bière." In *Contes d'un buveur de bière*, 3-30. Paris: Librairie Internationale. BnF Gallica. https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k5471441h/f18.item.
- De Waal, Esther. 1998. *The Ways of Simplicity: The Cistercian Tradition*. Mryknoll, NY: Orbis Books.
- Dietler, Michael. 2001. "Theorizing Feast: Rituals of Consumption, Commensal Politics, and Power in African Contexts." In *Feasts: Archaeological and Ethnographic Perspectives on Food, Politics, and Power*, edited by Michael Dietler and Brian Hayden, 65-114. Washington D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press.
- ———. 2010. "Consumption." In *The Oxford Handbook of Material Culture Studies*, edited by Dan Hicks and Mary C. Beaudry, 209-28. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dollard, Kit, Anthony Marett-Crosby, and Abbot Timothy Wright. 2003. *Doing Business with Benedict: The Rule of Saint Benedict and Business Management: A Conversation.* London: Continuum Intl Pub Group.
- Dornbusch, Horst. 2014. "Born to Be (Beer) King." *BeerAdvocate*, September 21, 2004. <u>https://www.beeradvocate.com/archived-articles/604/</u>.

- Dornbusch, Horst, and Karl-Ullrich Heyse. 2011. "Reinheitsgebot." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver. New York: Oxford University Press, 692-3.
- Dornbusch, Horst, and Garrett Oliver. 2011. "bottles." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 150-1. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Dorson, Richard M. 1956a. "Paul Bunyan in the News, 1939-1941 (Part I)." *Western Folklore* 15, no. 1: 26-39. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/1496407</u>.
- ———. 1956b. "Paul Bunyan in the News, 1939-1941 (Part II)." Western Folklore 15, no. 3: 179-93. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/1497312</u>.
- ———. 1976. "Folklore, Academe, and the Marketplace." In *Folklore and Fakelore*, edited by Richard M. Dorson, 1-30. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Douglas, Mary. 1992. Risk and Blame: Essays in Cultural Theory. London: Routledge.
- ———. 1996. *The World of Goods: Towards an Anthropology of Consumption*. New York: Routledge.
- Duncker, Karl. 1939. "The Influence of Past Experience upon Perceptual Properties." *American Journal of Psychology* 64, no. 2: 216-27. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1416111</u>.
- Dundes, Alan. 1963. "Advertising and Folklore." *New York Folklore Quarterly* 19, no. 2: 143-51. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/folklore-</u> advertising/docview/1290847795/se-2?accountid=12378.
- ——. 1980. *Interpreting Folklore*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Dunn, Barbara. 2011. "ale yeast." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 33. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Duvel Moortgat. n.d. "Financial." Accessed February 16, 2022. https://www.duvelmoortgat.be/en/info/financial.
- Eberts, Derrek. 2013. "Neolocalism and the Branding and Marketing of Place by Canadian Microbreweries." In *The Geography of Beer*, edited by Mark Patterson and Nancy Hoalst-Pullen, 189-99. Dordrecht, NL: Springer.
- Eriksen, Thomas Hylland, and Finn Sivert Nielsen. 2013. *A History of Anthropology*, 2nd ed. London: Pluto Press.

- Elder, E. Rozanne. 1998. *The New Monastery: Texts and Studies on the Earliest Cistercians*. Spencer: Cistercian Publications.
- ———. 2013. "Early Cistercian Writers." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Cistercian Order*, edited by Mette Birkedal Bruun, 199-217. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Elliott, Michael A. 2017. "The Rationalization of Craft Beer from Medieval Monks to Modern Microbrewers: A Weberian Analysis." In *Untapped: Exploring the Cultural Dimensions* of Craft Beer. Morgantown: West Virginia University Press.
- Everett, Holly. 2007. "A Welcoming Wilderness: The Role of Wild Berries in the Construction of Newfoundland and Labrador as a Tourist Destination." *Ethnologies* 29, no.1-2: 49-80. https://doi.org/10.7202/018745ar.
- ———. 2009. "Vernacular Health Moralities and Culinary Tourism in Newfoundland and Labrador." *Journal of American Folklore* 122, no. 483: 28-52. <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.0.0048</u>.
- Farmer, David Farmer. 2011. *The Oxford Dictionary of Saints*. 5<sup>th</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/acref/9780199596607.001.0001</u>.
- Featherstone, Mike. 1990. *Global Culture: Nationalism, Globalization and Modernity*. London: Sage Publications.

——. 1995. Undoing Culture: Globalization, Postmodernism and Identity. London: Sage.

- Felton, Harold. 1947. Legends of Paul Bunyan, New York: A. A. Knopf.
- Ferrell, Ann K., Erika Brady, Brent Björkman, Timothy H. Evans, Kate Parker Horigan, and Michael Ann Williams, eds. 2016. "Computational Folkloristics." Special issue, *Journal* of American Folklore 129, no. 511. <u>https://muse.jhu.edu/issue/33349</u>.
- Finlayson, Mark Alan. 2016. "Inferring Propp's Functions from Semantically Annotated Text." Journal of American Folklore 129, no. 511: 55-77. https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.129.511.0055.
- Flack, Wes. 1997. "American Microbreweries and Neolocalism" "Ale-ing" for a Sense of Place." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 16, no. 2: 37-53. https://doi.org/10.1080/08873639709478336.
- Fletchall, Ann M. 2015. "Place-Making through Beer-Drinking: A Case Studies of Montana's Craft Breweries." *Geographical Review* 106, no. 4: 539-566. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1931-0846.2016.12184.x.

- Foley, John Miles. 2012. Oral Tradition and the Internet: Pathways of the Mind. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Fort, Fatiha, and Francois Fort. 2006. "Alternatives marketing pour les produits de terroir." *Revue Francaise de Gestion* 32, no. 162: 146-59. <u>https://doi.org/10.3166/rfg.162.145-160</u>.
- Foster, Michael Dylan. 2015. "UNESCO on the Ground." *Journal of Folklore Research* 52, no. 2-3: 143-56. <u>https://doi.org/10.2979/jfolkrese.52.2-3.143</u>.
- Fowke, Edith. 1979. "In Defence of Paul Bunyan." New York Folklore 5, no. 1: 43-51. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/defense-paul-bunyan/docview/1290931614/se-2</u>.
- Frake, Justin. 2017. "Selling Out: The Inauthenticity Discount in the Craft Beer Industry." *Management Science* 63, no. 11: 3930-43. <u>http://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2620918</u>.
- Furnari, Chris. 2017. "Anheuser-Busch InBev's Media Investments Brew Controversy." Brewhound, June 8, 2017. <u>https://www.brewbound.com/news/anheuser-busch-inbevs-media-investments-brew-controversy</u>.
- Gabbert, Lisa. 2007. "Distanciation and the Recontextualization of Space: Finding One's Way in a Small Western Community." *Journal of American Folklore* 120, no. 476: 178-203. https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.2007.0035.
- Gade, Daniel W. 2004. "Tradition, Territory, and Terroir in French Viticulture: Cassis, France, and Appellation Contrôlée." *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94, no. 4: 848-67. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/3694101</u>.
- Garavaglia, Christian, and Johan Swinnen. 2017. "The Craft Beer Revolution: An International Perspective." *Choices* 32, no. 3: 1-8. <u>https://doi.org/10.22004/ag.econ.261900</u>.
- Garrido-Bañuelos, Gonzalo, Helia de Barros Alves, and Mihaela Mihnea. 2021. "Mapping the Sensory Fingerprint of Swedish Beer Market through Text and Data Mining and Multivariate Strategies." *Beverages* 7, no. 74. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/beverages7040074</u>.
- Geertz, Clifford. 1973. *The Interpretations of Cultures: Selected Essays*. New York: Basic Books, ACLS Humanities E-Books.
- Georges, Robert A. 1969. "Toward an Understanding of Storytelling Events." *Journal of American Folklore* 82, no. 326: 313-28. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/539777</u>.
- Giddens, Anthony. 2003. *Runaway World: How Globalization is Reshaping our Lives*, 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.

- Goldstein, Jenny Elaine. 2011. "The "Coffee Doctors": The Language of Taste and the Rise of Rwanda's Specialty Bean Value." *Food and Foodways* 19, no. 1-2: 135-59. https://doi.org/10.1080/07409710.2011.544226.
- Gonzalez, Miguel Vidal. 2008. "Intangible Heritage Tourism and Identity." *Tourism Management* 29, no. 4: 807-10. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2007.07.003</u>.
- Goodwin, Neva, Frank Ackerman, and David Kiron, eds. 1997. *The Consumer Society*. Washington, D.C.: Island Press.
- Grégoire, Paul-Christian. 2011. Orval: Le Val d'Or. Woippy, FR: Éditions Serpenoise.
- Grégoire, Christian. 1969. "Les origins de l'abbaye d'Orval." *Revue d'histoire ecclasiastique* 64, no. 3: 756-807. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/les-origines-de-labbaye-dorval/docview/1302218446/se-2?accountid=12378</u>.
- Grégoire, Christian et Charles Grégoire. 1967. "Mathilde de Toscane et la Légende d'Orval." Bulletin trimestriel de l'Institut Archéologique du Luxembourg 43: 46-55.
- Griffiths, James. 1988. ""We Always Call It 'Tucson Eat Yourself": The Role of Food at a Constructed Festival." In *We Gather Together: Food and Festival in American Life*, edited by Theodore C. Humphrey and Lin T. Humphrey, 219-34. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press.
- Gupta, Akhil. 2012. "A Different History of the Present: The Movement of Crops, Cuisines, and Globalization." In *Curried Cultures: Globalization, Food, and South Asia*, edited by Krishnendu Ray and Tulasi Srinivas, 29-48. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Gutierrez, C. Paige. 1998. "Cajuns and Crawfish." In *The Taste of American Place: A Reader on Regional and Ethnic Foods*, edited by Barbara G. Shortridge and James R, Shortridge, 139-44. New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Guy, Kolleen M. 2003. *When Champagne became French*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- ———. 2011. "Silence and Savoir-Faire in the Marketing of Products of the Terroir." *Modern & Contemporary France* 19, no. 4: 459-75. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/09639489.2011.610165</u>.
- Hafstein, Vladimar Tr.. 2015. "Intangible Heritage as Diagnosis, Safeguarding as Treatment." Journal of Folklore Research 52, no.2-3: 281-98. <u>https://doi.org/10.2979/jfolkrese.52.2-3.281</u>.
- Hampson, Tim. 2011. "drinking vessels." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 303-5. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Hartley, Michele. 1997. "Hand-Crafting" a Mark: The Study of Marker's Mark Bourbon as Folk Art." *Digest: A Journal of Foodways and Culture* 17: 14-24.
- Haymond, Raven. 2018. "Tasting the Forbidden Fruit as Rites of Passage." *Western Folklore* 77, no. 3-4: 313-46. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/26864128</u>.
- Heath, Dwight B. 2000. *Drinking Occasions: Comparative Perspectives on Alcohol and Culture*. Ann Arbour: Sheridan Books.
- Hede, Anne-Marie, and Torgeir Watne. 2013. "Leveraging the Human Side of the Brand using a Sense of Place: Case Studies of Craft Breweries." *Journal of Marketing Management* 29, no. 1-2: 207-24. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/0267257X.2012.762422</u>.
- Heldke, Lisa M. 2001. "Let's Cook Thai: Recipes for Colonialism." In *Pilaf, Pozole, and Pad Thai: American Women and Ethnic Food*, edited by Sherrie A. Inness, 175-98. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.
- Heldke, Lisa M., and Deane W. Curtin, eds. 1992. *Cooking, Eating, Thinking: Transformative Philosophies of Food.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Hermansen, Mark Emil Tholstrup. 2012. "Creating Terroir: An Anthropological Perspective on New Nordic Cuisine as an Expression of Nordic Identity." In "Nordic Food Culture," edited by Virginie Amilien, Silje Skuland, and Sigurd Bergflødt. Special issue, *Anthropology of Food* S7, no. 57. <u>https://doi.org/10.4000/aof.7249</u>.
- Hieronymus, Stan. 2005. *Brew like a Monk: Trappist, Abbey, and Strong Belgian Ales*. Boulder, CO: Brewers Publications.
- ———. 2012. For the Love of Hops: The Practical Guide to Aroma, Bitterness and the Culture of Hops. Boulder, CO: Brewers Publications.
- Hitchcock, Peter. 2003. *Imaginary States: Studies in Cultural Transnationalism*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Hoffman, Daniel G. 1951. "Robert Frost's Paul Bunyan: A Frontier Hero in New England Exile." *Midwest Folklore* 1, no. 1: 13-18. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/4317250</u>.
- ———. 1999. *Paul Bunyan: Last of the Frontier Demigods*. East Lansing: Michigan State University Press.
- Honigman, John H. 1961. Foodways in a Muskeg Community: An Anthropological Report on the Attawapiskat Indians. Ottawa: Northern Co-ordination and Research Center.
- Honko, Lauri. 1964. "Memorates and the Study of Folk Belief." *Journal of the Folklore Institute* 1, no. 1-2: 5-19. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/3814027</u>.

- Hornsey, Ian S. 2003. *A History of Beer and Brewing*. Cambridge, UK: Royal Society of Chemistry.
- Hornung, Erik. 2001. *The Secret Lore of Egypt: Its Impact on the West*. Translated by David Lorton. Ithica, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Howes, David. 1991. The Varieties of Sensory Experience: A Sourcebook in the Anthropology of the Senses. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
  - ——. 2003. Sensual Relations: Engaging the Senses in Culture and Social Theory. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.
- Howes, David, and Constance Classen. 2013. Ways of Sensing: Understanding the Senses in Society. London: Routledge.
- Howes, David, and Sarah Pink. 2010. "The Future of Sensory Anthropology/The Anthropology of the Senses." *Social Anthropology* 18, no. 3: 331-40. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8676.2010.00119\_1.x</u>.
- Huang, Qian. 2019. "Drinking Tea in St. John's: A Study of Diasporic Chinese Tea Drinking and Ethnic Identity." Master's thesis, Memorial University of Newfoundland, St. John's. <u>http://research.library.mun.ca/id/eprint/13934</u>.
- Hufford, Mary. 2003. "Knowing Ginseng: The Social Life of an Appalachian Root." *Cahiers de Littérature Orale* 53-54: 265-91. https://www.sas.upenn.edu/folklore/faculty/mhufford/KnowingGinseng.pdf.
- Humphrey, Lin T. 1988. ""Soup Night": Community Creation through Food." In We Gather Together: Food and Festival in American Life, edited by Theodore C. Humphrey and Lin T. Humphrey, 53-68. Ann Arbor, MI: UMI Research Press.
- Humphrey, Theodore C. and Lin T. 1988. We Gather Together: Food and Festival in American Life. Ann Arbor: UMI Research.
- Hymes, Dell. 1975. "Folklore's Nature and the Sun's Myth." *Journal of American Folklore* 88, no. 350: 345-69. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/538651</u>.
- Ikäheimo, Janne P. 2021. "Arctic Narratives: Brewing a Brand with Neolocalism." *Journal of Brand Management* 28, no.4: 374-87. <u>https://doi.org/10.1057/s41262-021-00232-y</u>.
- Inglis, Fred. 2000. The Delicious History of the Holiday. New York: Routledge.
- Ingold, Tim. 2011. "Worlds of Sense and Sensing the World: A Response to Sarah Pink and David Howes." *Social Anthropology* 19, no.3: 313-17. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8676.2011.00163.x</u>.

- Isani, Shaeda. 2017. "Of Synaesthetic Wine Metaphors, Discourse Communities, Addressers and addressees: The Specialised Language of Wine Descriptors." *ASp* 72: 93-112. https://doi.org/10.4000/asp.5038.
- Iseman, Courtney. 2021. "11 Years of Untappd: How One App Gamified the Relentless Pursuit of Novelty." *VinePair* (March 16, 2021). <u>https://vinepair.com/articles/untapped-impact-craft-beer/</u>.
- International Trappist Association. n.d. "About the Trappists." Accessed February 16, 2022. <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/trappists/</u>.
  - . n.d. "The International Trappist Association." Accessed February 16, 2022. <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/about-ita/</u>.
- . n.d. "Criteria for obtaining the ATP label." Accessed February 16, 2022. <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/about-ita/atp-label/#</u>.
- Jackson, Michael. 1984. World Guide to Beer. Philadelphia: Running Press.
  - ------. 2008. *Michael Jackson's Great Beers of Belgium*. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Boulder, CO: Brewers Publications.
- Jacobs, Claude F. 2001. "Folk for Whom? Tourist Guidebooks, Local Color, and the Spiritual Churches of New Orleans." *Journal of American Folklore* 114, no. 453: 309-30. <u>http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/542025</u>.
- Jacobson, Brian. 2011. "The Return of the King." Urban Milwaukee. May 23, 2011. Accessed May 18, 2021. <u>https://urbanmilwaukee.com/2011/05/23/tcd-exclusive-the-return-of-the-king/</u>.
- James, Paul, and Manfred B. Steger. 2014. "A Genealogy of 'Globalization': The Career of a Concept." *Globalizations* 11, no.4: 417-34. https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2014.951186.
- Jayne, Mark, Chris Gibson, Gordon Waitt, and Gill Valentine. 2012. "Drunken Mobilities: Backpackers, Alcohol, 'Doing Place.'" *Tourist Studies* 12, no.3: 211-31. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797612461082</u>.
- Jeantin, Jean-François-Louis. 1857. *Les Ruines et Chroniques de l'Abbaye* d'Orval, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Paris: Imprimerie de W. Remquet et Cse.
- Jochnowitz, Eve. 2004. "Flavors of Memory: Jewish Food as Culinary Tourism in Poland." In *Culinary Tourism*, edited by Lucy M. Long, 97-113. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.

- Johnson, Allan G. 2000. "cultural capital." In *The Blackwell Dictionary of Sociology*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers. CREDO Reference. <u>https://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/bksoc/cultural\_capital/0?institutionId=37</u> <u>9</u>.
- Johnston, Josée, and Shyon Baumann. 2007. "Democracy versus Distinction: A Study of Omnivorousness in Gourmet Food Writing." *American Journal of Sociology* 113, no.1: 165-204. https://doi.org/10.1086/518923.
  - ——. 2010. *Foodies: Democracy and Distinction in the Gourmet Foodscape.* New York: Routledge.
- Jones, Michael Owen. 1971. "The Concept of "Aesthetic" in the Traditional Arts." *Western Folklore* 30, no. 2: 77-104. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1499067</u>.
- Jones, Michael Owens, Bruce B. Giuliano, and Roberta Krell, eds. 1983. *Foodways and Eating Habits: Directions for Research*. Los Angeles: California Folklore Society.
- Jonveaux, Isabelle. 2011. "Bière belge et image monastique: Une exemple d'économie charismatique." *Ethnologie francaise* 41, no. 1: 117-30. https://www.jstor.org/stable/40991463.
- Jorgensen, Jeana. 2019. "The Most Beautiful of All: A Qualitative Approach to Fairy-Tale Femininity." *Journal of American Folklore* 132, no. 523: 36-60. <u>https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.132.523.0036</u>.
- Kaivola-Bregenhoj, Annikki, Barbro Sklute Klein, and Ulf Palmenfelt. 2006. Narrating, Doing, Experiencing: Nordic Folkloristic Perspectives. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society.
- Kaschl, Elke. 2000. "Beyond the Nation in Israeli Folk Dancing: The Performing Community in New York under the Impact of Globalization." *Jewish Folklore and Ethnology Review* 1-2: 59-77.
- Kearney, Breandán. 2016. "Orval Trappist | Changes in Fortune and Secrets of Success." *Belgian Smaak* (blog). Published on June 2, 2016. <u>https://www.belgiansmaak.com/orval-trappist-ale/</u>.
- Kearney, Michael. 1995. "The Local and the Global: The Anthropology of Globalization and Transnationalism." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24: 547-65.

- Kennedy, Maria Elizabeth. 2017. "Finding Lost Fruit: The Cider Poetic, Orchard Conservation, and Craft Cider Making in Britain." PhD diss., Indiana University, Bloomington. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- 2020. "Agrarian Eve to Original Sin: Cultural Narratives of Women in the American Cider Industry." *New Directions in Folklore* 17, no.1: 27-43. https://scholarworks.iu.edu/journals/index.php/ndif/article/view/29885.
- Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, Barbara. 1989. "Authoring Lives." *Journal of Folklore Research* 26, no. 2: 123-49. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/3814238</u>.
- ———. 1999. "Playing to the Senses: Food as Performance Medium." *Performance Research* 4, no. 1: 1-30. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/13528165.1999.10871639</u>.
- Kissmeyer, Anders Brinch. 2011. "water." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 824-6. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Klein, Jakob, and Anne Murcott, eds. 2014. Food Consumption in Global Perspective: Essays in the Anthropology of Food in Honour of Jack Goody. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Koczwara, Kevin. 2018. "Tom Peters: The Belgian Beer Whisperer of Philadelphia." *October*, February 23, 2018. <u>https://www.octmag.com/essays/tom-peters-belgian-beer-monkscafe-philadelphia</u>.
- Koontz, Amanda, and Nathaniel G. Chapman. 2019. "About Us: Authenticating Identity Claims in the Craft Beer Industry." *The Journal of Popular Culture* 52, no. 2: 351-372. https://doi.org/10.1111/jpcu.12787.
- Korsemeyer, Carolyn. 1995. "The Meaning of Taste and the Taste of Meaning." In *Arguing about Art: Contemporary Philosophical Debates*, edited by Alex Neill and Aaron Ridley, 30-52. New York: Routledge.
- ——. 2002. Making Sense of Taste: Food & Philosophy. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- ——, ed. 2007. The Taste Culture Reader: Experiencing Food and Drink. Oxford: Berg.
- Kozinets, Robert V. 2010. Netnography: Doing Ethnographic Research Online. Los Angeles: SAGE.
- . 2002. "The Field Behind the Screen: Using Netnography for Marketing Research in Online Communities." *Journal of Marketing Research* 39, no. 1: 61-72. <u>https://doi.org/10.1509/jmkr.39.1.61.18935</u>.
- Kraus-Weyermann, Thomas. 2011a. "malt." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 559-63. New York: Oxford University Press.

2011b. "pilsner malt." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 6523. New York: Oxford University Press.

Krawczyk-Wasilewska, Violetta. 2006. "e-Folklore in the Age of Globalization." *Fabula* 47, no. 3-4: 248-54. <u>https://doi.org/10.1515/FABL.2006.027</u>.

— 2016. Folklore in the Digital Age: Collected Essays. Łódź: Łódź University Press and Jagiellonian University Press.

- Krommydas, Niko. 2022. "We Asked 15 Brewers: What Beer Trends Need to Die? (2022)." *VinePair*, August 18, 2022. <u>https://vinepair.com/articles/wa-brewers-worst-beer-trends/</u>.
- Kuehn, Kathleen, and Sophie Parker. 2021. "One of the Blokes: Brewsters, Branding and Gender (In)visibility in New Zealand's Craft Beer Industry." *Journal of Consumer Culture* 21, no. 3: 519-38. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1469540518806956</u>.
- "Our Monthly Gossip with Readers and Correspondents." *Lippincott's Monthly Magazine: A Popular Journal of General Literature, Science, and Politics* 41 (January to June 1888): 132-7. Accessed June 28, 2021. <u>https://hdl.handle.net/2027/uiug.30112108101087</u>.
- Labov, William, and Joshua Waletzky. 1966. "Narrative Analysis: Oral Versions of Personal Experience." *Essays on the Verbal and Visual Arts: Proceedings of the 1966 Annual Spring Meeting of American Ethnological Society*, edited by June Helm, 12-44. Seattle: University of Washington Press.
- Lagasse, Paul. 2018. "Flanders." In *The Columbia Encyclopedia*. 8th ed. New York: Columbia University Press. <u>http://qe2a-proxy.mun.ca/login?url=https://search.credoreference.com/content/entry/columency/flanders/0?institutionId=379.</u>
- Latham, Rob. 2002. Consuming Youth: Vampires, Cyborgs, and the Culture of Consumption. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Langellier, Kristin M. 1989. "Personal Narratives: Perspectives on Theory and Research." *Text* and Performance Quarterly 9, no. 4: 243-76. https://doi.org/10.1080/10462938909365938.
- Lau, Kimberly J. 1999. "Folklore and Theories of Globalization." *Folklore Forum* 30, no. 1-2: 55-71.
- Lawless, Elaine J. 1988. "The Night I Got the Holy Ghost...": Holy Ghost Narratives and the Pentecostal Conversion Process." Western Folklore 47, no. 1: 1-19. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1500052</u>.

- LeBlanc, Marie-Ann Julie. 2015. "Marketing Tradition and Contemporary Folklore: How Microbreweries and Community Events Process Local Events and Folklore in Quebec." PhD diss., Memorial University of Newfoundland, St. John's.
- ———. 2020. "Branding Unibroue: Selling Québécois Folklore through Beer." In *The Folklorist* in the Marketplace: Conversations at the Crossroads of Vernacular Culture and Economics, edited by Puja Batra-Wells, and Willow G. Mullins, 47-71. Chicago: Utah State University Press.
- Lekai, Louis Julius. 1953. *The White Monks: A History of the Cistercian Order*. Wisconsin: Cistercian Fathers/Our Lady of Spring Bank.
- ———. 1955. "The Beginnings of the Cistercian Strict Observance." The Catholic Historical Review 41, no. 2: 129-143. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/25015878</u>.
- ——. 1977. The Cistercians: Ideals and Reality. Kent, OH: Kent State University Press.
- Lewell, Ted. 2002. *The Anthropology of Globalization: Cultural Anthropology Enters the 21st Century.* Westport: Bergin & Garvey.
- Lewis, George H. 1998. "The Maine Lobster as Regional Icon: Competing Images Over Time and Social Class." In *The Taste of American Place: A Reader on Regional and Ethnic Foods*, edited by Barbara G. Shortridge and James R, Shortridge, 65-83. New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Lien, Marianne. 2000. "Imagined Cuisines: 'Nation' and 'Market' as Organising Structures in Norwegian Food Marketing." In *Commercial Cultures: Economies, Practices, Spaces,* edited by Peter Jackson, Michelle Lowe, Daniel Miller, and Frank Mort, 153-73. Oxford, NY: Berg.
- Lockwood, Yvonne R., and William G. Lockwood. 1998. "Pasties in Michigan's Upper Peninsula: Foodways, Interethnic Relations and Regionalism." In *The Taste of American Place: A Reader on Regional and Ethnic Foods*, edited by Barbara G. Shortridge and James R, Shortridge, 21-36. New York: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Long, Lucy M. 2006. "Food Pilgrimages: Seeking the Sacred and the Authentic in Food." *Appetite* 47, no. 3: 393. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.appet.2006.08.035</u>.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2010. Culinary Tourism. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.
- , ed. 2015. The Food and Folklore Reader. New York: Bloomsbury.
- Loomis, C. Grant. 1941. "The Ring of Polycrates in the Legends of the Saints." *The Journal of American Folklore* 54, no. 211/212: 44-47. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/535800</u>.

Louf, André. 1983. The Cistercian Way. Kalamazoo, MI: Cistercian Publications.

- MacAulay, Suzanne P. 2004. "Diaspora by Degree: Narrative and Performance in Interviews of Expatriates from Wanganui, New Zealand." *Journal of American Folklore* 117, no. 465: 262-87. <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.2004.0076</u>.
- MacCannell, Dean. 1973. "Staged Authenticity of Social Space in Tourist Settings." *American Journal of Sociology* 79, no. 3: 589-603. <u>https://doi.org/10.1086/225585</u>.
- ———. [1976] 2013. *The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class*. New York: Schocken Books.
- Mackiewicz, Jo. 2010. "The Co-construction of Credibility in Online Product Reviews." *Technical Communication Quarterly* 19, no. 4: 403-26. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/10572252.2010.502091</u>.
- Manjarrez, Adriana Cruz. 2004. "Rethinking Theory in Practice: Response to Margaret Randall's AFS Address." *Journal of American Folklore* 117, no. 465: 349-52. https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.2004.0072.
- Markowski, Phil. 2004. Farmhouse Ales: Culture and Craftsmanship in the Belgian Tradition. Boulder, CO: Brewers.

———. 2011. "saison." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 711-12. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Materna, Kryštof, Veronika Bernhäuserová, Jiří Hasman, and David Hána. 2022. "How Microbreweries Flooded Europe: Mapping a New Phenomenon in the Beer Industry." *Journal of Maps*: 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1080/17445647.2021.2012536.
- Matthews, Mark Allen. 2015. *Terroir and Other Myths of Winegrowing*. Oakland: University of California Press.
- Mathews, Adam J., and Matthew T. Patton. 2016. "Exploring place marketing by American microbreweries: neolocal expression of ethnicity and race." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 33, no. 3: 275-309. <u>http://doi.org/10.1080/08873631.2016.1145406.</u>
- Mazzoni, Cristina. 2005. *The Women in God's Kitchen: Cooking, Eating, and Spiritual Writing*. New York: Bloomsbury.
- McArthur, Phillip H. 2008. "Ambivalent Fantasies: Local Prehistories and Global Dramas in the Marshall Islands." *Journal of Folklore Research* 45, no. 3: 263-98. <u>https://doi.org/10.2979/JFR.2008.45.3.263</u>.
- McAuley, Julian, and Jure Leskovec. 2013. "Hidden Factors and Hidden Topics: Understanding Rating Dimensions with Review Text." *RecSys '13*, October 12-16, 2013, Hong Kong, China.

- McCarl, Robert Jr. 1978. "Jump Story: An Examination of the Occupational Experience Narrative." *Folklore Forum* 11, no. 1: 1-17.
- McCracken, Grant. 1998. Culture and Consumption: New Approaches to the Symbolic Character of Consumer Goods and Activities. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- McKay, Ian. 2009. The Quest for the Folk: Antimodernism and Cultural Selection in Twentieth-Century Nova Scotia. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- McRobbie, Ling Rodriguez. 2013. "11 Patron Saints of Food, Coffee, and Alcohol." *Mental Floss*. May 13, 2013. <u>https://www.mentalfloss.com/article/50529/11-patron-saints-food-drink-and-those-who-make-them/</u>.
- Meder, Theo. 2011. "In Search of the Dutch Lore of the land: Old and New Legends throughout the Netherlands." *Folklore* 122, no. 2: 117-34. https://doi.org/10.1080/0015587X.2011.570501.
- Meiselman, Herbert L., ed. 2000. *Dimensions of the Meal: The Science, Culture, Business and Art of Eating.* Gaithersburg, MD: Aspen.
- Meethan, Kevin, Alison Anderson, and Steve Miles, eds. 2006. *Tourism, Consumption and Representation: Narratives of Place and Self.* London: CABI Pub.
- Melewar, T.C., and H. Skinner. 2020. "Territorial Brand Management: Beer, Authenticity, and Sense of Place." *Journal of Business Research* 116: 680-9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2018.03.038.
- Meyers, Thomas J. 2003. "Amish Tourism: 'Visiting Shipshewana is Better Than Going to the Mall." *Mennonite Quarterly Review* 77, no. 1: 109-26.
- Miller, Daniel. 1994. Material Culture and Mass Consumption. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- ———. 1998. "Coca-Cola: A Black Sweet Drink from Trinidad." In *Material Cultures: Why Some Things Matter*, edited by Daniel Miller, 169-88. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- ———. 2006. "Consumption." In *Handbook of Material Culture*, edited by Chris Tilley, Webb Keane, Susanne Kuechler, Mike Rowlands, and Patricia Spyer, 341-54. London: SAGE.
- Miller, John W. 2007. "Trappist Command: Thou Shalt Not Buy Too Much of Our Beer." *Wall Street Journal*, Eastern edition, 19 Nov 2007: A.1. https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB119628388037006909.
- Miller, Kiri. 2008. "Grove Street Grimm: *Grand Theft Auto* and Digital Folklore." *Journal of American Folklore* 121, no. 481: 255-85. <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/jaf.0.0017</u>.

- Mills, Barbara J. 2008. "Colonialism and Cuisine: Cultural Transmission, Agency, and History at Zuni Pueblo." In *Cultural Transmission and Culture: Breaking Down Boundaries*, edited by Miriam T. Stark, Brenda J. Bowser, Lee Horne, and Carol Kramer, 245-61. Tucson: University of Arizona Press.
- Mittag, Roger. 2014. "Geographic Appellations of Beer." In *The Geography of Beer*, edited by Mark W. Patterson and Nancy Hoalst-Pullen, 67-74. Dordrecht, NL: Springer.
- Mitenbuler, Reid. 2020. "How Budweiser Became the King of Beers." Updated September 21, 2020. <u>https://www.seriouseats.com/how-budweiser-became-the-king-of-beers-beer-history</u>.
- Mkono, Muchazondida. 2011. "The Othering of Food in Touristic Eatertainment: A Netnography." *Tourist Studies* 11, no. 3: 253-70. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797611431502.
- Molz, Jennie Germann. 2006. "Cosmopolitan Bodies: Fit to Travel and Travelling Fit." Body & Society 12, no. 3: 1-21. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1357034X06067153</u>.
- ———. 2007. "Eating Difference: The Cosmopolitan Mobilities of Culinary Tourism." Space and Culture 10, no. 1: 77-93. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1206331206296383</u>.
- Monk's Café. 2022. "Awards." Accessed August 16, 2022. https://www.monkscafe.com/awards/.
- Montell, Lynwood W., and Barbara Allen. 1982. "A Biographical Approach to the Study of Memorates." *International Folklore Review* 2: 85-104.
- Morrot, Gil, Frédéric Brochet, and Denis Dubourdieu. 2001. "The Color of Odors." *Brain and Language* 79, no. 2: 309-20. https://doi.org/10.1006/brln.2001.2493.
- Mosher, Randy. 2017. *Tasting Beer: An Insider's Guide to the World's Greatest Drink*, 2nd edition. North Adams, MA: Storey Publishing.
- Mould, Tom. 2011. *Still, the Small Voice: Narrative, Personal Revelation, and the Mormon Folk Tradition.* Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Moulin, Léo. 1975. L'europe à table. Paris: Elsevier Sequoia.
- ———. 1988. *Les liturgies de la table: Une histoire culturelle du manger et du boire*. Brussels: Fonds Mercator.
- Mouritsen, Ole G. 2015. "The Science of Taste." *Taste* 4, no. 18. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s13411-014-0028-3</u>.
- Muhammad, Khalil, Aonghus Lawlor, and Barry Smyth. 2017. "On the Pros and Cons of Explanation-Based Ranking." In *Case-Based Reasoning Research and Development*, edited by David W. Aha and Jean Lieber, 227-41. Springer International Publishing.
- Mullen, Patrick B. 1992. *Listening to Old Voices: Folklore, Life Stories, and the Elderly.* Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Nelson, Velvet. 2020. "Consuming Local: Product, Place, and Experience in Visitor Reviews of Urban Texas Craft Breweries." *Leisure Studies* 40, no. 4: 480-494. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/02614367.2020.1831044</u>.
- Narváez, Peter. 1994. ""Tricks and Fun": Subversive Pleasures at Newfoundland Wakes." *Western Folklore* 53, no. 4: 263-93. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/1499450</u>.
- Nelson, Max. 2003. "The Cultural Construction of Beer Among Greeks and Romans." *Syllecta Classica* 14, no. 1: 101-20. <u>https://doi.org/10.1353/syl.2003.0005</u>.

. 2005. *The Barbarian's Beverage*. New York: Routledge.

- Newman, Jacqueline S. 2000. "Chinese Meals." In *Dimensions of the Meal: The Science, Culture, Business and Art of Eating*, edited by Herbert L. Meiselman, 163-77. Gaithersburg, MD: Aspen.
- Newton, Sarah E. 1992. ""The Jello-O Syndrome": Investigating Popular Culture/Foodways." *Western Folklore* 51, no. 3-4: 249-67. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1499775</u>.
- Next Glass. 2022. "The Worldwide Leader in Bev Tech." Accessed August 16, 2022. https://www.nextglass.co/.
- Nicks, Trudy. 1999. "Indian Villages and Entertainments: Setting the Stage for Tourist Souvenir Sales." In *Unpacking Culture: Art and Commodity in Colonial and Postcolonial Worlds*, edited by Ruth B. Phillips and Christopher B. Steiner, 301-15. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Nip, Renée. 2002. "Life and Afterlife: Arnulf of Oudenburg, Bishop of Soissons, and Godelieve of Gistel: their function as intercessors in medieval Flanders." In *The Invention of Saintliness*, edited by Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker, 58-76. London: Routledge.
- Noyes, Dorothy. 2014. "Aesthetic Is the Opposite of Anaesthetic: On Tradition and Attention." *Journal of Folklore Research* 51, no. 2: 125-75. https://doi.org/10.2979/jfolkrese.51.2.125.

- —. 2016. "The Judgment of Solomon: Global Protections for Tradition and the Problem of Community Ownership." In *Humble Theory: Folklore's Grasp on Social Life*, edited by Dorothy Noyes, 337-70. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
- Oliver, Garrett. 2005. *The Brewmaster's Table: Discovering the Pleasures of Real Beer with Real Food.* New York, New York: HarperCollins Publishers.
- . 2011a. "Abbey beers." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 13. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- ———. 2011b. "Belgium." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 120-2. New York: Oxford University Press.
- ———. 2011c. "craft brewing." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 270-3. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- 2011d. "dry hopping." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 3079. New York: Oxford University Press.
- ——. 2011e. "glassware." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 397-8. New York: Oxford University Press.

2011f. "serving beer." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 726 8. New York: Oxford University Press.

- Olrik, Axel. [1909] 1965. "Epic Laws of Folk Narrative," in *The Study of Folklore*, translated by Jeanne P. Steager., edited by Alan Dundes, 129-41. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Order of Cistercians of the Strict Observance. n.d.a. *Exordium Cistercii*. Accessed August 16, 2022. <u>https://ocso.org/resources/foundational-text/exordium-cistercii/</u>.
- ———. n.d.b. Carta Caritatis. Accessed August 16, 2022. <u>https://ocso.org/resources/foundational-text/charter-of-charity/</u>.
- Oring, Elliott. 2008. "Legendry and the Rhetoric of Truth." *Journal of American Folklore* 121, no. 489: 127-66. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/20487594</u>.
- Orval. n.d. a. "The Ambassadeur Orval label." Accessed August 16, 2021. https://www.orval.be/en/page/487-the-ambassadeur-orval-label.
  - ------. n.d.b. "How to serve Orval." Accessed November 16, 2022. https://www.orval.be/en/page/509-how-to-serve-orval.
- Paiva, Andre Cunha, and Leandro Wang Hantao. 2020. "Exploring a Public Database to Evaluate Consumer Preference and Aroma Profile of Lager Beers by Comprehensive Two-Dimensional Gas Chromatography and Partial Least Squares Regression

Discriminant Analysis." *Journal of Chromatography A* 1630: 461529. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chroma.2020.461529.

- Palmer, John, and Colin Kaminski. 2013. *Water: A Comprehensive Guide for Brewers*. Boulder, CO: Brewers Publications.
- Paradis, Carita. 2010. "Touchdowns in winespeak: Ontologies and construals in use and meaning-making." In Proceedings from the 1st Conference on Linguistic Approaches to Food and Wine Descriptions, edited by Goded Rambaud and A. Poves Luelmo, 57-72. Madrid: UNED.
- Paradiso, John A. 2019. "AB InBev Acquires 100% of RateBeer." *Hop Culture*, 4 February, 2019. https://www.hopculture.com/ab-inbev-zx-ventures-ratebeer-news/.
- Patterson, Tim, and John Buechsenstein. 2018. *Wine and Place: A Terroir Reader*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.
- Paxson, Heather. 2010. "Locating Value in Artisan Cheese: Reverse Engineering Terroir for New-World Landscapes." *American Anthropologist* 112, no. 3: 444-57. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1433.2010.01251.x</u>.
- Persyn, Damiaan, Johan F. M. Swinnen, and Stijn Vanormelingen. 2019. "Belgian Beers: Where History Meets Globalization." In *The Economics of Beer*, edited by Johan F. M. Swinnen, 79-104. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pink, Sarah. 2007. Doing Visual Ethnography, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Sage.
- ———. 2009. *Doing Sensory Ethnography*. London: Sage.
- Pinon, Roger. 1968. "L'étude du folklore musical en Wallonie: Historique, problems, organisation, utilité." *Jahrbuch für musikalische Volks- und Völkerkund*e 4: 25-58. https://doi.org/10.1515/9783111448497-003.
- Poelmans, Eline and Johan Swinnen. 2011a. "A Brief Economic Historic of Beer." In *The Economics of Beer*, edited by Johan F. M. Swinnen, 3-28. Oxford: Oxford university Press.
- ———. 2011b. "From Monasteries to Multinationals (and Back): A Historical Review of the Beer Economy." *Journal of Wine Economics* 5, no. 2: 196-216. <u>https://doi.org/10.1017/S1931436100001607</u>.
- Poelmans, Eline, and Sandra Rousseau. 2017. "Beer and Organic Labels: Do Belgians Consumers Care?" *Sustainability* 9, no .9: 1509. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/su9091509</u>.

- Poelmans, Eline, and Jason Taylor. 2019. "Belgium's Historic Beer Diversity: Should we Raise a Pint to Institutions." *Journal Institutional Economics* 15, no. 4: 695-713. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1744137419000080.
- Pomranz, Mike. 2020. "BeerAdvocate Purchased by Untappd's Ownership Group." *Food & Wine*, February 24, 2020. <u>https://www.foodandwine.com/news/untappd-purchases-beer-advocate</u>.
- Powell, Hillary. 2010. ""Once Upon a Time There Was a Saint…": Re-evaluating Folklore in Anglo-Latin Hagiography." *Folklore* 121, no. 2: 171-89. https://www.jstor.org/stable/29534129.
- Prahlad, Anand. 2021. "Tearing Down Monuments: Missed Opportunities, Silences, and Absences – A Radical Look at Race in American Folklore Studies." *Journal of American Folklore* 134, no.533: 258-64. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/tearing-</u> <u>down-monuments-missed-opportunities/docview/2629432751/se-2?accountid=12378</u>.
- Pranger, M.B. 2013. "Bernard de Clairvaux: work and self." In *The Cambridge Companion to the Cistercian Order*, edited by Mette Birkedal Bruun, 186-98. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Prättälä, Ritva. 2000. "North European Meals: Observations from Denmark, Finland, Norway, and Sweden." In *Dimensions of the Meal: The Science, Culture, Business and Art of Eating*, edited by Herbert L. Meiselman, 191-201. Gaithersburg, MD: Aspen.
- Preston, Michael J. 1973. "Olympia Beer Comes to Colorado: The Spread of a Tradition." *Western Folklore* 32, no. 4: 281-3. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1498311</u>.
- Price, Chandler. 2018. "BrewFinder An Interactive Flavor Map Informed by Users." In *Social Computing and Social Media. User Experience and Behaviour*, edited by Gabriele Meiselwitz, 342-54. Springer International Publishing.
- Propp, Vladimir. [1958] 2015. *Morphology of the Folktale*, translated by Laurence Scott, edited by Svatava Pirkova-Jakobson. Mansfield Centre: Martino Publishing.
- Protz, Roger. 2011. "Pilsner Urquell." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 653-654. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Proust, Marcel. [1913] 2003. Swann's Way. Vol. 1 of In Search of Lost Time. Translated by C. K. Scott Moncrieff and Terence Kilmartin. Revised by D. J. Enright. New York, NY: Modern Library.
- RateBeer. n.d. "RateBeer.com Statistics. Accessed February 6, 2023. <u>https://www.ratebeer.com/Stats.asp</u>.

- Reed-Danahay, Deborah. 1996. "Champagne and Chocolate: "Taste" and Inversion in a French Wedding Ritual." *American Anthropologist* 98, no. 4: 750-61. https://doi.org/10.1525/aa.1996.98.4.02a00060.
- Reid, Neil, Ralph B. McLaughlin, and Michael S Moore. 2014. "From Yellow Fizz to Big Biz: American Craft Beer Comes of Age." *The American Geographical Society's Focus on Geography* 57, no. 3: 114-125. https://doi.org/10.1111/foge.12034.
- Ressek, Audrey. 2012. "Appetites Without Prejudice: U.S. Foreign Restaurants and the Globalization of American Food Between the Wars." In *Local Foods Meet Global Foodways: Tasting History*, edited by Benjamin N. Lawrance, and Carolyn Thomas de la Pena, 38-59. New York: Routledge.
- Rice, Jeff. 2016. "Professional Purity: Revolutionary Writing in the Craft Beer Industry." *Journal of Business and Technical Communication* 30, no.2: 236-261. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1050651915620234</u>.
- Ritzer, George and Allan Liska. 1997. "McDisneyization' and 'Post-Tourism': Complementary Perspectives on Contemporary Tourism." In *Touring Cultures: Transformations of Travel and Theory*, edited by Chris Rojek and John Urry, 96-109. New York: Routledge.
- Robinson, Jancis. 2015. *The Oxford Companion to Wine*. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Robinson, John A. 1981. "Personal Narratives Reconsidered." *Journal of American Folklore* 94, no. 372: 58-85. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/540776</u>.
- Rogerson, Christian, and Keagan J.E. Collins. 2015. "Beer Tourism in South Africa: Emergence of Contemporary Directions." *Nordic Journal of African Studies* 24, no. 3-4: 241-58. <u>https://doi.org/10.53228/njas.v24i3&4.122</u>.
- Röhrich, Lutz. 1980. "Folklore and Advertising." In *Folklore Studies in the Twentieth Century: Proceedings of the Centenary Conference of the Folklore Society*, edited by Venetia J. Newall, 114-5. Totowa, NJ : Rowman and Littlefield.
- Romberg, Raquel. 2003. Witchcraft and Welfare: Spiritual Capital and the Business of Magic in Modern Puerto Rico. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Ryan, Patrick. 2006. "Celticity and Storyteller Identity: The Use and Misuse of Ethnicity to Develop a Storyteller's Sense of Self." *Folklore* 117, no. 3: 313-28. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/00155870600928971</u>.
- Saint Arnold Brewing Company. n.d. "Saint Arnold, The Guy." Accessed June 25, 2021. https://www.saintarnold.com/the-guy/.

- Salomonsson, Anders. 1990. "Food for Thought. Themes in Recent Swedish Ethnological Food Research." *Ethnologia Scandinavica* 20: 111-33.
- Samuels, David W. 2009. *Putting a Song on Top of it: Expression and identity on the San Carlos Apache Reservation*. Tucson: The University of Arizona Press.
- Santala, Ville, G. Costa, L. Gomes-Jr, T. Gadda, and T.H. Silva. 2020. "On the Potential of Social Media Data in Urban Planning: Findings from the Beer Street Curitiba, Brazil." *Planning Practice & Research* 35, no. 5: 510-525. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/02697459.2020.1767394</u>.
- Scheffer, Sandrine, and Bertil Sylvander. 1997. "The Effects of Institutional Changes on Qualification Processes: A survey of the French Institute for Denomination of Origins (INAO). In *Typical and Traditional Products: Rural Effects and Agro-Industrial Problems*, edited by F. Arfini and C. Mora, 463-82. Proceedings of the 52<sup>nd</sup> EAAE Seminar, Parma, Italy, June 19-21, 1997.
- Scher, Philip W. 2016. "Landship, Citizenship, Entrepreneurship and the Ship of State in Barbados: Developing a Heritage Consciousness in a Postcolonial State." Western Folklore 75, no. 3-4: 313-51. <u>https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/landshipcitizenship-entrepreneurship-ship-state/docview/1860777749/se-2?accountid=12378.</u>
- Schiefenhövel, Wulf, and Helen M. Macbeth. 2011. *Liquid Bread: Beer and Brewing in Cross-Cultural Perspective*. New York: Berghahn Books.
- Schnell, Steven M. 2013. "Deliberate Identities: Becoming Local in America in a Global Age." Journal of Cultural Geography 30, no. 1: 55–89. https://doi.org/10.1080/08873631.2012.745984.
- Schnell, Steven M., and Joseph F. Reese. 2003. "Microbreweries as Tools of Local Identity." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 21, no. 1: 45-69. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/08873630309478266</u>.
  - ———. 2014. "Microbreweries, Place, and Identity in the United States. In *The Geography of Beer*, edited by M. Patterson and N. Hoalst-Pullen, 167-87. Dordrech, NL: Springer.
- Schoenmueller, Verena, and Oded Netzer, and Florian Stahl. 2020. "The Polarity of Online Reviews: Prevalence Drivers and Implications." *Journal of Marketing Research* 57, no.5: 853-877. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0022243720941832</u>.
- Scott, John Roper. 1985. "Personal Experience Narratives among Professional Sailors: Generic Keys to the Study of an Occupation." PhD diss., Memorial University of Newfoundland, St. John's. Memorial University Research Repository.

Seremetakis, C. Nadia, ed. 1994. The Senses Still. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Servais, Jean-Claude. 2012. Orval, Édition Intégrale. Marcinelle, BE: Dupuis.

- Shahsavari, Shadi, Pavan Holur, Tianyi Wang, Timothy R. Tangherlini, and Vwani Roychowdhury. 2020. "Conspiracy in the Time of Corona: Automatic Detection of Emerging COVID-19 Conspiracy Theories in Social Media and the News." *Journal of Computational Social Sciences* 3, no. 2: 279-317. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s42001-020-00086-5</u>.
- Sherlock, Gavin. 2011. "lager yeast." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 534-535. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Shortridge, Barbara G. 2010. "Ethnic Heritage Food in Lindsborg, Kansas, and New Glarus, Wisconsin." In *Culinary Tourism*, edited by Lucy M. Long, 268-96. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.
- Shortridge, James R. 1996. "Keeping Tabs on Kansas: Reflections on Regionally Based Field Study." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 16, no. 1: 5-16. https://doi.org/10.1080/08873639609478344.
- Sibenaler, J. -B. 1899. "Notice sur Orval." *Annales de la Fédération Archéologique et Historique de Belgique* 13. *Federation Archéologique et Historique de Belgique*, published by Ernest Matthieu,165-71.
- Silverstein, Michael. 2003. "Indexical Order and the Dialectics of Sociolinguistic Life." Language & Communication 23, no. 3-4: 193-229. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0271-5309(03)00013-2</u>.
- Silverstein, Shel. 1974. "Paul Bunyan." In *Where the Sidewalk Ends*, 124-5. New York, NY: HarperCollins.
- Sims, Martha C., and Martine Stephens. 2011. *Living Folklore: An Introduction the Study of People and Their Traditions*. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Sjölander-Lindqvist, Annelie, Wwilhelm Skoglund, and Daniel Laven. 2019. "Craft Beer— Building Social Terroir through Connecting People, Place and Business." *Journal of Place Management and Development* 13, no. 2: 149–162. <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/JPMD-01-2019-0001</u>.
- Skrabec, Quentin R. 2003. *St. Benedict's Rule for BusinessBsuccess*. West Lafayette, LA: Purdue University Press.
- Small, Larry. 1985. "Folk Legend and Personal Experience Narrative." In Folk Literature Series: A Folklore/Folklife Educational Series, edited by Larry Small. St. John's, NL: Breakwater Books.

- Snoeck, Jorg. 2021. "No Monks, No Label: Achel is No Longer an Official Trappist Beer." *Retail Detail*, January 21, 2021. <u>https://www.retaildetail.eu/news/food/no-monks-no-label-achel-no-longer-official-trappist-beer/</u>.
- Solomon, Gregg Eric Arn. 1990. "Psychology of Novice and Expert Wine Talk." *American Journal of Psychology* 103, no. 4: 495-517. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1423321</u>.
- Sommers, Brian J. 2008. *The Geography of Wine: How Landscape, Cultures, Terroir and the Weather make a Good Drop.* New York: Plume.
- Spackman, Christy, and Jacob Lahne. 2019. "Sensory Labor: Considering the Work of Taste in the Food System." In "Sensory Labor: Considering the Work of Taste in the Food System," edited by Amy Bentley. Special issue, *Food, Culture & Society* 21, no. 2: 142-151. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/15528014.2019.1573039</u>.
- Spike, Michèle, K. 2004. *Tuscan Countess: The Life and Extraordinary Times of Matilda of Canossa*. New York: The Vendome Press.
  - ———. 2015. *Matilda of Canossa & the Origins of the Renaissance*. Williamsburg, VA: The Muscarelle Museum of Art.
- Stahl, Sandra Dolby. 1975. "The Personal Narrative as a Folklore Genre." PhD diss., Indiana University, Bloomington. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.

------. 1977a. "Introduction." *Journal of the Folklore Institute* 14, no. 1-2 : 5-8. https://www.jstor.org/stable/3814038.

- . 1977b. "Personal Narrative as Folklore." *Journal of the Folklore Institute* 14, no. 1-2: 9-30. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/3814039</u>.
  - ——. 1989. *Literary Folkloristics and the Personal Narrative*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Stalpaert, Anny. 1957. "La légende d'Orval, ses attestations, son origine et ses attachés avec d'autres légendes." *Cîteaux in de Nederlanden* 8: 132-138.
- Stagnaro, Angelo. 2020. "26 Patron Saints to Help You Around the Kitchen." *National Catholic Register* (blog). December 10, 2020. <u>https://www.ncregister.com/blog/kitchen-saints</u>.
- Steger, Manfred B., & James, Paul. 2013. "Levels of Subjective Globalization: Ideologies, Imaginaries, Ontologies." *Perspectives on Global Development & Technology* 12, no. 1-2: 17-40. <u>https://doi.org/10.1163/15691497-12341240</u>.
- Stevenson, Angus, and Christine A. Lindberg, eds. 2010. "pilgrimage." In New Oxford American Dictionary. Oxford: Oxford University Press. <u>https://www-oxfordreference-</u>

com.qe2a-

proxy.mun.ca/view/10.1093/acref/9780195392883.001.0001/m en us1278098.

- Stoller, Paul. 1989. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- . 1997. *Sensuous Scholarship*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Stoller, Paul, and Cheryl Olkes. 1986. "Bad Sauce, Good Ethnography." *Cultural Anthropology* 1, no.3: 336-352. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/656197</u>.
- Storey, John. 2003. *Inventing Popular Culture: From Folklore to Globalization*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing.
- Strong, Gordon, and Kristen England. 2022. *Beer Judge Certification Program, 2021 Style Guidelines, Beer Style Guidelines.* BJCP, Inc. https://www.bjcp.org/download/2021 Guidelines Beer.pdf,%2053-55.
- Stryker, Kimberly D., and Jared L. Schmidt, eds. 2020. "The Spirits of the Folk: Alcohol-Based Community Identity in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century." Special issue, *New Directions in Folklore* 17, no. 1.
- Sutton, David E. 2001a. *Remembrance of Repasts: An Anthropology of Food and Memory*. Oxford: Berg.
- ———. 2001b. "Whole Foods: Revitalization through Everyday Synesthetic Experience." Anthropology and Humanism 25, no .2: 120-30. https://doi.org/10.1525/ahu.2000.25.2.120.
- ------. 2010. "Food and the Senses." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 39: 209-223. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.anthro.012809.104957.
- Swinnen, Johan. 2017. "Beer Consumption and Trade in an Era of Economic Growth and Globalization." *Choices* 32, no. 3: 1-6. <u>https://doi.org/10.22004/ag.econ.263133</u>.
- Tangherlini, Timothy R. 1990. "'It Happened Not Too Far From Here...': A Survey of Legend Theory and Characterization." *Western Folklore* 49, no. 4: 371-390. <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/1499751</u>.
  - ——. 2013. "The Folklore Macroscope: Challenges for a Computational Folkloristics." Western Folklore 72, no. 1: 7-27. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/24550905</u>.
- ———. 2016. "Big Folklore: A Special Issue on Computational Folkloristics." *Journal of American Folklore* 129, no. 511: 5-13. <u>https://doi.org/10.5406/jamerfolk.129.511.0005</u>.

-. 2018. "Toward a Generative Model of Legend: Pizzas, Bridges, Vaccines, and Witches." *Humanities* 7, no. 1: 1-19. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/h7010001</u>.

- Tangherlini, Timothy R., Vwani Roychowdhury, Beth Glenn, Catherine M. Crespi, Roja Bandari, Akshay Wadia, Misagh Falahi, Ehsan Ebrahimzadeh, and Roshan Bastani. 2016.
  ""Mommy Blogs" and the Vaccination exemption Narrative" Results From A Machine-Learning Approach for Story Aggregation on Parenting Social Media Sites." *JMIR Public Healthand Surveillance* 2, no. 2: e166. https://doi.org/10.2196/publichealth.6586.
- Taylor, Bill. 2011. "lambic." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 535-539. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Teil, Geneviève. 2012. "No Such Thing as Terroir?: Objectivities and the Regimes of Existence of Objects." Science, Technology and Human Values 37, no. 5: 487-505. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0162243911423843</u>.
- Terrio, Susan. 2016. "Visions of Excess: Crafting and Consuming Good Chocolate in France and the United States." In *Critical Craft, Technology, Globalization, and Capitalism*, edited by Clare M. Wilkinson-Weber and Alicia Ory DeNicola, 135-52. London: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Terrio, Susan J. 2000. *Crafting the Culture and History of French Chocolate*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Thanh, Tan Vo, and Valentina Kirova. 2017. "Wine Tourism Experience: A Netnography Study." *Journal of Business Research* 83: 30-37. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2017.10.008.
- Thursby, Jacqueline S. 2010. "Culinary Tourism among Basque and Basque Americans: Maintenance and Inventions." In *Culinary Tourism*, edited by Lucy M. Long, 186-205. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky.
- Thompson, Derek. 2018. "Craft Beer Is the Strangest, Happiest Economic Story in America." *The Atlantic*, January 19, 2018. <u>https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2018/01/craft-beer-industry/550850.</u>
- Thompson, Stith. 2000. Motif-Index of Folk-Literature: A Classification of Narrative Elements in Folktales, Ballads, Myths, Fables, Medieval Romances, Exempla, Fabliaux, Jest-Books, and Local Legends. Helsinki : Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia, Academia Scientiarum Fennica.

Tillière, N. [1897] 1967. Histoire de l'Abbaye d'Orval. Éditions d'Orval.

Tolbert, Jeffrey A., and Eric D. M. Johnson. 2019. "Digital Folkloristics: Text, Ethnography, and Interdisciplinarity." *Western Folklore* 78, no. 4: 327-56. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/26864167</u>.

- Tota, Matthew. 2022. "St. Joseph's Abbey to Close Spencer Brewery." *Worcester Magazine*, May 14, 2022. <u>https://www.worcestermag.com/story/lifestyle/2022/05/14/st-josephs-Abbey-close-spencer-brewery/9782190002/</u>.
- Tresidder, Richard. 2015. "Eating Ants: Understanding the Terroir Restaurant as a Form of Destination." *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change* 13, no. 4: 344-60. https://doi.org/10.1080/14766825.2014.956751.
- Trollinger, Susan L. 2012. *Selling the Amish: The Tourism of Nostalgia*. Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins University Press.
- Trubek, Amy B. 2009. *The Taste of Place: A Cultural Journal into Terroir*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- ------. 2010. "Maple Syrup: Differences between Vermont and Quebec." *Cuizine* 2, no. 2. <u>https://doi.org/10.7202/044354ar</u>.
- Trubek, Amy, Kolleen M. Guy, and Sarah Bowen. 2010. "Terroir: A French Conversation with a Transnational Future." *Contemporary French and Francophone Studies* 14, no. 2: 139-48. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/17409291003644206</u>.
- Turak, August. 2013. The Business Secrets of the Trappist Monks One CEO's Quest for Meaning and Authenticity. New York, NY: Columbia Business School Publishing.
- Turgeon, Laurier, and Madeleine Pastinelli. 2002. ""Eat the World": Postcolonial Encounters in Quebec City's Ethnic Restaurants." *Journal of American Folklore* 115, no. 456: 247-68. https://doi.org/10.2307/4129222.
- Turner, Victor and Edith Turner. 1978. *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture:* Anthropological Perspectives. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Turney, Ida Virginia. 1928. Paul Bunyan Comes West. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co.
- Tutenges, Sébastien. 2015. "Pub Crawls at a Bulgarian Nightlife Resort: A Case Study using Crowd Theory." *Tourist Studies* 15, no. 3: 283-99. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797615597856.
- Tye, Diane. 2014. *Baking as Biography: A Life Story in Recipes*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- . 2018. "Edible Men: Playing with Food at Bachelorette Parties." Western Folklore 77, no.3/4: 221-48. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/26864125</u>.

- Tye, Diane, and Ann Marie Powers. 1998. "Gender, Resistance and Play: Bachelorette Parties in Atlantic Canada." *Women's Studies International Forum* 21: 551-61. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395(98)00062-4.
- UNESCO. 2016. "Beer culture in Belgium." *Intangible Cultural Heritage*. Accessed September 20, 2017. <u>https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/beer-culture-in-belgium-01062</u>.
- . n.d.a. "Browse the Lists of Intangible Cultural Heritage and the Register of good safeguarding practices." *Intangible Cultural Heritage*. Accessed June 28. 2021. <u>https://ich.unesco.org/en/lists</u>.
- ------. n.d.b. "What is Intangible Cultural Heritage?" *Intangible Cultural Heritage*. Accessed June 28, 2021. <u>https://ich.unesco.org/en/what-is-intangible-heritage-00003</u>.
- University of Missouri Libraries. n.d. "Linked ATU Tales" ATU 300 559 Tales of Magic." Accessed August 16, 2022. <u>https://libraryguides.missouri.edu/c.php?g=1083510</u>.
- Untappd. 2020. "Next Glass Announces Strategic Investment by Providence Strategic Growth." Press release, Wilmington, NC, April 2020. <u>https://untappd.com/press/release/2020-04-23/</u>.
- Uriely, Natan, and Yaniv Belhassen. 2005. "Drugs and Risk-Taking in Tourism." Annals of Tourism Research 33, no. 2. https://doi.org/10.1016/k.annals.2005.10.009.
- Urry, John, and Jonas Larsen. 2011. *The Tourist Gaze 3.0*. Los Angeles: SAGE. https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781446251904.
- Van Den Steen, Jef. 2018. Belgian Trappist and Abbey Beers: Truly Divine. Tielt, BE: Lannoo.
- Van Dommelen, Peter. 2006. "Colonial Matters: Material Culture and Postcolonial Theory in Colonial Situations." In *Handbook of Material Culture*, edited by Chris Tilley, Webb Keane, Susanne Kuechler, Mike Rowlands, and Patricia Spyer, 104-24. London: SAGE.
- Van Gennep, Arnold. [1960] 2004. The Rites of Passage. London: Routledge.
- Van Zandycke, Sylvie. 2011. "yeast." *In The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 858-61. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Vaughan, Theresa A. 2011. "The Alewife: Changing Images and Bad Brews." In "Medieval Brewing," edited by Barbara S. Bowers. Special issue, AVISTA Forum Journal 21, no. 1&2: 34-41.
- Ventsel, Aimar. 2010. ""Our Beer is Better Than Theirs": Sub-cultural Comics as Joking Relationship with Identity." *Folklore* 46: 143-160. https://doi.org/10.7592/FEJF2010.46.ventsel.

- Verdonck, Erik, and Luc de Raedemeaker. 2016. *The Belgian Beer Book*. Tielt: Lannoo Publishers.
- Verhaal, J. Cameron, and Stanislav D. Dobrev. 2020. "The Authenticity Paradox: Why the Return to Authenticity on Audience Appeal Decrease in Popularity and Iconicity." *Journal of Management* 48, no.2: 251-80. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206320950414</u>.
- Villa, Keith. 2011. "Orval Brewery." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 630-1. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Voyant Tools Help. n.d. "Stopwords." Accessed August 16, 2022. <u>http://libvoyant.unm.edu/resources/voyant/current/docs/docs/index.html#!/guide/stopwor</u> <u>ds</u>.
- Walls, Robert E. 1996. "Bunyan, Paul." In *American Folklore: An Encyclopedia*, edited by Jan Harold Bunvand, 216-9. New York & London: Garland Publishing.
- Walsh, William S. 1915. *Heroes and Heroines of Fiction: Classical, Mediæval, Legendary.* Philadelphia and London: J. B. Lippincott Company.
- Warnes, Andrew. 2013. "Edgeland Terroir: Authenticity and Invention in New Southern Foodways Strategy." In *Larder: Food Studies Methods from the American South*, edited by John T. Edge, Elizabeth S. D. Engelhardt, and Ted Ownby, 345-62. Athens: University of Georgia Press.
- Wassebourg, Richard de. 1549. *Antiquitez de la Gaule Belgicque,[...]* Paris: V. Sertenas, fo.ccxxxix.b . <u>https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/bpt6k8716691b/f498.item</u>. Bibliothèque nationale de France.
- Webb, Tim. 2011. "Flanders." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 358-9. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Webb, Tim, and Stephen Beaumont. 2012. *The World Atlas of Beer*. New York: Sterling Epicure.
- Welch, Wendy. 1997. "Pouring Out Their Hearts: A Study of How Women Use Coffee." *Culture & Tradition* 19: 79-86.
- Westerman, William. 2006. "Wild grasses and New Arks: Transformative Potential in Applied and Public Folklore." *American Folklore Society* 119, no. 471: 111-28. <u>https://www.jstor.org/stable/4137786</u>.
- Whalen, Philip. 2007. ""A Merciless Source of Happy Memories": Gaston Roupnel and the Folklore of Burgundian Terroir." *Journal of Folklore Research* 44, no. 1: 21-40. https://doi.org/10.2979/JFR.2007.44.1.21.

- Wilson, Bert. 2006. "The Concept of the West: And Other Hindrances to the Study of Mormon Folklore," In *The Marrow of Human Existence: Essays on Folklore*, edited by Jill Terry Rudy, 169-89. Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Wilson, James E., and Mitchell Beazley. 1999. *Terroir: The Role of Geography, Climate and Culture in the Making of French Wine*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- WIRED. 2021. "Brewmaster Answers Beer Questions From Twitter | Tech Support | WIRED." November 5, 2021. YouTube video, 17:45. <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=18fwz9Itbvo</u>.
- Yakobson, Chad Michael. 2011a. "Brettanomyces." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 157-9. New York: Oxford University Press.
- ———. 2011b. "mouthfeel." In *The Oxford Companion to Beer*, edited by Garrett Oliver, 598-599. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Yante, Jean-Marie. 2015. Les origines de l'abbaye cistercienne d'Orval: Actes du colloque organisé à Orval le 23 juillet 2011. Series: Bibliothèque de la Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, 99. Turnhout: Brepols Publishers.
- Yoder, Don. 1972. "Folk Cookery." In *Folklore and Folklife, an Introduction*, edited by Richard M. Dorson, 325-50. Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Yool, Stephen, and Andrew Comrie. 2014. "A Taste of Place: Environmental Geographies of the Classic Beer Styles." In *The Geography of Beer*, edited by Mark W. Patterson and Nancy Hoalst-Pullen, 99-108. Dordrecht, NL: Springer.
- Zainasheff, Jamil, and John J. Palmer. 2007. *Brewing Classic Styles: 80 Winning Recipes Anyone Can Brew*. Boulder, CO: Brewers Publications.
- Zheng, Xiangchun. 2019. "Narrating Terroir: The Place-Making of Wine in China's Southwest." Food, Culture, & Society 22, no. 3: 280-98. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/15528014.2019.1596435</u>.
- Zincone, S. 2014. "BENEDICT of Nursia." In *Encyclopedia of Ancient Christianity*, edited by Angelo Di Berardino, 1:352-1:353. Downers Grove: InterVarsity Press.
- Zuerner, Adrienne E. 2015. "Deuline, Charles (1827-77)." In *The Oxford Companion to Fairy Tales*, edited by Jack Zipes. 2n ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Accessed on June 28, 2021. CREDO Reference.

#### Appendices

#### Appendix A

International Trappist Association (ITA) Members, Trappist® products, and Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) labels.

| Name of the<br>Abbey                             | Location                 | Date of<br>membership | Trappist or<br>Trappistine | Trappist <sup>®</sup> Product(s) <sup>56</sup>                  | Products with Authentic<br>Trappist Product label <sup>57</sup>                      |
|--|--------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------------|---|--|
| St. Benedictus<br>Abbey, De Achelse<br>Kluis     | Achel, Belgium           |                       | Trappist                   | Beers   |  |
| Our Lady of<br>Koningshoeven<br>Abbey, La Trappe | Tilburg,<br>Netherlands  |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers; Bread; Cheeses;<br>Chocolate; Cookies/biscuits;<br>Jams, and preserves; Honey |
| Our Lady of the<br>Sacred Heart<br>Abbey         | Westmalle,<br>Belgium    |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers; Cheeses   |
| Scourmont Abbey                                  | Chimay, Belgium          |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers; Cheeses   |
| Orval Abbey                                      | Orval, Belgium           |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers; Cheeses   |
| Our Lady of Saint-<br>Remy Abbey                 | Rochefort, Belgium       |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers  |
| Our Lady of<br>Brialmont Abbey                   | Tilff, Belgium           |                       | Trappistine                | Mushrooms   |  |
| Our Lady of<br>Soleilmont Abbey                  | Fleurus, Belgium         |                       | Trappistine                | Bread; Cookies/biscuits;<br>Religious (liturgical<br>vestments) |  |
| Sint-Sixtus Abbey                                | Westvleteren,<br>Belgium |                       | Trappist                   |   | Beers  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Products made by the members of the ITA, recognized by the association, carrying the Trappist® trademarked word, and listed on the ITA official website accessed Jan 11, 2022, <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/products/</u>. <sup>57</sup> Products with the ATP label and listed on the ITA's website, accessed January 5, 2022, <u>https://www.trappist.be/en/about-ita/atp-label/#</u>.

| Our Lady of<br>Nazareth Abbey                 | Brecht, Belgium                   | Trap | pistine | Care products; Cleaning<br>products; Religious<br>(liturgical vestments)  |                 |
|---|-----------------------------------|------|---------|---|-----------------|
| Our Lady of<br>Klaarland Priory               | Bocholt, Belgium                  | Trap | pistine | Brewers' yeast tablets;<br>Cookies/biscuits; Jams,<br>and preserves; Others<br>(candles); Religious<br>(liturgical vestments) |                 |
| Lilbosch Abbey                                | Echt and Tegelen,<br>Netherlands  | Trap | pist    | Honey; Jams, and<br>preserves; Others (pork);<br>Wines  |                 |
| Maria Toevlucht<br>Abbey                      | Zundert,<br>Netherlands           | Trap | pist    | Others (CDs of religious music)   | Beers           |
| Stift Engelszell<br>Abbey                     | Engelhartzell,<br>Austria         | Trap | pist    | Cheeses; Honey  | Beers; Liqueurs |
| Mont-des-Cats<br>Abbey                        | Godewaersvelde,<br>France         | Trap | pist    | Beers   | Cheeses         |
| Saint Joseph's<br>Abbey                       | Spencer,<br>Massachusetts,<br>USA | Trap | pist    | Jams, and preserves;<br>Religious (liturgical<br>vestments)   | Beers           |
| Tre Fontane Abbey                             | Rome, Italy                       | Trap | pist    | Chocolate; Honey; Olive<br>oil  | Beers; Liqueurs |
| Monastery of St.<br>Peter of Cardeña          | Burgos, Spain                     | Trap | pist    | Beers; Cheeses; Chocolate;<br>Honey; Liqueurs; Others<br>(ceramic objects); Wines   |                 |
| Mount Saint<br>Bernard Abbey,<br>Tynt Meadow  | Leicestershire,<br>United Kingdom | Trap | pist    | Honey; Others (pots and vases, wooden rosaries)   | Beers           |
| Abbey Our Lady of<br>the Moldau, Nasi<br>Pani | Neveklov, Czech<br>Republic       | Trap | pistine | Cookies/biscuits; Jams,<br>and preserves  | Chocolate       |
| Our Lady of Port<br>du Salut Abbey            | Entrammes, France                 | Trap | pist    | Cookies/biscuits  |                 |

#### Appendix B

Products by members of the International Trappist Association (ITA), distinguishing between Trappist® products (x) and Authentic Trappist Product labels (o)

| Abbey Name                              | Beers | Bread | Brewers'<br>yeast<br>tablets | Care<br>products | Cheeses | Chocolate | Cleaning<br>products |
|---|-------|-------|------------------------------|------------------|---------|-----------|----------------------|
| St. Benedictus Abbey, De Achelse Kluis  | х     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Our Lady of Koningshoeven Abbey, La     |       |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Тгарре                                  | 0     | 0     |                              |                  | 0       | 0         |                      |
| Our Lady of the Sacred Heart Abbey      | 0     | 0     |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Scourmont Abbey                         | 0     | 0     |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Orval Abbey                             | 0     | 0     |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Our Lady of Saint-Remy Abbey            | 0     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Our Lady of Brialmont Abbey             |       |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Our Lady of Soleilmont Abbey            |       | X     |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Sint-Sixtus Abbey                       | 0     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Our Lady of Nazareth Abbey              |       |       |                              | Х                |         |           | Х                    |
| Our Lady of Klaarland Priory            |       |       | Х                            |                  |         |           |                      |
| Lilbosch Abbey                          |       |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Maria Toevlucht Abbey                   | 0     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Stift Engelszell Abbey                  | 0     |       |                              |                  | Х       |           |                      |
| Mont-des-Cats Abbey                     | х     |       |                              |                  | 0       |           |                      |
| Saint Joseph's Abbey                    | х     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Tre Fontane Abbey                       | 0     |       |                              |                  |         | Х         |                      |
| Monastery of St. Peter of Cardeña       | х     |       |                              |                  | Х       | Х         |                      |
| Mount Saint Bernard Abbey, Tynt Meadow  | 0     |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |
| Abbey Our Lady of the Moldau, Nasi Pani |       |       |                              |                  |         | 0         |                      |
| Our Lady of Port du Salut Abbey         |       |       |                              |                  |         |           |                      |

| Cookies/biscuits | Honey | Jams, and preserves | Liqueurs | Mushrooms | Olive oil | Others | Religious | Wines |
|------------------|-------|---------------------|----------|-----------|-----------|--------|-----------|-------|
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
| 0                | 0     | 0                   |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          | Х         |           |        |           |       |
| Х                |       |                     |          |           |           |        | Х         |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        | Х         |       |
| Х                |       | Х                   |          |           |           | Х      | Х         |       |
|                  | х     | х                   |          |           |           | х      |           | Х     |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           | Х      |           |       |
|                  | х     |                     | 0        |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |
|                  |       | Х                   |          |           |           |        | Х         |       |
|                  | Х     |                     | 0        |           | Х         |        |           |       |
|                  | Х     |                     | Х        |           |           | Х      |           | Х     |
|                  | Х     |                     |          |           |           | Х      |           |       |
| х                |       | Х                   |          |           |           |        |           |       |
| х                |       |                     |          |           |           |        |           |       |

#### Appendix C

Members of the International Trappist Association (ITA) that are official Trappist® breweries and produce beers, and beer with the Authentic Trappist Product (ATP) label.

| Date of<br>first beer<br>brewed | Brewery<br>Name <sup>58</sup> | Beer(s)   | Town,<br>Country                   | Official Abbey<br>Name <sup>59</sup>               | Foundatio<br>n/Restora<br>tion<br>Date <sup>60</sup> | Website(s)   |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| 1839                            | Westvleteren<br>61            | Blond<br>8<br>12                                | Westvleteren,<br>Belgium           | Sint-Sixtusabdij                                   | 1831   | https://sintsixtus.be/<br>https://www.trappist<br>westvleteren.be/en |
| 1856                            | Westmalle                     | Tripel<br>Dubbel<br>Extra                       | Westmalle,<br>Belgium              | Adbij der<br>Trappisten                            | 1794   | https://www.trappist<br>westmalle.be/                                |
| 1862                            | Chimay                        | Gold<br>Red<br>Triple<br>Blue<br>Grande Reserve | Forges,<br>Belgium                 | Abbaye Notre-<br>Dame de<br>Scourmont              | 1871   | https://www.scourm<br>ont.be/<br>https://chimay.com/                 |
| 1884                            | La Trappe                     | PUUR<br>Witte Trappist<br>Blond                 | Berkel-<br>Enschot,<br>Netherlands | Adbij Onze Lieve<br>Vrouw van<br>Koninshoeven/Tilb | 1881   | https://www.latrappe<br>trappist.com/                                |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> The brewery names selected here are the largest font found on the bottles of beer, therefore the name that is most likely associated with the beer.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> All names are taken from the OCSO official website, though many of the Abbey are nicknamed after their locations (i.e. Saint Sixtus Abbey in Westvleteren is often called "Westvleteren Abbey").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Many of the Abbeys' locations have long histories of the locations being a place of worship and spiritual reflection long before the settlement of Trappists, meaning some might have been the place of churches, hermit settlements or Benedictine Abbeys before being established as Trappist Abbey. The dates chosen for this section are found on the official OCSO website, unless indicated otherwise.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> In **bold** are the Abbeys that produce official Trappist® beers.

|                    |                     | Dubbel<br>Bockbier<br>Isid'Or<br>Tripel<br>Quadrupel<br>Quadrupel Oak Aged |                                      | urg  |                    |                                       |
|--------------------|---------------------|--|--------------------------------------|--|--------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 1899 <sup>62</sup> | Rochefort           | 6<br>8<br>10   | Rochefort,<br>Belgium                | Abbaye Notre-<br>Dame de Saint-<br>Rémy      | 1887               | https://www.abbaye-<br>rochefort.be/  |
| 1931               | Orval               | Orval<br>Orval Vert <sup>63</sup>  | Villers-<br>devant-Orval,<br>Belgium | Abbaye Notre-<br>Dame d'Orval                | 1927               | https://www.orval.b<br>e/en/          |
| 1998 <sup>64</sup> | Achel <sup>65</sup> | Blond 8<br>Bruin 8<br>Blond Extra 9.5<br>Bruin Extra 9.5                   | Hamont-<br>Achel,<br>Belgium         | Achelse Kluis or<br>Sint-<br>Benedictusadbij | 1846 <sup>66</sup> | https://www.achelse<br>kluis.org/nl   |
| 2011               | Mont des Cats       | Mont des Cats  | Godewaersvel<br>de, France           | Abbaye Sainte-<br>Marie-du-Mont              | 1826               | http://www.abbaye-<br>montdescats.fr/ |
| 2012               | Stift               | Gregorius  | Engelhartszell,                      | Stift Engelszell                             | 1925               | https://www.stift-                    |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> The earliest recorded proving the production of beer dates back to 1595. The reason for this not being the chosen date is because the monastery (including the brewery) has been abandoned, invaded, pillaged, sold, and destroyed until it was bought by father Anselmus Judong in 1887 and began to be restored and expanded in 1887. In 1899, a brewery was constructed within the walls of the monastery allowing only a limited amount to be sold. Renovations and expansions in 1952, 1960 and in the 2000s further and further increased their beer production.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Only sold as draft at A L'Ange Gardien, a cafe near the monastery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Though a brewery was built in 1850, it initially was not widely distributed but served mostly within the Abbey. Additionally, beer was not brewed between the second world war and 1998 due to...wars, pillaging and financial issues.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> In 2021, Achel lost the ATP label for their beer due to lack of monks on site (Snoeck 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> It is unclear why, but Achel is not found on the OCSO website, so this date is selected from Achel's own website. OCSO has been contacted by email in regards to this issue.

|      | Engelszell            | Nivard<br>Benno<br>Weisse<br>Zwickl  | Austria                                 |                              |                    | engelszell.at/  |
|------|-----------------------|--|---|------------------------------|--------------------|---|
| 2013 | Spencer <sup>67</sup> | Trappist Classics:<br>Trappist Ale<br>Trappist Holiday Ale<br>Trappist Monks' Reserve<br>Ale<br>American Trappist Craft<br>Beers:<br>Trappist Imperial Stout<br>Trappist IPA<br>Trappist Premium Pilsner<br>Trappist Vienna Lager<br>Monks' IPA<br>Spencer Fruit Series:<br>Spencer Peach Saison<br>Spencer Grapefruit IPA | Spencer,<br>United States<br>of America | St. Joseph's Abbey           | 1950 <sup>68</sup> | https://www.spencer<br>Abbey.org/<br>https://spencerbrewe<br>ry.com/index.php |
| 2013 | Zundert               | 8<br>10  | Klein Zundert,<br>Netherlands           | Adbij Maria<br>Toevlucht     | 1900               | https://www.abdijma<br>riatoevlucht.nl/en/                                    |
| 2015 | Tre Fontane           | Tripel   | Roma, Italy                             | Abbazia delle Tre<br>Fontane | 1867               | http://www.birratref<br>ontane.it/  |
| 2016 | Cardeña               | Tripel   | San Pedro de<br>Cardeña                 | Abadía<br>Cistercience       | 1942               | https://www.monast<br>eriosanpedrodecarde                                     |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> In 2022, Spencer ceased beer production (Tota 2022).
 <sup>68</sup> Initial foundation occurred by Fr. Vincent de Paul in Petit-Clairvaux, Nova Scotia, Canada in 1825, and asked for affiliation with La Trappe in 1868, considered their official incorporation date on the OCSO website. However, after some movement, they transferred officially to Spencer in 1950, which is why the date is selected here.

|      |             |                      | (Burgos),<br>Spain              |                              |      | <u>na.com/</u>                        |
|------|-------------|----------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------|------|---------------------------------------|
| 2018 | Tynt Meadow | English Trappist Ale | Leicester,<br>United<br>Kingdom | Mount Saint<br>Bernard Abbey | 1835 | http://www.mountsa<br>intbernard.org/ |

# Appendix D

Most used terms in descending order of the number of times used in Orval beer reviews on Untappd.

| 1      | beer     | 81   |
|--------|----------|--|
| 2<br>3 | good     | 44   |
| 3      | orval    | 40   |
| 4      | trappist | 38   |
| 5<br>6 | belgian  | 35   |
|        | dry      | 33   |
| 7      | taste    | 28   |
| 8      | really   | 27   |
| 9      | nice     | 26   |
| 10     | sour     | 25   |
| 11     | bottle   | 23   |
| 12     | classic  | 28<br>27<br>26<br>25<br>23<br>23<br>22<br>22<br>22<br>22<br>22<br>22<br>22 |
| 13     | bit      | 22   |
| 14     | bitter   | 22   |
| 15     | brett    | 22   |
| 16     | day      | 22   |
| 17     | little   | 22   |
| 18     | old      | 22   |
| 19     | flavour  | 21   |
| 20     | bottled  | 19<br>17   |
| 21     | beers    | 17   |
| 22     | fruity   | 16   |
| 23     | sweet    | 16   |
| 24     | best     | 15   |
| 25     | just     | 15   |
| 26     | finish   | 14   |
| 27     | fresh    | 14   |
| 28     | light    | 14   |
|        |          |  |

| 29        | advent     | 13 |
|-----------|------------|----|
| 30        | funky      | 13 |
| 31        | lovely     | 13 |
| 32        | caramel    | 12 |
| 33        | hoppy      | 12 |
| 34        | it's       | 12 |
| 35        | months     | 12 |
| 36        | time       | 12 |
| 37        | years      | 12 |
| 38        | favourite  | 11 |
| 39        | glass      | 11 |
| 40        | hint       | 11 |
| 41        | it's       | 11 |
| 42        | quite      | 11 |
| 43        | strong     | 11 |
| 44        | sweetness  | 11 |
| 45        | bitterness | 10 |
| 46        | fruit      | 10 |
| 47        | malty      | 10 |
| <b>48</b> | month      | 10 |
| 49        | style      | 10 |
| 50        | tasting    | 10 |
| 51        | think      | 10 |
| 52        | great      | 10 |
| 53        | love       | 9  |
| 54        | year       | 9  |
| 55        | aged       | 8  |

# Appendix E

Most used terms in descending order of the number of times used in Orval beer reviews on RateBeer

| r      |             |     |
|--------|-------------|-----|
| 1      | beer        | 441 |
| 2<br>3 | head        | 430 |
|        | taste       | 414 |
| 4      | aroma       | 387 |
| 5      | bottle      | 337 |
| 6      | white       | 305 |
| 7      | dry         | 276 |
| 8      | medium      | 253 |
| 9      | yeast       | 226 |
| 10     | light       | 222 |
| 11     | orange      | 222 |
| 12     | amber       | 218 |
| 13     | carbonation | 217 |
| 14     | bitter      | 214 |
| 15     | finish      | 209 |
| 16     | sour        | 183 |
| 17     | bitterness  | 171 |
| 18     | sweet       | 170 |
| 19     | nice        | 166 |
| 20     | good        | 164 |
| 21     | notes       | 164 |
| 22     | hazy        | 162 |
| 23     | body        | 152 |
| 24     | pours       | 151 |
| 25     | fruity      | 148 |
| 26     | like        | 145 |
| 27     | citrus      | 137 |
| 28     | belgian     | 130 |

| 29        | slightly  | 127 |
|-----------|-----------|-----|
| 30        | hops      | 121 |
| 31        | trappist  | 113 |
| 32        | complex   | 111 |
| 33        | bit       | 109 |
| 34        | color     | 108 |
| 35        | quite     | 108 |
| 36        | brett     | 103 |
| 37        | flavour   | 102 |
| 38        | malt      | 100 |
| 39        | fruit     | 96  |
| 40        | funky     | 96  |
| 41        | caramel   | 94  |
| 42        | great     | 93  |
| 43        | dark      | 90  |
| 44        | fruits    | 89  |
| 45        | spicy     | 87  |
| 46        | little    | 84  |
| 47        | long      | 81  |
| <b>48</b> | hoppy     | 80  |
| 49        | really    | 79  |
| 50        | high      | 78  |
| 51        | orval     | 78  |
| 52        | floral    | 77  |
| 53        | yeasty    | 77  |
| 54        | sweetness | 76  |
| 55        | golden    | 75  |
|           |           |     |

# Appendix F

Most used terms in descending order of the number of times used in Orval beer reviews on BeerAdvocate

|        |             | 1    |
|--------|-------------|------|
| 1      | beer        | 1527 |
| 2      | head        | 1090 |
| 3      | taste       | 746  |
| 4      | like        | 693  |
| 5<br>6 | bottle      | 635  |
| 6      | carbonation | 629  |
| 7      | dry         | 571  |
| 8      | light       | 563  |
| 9      | yeast       | 534  |
| 10     | white       | 522  |
| 11     | belgian     | 498  |
| 12     | nice        | 474  |
| 13     | orange      | 446  |
| 14     | good        | 441  |
| 15     | finish      | 424  |
| 16     | glass       | 423  |
| 17     | smell       | 417  |
| 18     | bit         | 414  |
| 19     | poured      | 400  |
| 20     | aroma       | 393  |
| 21     | funk        | 382  |
| 22     | flavour     | 375  |
| 23     | medium      | 373  |
| 24     | sweet       | 363  |
| 25     | it's        | 354  |
| 26     | amber       | 354  |
| 27     | color       | 344  |
| 28     | just        | 332  |

| 29        | hops       | 331 |
|-----------|------------|-----|
| 30        | notes      | 328 |
| 31        | great      | 324 |
| 32        | overall    | 324 |
| 33        | pours      | 324 |
| 34        | citrus     | 323 |
| 35        | body       | 322 |
| 36        | little     | 321 |
| 37        | lacing     | 319 |
| 38        | really     | 309 |
| 39        | complex    | 303 |
| 40        | flavours   | 299 |
| 41        | bitterness | 295 |
| 42        | malt       | 294 |
| 43        | brett      | 289 |
| 44        | slightly   | 285 |
| 45        | orval      | 283 |
| 46        | mouthfeel  | 282 |
| 47        | sour       | 273 |
| <b>48</b> | nose       | 272 |
| 49        | bitter     | 268 |
| 50        | trappist   | 266 |
| 51        | lemon      | 260 |
| 52        | fruit      | 259 |
| 53        | hazy       | 256 |
| 54        | quite      | 253 |
| 55        | ale        | 248 |

# Appendix G

Most used terms in descending order of the number of times used in Orval beer reviews overall.

| 1  | beer        | 2059 |
|----|-------------|------|
| 2  | head        | 1526 |
| 3  | taste       | 1188 |
| 4  | bottle      | 995  |
| 5  | dry         | 880  |
| 6  | carbonation | 853  |
| 7  | white       | 829  |
| 8  | light       | 799  |
| 9  | aroma       | 785  |
| 10 | yeast       | 767  |
| 11 | orange      | 670  |
| 12 | nice        | 666  |
| 13 | belgian     | 663  |
| 14 | good        | 649  |
| 15 | finish      | 647  |
| 16 | medium      | 626  |
| 17 | amber       | 573  |
| 18 | sweet       | 549  |
| 19 | bit         | 545  |
| 20 | bitter      | 504  |
| 21 | flavour     | 498  |
| 22 | glass       | 498  |
| 23 | notes       | 498  |
| 24 | sour        | 481  |
| 25 | pours       | 477  |
| 26 | bitterness  | 476  |
| 27 | body        | 476  |
| 28 | citrus      | 466  |
| 29 | smell       | 464  |
|    |             |      |

| 9                          | 51       | flavours  | 358 |
|----------------------------|----------|-----------|-----|
| 6                          | 52       | mouthfeel | 338 |
| 8                          | 53       | nose      | 332 |
| 5                          | 54       | funky     | 319 |
| )                          | 55       | bottled   | 304 |
| 8<br>5<br>)<br>}           | 56       | lemon     | 301 |
|                            | 57       | tart      | 300 |
| )                          | 58       | floral    | 299 |
| )<br>5<br>7                | 59       | apple     | 274 |
|                            | 60       | spicy     | 268 |
| )<br>5<br>3<br>9           | 61       | sweetness | 268 |
| 5                          | 62       | slight    | 267 |
| 3                          | 63       | time      | 262 |
| )                          | 64       | dark      | 259 |
|                            | 65       | unique    | 255 |
| 5                          | 66       | spice     | 246 |
| 3                          | 67       | high      | 241 |
| )                          | 68       | caramel   | 239 |
| 5                          | 69       | yeasty    | 236 |
| 5<br>3<br>5<br>4<br>3<br>3 | 70       | best      | 234 |
| 3                          | 71       | beers     | 233 |
| 3                          | 72       | drink     | 233 |
| 3                          | 73<br>74 | golden    | 233 |
|                            | 74       | strong    | 233 |
| 7                          | 75       | earthy    | 232 |
| 5<br>5<br>5                | 76       | huge      | 232 |
| 5                          | 77       | fruits    | 231 |
| 5                          | 78       | feel      | 226 |
| ł                          | 79       | smooth    | 225 |
|                            |          |           |     |

| hops     | 458  |
|----------|--|
| color    | 454  |
| funk     | 452  |
| poured   | 432  |
| little   | 427  |
| great    | 426  |
| complex  | 420  |
| slightly | 420  |
| hazy     | 419  |
| trappist | 417  |
| brett    | 416  |
| really   | 415  |
| fruity   | 403  |
| just     | 402  |
| orval    | 401  |
| malt     | 398  |
| it's     | 394  |
| overall  | 386  |
| quite    | 372  |
| fruit    | 365  |
| lacing   | 361  |
|          | color<br>funk<br>poured<br>little<br>great<br>complex<br>slightly<br>hazy<br>trappist<br>brett<br>really<br>fruity<br>just<br>orval<br>malt<br>it's<br>overall<br>quite<br>fruit |

|     | r          |     |
|-----|------------|-----|
| 80  | banana     | 221 |
| 81  | pale       | 219 |
| 82  | big        | 218 |
| 83  | thick      | 218 |
| 84  | long       | 216 |
| 85  | cloudy     | 211 |
| 86  | palate     | 211 |
| 87  | foam       | 202 |
| 88  | carbonated | 201 |
| 89  | crisp      | 200 |
| 90  | aftertaste | 198 |
| 91  | appearance | 198 |
| 92  | alcohol    | 197 |
| 93  | mouth      | 196 |
| 94  | balanced   | 193 |
| 95  | lots       | 192 |
| 96  | hint       | 189 |
| 97  | spices     | 189 |
| 98  | hoppy      | 187 |
| 99  | bodied     | 186 |
| 100 | pretty     | 183 |